

**2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)**

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

---

**“Movie Credits” for Data and other Research Artifacts**  
**Monday, July 19 • 4:00pm - 5:30pm ET**

**More info & slides on Sched Session Page:** <https://sched.co/jMOr>

---

**Attendance & Check in**

*Add your Name / affiliation / pronouns / location / social media to a bullet*

- Madison Langseth, USGS, she/her, Denver, CO
- Mark Parsons, University of Alabama in Huntsville, Boulder CO.
- Sara Lafia / ESIP Fellow (University of Michigan) / she/her / CA & MI / @lafia\_s
- Qian Huang, University of South Carolina, she/her, Columbia, SC
- Kathy Fontaine / RPI TWC / she/her / Troy, NY
- Elizabeth Adams/ Kentucky Geological Survey/ she, her/ Lexington, KY
- Ruth Duerr / Ronin Institute / she/her / Westminster, CO
- Hannah Collier / ORNL / she, her / Knoxville, TN
- Jasmine Lai / Arctic Data Center - NCEAS/ she/her / Santa Barbara California/ @arcticdatactr
- Nancy Hoebelheinrich, Knowledge Motifs LLC, San Mateo CA
- Tyler Christensen / NOAA / she/her / Silver Spring MD
- Chantel Ridsdale / Ocean Networks Canada / she/her / Victoria, BC / @ChantelRidsdale
- Denise Hills (she/her) / Geo Survey of Alabama / Tuscaloosa, AL / @honu\_girl
- Sarah Ramdeen/Columbia University/ Huntsville AL/ She,her
- Kelsey Breseman / EDGI / she / Seattle / @ifoundtheme @envirodgi @eew\_network
- Jonathan Blythe, BOEM
- Audrey Mickle, MBLWHOI Library, WHOI
- Seth McGinnis, NCAR, he/him, Boulder CO
- Terri Velliquette, ORNL, she/her, Oak Ridge, TN
- David Valentine, UCSD. San Diego, CA, United States
- Lesley Wyborn, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia
- Chung-Lin Shie, UMBC/JCET, NASA/GSFC, he/his, Greenbelt, MD
- Matt Jones, DataONE / UCSB / @metamattj
- Susan Shingledecker, ESIP, she/her, Severna Park, MD, @sshingledecker
- Douglas Fils Ocean Leadership
- John Relph, NOAA/NCEI, he/him
- Mikki Johnson, USGS NGGDPP, she/her, Denver, CO
- Lauren Walker, NCEAS, she/her, Nashville TN
- Lisa Kaser, NSIDC, she/her, Boulder ,CO
- Lisa Dallas,NASAGSFC, GLOBE Program, Philadelphia, PA (telework)

## 2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

- Sarah O'Connor, NOAA/NCEI she/her
- Yaxing Wei, ORNL DAAC
- Debbie Roth, MBLWHOI Library, WHOI
- Debora Drucker, Embrapa, [debora.drucker@embrapa.br](mailto:debora.drucker@embrapa.br)
- Candida Dewes, NSIDC, she/her, Westminster, CO
- Don Collins, NOAA/NCEI, he/him
- Val Stanley, OSU-MGR, she/her, Corvallis OR
- Ethan Davis, UCAR Unidata, he/him, Longmont, CO
- Bob Downs, SEDAC, he/him
- Rob Casey, IRIS, he/him, Seattle, WA (late)
- Joan Damerow, LBNL, Berkeley CA
- Brenda Thomson, she/her, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, Troy, NY [thomsb2@rpi.edu](mailto:thomsb2@rpi.edu)
- Andrea Pörsch / Helmholtz Metadata Collaboration / GFZ German Research Centre for Geosciences, Potsdam Germany

### Agenda

- **Welcome**
  - Orient attendees to tech (Zoom and QiqoChat)
  - Invite attendees to share their name/affiliation/location in the Zoom chat
  - Invite others to take notes in this document (if desired)
  - Slido poll: What types of research artifacts have you cited in your work? (Select all that apply) Literature, data, software, samples, ontologies/vocabularies, learning resources, other, none of the above
- **Community Participation Guidelines Reminder**
  - By participating in this session, you agree to adhere to the ESIP [Community Participation Guidelines](#)
  - Report an Issue: <https://www.integritycounts.ca/org/esip>
- **Update on Research Artifact Citation Cluster's work on CRediT for data and other research artifacts**
- **Next Steps on CRediT for Data**
  - Slido poll: What is the most important factor to you in considering authorship for data?
  - Introduce Breakout Group Activity
    - i. Choose a data type:
      1. Remote sensing (Remote)
      2. In situ (In situ)
      3. Big field campaign (Field)
      4. Data from physical samples (Samples)
      5. Lab data (Lab)
      6. Citizen science data (CitSci)

## 2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

### 7. Simulation data (Sim)

- **Breakout Group Activity**
- **Wrap-up & Closing**
  - Summary of Breakout Group Findings
  - Now What? - [Join the Research Artifact Citation Cluster](#) to help us develop guidelines for developing author lists for datasets!

### Resources for this session (link supplementary docs or presentations here)

- Slido Polls: <https://app.sli.do/event/lw8e0aym>
- Breakout Activity Spreadsheet:  
[https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1NU6anP2-TTvWE\\_CBpGhryC0DJ8BsfbPe9N\\_NgV4DKRbg/edit#gid=365283645](https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1NU6anP2-TTvWE_CBpGhryC0DJ8BsfbPe9N_NgV4DKRbg/edit#gid=365283645)
- Session Slides:  
[https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1t8kX95HYVT2\\_B1f6gUuH4KmHIVNW0maMdZsV5fQYilw/edit#slide=id.p](https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1t8kX95HYVT2_B1f6gUuH4KmHIVNW0maMdZsV5fQYilw/edit#slide=id.p)

### Breakout Group Notes

#### Remote sensing (Remote)

- Which roles seem to be most important for your data type:
  - 
  - 
  - 
  - 
  -
- What other factors are important to include in authorship discussions for this data type?
  - 
  - 
  - 
  -
- Other Notes or Comments?
  - Big difference between NOAA (operational continuity concerns vs NASA innovation and new instruments/data concerns) in several role evaluations.
  -

#### In situ (In situ)

**2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)**

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

- Which roles seem to be most important for your data type:
  - 
  - 
  - 
  - 
  -
- What other factors are important to include in authorship discussions for this data type?
  - 
  - 
  - 
  -
- Other Notes or Comments?
  -

**Big field campaign (Field)**

- Which roles seem to be most important for your data type:
  - Overall design of the campaign (may be the PI)
  - 
  - 
  - 
  - 
  -
- What other factors are important to include in authorship discussions for this data type?
  - 
  - 
  - 
  -
- Other Notes or Comments?
  - Methodology/Experimental design is really important and it wasn't clear which roles captured this best. Also it is important to distinguish from reusing existing methods versus developing new ones

**Data from physical samples (Samples)**

- Which roles seem to be most important for your data type:
  - 
  - 
  - 
  - 
  -
- What other factors are important to include in authorship discussions for this data type?
  -

**2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)**

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

- ☐
- ☐
- ☐
- Other Notes or Comments?
  - ☐

**Lab data (Lab)**

- Which roles seem to be most important for your data type:
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
- What other factors are important to include in authorship discussions for this data type?
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
- Other Notes or Comments?
  - ☐

**Citizen science data (CitSci)**

- Which roles seem to be most important for your data type:
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
- What other factors are important to include in authorship discussions for this data type?
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
  - ☐
- Other Notes or Comments?
  - ☐

**Simulation data (Sim)**

- Which roles seem to be most important for your data type:
  - ☐
  - ☐

## 2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

- 
- 
- 
- What other factors are important to include in authorship discussions for this data type?
  - 
  - 
  - 
  -
- Other Notes or Comments?
  -
- 

### 5 ways to stay involved with ESIP

- Join the conversations on our [ESIPFed Slack Channel](#) and say hello on #general.
- Keep up with the latest from in and around ESIP by signing up for the [ESIP Monday Update](#) or the mailing list of this group.
- Share your feedback, questions, and suggestions with our Twitter community [@esipfed](#) and [#esipfed](#).
- Hop on an [ESIP Telecon](#) that interests you - no need to RSVP!
- At this meeting, check out the Research Showcase Poster and Demo Gallery.

### Feedback

Please take a moment to share your thoughts on this session in Sched by going to the Sched session page linked at the top of this document.

### Paste in Zoom Chat notes that you would like to save here

From Me to Everyone: 03:53 PM

Slido link: <https://app.sli.do/event/lw8e0aym/live/polls>

From Megan Carter (ESIP Staff) to Everyone: 04:00 PM

<https://app.sli.do/event/lw8e0aym/live/polls>

From Megan Carter (ESIP Staff) to Everyone: 04:03 PM

What types of research artifacts have you cited in your work? Answer here:

<https://app.sli.do/event/lw8e0aym/live/polls>

Literature and Data are winning so far!

What types of research artifacts have you cited in your work? Answer here:

<https://app.sli.do/event/lw8e0aym/live/polls>

From Kelsey Breseman (EDGI) to Everyone: 04:06 PM

**2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)**

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

Gunalcheesh! I'm Tlingit living on Duwamish lands

From Kathy Fontaine to Everyone: 04:06 PM

<https://native-land.ca>

Mohican lands here!

From Nancy Hoebelheinrich, ESIP Board member to Everyone: 04:07 PM

Ohlone here!

From Lesley Wyborn to Everyone: 04:09 PM

Ngunawal over here in OZ

From Hannah Collier to Everyone: 04:10 PM

Tsalaguwetiyi land in Knoxville TN!

From Denise Hills to Everyone: 04:11 PM

Moscogee (Creek) Nation here in Tuscaloosa, AL

Pardon - Muscogee

From ruth.duerr3@gmail.com to Everyone: 04:12 PM

Cheyenne, Arapahoe, Nuu-acha-tuvu-pu (Ut), Ochethi Sakowin (neither have all the diacriticals, etc. they should have) here in Westminster

Ur = UTE

From kroser to Everyone: 04:13 PM

Chitimacha here in New Orleans, LA

From Mikki\_USGS to Everyone: 04:15 PM

Englewood, CO => Očhéthi Šakówin

Núu-ágha-tuvu-pu (Ute)

Cheyenne

From ruth.duerr3@gmail.com to Everyone: 04:15 PM

Thanks - have to learn to get all those markings on the terms...

From Kelsey Breseman (EDGI) to Everyone: 04:15 PM

Have you come across <https://github.com/all-contributors/all-contributors> ?

From Kelsey Breseman (EDGI) to Everyone: 04:20 PM

& another way we attempted to give credit broadly:

<https://environmental-enforcement-watch.org/static/4145c0e335a7014537f21e447e79031f/1cfc2/EEW-Authorship.png>

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:22 PM

+1 Kelsey (and Ruth). We need to think of a graph of credit

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 04:27 PM

Where do things like websites and collections of visualizations fit?

From Kathy Fontaine to Everyone: 04:29 PM

Related to Ruth's microcredit point - how low do you go before the credit just makes no more sense? I.e., when you credit something that is nested, that is in turn nested, it doesn't really mean anything anymore..... Is this something to leave to the author(s)?

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 04:29 PM

Thanks!

**2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)**

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

From Chung-Lin Shie to Everyone: 04:29 PM

How about service/tool like Giovanni?

From metamattj to Everyone: 04:29 PM

@seth — for static visualizations, we treat them as first class objects that can be preserved and cited like other files.

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:30 PM

Services are covered in ESIP's software and services guidelines

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 04:30 PM

I'm down with bundling "derived data products" into the "data" bucket.

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:30 PM

+1 metamattj

From kroser to Everyone: 04:31 PM

Wouldn't visualizations be considered a "derived product"? So they are their own thing, but need to acknowledge the lineage to the source data?

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:31 PM

Yes @kroser. That's true of data in general

From metamattj to Everyone: 04:31 PM

@on the microcredits point, this has been discussed in the transitive credit work that Dan Katz and Arfon Smith published on

1. Katz DS, Smith AM (2014) Implementing Transitive Credit with JSON-LD. arXiv:1407.5117 [cs], <http://arxiv.org/abs/1407.5117>

From Kelsey Breseman (EDGI) to Everyone: 04:32 PM

curious how (or if) this framework deals with credit over time, e.g. published revisions, open source code, webpages as they update

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:32 PM

Transitive credit and provenance are closely related

From metamattj to Everyone: 04:33 PM

+1 @mark

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 04:33 PM

I think the main challenge with derived data products is deciding when a derived product is sufficiently different from the parent to regard it as a new thing that warrants its own identity. Sometimes that's obvious, but often it's fuzzy.

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:34 PM

Yes, Seth. We hope to dig in to that a bit today

From rcasey to Everyone: 04:34 PM

@kroser - Visualizations \*can\* be a derived product, generally when they represent an amalgamation of original raw data, which expresses a new concept. I wouldn't say all visualizations are derived product in the sense of being stand-alone. A plot of raw data showing values is mainly a translation of the dataset and doesn't present something new worth considering as its own product.

From Chung-Lin Shie to Everyone: 04:34 PM



**2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)**

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

Thanks Mark!

From John Relph to Everyone: 04:34 PM

Citations are a snapshot in time.

From Don Collins to Everyone: 04:36 PM

Another challenge is defining when a "dataset" is a standalone thing (maybe called a granule) and when a "dataset" is really better cited as a collection of things that may arrive over time.

And ultimately what is the citable object, as a result of this analysis.

From kroze to Everyone: 04:36 PM

@rcasey- ok, I see that point, thanks! I was thinking of a visualization that has more analysis and manipulation applied to the data.

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:36 PM

@don check out the RDA dynamic data citation guidelines

From ruth.duerr3@gmail.com to Everyone: 04:38 PM

brb

From Me to Everyone: 04:38 PM

<https://app.sli.do/event/lw8e0aym/live/polls>

From rcasey to Everyone: 04:39 PM

@kroze - Yeah, tough call. It might boil down to whether that visualization is controlled, curated, and permanent versus being dynamically generated on demand. If you can create a catalog of something unique that you make always available, then that sounds like a derived product.

From ruth.duerr3@gmail.com to Everyone: 04:42 PM

Back

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 04:44 PM

Are these questions assuming a 1:1 correspondence between projects and data products?

Because that's often not the case when you're cobbling together funding from different sources to support data archiving work.

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:45 PM

Field campaign could include a cruise

"Project" == team producing a data set

From ruth.duerr3@gmail.com to Everyone: 04:50 PM

yes

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:50 PM

yes

From Robert Downs to Everyone: 04:51 PM

what is the url for the google sheet?

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:51 PM

[https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1NU6anP2-TTvWE\\_CBpGhryC0DJ8BsfhPe9NNgV4DKRbg/edit#gid=613901446](https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1NU6anP2-TTvWE_CBpGhryC0DJ8BsfhPe9NNgV4DKRbg/edit#gid=613901446)

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 04:51 PM

Will there be cluster members available to answer questions about how a role applies to a particular kind of data?

**2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)**

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:52 PM

@Seth each breakout will have a lead from the cluster

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 04:52 PM

Great! Thanks!

From Yaxing Wei (ORNL) to Everyone: 04:52 PM

What's considered as "Simulation" data? Does it include synthesized/derived data based on remote sensing/in situ/... data?

From metamattj to Everyone: 04:52 PM

or can you define all of the data types please?

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 04:53 PM

We mean modeled data essentially

From Yaxing Wei (ORNL) to Everyone: 04:53 PM

thanks

From metamattj to Everyone: 04:55 PM

thanks

From Chung-Lin Shie to Everyone: 04:56 PM

Simulation data can be pure modeled data or data assimilation reanalysis

From Tyler Christensen - NOAA to Everyone: 05:19 PM

Ruth... our averages are fixed for the remote sensing tab.

From Val Stanley to Everyone: 05:20 PM

Have to head out now - fun session! Thanks everyone

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 05:23 PM

Observation: it was hard to figure out how to apply/interpret the roles for simulations, so we have some roles that were ranked by some people as NA but by others as medium or high. I think that reflects differences in interpretation of how that role applies, and that these should be carefully examined, rather than counting NA values as abstentions in the weighting.

Also, I see one role where everyone ranked it as NA, but the average is showing up as 3... May need to check the spreadsheet code.

From John Relph to Everyone: 05:25 PM

Kathy, we made the same observation in the Big Campaign subgroup

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 05:25 PM

Credit is almost always "it depends"

From metamattj to Everyone: 05:25 PM

and we did too in "In situ"

From Seth McGinnis to Everyone: 05:26 PM

+1 from simulation

From Denise Hills to Everyone: 05:27 PM

Yes, definitely I saw that, Sarah

From Mikki\_USGS to Everyone: 05:27 PM

Agreed - I felt there were quite a few linked roles

From Mark Parsons to Everyone: 05:32 PM

**2021 ESIP Summer Meeting (July 19th-23rd, 2021)**

<https://2021esipsummermeeting.sched.com/>

[Meeting Takeaways Doc](#)

Community Participation Guidelines & Reporting: Click [HERE](#)

Thanks for all the data everyone. Very useful for future cluster discussion.

From Mikki\_USGS to Everyone: 05:32 PM

Thank you for this session! Great discussion.

From Mikki\_USGS to Everyone: 05:32 PM

Thank you for this session! Great discussion.

From Rob Casey to Everyone: 05:32 PM

<https://lists.esipfed.org/mailman/listinfo/esip-citationguidelines>

From deboradrucker to Everyone: 05:33 PM

thanks for the session!

From Lesley Wyborn to Everyone: 05:33 PM

great work madison!

From Megan Carter (ESIP Staff) to Everyone: 05:33 PM

Thanks everyone! Great job, Madison!