Addressing Issues of Equity During and After COVID-19: Recommendations for Higher Education Institutions and General Information

Crowdsourced and edited by Anna CohenMiller, PhD Graduate School of Education, Co-Founding Director The Consortium of Gender Scholars, Nazarbayev University, www.anna.cohenmiller.com

Last updated Oct 13, 2020



Link to this document

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1z7cN5x9_FeOK50a1-aKL-rwQtGhAtsc3tgoCwR9r_Ns/edit

Suggested citation:

CohenMiller, A. (Ed.) (2020). Addressing issues of equity during and after COVID-19: Recommendations for higher education institutions and general information. Available at: https://docs.google.com/document/d/1z7cN5x9 FeOK50a1-aKL-rwQtGhAtsc3tgoCwR9r Ns/e dit

**Please email anna.cohenmiller@nu.edu.kz with any additional information on articles or resources to add to this list

INTRODUCTION

The following are a set of articles, research, and various pieces speaking to the concern and current reality about issues of equity during and after COVID-19. The articles and reports in particular highlight caregivers potentially insurmountable challenges/obstacles during the pandemic (e.g., mothers as front-line workers during COVID-19; caretakers facing a 4th shift with homeschooling). The texts include what the higher education landscape can do to address potentially catastrophic repercussions of these inequities. The document is organized into two major sections:

- 1. Articles relating to academia, gender, and COVID-19
- 2. Articles relating to gender and COVID-19 broadly

From the section on academic, gender, and COVID-19, see these recent articles with <u>advice for administrators</u>, <u>Faculty Equity & COVID-19</u>, and <u>documenting pandemic impacts: best practices</u>.

The following are a few compiled points for higher education institutions:

- "Decrease faculty uncertainty by communicating clear metrics and specific benchmarks; these may be determined at the departmental level." <u>Advance Program</u>
- "Articulate the value of teaching and service in an academic world where research is often seen as paramount. This work has always been essential to the functioning of the university and is especially critical now. The pandemic (and racial injustice) has resulted in an increased need for faculty to engage in outward facing public engagement, support and mentor students, and engage in committee and leadership efforts on campus and nationally. Therefore, communicate to faculty that this work is valued; align evaluation standards and criteria to match where faculty have placed their efforts to address the critical needs of this moment; adjust reward structures to mirror this commitment. Where the balance has been skewed in evaluative processes, reset norms and expectations." Advance Program
- "To mitigate evaluation bias, inform evaluators of the differential impact of COVID-19 on faculty from marginalized groups." <u>Advance Program</u>
- Marginalized groups are further experiencing obstacles during the pandemic ("we are all in the same storm but not all in the same boat" - <u>Advance Program</u>);
- Waive nonessential service;
- Reconfigure metrics for promotion and tenure;
- Remove / adjust use of student feedback;
- Pay special attention to consider support for those with caretaking duties (e.g., children, parents, other people in the household), such as reduction of teaching load;
- Reallocate travel funds to support those with childcare demands, and others with special needs.

^{*}The following have not yet been organized and instead represent a variety of sources and recommendations since the beginning of the pandemic.

| Academia, Gender and COVID | Article source |
|---|---|
| Documenting pandemic impacts: best practices (a report from UMass Amherst including information about workloads, online teaching, and research) | https://www.umass.edu/advance/sites/default/files/inline-files/UMass%20ADVANCE%20COVID-19%20Tool%20August%2017%202020%20Final.pdf |

| | 1 |
|--|--|
| Faculty Equity and COVID-19: The problem, evidence and recommendations (a report from the University of Michigan ADVANCE Program) | https://advance.umich.edu/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/UM-ADVANCE-Faculty-Equity-and-COVID-19-Oct-2020.pdf |
| In the wake of COVID-19, new solutions are needed for gender equity | https://www.pnas.org/content/suppl/202 0/06/17/2010636117.DCSupplemental |
| Continuing the Conversation on Gender Equity During the COVID-19 Pandemic (an evolving document which began from St. Mary's University faculty, with steps for universities and governmental bodies) | https://academicequity.smcm.edu/?fbclid =IwAR08mi9m69ipnmByHGseK5ZXq KC-vNIqdfHgzm22MNXi3-oXrV5plL GS2xA |
| Faculty During & After COVID-19 Don't let go of equity (key recommendations) | https://www.mtu.edu/advance/resour ces/articles-books/supporting-faculty -during-and-after-covid.pdf |
| WGSC STATEMENT REGARDING CAREGIVING RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FALL 2020 RETURN TO CAMPUS (WGSC recommendations for universities) | https://consortium.gws.wisc.edu/202 0/06/23/wgsc-statement-regarding-c aregiving-recommendations/?fbclid=I wAR1TjY1002YPmS-8i9qqovn3_nP mi5d1hHO0Fo1gO5uaP2rxR54IYBZ bOhl |
| Labor inequities for faculty and GE caregivers during COVID-19: A call to action (University Oregon) | https://csws.uoregon.edu/labor-ineq uities-covid-19/ |
| A Call to Higher Education Administrators Regarding Faculty Review and Reappointment Processes During the COVID-19 Crisis (ASA & other major organizations) | https://www.asanet.org/news-events/asa-news/asa-statement-regarding-faculty-review-and-reappointment-processes-during-covid-19-crisis |
| Tenure and promotion after the pandemic (recommendations) | https://science.sciencemag.org/cont ent/368/6495/1075 |
| University leadership and the Faculty Senate of the University of Washington, deans, and department heads (Open Letter University | https://docs.google.com/document/u/ 1/d/1LqxRT2mvhc6imH4wIJD0VPRi 9uK0Ih8oHuA1nwOQ_fA/mobilebasi |

| Washington) | c?fbclid=lwAR32wgM5Qr_IncoaSu2 M8gJ3_1V6zO36KNS-3ZwkPf79Efl HmR5Y-iTHX4I |
|--|--|
| Adjustments for COVID-19 - Since Spring 2020 and the closure of our campuses due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Office of the Provost has implemented new guidelines and options to ensure faculty members' success (WVU) | https://faculty.wvu.edu/adjustments-f or-covid-19?fbclid=lwAR0gUkhbon2TE AMRe8VIzR pQ81K3uqjd8vt1a PtbMwl Z 7-6NOanO75wl |
| Support for Student Parents & Caregivers (Berkeley) | https://grad.berkeley.edu/financial/fa milies/?fbclid=IwAR0AzqVfGSkOkmP2D -0nnCRFY2OqfvaQpTrg9snX-HEIVsPIS5f GfaOZegg |
| Open Letter on Research Productivity and Childcare (UCLA) | https://csw.ucla.edu/2020/07/06/ope n-letter-on-research-productivity-and -childcare/?fbclid=lwAR1dKiV28kI7D FpQRoqn8LtchRfACw17yL5E6IN7v VV_27FIN-5YPRkDKxI |
| Open letter from Dartmouth | See below for the shared document |

| Gender and COVID - general information relating to inequity for mothers and caregivers | Article link |
|---|--|
| They go to Mommy first: How the pandemic is disproportionately disrupting mothers' careers. | https://www.nytimes.com/2020/07/15/pare nting/working-moms-coronavirus.html?smi d=em-share |
| In the wake of COVID-19, academia needs new solutions to ensure gender equity | https://www.pnas.org/content/117/27/1537 8 |

| Promoting equity and inclusion for mothers in academia | https://www.insidehighered.com/blogs/university-venus/promoting-equity-and-inclusion-mothers-academe |
|---|--|
| Statement of Principles on Family Responsibilities and Academic Work | https://www.aaup.org/report/statement-principles-family-responsibilities-and-academic-work?fbclid=lwAR1W48RpDyuJtKfoAtKT4Ot9VTcDmqEvIS_K8Dww5EHTRE889wY2yHgvxJc |
| How our new work-life reality is chipping away at equity and inclusion Beware of letting the COVID-19 crisis exacerbate established biases, warns a focus group of corporate and nonprofit leaders. | https://www.fastcompany.com/90523609/how-our-new-work-life-reality-is-chipping-away-at-equity-and-inclusion?fbclid=lwAR1rezuJ4_y2e1nvjfS5ILADO6G7Ua6iuGPiBzgKFpasx71WZj-2wCaMjXc |
| A Semester to Die For - DISPATCH FROM THE FRONTLINES OF CARE | https://spectrejournal.com/a-semester-to-die-for/?fbclid=IwAR2lIfQuO8m75GDQipexdLEgBJWVYZ3WQy02SXCb0Cs5UTYNfUuxiOw6s94 |
| Will COVID-19 Push Women Out of the Labor Force? | https://thesocietypages.org/ccf/2020/07/07/will-covid-19-push-women-out-of-the-labor-force/?fbclid=lwAR0KOLWglKGFwSAFaYSJvRGXNDt5Sqr4fzOZ-8CVG6UWqlovjyh7Fn66yfA |
| Pandemic Could Scar a Generation of Working Mothers Working from home has highlighted and compounded the heavier domestic burden borne by women. Now office reopenings may force new career sacrifices. | https://www.nytimes.com/2020/06/03/business/economy/coronavirus-working-women.html |
| Race and Gender Inequality Makes COVID-19 More Dangerous for Black and Brown People and for Women | https://www.forbes.com/sites/chelseyzhu/ 2020/07/10/many-college-professors-dont -want-to-teach-in-person-will-they-have-a- choice/#651ca23069cf |
| Race and Gender Inequality Makes COVID-19 More Dangerous for Black and Brown People and for Women | https://communitychange.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/Race-and-Gender-Inequality-Makes-COVID-19-More-Dangerous-for-Blac |

| The pandemic and the female academic | https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-02 0-01135-9?fbclid=IwAR3WkJeWVzLVm1NFty WFmysK-bOB9kRK6ZVCrHQsYpnuRCI31qKiS zmPxSY |
|---|--|
| Mothers as workers, primary caregivers, and breadwinners during COVID-19 | https://iwpr.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/ 05/Holding-Up-Half-the-Sky-Mothers-as-Bre adwinners.pdf?fbclid=IwAR11-KzrbjZlTLSSG 90uFDeukpe8tzIU43edaz5qIp4jb-m4hQ1yTT M-rfY |
| The decline of women's research production during the coronavirus pandemic - Preprints analysis suggests a disproportionate impact on early career researchers. | https://www.natureindex.com/news-blog/decline-women-scientist-research-publishing-production-coronavirus-pandemic |
| COVID-19's gendered impact on academic productivity | https://github.com/drfreder/pandemic-pub- bias |
| Pandemic lockdown holding back female academics data show | https://www.timeshighereducation.com/ne ws/pandemic-lockdown-holding-back-femal e-academics-data-show |
| Are women publishing less during the pandemic? Here's what the data say -Early analyses suggest that female academics are posting fewer preprints and starting fewer research projects than their male peers. | https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-02 0-01294-9 |
| The Need for Gender-Equitable Response Measures for Women at CWRU during COVID-19 | https://case.edu/centerforwomen/sites/case .edu.centerforwomen/files/2020-06/Faculty %20Senate%20Committee%20Statement% 20on%20COVID_0.pdf |
| | k-and-Brown-People-and-for-Women 41620 .pdf |

| No Room of One's Own - Early journal submission data suggest COVID-19 is tanking women's research productivity. | https://www.insidehighered.com/news/202 0/04/21/early-journal-submission-data-sugg est-covid-19-tanking-womens-research-prod uctivity#.Xr kSSC0yZY.link |
|--|---|
| 'It Was Just Too Much': How Remote Learning Is Breaking Parents | https://www.nytimes.com/2020/04/27/nyreg ion/coronavirus-homeschooling-parents.ht ml?searchResultPosition=9 |
| Parents' stress levels spike as pandemic drags on | https://www.axios.com/coronavirus-parents -stress-066aa3e1-d1d9-4112-84ed-c65184d0 4e39.html?utm source=twitter&utm mediu m=social&utm campaign=organic |
| Gen X women were already exhausted, then came a pandemic | https://amp.cnn.com/cnn/2020/04/20/healt h/generation-x-coronavirus-calhoun-kalita- wellness/index.html?fbclid=IwAR2rQn5PVCu RDW-jKNVj1kidvz6nNvmjMcRV70MZuu8ml7_ b625NXeHoz7M· |
| A working mom's quarantine life This Mother's Day, eight women balancing careers and kids concede that thriving is out of reach. Surviving is enough. | https://www.washingtonpost.com/lifestyle/ 2020/05/06/coronavirus-pandemic-working- moms-quarantine-life/ |
| Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung (Germany's leading newspaper; the headline translates as "Scholarly Excellence Is Under Threat"): "Die wissenschaftliche Exzellenz ist bedroht" | https://www.faz.net/aktuell/karriere-hochsc hule/corona-die-oekonomin-nicola-fuchs-sc huendeln-im-interview-16760409.html?GEP C=s5" |
| Pandemic Motherhood and the Academy: A Critical Examination of the Leisure-Work Dichotomy | https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.10 80/01490400.2020.1774006 |

| General Recommendations for Addressing Equity in Academia | |
|---|---|
| Improving unconscious bias and diversity training | https://www.gse.harvard.edu/news/19/11/harvard-edcast-unconscious-bias-schools https://hbr.org/2017/04/dont-give-up-on-un |
| | <u>conscious-bias-training-make-it-better</u> |

DARTMOUTH UNIVERSITY FACULTY LETTER RE: CAREGIVERS AND COVID-19

"To the Committee on the Faculty,

We are writing as a follow-up to Jim Feyrer's presentation at the Arts & Sciences Faculty Meeting on Monday, May 11. We greatly appreciate the work that the Committee on Faculty is doing, and we would like to weigh in on one of the issues that came up in the presentation, namely the way in which the COVID-19 crisis is impacting care-givers.

We are particularly concerned about initial data showing that faculty doing essential caregiving work will suffer career penalties, and that the impact will fall disproportionately on women. We applaud the decision that has already been taken to extend all tenure clocks by a year; we are also encouraged by the recognition that faculty with children in Dartmouth Daycare face significant home caregiving challenges.

However, the new home caregiving responsibilities affect a much broader swathe of the faculty, with long-term consequences for academic achievement and leadership across the disciplines. This letter is **motivated by the urgency of recognizing the bigger picture: the full scope of who is affected by the new home caregiving duties, and the likely impact, both on individual careers and for academia more generally.**

To give you a sense of this bigger picture, we have appended links to articles documenting a distinctive effect of the pandemic [N.B: to open the embedded links, please go to the attached Word document]: within a month after lockdowns began across the United States, scholarly

journal editors in the sciences, social sciences and humanities began noting a precipitous decline in submissions from women. International media began carrying stories about women professionals—among whom academics were prominent—finding their work grinding to a halt as full-time home caregiving responsibilities landed mostly on their shoulders.

This uneven distribution of the lockdowns' social consequences has already had a chilling effect on the careers of women in academia. As time goes on, we can expect the pandemic to exacerbate gender inequalities across disciplines even further. This affects male faculty who are caregivers as well, imposing career penalties on those striving for gender equity at home.

In practical terms, that means many talented people, mostly women, will have to shelve grant applications, let projects fall by the wayside, and leave articles and book manuscripts unfinished. Long term, the leadership of our disciplines will go to the people who didn't have to take on full-time carework during the pandemic. Without institutional efforts to offset the career disadvantages created by home caregiving, we will see fewer women journal editors, fewer women presidents of their professional societies, fewer women awarded top honors in their fields. Male faculty with home caregiving responsibilities will also be sidelined, reinforcing the insidious and pervasive message that gender equity is only to be preached, never practiced—on penalty of lasting damage to one's career.

In light of this, we request that you broaden the scope of your considerations beyond impact on junior faculty and people with children in Dartmouth daycare, to include all faculty ranks and the full range of home caregiving that now impacts our work—such as caring for elementary school aged children, the disabled and the elderly. Please read the links below for some insight on the impossibility of fulfilling those responsibilities to our loved ones—whether stepping into the role of a 4th grade teacher, or that of a nurse—while simultaneously meeting our obligations to our students and our research.

The situation is dire, and unsustainable. We need institutional acknowledgement and support of these new demands and their impact on our work as faculty members. Specifically, we ask that the College consider:

1. Temporary Support for Pandemic-Related Home Caregiving, Including Paid Time Off

Leading higher education institutions in the US have already put in place a suite of temporary programs for paid time off during the pandemic; we urge Dartmouth to follow suit.

For example, <u>Princeton</u>, <u>Brown</u> and the <u>University of Michigan</u> are all offering "in house" funded leave programs, offering approximately *two weeks of paid time off* for faculty and staff affected by COVID-19 in the form of home caregiving responsibilities, as well as illness. Princeton also offers <u>100 hours of subsidized home childcare</u> for those children at home due to school closures. <u>Stanford</u> offers a similar 10-day subsidized home childcare program.

Of note: The PTO offerings at both Brown and Michigan are *in addition to* the 80 hours of paid time off those universities make available to faculty and staff through the federal Emergency Family Medical Leave Act (EFMLA) and the Emergency Paid Sick Leave Act (EPSLA).

Additionally, Yale and other peer institutions, are offering extensive support to faculty and staff with new home caregiving responsibilities, such as access to <u>free online tutoring for school-aged children</u>, to relieve some of the burden of homeschooling.

2. A College-Wide Policy on Course and Term Trading

Traditionally, faculty governance has left such decisions to the discretion of department chairs, who have usually denied such requests. As the College expands teaching flexibility in the move to a blended instructional model this Fall, we ask that you also create clear institution-wide rules so that faculty can be flexible about whose courses are offered when. In some cases, course forgiveness may be in order.

Longer term, to reduce the disadvantages created by the new home caregiving responsibilities, the College might consider the following:

- a. Course relief for faculty with significant caregiving responsibilities.
- b. Consideration of caregiving responsibilities in junior and senior faculty fellowship applications, so that faculty who took on home caregiving during the pandemic are not disadvantaged in allocations of fellowships by the College.

c. Setting aside internal research funding and other forms of support for caregivers, modeled on existing programs such as "Inclusive Excellence;" such models urgently need to be expanded to include caregivers impacted by COVID-19.

Finally, we would like to underscore that these recommendations represent an investment in faculty resilience in the face of the pandemic. The <u>tremendous strain that home caregivers experience</u>—whether they care for children or the aged—has been <u>well-documented</u>. These impacts have been magnified by the fears that arise for everyone living through a life-threatening crisis. Under these conditions, the admirable investments the College has already made in wellness will only be effective when paired with a mitigation of the stressors in the professional environment. Dartmouth can offer a model for higher education institutions through its leadership in recognizing and addressing the disproportionate burdens the pandemic has placed on women in particular and caregivers in general.

APPENDIX

Please find below a sampling of recent articles on the gendered impact of home caregiving resulting from the pandemic; the articles are drawn both from academic journals and international newspapers.

Nature

https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-020-01135-9?fbclid=IwAR3WkJeWVzLVm1NFtyWFmysK-bOB9kRK6ZVCrHQsYpnuRCl31qKiSzmPxSY

· Inside Higher Ed

https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2020/04/21/early-journal-submission-data-suggest-covid-19-tanking-womens-research-productivity#.Xr kSSC0yZY.link

New York Times

https://www.nytimes.com/2020/04/27/nyregion/coronavirus-homeschooling-parents.html?se archResultPosition=9

· CNN

https://amp.cnn.com/cnn/2020/04/20/health/generation-x-coronavirus-calhoun-kalita-wellness/index.html?fbclid=IwAR2rQn5PVCuRDW-jKNVj1kidvz6nNvmjMcRV70MZuu8ml7b625NXeHoz7M

Washington Post

https://www.washingtonpost.com/lifestyle/2020/05/06/coronavirus-pandemic-working-mom s-quarantine-life/

Axios

https://www.axios.com/coronavirus-parents-stress-066aa3e1-d1d9-4112-84ed-c65184d04e39
.html?utm source=twitter&utm medium=social&utm campaign=organic

· Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung (Germany's leading newspaper; the headline translates as "Scholarly Excellence Is Under Threat"): "Die wissenschaftliche Exzellenz ist bedroht"

https://www.faz.net/aktuell/karriere-hochschule/corona-die-oekonomin-nicola-fuchs-schuen deln-im-interview-16760409.html?GEPC=s5"