

Ray Lutz
Executive Director, Citizens Oversight
771 Jamacha Rd
El Cajon, (San Diego County) CA 92019

raylutz@citizenoversight.org
619-820-5321 (mobile)
619-440-3646 (support)

August 6, 2024

Jocelyn Benson
Michigan Secretary of State
c/o Elections Department, Michigan Department of State
[**elections@michigan.gov**](mailto:elections@michigan.gov)



AuditEngine

REF M2018

Dear Secretary Benson:

Thank you for accepting my letter.

My wife was born and raised in Bay City, MI, and although I am currently based in San Diego, I have a special personal interest in Michigan. Plus, if you don't mind me saying, you are one of my favorite elected officials, and so I thank you for that.

I am writing to introduce you to AuditEngine¹, our cutting-edge ballot image auditing (BIA) platform, and I hope to discuss some pilot audits in Michigan, and to participate in any bidding opportunities you might have in this category.

I will put your mind at ease to know that this is not a response to the 2020 election. We started this project in 2019 from an idea I had in about 2006. Our agenda is to help the election officials to accurately complete the canvass and improve voter confidence. When an independent audit is performed with an ability for the public to review the images of ballots of concern, this can put those concerns to rest. We think that it is actually more convincing if the audit finds a few small differences that can be easily checked, both in images and on paper.

Since I will be in MI in the week of August 12-16, I am hoping I can meet with you or your staff to explain how we might conduct a pilot audit in MI in the upcoming election and make our service available for any audits that seem appropriate. (If

¹ Please visit <https://AuditEngine.org>

need be, I can extend my stay into the following week if that would be more convenient for you, or we can also meet virtually, if the in-person meeting is out of the question.)

Below, I would like to highlight a few key aspects of this solution.

AuditEngine "reads" BMD ballots (not QR Codes!)

We differ from other BIA options in that we can "read" all of the printed options on a BMD ballot and do not rely on any barcodes. To our knowledge, no other provider can provide this capability. Clear Ballot, another other leading provider, generally uses code from ES&S to decode the barcodes or does not process them at all.

Our platform runs in the cloud so we can use up to 10,000 computers in parallel to quickly retabulate your election. If we use "cooperative workflow," where we receive the election details and ballot styles prior to the election, then we can produce an independent tabulation within normally about 24 hours.

Maryland Pilot, and Audits In NJ, FL, WI, GA:

Our solution has been run for a number of audits in New Jersey (Mainly Mercer, Monmouth, and Hunterdon counties), Georgia (Fulton, DeKalb, and Bartow Counties), Florida (Volusia, Collier, Port St. Lucie Counties) and Wisconsin (Dane County, and quite a few others.

Volusia County

It's interesting to note that in Volusia County, because they had some uploading errors, and memory device failures followed by rescanning, the audit was very helpful. We were able to confirm that the canvass was accurate despite all these system shortcomings. When the official was later confronted with theories of hacking, they were able to provide our report to those members of the public, and it put them to rest.

The issues in Volusia resulted in our understanding of a "dual tabulation" design in ES&S equipment that we were the first to understand and disclose to the public. ES&S Equipment CVR and aggregated totals may differ, and ES&S never does internally compare them.

Recent Audit of Monmouth, NJ 2022 election

We recently completed an audit of a recent election in Monmouth County and are pleased to share some of our findings and capabilities². We found an error in double uploading six thumb drives due to insufficient tracking by ES&S software.

² <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1HhAfIGlhEQUIHpyChl0uJORUymyGAZq9thdPMbKuGXs/edit> -- AuditEngine Narrative Report for Burlington, Mercer and Monmouth Counties (2022) New Jersey (also attached with the letter).

AuditEngine was able to independently detect and remove all repeated ballot images, and for the contests that were hand counted, we came within 3 votes of the hand counts, demonstrating the precision of our system. (Actually, we may have been more accurate than the hand count.)

Additionally, we identified discrepancies in three additional contests that were not hand counted (because they were not competitive), highlighting the importance of comprehensive auditing for all contests, regardless of their competitiveness.

AuditEngine is designed to provide a thorough and transparent audit process, ensuring voter confidence and election integrity. We believe our platform can be an invaluable tool for your future elections, providing an additional layer of scrutiny and accuracy.

We have recently also revised our pricing model which we believe is very competitive. But to perform these complex audits routinely, we must have "clean data" that do not require extra work to resolve differences in contest names and options. Our pricing model, based on clean data, is \$5K for the first 25K sheets and \$0.07 per sheet thereafter.³

We can offer this pricing only with clean data, and it does not include extras you may want to include, such as quick turnaround (cooperative workflow), narrative report, and physical ballot scanning, which are available for nominal additional cost. If there are issues in the data that we have to work around, then for the ones we have already seen, we have a pricing schedule to guide those charges.

Therefore, I hope I can have an in-person meeting at your office and answer any questions you might have at that time. If this idea is not convenient, then perhaps we can meet via video conference.

Thank you for your time and consideration. We look forward to the opportunity to work with you to enhance the integrity of the electoral process of Michigan.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Ray Lutz', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Ray Lutz
Executive Director, CitizensOversight
and the AuditEngine Team.

³ Prices and policies may be changed without notice. This pricing guide is still experimental and we are open to discussion, of course.

ATTACHMENTS

The following additional information is provided in PDF form and also by link.

- a. **AuditEngine Narrative Report for Burlington, Mercer and Monmouth Counties (2022) New Jersey -- M2009**
<https://copswiki.org/Common/M2009>
- b. **AuditEngine Pricing Model --**
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1K4kWOr_heZKIU00WnwVN4etkgohRZB87TYu9njVocIE/edit?usp=sharing
- c. **"Election Design to Enable BIA Auditing"**
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1o81zAhyN63RNLZsqnSRx08A5T5InBLSqHqpvXiQEq_U/edit?usp=sharing
This document provides tips and hints for designing your election to avoid many pitfalls we have seen in recent audits we have performed.
- d. **"AuditEngine Findings" (M2007)**
Here, we summarize the findings and details we have learned by conducting these numerous audits.
<https://copswiki.org/Common/M2007>
- e. **Technical Brief: Dual Tabulations in ES&S Voting Systems (M1989)**
<https://copswiki.org/Common/M1989>