VIP 3 — 36. Oturum — Özgün deşifre

06.10.2026 • Dinî Rehberlik ve Manevi Esenlik

Videoyu aç

Reels seçimi için zaman kodlu çalışma metni. Mevcut otomatik konuşma dökümleri, bu videonun kaynak sırası ve süresine göre birleştirilmiştir. Baştan sona dinlenerek doğrulanmış nihai deşifre değildir. Adlar, sayılar, alıntılar ve olumsuz ifadeler dâhil seçilecek her pasajı videodan kontrol edin.

Zaman koduna tıklayarak ilgili ana gidebilirsiniz. “Kontrol” işaretleri düşük güvenli veya parça sınırındaki metinleri gösterir; işaretsiz metin de hata içerebilir. “Metin boşluğu” notları sessizlik iddiası değildir. Düzeltme önerisini zaman koduyla yorum olarak ekleyebilirsiniz.

Metinde bulunan dil: İngilizce. Video süresi: 01:19:00.

Kayıt notu: Kamera dosyaları arasındaki gerçek kayıt boşlukları, arşiv videosunda olmadığı için bu metinle doldurulamaz.

00:00:00 – 00:00:42 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

awareness there does scratch that but feminism is definitely one of the core principles of the feminist movement is to seek autonomous the ability to take care of oneself without the interference of another for women in particular so an individual's ability to act on their own values make free and informed choices and control their own life or body right and you know we know those of us who are familiar with the feminist movement or even just general trends in Western

00:00:42 – 00:01:23 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

society and in some Muslim societies where there is influence of liberal thought or Western thought or Western education there is this desire for women to be unencumbered and to gain empowerment empowerment through the state laws the legal system to be able to make their own choices I don't need the permission of my husband I own my own property I don't have to be forced to take care of my children this is actually a principle that's clearly written for instance in Marxist literature where they called for the

00:01:23 – 00:02:05 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

the state to set up a system where people could have children, but those children, the tarbiyah or the rearing, the child rearing, would be outsourced to the state so that the woman would be able to have her own property and her own freedom. Okay, so you can read about this, and some of my work does talk about this explicitly. But what I'm arguing today, and what you might have seen in the title of the my paper that's in the booklet and in the abstract that's there is I'm going to be talking about autonomy and I just today from the perspective of the old lady right and

00:02:05 – 00:02:46 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

from the feminist perspective the old lady actually presents a really big challenge right so it was I'm talking about feminist discussions kind of like from the 60s until the 90s or 2000s I mean there are different phases of feminism but during this period there were feminists the feminists were generally they embraced youth and the ability to be sort of strong and independent and to go out and do anything that they wanted in the world and the older generation of feminists resented the fact that the younger ones

00:02:46 – 00:03:28 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

didn't understand that the challenge of what that means as you get older so for example Barbara McDonald she's a social activist she was a social worker I think and she was a feminist who was active in the 80s and 90s and there was this huge forum once that was held for it was like a feminist conference kind of like this one I guess and she got up on the podium and she berated a lot of the women who were present because most of them were younger and she felt like they didn't get what the older feminists needed so she said I mean so here I point out from

00:03:28 – 00:04:10 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

my article she was the first to point out that young women's alienation from old women their dread of becoming them they were too afraid to ever be look like you look at the old women and that feminist strong girl you know the one who says I don't need marriage and I don't need kids and I am beautiful and I can do whatever I want and I can be a act like a man if I want I mean this person unfortunately was one of those women right so she said that the young women's alienation from old women their dread of becoming them their revulsion toward old women's bodies is a direct result of a sexist consumer society that that falsely empowers youth and disempowers the old.

00:04:12 – 00:04:54 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

Okay. She told them, Barbara MacDonald, we, the old women among you, we're not your grandmothers, we're not your mothers or your aunts. Why did she say this? She said this because one of the strands of feminism works to, they wish to have value They want to be recognized as individual selves who are not defined by their relationships to others. I'm not important just because I'm a mom. I mean, I actually even read recently a Muslim woman scholar, very well respected.

00:04:54 – 00:05:41 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

I respect her very much, too. But I was very surprised at her wording when she said in an interview, you know, a lot of our young women, they've been brainwashed into thinking the only important role that you can have is a mother. and it's like well of course your first role is being the abd of Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala but brainwashed when the messenger of Allah sallallahu alayhi wa sallam was said Jannah is at the feet of the mother I mean that's not the right word right so but this is coming from that feminist sort of water that we swim in where that kind of language is really normal even in Muslim American speech speech so you know she's saying I'm not here and I'm not important and I don't deserve rights and

00:05:41 – 00:06:25 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

I don't deserve to be looked out for by the state for instance by them taking care of what I need just because or I'm not worthy of respect actually in this particular sentence I'm not worthy of respect just because I'm a grandma or a mother or I'm your aunt they'll be treating me like that right so the desire is to be respected for something other than wisdom such as your contribution to society through work through skill through your career I mean that's like I mean I'm defined by something that is greater than just what is my relationship with my husband or my family which is how the woman and I

00:06:25 – 00:07:06 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

would say even the man in previous to this movements these movements would be recognized for and so and she also said she actually was someone who did not like the idea of women being known just because they're wise as they get older she said actually the reason why it's really great to be an old woman is not not because they gain wisdom, it's because they gain a special power. For the first

time in her life, MacDonald says about the old woman, an old woman can refuse society's meaningless busy work and self betrayals and she can take charge of her own life.

00:07:07 – 00:07:47 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

Such a woman won't do what she is told, she will only do what is important in her own life direction. Right, how much time do I have? Four minutes. Ten minutes? Four minutes. Alright. Bismillah. Okay. So since I have four minutes, I'm just going to ask for five more minutes extra. And the problem actually is that the feminists have to face is that old women, regardless of what you say, they get old and they get weak. and if you haven't held up your duty as a mother as a wife as a daughter as a

00:07:47 – 00:08:29 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

grandmother as an aunt who is going to hold up their duty to you when you get old right so that desire to break down the structure of family and marriage is only going to come back to bite you I wanted to tell you this story this is actually sort of like the linchpin or the main thing that I would like to to circle our talk around today, which is an incident with the Prophet ﷺ when he was sitting with the Sahaba one day and a Bedouin came and he asked for something. He said, oh, ya Rasulullah, give me something. And so the Prophet ﷺ said, what do you want? Actually, the Prophet ﷺ asked him, what do you want? And he said, I want sheep and I want this,

00:08:29 – 00:09:08 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

you know, stuff like livestock, you know, dunya stuff. And so the Prophet ﷺ found a way to meet his request and he left and then he turned to the rest of the Sahaba who were still with him and he says to them sallallahu alayhi wa sallam are you incapable of being like the ajuz the old woman of Bani Israel and they said ya Rasulullah sallallahu alayhi wa sallam who is the ajuz of Bani Israel and he told them the story about a woman of the Bani Israel in the time of Sayyidina Musa Sayyidina Musa was looking for the grave of Sayyidina Yusuf he wanted to go visit the grave of Sayyidina Yusuf

00:09:09 – 00:09:50 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

And he went to the area, but he didn't know exactly where the grave was, and he knew that this woman knew the location. He went to her and he said, can you show me the place where Sayyidina Yusuf is buried? And she said, only if you grant my request. First response. Only if you grant my request. And he said, what's your request? And he said, she said, my request is that I be with you in Jannah. This is a hadith of Ibn Hibban and Ibn Majah, you can look it up. And Sayyidina Musa is like, what? You want to be with me in Jannah? And he hesitates, right? And Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala tells Musa alayhi salam Make dua for this Give her this by making the dua And so he makes the dua

00:09:50 – 00:10:34 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

And the woman, what this tells you about her is She is completely accepting of Raj's she knows I don't have any ability to reach the station of Musa alayhi salam but I am NOT going to be ashamed of that incapacity I'm going to turn to the one who is able to meet my gap or my deficiency directly which is a lost pan with Allah right and she took care of what she wanted in a way that complete, through Allah took care of that incapacity. So I'm trying to compare this concept of wanting empowerment among the feminists and the

00:10:34 – 00:11:19 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

desire and the focus on the Prophet telling you, are you incapable of being incapable? It's really what he's saying here, the opposite of empowerment. And this is not to say that the Prophet meant you should try to be old and weak meaning you should try to be like this and your teeth falling out and you

can't get off the bed and that's not what he's saying the Prophet asked actively Allahumma inni a'udhu bika an uradda ila arda lil umar right protect me Allah from returning to the decrepitude of old age don't let me have the decrepitude the weakness the I'm unable to worship you and I'm senile my senses are impaired please protect me I seek refuge in you from that and the

00:11:19 – 00:12:01 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

The Prophet ﷺ said, اللَّهُمَّ إِنِّي عَوْضُ بِكَ مِنَ الْعَجْزِ وَالْكَسْلِ وَالْبُخْلِ You know, there are many du'as that talk about this. Where the ajiz that is being talked about, if you look at the shuruhr of the hadith, they say it's the human being, this is not an old woman, a young woman, a strong man, a weak man. This is every man and every woman is as essential, is incapable. capable. And so I don't want to be physically incapable, Ya Allah, but what the woman is teaching in that incident, what the Prophet ﷺ is reminding us with the ajuz is,

00:12:02 – 00:12:45 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

la hawla wa la quwwata illa billah, right? Shall I not tell you about a word among the treasures of paradise? They said, Ya Rasulullah, what is it? Rasulullah ﷺ, and he said, la hawla wa la quwata illa billah no strength, no ability except through Allah so I had a verse here that I just I think we can close with inshallah and it is that Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala is he who created anyways you can read the verse right, bismillah and I had a word also from Sheikh Saeed Nursi where he reminded us Thus, O human being, if you believe in God alone and become his servant alone,

00:12:45 – 00:13:27 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

you will attain a distinguished station above all creatures. But if you disdain servitude and ignore it, you will become a wretched slave before helpless creatures. So it's our choice, really, to want to turn to Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala and ask for his help in everything that we do and be constantly spiritually aware of our ids both physically and internally or we can be in ignorant or ignoring his presence and try to do things ourselves

00:13:27 – 00:14:09 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

and see who wins what's all the love when I say you know I'm sorry thank you Thank you very much. If there is, it might be triggering, so if it is a difficult topic, you can walk out. Is that fine? It's a good one. The idea of ageing might be difficult, right? Yeah, okay. Okay. So, just, I mean, why ageing? So, one thing is, really, the Qur'an pays so much attention to the vulnerable community, right?

00:14:09 – 00:14:53 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

People who are vulnerable. I mean, when we say vulnerable in the context of the Qur'an, we see the widows, right, the orphans, the slaves, that kind of in the context of the Prophet's time, I mean, we see this is a very important topic in the world of the Qur'an. And the same thing in the Risale-e-Nurtu actually, so Ustad Bediuzzaman Said Nursi, he dedicates a significant portion of his work to the vulnerable communities. Although even part of Dr. Khan's presentation, maybe there is so much emphasis on autonomy,

00:14:54 – 00:15:35 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

kind of independence, because maybe one of the attributes of our age is really to emphasize our autonomy but when you are vulnerable weakness becomes the reality of life too and that's why in the Risale-i Nur there is a treatise, a Risale on the sick there is one on the elderly those who are old I have been teaching in a prison context so the university has a program for the prison isn't community, so I go and teach there. And interestingly, Nur actually writes about the inmates.

00:15:36 – 00:16:19 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

And he teaches, or he encourages his followers not to ignore this community, the inmate community. Of course, poverty is also part of it, right? So again, those who are into poverty, they're also vulnerable. And this is also part of the world of the Risale-i Nur. So just, I mean, the idea is that to make this connection, The Qur'an pays attention to the vulnerable community, and we see this is part of the world of the Risale-i-Nur, the elderly, the sick, right? And certain anxieties about our time, right? And that's why I'm interested in this topic.

00:16:19 – 00:17:02 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

But we will focus on, just to be specific, we will focus on the elderly, his treatise on the elderly. I mean, since the topic of the focus of the symposium is global crises, right? And I don't know if you have ever checked some of the studies, you know, writings, statistics about aging the dynamics of the aging community in the world and first the numbers increasing just to give you for example like few numbers right by 2015

00:17:03 – 00:17:43 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

the global population of people age 60 and older is expected to double 60 and older, right? By 2050, right? So it will be, it will double, right? And then 2018, people aged 65 and over will outnumber children under 18. So basically the majority of people will be older people, right? Those who are over 60 by 2018. So this is like, and the question is that who will take care of these people, right? So I mean, so this is a real, if, huh? Robots, yes, robots, yes, maybe AI.

00:17:44 – 00:18:33 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

And in Japan, for example, some of the countries, they already actually, they experienced the crisis. In countries like Japan and Monaco, the people who are age over 60, they make 30% of the country's population now. So imagine one-third of the population of the country, they're over 60. And then the question is, creates new challenges, really, how do we address the question of aging and also caregiving, right? And then, I mean, my point is that it's really, it's just, it's kind of an impressive vision

00:18:33 – 00:19:13 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

that we see in the Risaleh in Nursi dedicates just one treatise, one Risaleh to the aging community. And actually, I tried to do research. To my knowledge, there is no any Risaleh in a similar tone in Islamic theology. So if anyone has really come across anything, let me know if there's any treatise, Risaleh specifically. And we will go over kind of the reason and it's why it kind of is an authentic work, right? And then there are also a few problems that are associated with kind of age and community.

00:19:14 – 00:19:58 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

I mean, one thing is we know that the expanded age, right? Kind of the lifespan has extended. People, they live longer, right? I don't know what is the age where people, they say, I am old, right? I mean, certainly it's changed, right? In Turkish, there is, even I studied literature in Turkish there is a saying attributed to one of the the poets it says it says in Turkish yash otuzbes yolun yarası so my age is 35 kind of this is I am in the middle of the way meaning kind of I have 35 years left right kind of the average but now in it changed right there's people you know we call what we call

00:19:58 – 00:20:39 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

centennials the numbers increasing actually global yes I see yes yes you didn't make it so this is not even this is not okay so no one should recite it right so but this is the the reality right so people they

they live you know until 90s late 90s right hundred but this lifespan also creates issues right people I mean I know I think I have a few people in my circle people who have

00:20:39 – 00:21:22 | **İngilizce**

severe dementia right Alzheimer's you know people so then the question is that now we have more older people what with more problems I mean you can say well maybe the quality of life has increased but then you have problems too and then And now how do we address? I think, you know, you mentioned there are a few countries that they have robots basically to entertain the elderly, kind of to support. One was, I mean, if you're interested, one is called, I think in Japan, like a dozen years ago, they had a robot called Paro. So it's like a, what's called, it's like a baby seal. And then you give it to the elderly, so they hug it and to give them some emotional support, right?

00:21:22 – 00:22:05 | **İngilizce**

I know during COVID, especially one of the major issue people, of course, they were dying alone, right? And one company actually formed a robot where the robot would have, you know, people. Again, the major issue is that when people, they die, they want to have actually someone next to them to hold their hands. And even now, actually, in America, I know it's a big issue. I know from the physician community, people, they die alone, right? And then they had this robot where the robot would hold the elderly's hands, right? So that kind of act is to have part of it, right? So it's not, you know, it's nothing similar to holding a human hand.

00:22:06 – 00:22:48 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So you have these issues as a reality. Loneliness is an issue, again, globally. I think now even in Turkey, I hear more people saying, you know, I am alone, I am by myself, right? There are, again, lots of studies. And in countries there is actually certain terms that are associated with lonely death. In Japan the term is called Kodokushi. So actually it refers to people who die but then they will not be discovered for weeks, for months, right? Up to six months, if not years.

00:22:48 – 00:23:30 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

years, you can check it, there are studies, newspaper pieces, it's called Kodokushi in Japan. This term means lonely death because there is 5% of the Japanese population, those who die, they die in this context. They die alone by themselves and they are not discovered for a long time, 5%. A similar concept actually used in South Korea's context called Godaksa, and again the implication, people, it refers to those who die alone. Another issue, problem with old age that's relevant to our discussion is medical assisted dying.

00:23:30 – 00:24:11 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So, I mean, this is a nicer term. It used to be called physician assisted suicide. So, I know in America there are a dozen states who passed laws now they legalized assisted suicide meaning people for various reasons they can opt to take their life right so it's a nice way of killing yourself instead of going to jump off a cliff right and Canada actually there are for example in Canada those in 2024 this is actually online available part of the official health Canadian institution more than 20

00:24:11 – 00:24:53 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

people they applied for physical as medical assisted dying meaning they want to take their life and only 16,000 application was accepted so meaning that you have to be a qualified to do it there are certain criteria you have to be qualified to be killed but only limit that they have some criteria but the The point is that it's getting common, more countries, they pass the laws, and the question how do we

address it, right? How many minutes do I have to start? Another five. Five? Thank you. This is very generous. All right. So these are some of the questions, right?

00:24:53 – 00:25:39 | **İngilizce**

So that at least Muslims first, they need to be part of the conversation, and specifically Specifically, I think the work of Ishtar Bedi Zaman is very relevant for these questions. And maybe one of the terms, the concept that we can highlight is really the concept of hope, right? Because when people in the state of despair, right, when they think there is no solution for their problems, then they opt for, you know, again, whether medical assistance. And then when you, medical assistance dying, when you look at the reasonings, One is, one of the reasons that people, they want to take their life, right, is that they think they don't have a meaningful contribution to life.

00:25:40 – 00:26:21 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So meaning life is not meaningful anymore, right? And this is one of them, loneliness is another of them. like people they feel just lonely and and autonomy independence you know lots of basically concerns anxieties about let's say you start not to drive especially in places like America it's really public transportation is terrible unlike Europe and you are dependent and then losing your independence is is it's a big problem. And then for Ustad Nursi, so why why really kind of this his work

00:26:21 – 00:27:06 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

needs to be part of the conversation. One thing is he wrote in a context that life was very difficult for him. So he's, I mean if you think of, this is in the flash Islam Alar, he wrote in exile in Barla, most of it, and then he was around 60 right he was lonely he was isolated he was by himself he didn't have you know he was not married he didn't have children right basically he it was not permissible even for him to to meet people like even his students initially so he meant it's a very difficult time and then he he brings really his he often so it's called each each section is called Raja means hope and then he

00:27:06 – 00:27:55 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

He makes his life story as a departure point to address certain issues and problems, right? So we'll give a few examples, then I conclude. One thing is he begins actually with, in the introduction, he begins with a verse from Surah Maryam. Surah Maryam, the 19th chapter of the Qur'an. This is actually the chapter when the name of Allah SWT, Ar-Rahman, is mentioned the most. you know, outside of, you know, the Bismillah ar-Rahman ar-Rahim in the beginning of each chapter. This is the chapter that's mentioned the most. And it kind of, he begins with the story of Zakaria alayhi salam, right? So Zakaria alayhi salam refers to his old age, that how kind of his bones weakened, his hair grayed, right?

00:27:56 – 00:28:36 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So he begins with this. But in this context, the surah is also full of hope, right? Because you have the miraculous story of Sayyidina Isa, the virgin birth. You have also in old age, the Qur'an is giving the news of Yahya. And both his wife and him, they actually question when the angel approaches them, says like, how is this possible? And the Qur'an actually refers to his own creation, that if you doubt anything about this miracle, look at your own creation.

00:28:37 – 00:29:18 | **İngilizce**

And Bediüzzaman is also actually frequently, right, repeatedly, I mean, he makes references to mercy of Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala in nature, right? That if you look at the nature, you get the creation, you see Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala's mercy and rahmah is prevalent all over the world, right? So then

there is no reason to despair. And then part of his teaching, again, because he's an elderly and he's addressing the elderly, it makes the voice very authentic. It's a living voice. It's not only a preaching voice.

00:29:18 – 00:30:00 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

It's a living voice. And he asked them to make their aging, Old age as a spiritual opportunity to be closer to Allah SWT. So meaning, yes, it is painful, it is difficult, but it's not meaningless. So despair often happens, actually, you know, scholars mention, when you see your suffering meaningless. If you find your suffering meaningless, then it's not in vain, right? So it can be a spiritual occasion. So I will finish with the last story, and then we'll conclude, right? Bismillah. So when, try to see what's time.

00:30:00 – 00:30:43 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So after his, you know, he would remember he was captivated, right, during World War I, and then he returned to Istanbul. So when he saw kind of the direction of the new modern Turkey, he was disappointed, and he decides to go to leave for his hometown, Zivan. So he goes to the castle and he sees kind of the city is destroyed by the Armenians and all of his friends. They left, they died. It's a very, very painful, difficult scene, right? And then all of a sudden he pays attention to a tree, like a tree.

00:30:44 – 00:31:26 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

he makes the tree speak in his work he says look at us too the tree he says look at us too again imagine your relatives are gone the city is gone his madrasa is gone his students are gone and actually he makes a reference to the Quranic verse and says don't look at only the destruction of humans or the things that are constructed by humans and destructed by them, why don't you pay attention to this tree as the creation of Allah that is still standing and it becomes the source of hope for him.

00:31:26 – 00:32:08 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

Thank you very much. Thank you very much. We will come to our final panelists. Before we allow her to take the stage, as it were, if I could make two requests to the audience. One, if people want to move a little bit further along so that new people that come in may be able to do so. And also, we're in a very small room, so I would ask you to not have side conversations we can all hear because of the smallness of the room.

00:32:09 – 00:32:39 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

And it disturbs the speaker. If anybody wants to sort of get up and move, and let them do so now. Otherwise, we are very happy to have our final speaker, Dr. Toubanour, who will give her presentation, followed by a Q&A. Thank you. I don't need a mic. I think I'm fine. Okay, as long as you have the section for the recording. Okay, yeah. Can I put that on? If you want. Yes, it works.

00:32:39–00:32:55 *[Metin boşluğu: bu aralık için döküm bulunmuyor. Videodan kontrol edin.]*

00:32:55 – 00:33:36 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

I would like to especially greet my father and my mother who are present here as well, although they don't speak any English, which will make it even harder for me to make this presentation in front of them. So the topic of this symposium is the theme is Qur'anic solutions to global crises. So I'm not going to talk about aging today. We are going to rather talk about the self. We are going to look into the human being, inshallah. I think in this context, it is important to begin by recognizing that many of the

00:33:36 – 00:34:18 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

problems we face in the world today are in one way or another created or intensified by human beings. Therefore, before we can actually properly understand the problems themselves, we first need to understand the human being. How we think, how we behave, how we contribute to the problems that we face. Once we have a clearer understanding of this, we can then look at some of the key elements that contribute to these global problems. Only after identifying and understanding their underlying causes can we begin to explore

00:34:18 – 00:35:00 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

meaningful solutions. With this in mind, I would like to briefly introduce the perspectives of Imam Said Nursi and David Bohm on the human being and the nature of the self. In particular, I would like to look at how they approach the question of the self and, in Bohm's case, how he explores this through the nature of thought and the thought process. This provides an important starting point for considering how the Quranic perspective might offer solutions to some of the crises we experience today. Although Nursi and Boom

00:35:00 – 00:35:41 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

come from very different intellectual and theological frameworks and backgrounds, I think they are pointing towards a remarkably similar fundamental problem. We do not sufficiently understand the structure through which we experience ourselves and the world boom for example was deeply interested in the way thought memory emotion and body and the body operate together as a kind of mechanism for him thought is not simply something we consciously use as a

00:35:41 – 00:36:26 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

neutral tool it is rather why because it works like a computer program and most of the time it is you know done unconsciously but the problem is that it does not know that it's unconscious it thinks that it is conscious but most of the time thought operates unconsciously and this reminds me of imam ali radiallahu and saying he's believed to have said people are asleep, only when they die they wake. One of Bohm's central observations, sorry I'm not here yet, one of Bohm's central observations is that thought tends to

00:36:26 – 00:37:06 | **İngilizce**

divide reality, and this is very important. Thought, he says, tends to divide reality. It creates distinctions, categories, and boundaries, and then forgets about those, that these divisions were produced by thought himself, and in And after that, we begin to experience the fragments as if they were independent realities. And this can become self-perpetuating. Why? Because thought produces a problem, and then thought attempts to solve the problem, often producing further problems while doing that in the process.

00:37:06 – 00:37:49 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So for Boum, part of the difficulty lies not simply in the problem that we see around us, in the problems that we see around us, but in the structure of the human mechanism that is producing and perceiving those problems. This creates an interesting point of contact with Imam Nursi. Nursi speaks speaks about the ane becoming thick through ownership and attribution. Through ownership and attribution. Boom speaks about thought creating divisions and then becoming caught within the structure that itself has produced.

00:37:50 – 00:38:30 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

The language is different. The philosophical and theological frameworks are different. but both invite us to look one level deeper than the immediate problem itself. So I ask, could some of these problems be connected to the way human beings understand or misunderstand themselves? Perhaps the question is not only how do we solve this particular problem, Perhaps we should ask, what is it within the human being that continually produces these problems?

00:38:31 – 00:39:15 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

And this is the question that I would like us to explore. So why is it then that we don't realize that thought is the source of the problem? Why is it that we don't realize that? Bohm helps explain why this process is difficult to notice. because it's a very quick process it takes seconds and this is also one of the reasons we most of the time don't really notice it he defines thought as the response of memory in any form which has meaning so he makes a difference between thought and thinking active thinking he said thought is just the

00:39:15 – 00:39:55 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

accumulation of whatever we have in the memory in in our subconscious that has accumulated over the years that we have taught by our parents, by our environment, by our teachers in school and so on and so forth. They have all been stored in our memories and our subconscious and thought actually is only rearranging whatever is in the memory and bringing it on the table and we think we have come up with something new whereas we haven't actually. Whereas thinking he he says, coupled with intelligence, actually is something active. So you don't go back

00:39:55 – 00:40:36 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

to the memory, you look at the problem in a detached way, you don't attach yourself in a detached way, and you try to find a solution to the problem without making it your own basically but we'll come to that so this includes remembered so this includes remembered knowledge images assumptions and the emotional and bodily responses associated with them this is all of this is coupled with thought in his account these operate as an interconnected system an idea can

00:40:36 – 00:41:17 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

provoke and this is important an idea can provoke fear and physical tension while that tension can reinforce the idea again and then it becomes a vicious cycle much of this happens automatically and I want to give an example for this a very simple example consider I send a message to my friend Aisha and receive no reply from her now previous previous experiences of rejection that I had in the past may give the silence of her a particular meaning so I immediately say I do not matter to Aisha okay so this is the I do not matter to

00:41:17 – 00:41:56 | **İngilizce**

Aisha actually is an assumption of mine but what follows after that straightaway is hurt and bodily tension arises so immediately it turns into an emotional reaction making that interpretation feel like an obvious fact I then withdraw or or respond coldly to Aisha when I meet her. And Aisha, confused of this behavior, of my behavior, becomes more distant, right? The resulting distance then appears to me to confirm my original belief of her.

00:41:57 – 00:42:37 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

Do you see how the circle is kind of turning into a vicious cycle? My unanswered message was actually real, but its meaning was initially uncertain. It needed to be analyzed. My thoughts supplied

an interpretation, helped produce an emotional reaction, and prompted behavior that contributed to the very distance which I feared all along. yet I still may experience the whole difficulty as something Aisha has done. So it's not my fault.

00:42:38 – 00:43:21 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

Any reasoning that comes after that can then become a search for evidence of rejection, leaving the original assumption, I do not matter to Aisha, completely unexamined. Bohm's invitation is to become aware of thought while it is operating so this is what he suggests become aware of your thought while it is still operating to notice how memory interpretation feeling and action shape what we experience as reality he gives an example in his book wholeness

00:43:21 – 00:44:12 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

and the Implicit Order, David Bohm, which I found quite interesting. He says, he recounts a gathering at Princeton where Einstein and his associates remained on one side of the of the room and Bo and his associates remained on the other side of the room and he presents this as an example of how firmly held judgment because they couldn't agree on a physical like on a theory of physics right so he says this is a perfect example of how firmly held judgments can obstruct communication even between people capable of extraordinary ordinary reasoning, right? So what does that tell us? It tells us that the

00:44:12 – 00:44:54 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

deeper question is rather ontological. By ontology I mean our understanding of what exists on the one hand and what kind of being we are on the other hand. The question is not only what should I do, it is also what am I taking myself to to be when I act as I act. So where do I come from actually as a human being? So here we have the assumption again that we were just talking about. What do I assume myself to be ontologically when I approach a problem? Am I an independent owner facing a world of things available for my purpose?

00:44:54 – 00:45:38 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

Or am I a dependent being whose life and capacities are received and whose use of them carries responsibility. To give a concrete example from politics, it would be the relationship between authority and responsibility. A prime minister's powers, for instance, are conferred through public institutions. They depend on the work, cooperations and trust of others. The office is held temporarily and carries obligations towards the people affected by its decisions. Now, if the Prime Minister were to exercise this authority

00:45:38 – 00:46:18 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

as though it permits personal exemption from shared obligations, in other words, claims ownership over that authority, it would be misconduct. An entrusted power is then treated as a personal privilege. village. And the same is with us and creation and what Allah has entrusted upon us. In the reading developed here from Nursi, the disorder begins, and this is important because it's the ontological statement of Bediüzzaman Said Nursi, the disorder begins when we live the first way and we actually

00:46:18 – 00:47:03 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

exist the second way. Our assumed status no longer corresponds, our assumed status, the assumption of what our status is no longer corresponds to our condition, the way how we have been created basically. Nursi explains this through the concept of the human eye. In the thirtieth word Imam Nursi approaches the relationship between the human being, the universe and God through a

relatively simply but profound idea. Very briefly the ana can be understood as a kind of point of reference within the human being it's it's not the self the human idea that he

00:47:03 – 00:47:42 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

talks about is not the whole self it's just the point of reference for us it allows us to recognize and measure certain realities for example I experience my own limited power and through this limitation I can begin to understand divine power Buddha I experience love for example and through through my own limited capacity to love, I can begin to understand something about divine love. But there is a crucial condition. When the human being begins to treat the ana, the ana, as something that truly belongs to itself,

00:47:44 – 00:48:25 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

and he calls that mana'i ismi, when it develops a strong sense of ownership over its existence, its qualities, its thoughts, and its experiences, the ana becomes, as we said before, in Nursi's language, thickened. And as it becomes thicker, it starts to create problems, like similar to what David Bohm was referring to about the thought system. So remember Fir'aun, for example, who went so far as to claim divinity, asserting that he would be able to give life and take life. on the other hand when a person recognizes

00:48:25 – 00:49:10 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

that the qualities they experience are not ultimately their own when the sense of ownership becomes thinner the sense of ownership becomes thinner then the ana itself also becomes thinner that means what does it mean if the ana becomes thinner it is we receive truth because we are manifesting Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala's names and attributes on ourselves right so we receive truth and the truth that we receive if the anna is thin it just flows through us it just flows through us and we can see it in our actions that means the mind becomes sharper there is wisdom this is what we call wisdom right but if the anna is thick what happens

00:49:10 – 00:49:53 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

is we dye the truth with our own colors it becomes distorted so paradoxically this does not mean that the human being loses the self. Rather the self becomes a means of understanding something beyond itself when the anna becomes thinner. So in very simple terms Nursi is presenting the anna as a kind of measuring instrument and through the limited human self we can come to recognize realities that are unlimited. Now Imam Nursi does not leave this at the level of the individual. He He distributes individual eyeness being reinforced collectively.

00:49:54 – 00:50:36 | **İngilizce**

He also says that in its misoriented state, whatever the eye encounters, as we said before, is dyed with its own colors. The same pattern can affect desire, power, and reason. And in Isharat al-I'jaz, Imam Nursi talks about desire, power, and reason, in the context of when he's doing the Tafsir of Surah Fatiha and when he's explaining the idea of Sirat al-Mustaqim. What is Sirat al-Mustaqim? What does it mean? So he's providing a framework for Sirat al-Mustaqim there. So the same pattern that we talked

00:50:36 – 00:51:19 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

about, the ana, can affect desire, power, and reason. Desire becomes, yes, two minutes, okay. Desire becomes a demand for more. Power becomes the need to control. reason supplies arguments for what self-interest already wants. Yeah? So, now I would like to quickly talk also about what is

independence, why is independence a misreading? Yeah? Why is independence a misreading? Because dependence itself is not an emergency exit. We are truly dependent, and we really have to understand that.

00:51:19 – 00:52:01 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

It's not an emergency exit. It is not something that begins only when our plans fail, for example, right? Even our next breath depends on conditions we did not originate and cannot secure by our own will. And we have to remind ourselves of this constantly. Now, Imam Nursi talks about the holo movement in his book. and he talks about apparently static beings and when he says that he says apparently stable forms belong within an ongoing movement an ongoing movement which he calls the hollow movement in his account what appears

00:52:01 – 00:52:43 | **İngilizce**

as a distinct thing that we see outside in front of our eyes unfolds from a deeper hole he says so nothing really is static as we think it is its apparent separateness does not make it independently existent. And Imam Nursi also makes a similar account to this, where he says that material, that merely material, you know, that we see outside, anything that we see outside actually, is a field of signs. And there are signs where Allah's names are constantly reflected on them. So nothing is static. Everything is actually also in a constant coming and going, coming and going.

00:52:43 – 00:53:28 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

so there is a flow as well so the dependence and independence that we're talking about and we talked about the previous speakers talked about independence isn't it so what it is actually is that we when we claim independence we put ourselves outside of the whole system of dependent beings that are manifesting Allah's names and attributes we put ourselves outside them and we look at them from almost like from as an external being right and then we say you know we have ownership over those but we forget that we ourselves are also part of this system we are also created and we are also within that same

00:53:28 – 00:54:08 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

sort of system and pattern. There is the wholeness, there is Tauhid, and there is, you know, all the creation that flows on them, including human beings. We are also transient, we are also here and we believe this place about, like anything else as well. Yes, I'm just finishing here now, just one last, yes, so because this is I think also very important. Now, because now I'm going to talk about recovery, and we have to talk about recovery so that we can actually finish this thing off. Recovery requires more than telling ourselves to be less selfish.

00:54:09 – 00:54:50 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

Bohm suggests an important practice of, he calls it suspension. He says it invites us to hold an assumption, hold an assumption before attention without immediately defending it or suppressing it right so we have an idea we put it on the table it's an assumption it's a theory at that stage right so people may object to it people may find something better people may say anything to it right if I own it I will defend it with all my might right but if I don't own it if I know my place in creation then anyone can contribute and we can come to a better solution we can

00:54:50 – 00:55:31 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

can reach a better solution, basically. Imam Nursi, on the other hand, uses four prophetic ways for this. He talks about ajz, faqr, shafqa, and tafakkur. And these are very important, actually, all of them.

But what I want to say, especially about ajz and faqr, is he talks about acknowledgment. And I want to underline that word, acknowledgment. He doesn't say, let's understand or realize that we are ajz, we have ajz and we are faqr beings, needy beings, we have poverty, no he says we need to acknowledge that there is ajz in us and that we are populist the acknowledgement is important

00:55:31 – 00:56:11 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

and in terms of like tafakkur I think it's, tafakkur is to be able to read beyond what we are used to you know, but I think Bohm's idea of holding the assumption before we make a decision is very important as a feeding point to the idea of tafakkur, to implement that in our understanding of tafakkur as well, inshallah. Wallahu'alem, thank you very much for your patience. I would love to give all the speakers much more time, but we're already running late.

00:56:13 – 00:56:53 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So I'm going to start the Q&A session here, but in a slightly different format, in the sense that we've had three speakers, they've all come a very long way, so I'm actually going to take one round of questions to begin with. we'll see if we have any time after that but i will ask in order of the panelists first okay so do we have any questions first for dr fariha okay so please and if i could ask you to keep your your questions brief no comments we just don't have time it's to do with all the people and so it's probably for first and second speakers both of them

00:56:55 – 00:57:41 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

I'm just wondering whether there is a distinction between the physical disability or reduced ability I should say of older people and the society's attitude to older people. So what I'm trying to say is that the older people as far as I'm concerned are not in in a sense, less disabled, unless they have an organic illness such as dementia, than the rest of the society. The mental health situation of younger people, for example, the lost, apparently, walking and, you know, apparently powerful people, but their abs

00:57:41 – 00:58:24 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

is hidden, in a sense. That's just the external ability to move around. So I'm just wondering distinction between what the ads that is affecting all of us, we don't know if our next breath is going to come, and the ads that is, in a sense, not supported by society, that doesn't actually bring about their needs. It could happen to people with disabilities who are young. So why making distinctions between older people and people with disabilities? so I is a universal thing but all the people are being played as seen as a

00:58:24 – 00:59:04 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

burden so are they making a distinction between lack of societies you know provision and labeling all the people or is it you know add something that is it's universal let's see do we have a question for dr sally okay and we have a question for then we will begin with this question which i think was directed to actually both of the speakers and if we have you can start please Not here? That's up to you. Yeah, that's up to you. We're going to .

00:59:05 – 00:59:52 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So thank you, Dr. for your question. The question was, is there a distinction, or am I using the image of the old lady as a particular kind of representation of Arabs? And do those who have disabilities not count as a similar type of symbol? Absolutely true. They do count as that kind of a symbol. I use the old lady in particular because I saw the Prophet ﷺ use the ajuz as an example and why would he

address a group of men, his companion sitting in front of him and say, can't you be like her? So in what sense was he

00:59:52 – 01:00:38 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

saying to be like that old woman I wanted to sort of get at that and think through that example and through that symbol for how we today think about the old person the old woman the incapacitated person because I think there's a few different reasons why I personally I'm actually very interested in thinking about aging and the elderly as a way to grapple with how to present an Islamic alternative to feminism. I'm fascinated with that because just, you know, it breaks down any kind of expectation of what you think you can

01:00:38 – 01:01:20 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

actually accomplish. As someone, let's say there's a feminist who believes that she She really doesn't need family relationships. She really doesn't need to honor her parents, her husband, her children, society's expectations of her. And we don't really, I mean, myself, the goal, for instance, for the Silla Initiative, is not to uphold social expectations that are no longer fitting. You know, like if things have changed and we need to examine the kinds of expectations we have of women of

01:01:20 – 01:02:05 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

families there is room within the Sharia to to be flexible so it's not about blindly upholding a kind of kind of our but you know one of the things that I was thinking about when dr. to manure was speaking just now and you were talking about um all of us are part of a dependent system and we have a tendency not to recognize that we see ourselves as apart from the rest of what we see i think that's it's a really dangerous and really hopeless kind it leads to hopelessness i think that's what leads to hopelessness is because you know if you imagine you can carry yourself alone uh could you turn off the phone

01:02:05 – 01:02:46 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

please in the back yeah so you know I and when I was thinking about your example of the dependent system one of the things I don't think any of us talked about today was the role of the Sharia right the role of the hukum of Allah swt not just reflecting on his creation but what is the what is the then like the thing that it must lead to once you see Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala present and when you see yourself as part of that creation you must then plug yourself in to as much as possible

01:02:46 – 01:03:26 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

the system sorry I'm like really small and I can't see you so you know you have to plug yourself into the system that will make it work right that dependent system that we're all a part of How is it going to work? It works if you do what Allah has told you to do. And that's another aspect of liberal thought, of the quest for autonomy that I wasn't able to get to. But it's something that we're really allergic to as modern people, as contemporary people. And I think that it's really unfortunate because we're suffering in a lot of different ways. in particular when we look at that the old woman is just a symbol of how that

01:03:26 – 01:04:10 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

manifests today today but there are many many symbols some of them you mentioned dr turner and um and uh you know each of us in our lives will come to a place where we find that dependence manifested and dr said don't think of it as just an emergency exit like that was your state the entire time and you just now happen to become aware of it so thank you um did you want to come back on

this question It was posed to both of you. If there's a distinction, perhaps, Dr. Turner, would you like to repeat very succinctly? I'm thinking in terms of the most arges person is the one who doesn't think that he's arges.

01:04:11 – 01:04:53 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

And yet we are focusing on the older person, which is a society's fault, not the actual act, because experientially that person may be of huge value. Yeah, I mean, so meaning the emotional part of this course, at least also the disabilities, right, kind of those who have severe disabilities. But even in this context, right, I think just Dr. Khan mentioned Sharia, right, so I mean

01:04:53 – 01:05:36 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

I mean, from the beginning, Sharia always integrated them actually into, I mean, it was, I mean, when you look at the life of the Prophet, peace be upon him, you know, some of the, you know, examples when he would designate his successor, so that they were always integrated part of the larger society, even whether they had, like, mental disabilities or physical disabilities, the idea is that, so the physical part were always integrated, especially if you think of the fiqh, how they were discussed, So, there was kind of always part of the larger picture. I think this is one part of it. In both cases, whether those who have really, you know, kind of were left ajiz by the society,

01:05:37 – 01:06:23 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

and then also the idea of kind of recognizing, acknowledging your ajiz, your weaknesses. In both of them, the idea is to see them in a meaningful way, to make it as an occasion for your spiritual growth I think I see this is kind of in both cases missing in the society that kind of is almost not seen as a meaningful I mean actually I have you know my one of my books that I had I wrote on the problem of evil and suffering so I have section on the disability and one of and again one of the the issue that I see that also kind of in the literature about disability not to kind of the society also should not should not pity us that meaning we

01:06:23 – 01:07:03 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

don't need the compassion of the society which I also see this as an extreme to you I mean yes so society leaves you in a difficult situation like your disability is also increased with the problems in the society but also I think this this perception is a problem right because you know I am this is I am a I'm a person with a disability but I don't need your help and kind of I see this also as an extreme point too. And the other thing is I think just in the literature, it's like generally one of the

01:07:03 – 01:07:44 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

points that we can drive from the Risale-e-Nur, right, if we see that kind of weakness whether you know physical weakness or just kind of emotionally not a emotionally acknowledging our weakness to think that usually the weakness or suffering can bring the best out of people so it can change our perception right so the suffering sickness poverty because if you really if you think of who are the celebrated people in terms of character just think for a moment like let's say the most generous the kind right the one who always helps right I mean the one

01:07:44 – 01:08:26 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

who is caring the one who is loving well in what context actually you bring kind of you exercise this these attributes when when you have actually I just when you have people who are weak right so they think it will actually bring the best out of people and now I see that more more more studies one one thing that actually recently I was walking and I was listening to a science podcast and it was about the

science podcast was about you know when people they let's say if you eat together if you eat together and then usually when you eat so your blood sugar spikes

01:08:26 – 01:09:20 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

right and apparently when you eat together it kind of it comes to the usual level very quickly vis-a-vis when you eat by yourself. So now if you think of, again, in the context of aging, loneliness, I mean, it reminds me basically kind of the Prophet's emphasis on kind of community, engaging, you know, don't eat by yourself. So there are not many implications. I want to leave the mic because... We have time for one more question or we can close. We're actually at time, but because we started late if we have one more question this question is for professor you know you mentioned

01:09:20 – 01:10:00 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

the our our tendency to categorize the world and divide it and then fix those divisions and then begin to see them as realities but since the time of aristotle it has been recognized that human reasoning is based on certain categories and if you really think about it categories ultimately are about questions and that's how aristotle actually generates so if there's a thing i ask what is it that's one category when is it how is it and then you get the 10 categories

01:10:01 – 01:10:43 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

This thing gets, it influences the entire tradition, including the works on Montauk that worked on, the most important of which is . And it gets into Immanuel Kant, and I think that it is the categories of Immanuel Kant and his idea that the Schemata frame how we see the world, and I think this is where the physicist's bones come from. My question to you is, if this is an inescapable human condition, that it's actually built into the very capacity to think, because it's like what Kant calls the conditions of possibility for understanding,

01:10:44 – 01:11:24 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

how can we dislodge this? How can you really avoid it? It's inevitable. Isn't it kind of wishful thinking to think that you can break this? Thank you very much. It's a good question. So, and it is correct that you say that human beings, you know, it's the way how we think. We categorize, as you said. And this is, you know, how we live our lives. So by the time we actually come to this world and we're born, we fall into, you know, it reminds me of this verse,

01:11:25 – 01:12:07 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِيمِ إِنَّا لِلَّهِ وَإِنَّا إِلَيْهِ رَاجِعُونَ We come from Allah and then we return to Him. رَاجِعُونَ actually is mentioned many times in the Qur'an. And a lot of times we think that, you know, even this verse also is always used in the context of death, right? somebody dies and we say and raja is also most mostly thought about in terms of uh you know we we will meet our lord when after we die but the concept that uh i think we use as well as the other scholars as well have tried to emphasize is um becoming this world we fall into a world of

01:12:07 – 01:12:48 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

multiplicity and it is important to not drown in this world of multiplicity to be able to find a way back to tawhid um so and in a way so what we're saying is because this is exactly you know and put in another way maybe how do we find our way back to tawhid within this this world of multiplicity because this is how our mind works we always divide we always categorize we always look at thinking structures so i think what is what i what i've tried to emphasize is it's inevitable it inevitable as you said to think in those terms but the the most important bit i i believe is that

01:12:49 – 01:13:32 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

not to get not to see them as as static aesthetic categorizations as fixed categorizations and we do that not only with things or creative beings that we see around us but we also do it with with processes, with ideas, even with religion sometimes as well, you know. Even with the Rasail-e-Noor? Exactly, with the Rasail-e-Noor as well. So the moment we think in fixed matters, in static matters, it becomes impossible to develop an idea to go further and to because but what

01:13:32 – 01:14:12 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

we're trying to do is we're trying to understand the the absolute ultimately this is our if this is our aim as Muslims in this world and to know him then we ought not to think in fixed terms we have to leave the questions always open. The moment we answer a question, we close the doors to ourselves. So we ought to always be, you know, careful in those, you know, when we answer those questions and always leave the door slightly open in case we come across something that may open our horizons again to understand our

01:14:12 – 01:14:51 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

creator. And I think that's kind of like what I was referring to. And one of the best ways to do it is through discussions. Exactly, to dialogue. And this is also what, Bohm actually talks a lot in his works. He has the whole videos on how to do dialogue, how to make dialogue, actually. Because the problem always is that people come up with assumptions and theories, but they have attached themselves and identified with those so much that if someone says something, they see it as an attack on their own identity, on themselves. themselves. And that's why the dialogue doesn't go anywhere after that.

01:14:53 – 01:15:37 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

So final words? We're not done yet. It's a comment question kind of thing. So when you were just speaking about that and even earlier when you were talking about the actually when Dr. Arif brought up categories and the difficulty of being able to not think in that way, I think the Islamic tradition, I wonder what you would say about this, the Islamic tradition has always recognized the difficulty of coming out of those categories, and the people who worked to train the believer how to come out of those categories were the Sufis, were the Masha'ib,

01:15:37 – 01:16:19 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

who had an experience of Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala where they had erased, like they had gone beyond the categories through fanat. And then, but the important thing is, how do you come back? Because it is inevitable, it is in, like, escapable for the human being to work and think through categories. Otherwise, you'll be like, you're going to be crazy. So the way to do it. A lot of them actually have been seen as majnun. Yeah, but you come back to it in the state of where you're working with the categories, but now it's a constant awareness of Allah So I wonder what that was my comment part of the question

01:16:19 – 01:17:03 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

is, how do you see, like, I'm really fascinated with the fact that whose work I'm not very familiar with, is basically talking about these concepts but he's using new language and was there a reason why he had to use new language what why was he using such difference with the energy yes very very very brief yes answer to that these are not safe mercy it says it and in his work he says if I hope if I would have come during the times of you know in a design for example remember bang I would have written their work if they would have come during my time is there my might work so it's it's really a matter of like you know what kind of like time you're born into

01:17:03 – 01:17:43 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

as a and what kind of like what is the requirement and what is the necessity of that time um and that answers your question you know so this is why he uses a different sort of language that is maybe uh easier accessible to the the the lives and of people today of the modern people, basically, and the way how they think. And with that, you mean their intelligence, their ability to read a lot. I think that's really powerful. Like, they still reach him, even as a modern person. Exactly. I'm sure this conversation will continue in the conversation. Before I ask you to thank all of our speakers,

01:17:43 – 01:18:27 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

I want to remind you that in about 20 minutes next door, we're going to have a book launch of Professor Tuna's work, knowing God in the secular age he would be too humble to remind you of it himself, so I'm doing it and I'll get into trouble when I leave the room Can you also remind us, Delia of the workshop as well I don't know about the workshop I don't know about the workshop I'm sure that if you open up the program you will find the workshop that will be after 12.30 I would thank all of you and ask you to thank all the speakers in the judicial level. Thank you very much.

01:18:27–01:18:54 *[Metin boşluğu: bu aralık için döküm bulunmuyor. Videodan kontrol edin.]*

01:18:54 – 01:18:58 | **İngilizce** • *Kontrol*

Thank you very much. The audience missed this part, right?

Kontrol notları

341 cümlede otomatik güven/parça sınırı uyarısı, 2 metin boşluğu bulunuyor. Bu işaretler ön inceleme içindir; konuşmacının ne söylediğini kesinleştirmez. Metne dayanarak bir alıntı seçmeden önce bağlantılı video aralığını dinleyin.

00:00:28 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
and control their own life or body right and you know we know those of us who are

00:08:38 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
who were still with him and he says to them

00:08:43 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
are you incapable of being like the ajuz

00:09:09 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
And he went to the area, but he didn't know exactly where the grave was, and he knew that

00:12:02 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
la hawla wa la quwwata illa billah, right? Shall I not tell you about a word among the

00:12:12 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
la hawla wa la quwata illa billah

00:14:12 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
I mean, when we say vulnerable in the context of the Qur'an, we see the widows, right, the orphans, the slaves, that kind of in the context of the Prophet's time, I mean, we see this is a very important topic in the world of the Qur'an.

00:15:31 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
And interestingly, Nur actually writes about the inmates.

00:15:46 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
Of course, poverty is also part of it, right?

00:19:32 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
in Turkish there is a saying attributed to one of the the poets it says it says

00:19:40 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
in Turkish yash otuzbes yolun yarası so my age is 35 kind of this is I am in the

00:31:45 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
Before we allow her to take the stage, as it were,

00:32:55 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
I would like to especially greet my father and my mother who are present here as well,

00:33:13 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
So the topic of this symposium is the theme is Qur'anic solutions to global crises.

00:46:53 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
profound idea. Very briefly the ana can be understood as a kind of point of

00:53:30 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
and pattern. There is the wholeness, there is Tauhid, and there is, you know, all the

00:53:39 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
are also here and we believe this place about, like anything else as well.

00:53:44 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
Yes, I'm just finishing here now, just one last, yes, so because this is I think

00:58:17 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
so I is a universal thing but all the people are being played as seen as a

00:58:30 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
provision and labeling all the people or is it you know add something that is

00:58:36 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
it's universal let's see do we have a question for dr sally okay and we have a question for

00:58:48 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
then we will begin with this question which i think was directed to actually both of the speakers

00:58:57 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
and if we have you can start please

00:59:28 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
Absolutely true. They do count as that kind of a symbol. I use the old lady in particular because

00:59:36 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
I saw the Prophet ﷺ use the ajuz as an example and why would he address a group of men,

00:59:52 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
saying to be like that old woman I wanted to sort of get at that and think

01:00:18 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
in thinking about aging and the elderly as a way to grapple with how to present

01:01:14 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
and we need to examine the kinds of expectations we have of women of

01:01:28 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
blindly upholding a kind of kind of our but you know one of the things that I

01:01:35 — Düşük güvenli sözcük, Konuşma algısı belirsiz
was thinking about when dr. to manure was speaking just now and you were

Diğer işaretli pasajlar metin akışında “Kontrol” etiketiyle gösterilir.