

Judge & Court Clerk

Socio-Scientific Issues
Evidence Review & Penalty Recommendation

I. Role Assignment

Each of you will take on a role to participate in the trial. Review the roles below and decide who will do what.

Role	Responsibilities	Name
Judge	Will preside over the case which includes preparing the jury to make their decision and also giving the final recommendations for penalty.	
Court Clerk	Will guide the class through the different parts of the trial.	

II. Opening Statement Review

You will hear the opening statements from the Plaintiff and Defendant attorneys. List your thoughts on the evidence they provided below, so that you are ready to preside over the case and provide recommendations for the penalty if it is necessary.

Plaintiff Attorney Opening Statement Review	
Notes	
Defendant Attorney Opening Statement Review	
Notes	

III.



IV. Clarifying Questions

After listening to the opening statements, you will be given the opportunity to ask questions to both the Defendant Attorney and the Plaintiff Attorney. Please see a list of possible questions below and also write down your own questions.

Questions	1. What other evidence could be provided to support your case?
	2. Did you consider the daily and seasonal change of the solar angles in your analysis?
	3. Did you consider daytime length in your analysis?
	4. Why did you choose to analyze solar output on [insert day]?
	5.
	6.
	7.
	8.
	9.

V. Cross-Examination

You will be given the opportunity to ask questions to the Defendant and the Plaintiff. Please see a list of possible questions below and also write down your own questions.

Defendant Cross-Examination	
Notes	
Questions	1. When did you move into your home?
	2.
	3.
	4.
	5.



Plaintiff Cross-Examination	
Notes	
Questions	1. Why wouldn't you place the solar panels where there are no trees?
	2.
	3.
	4.
	5.

VI. Final Argument

During the final argument, bear in mind that the information provided by each side might be biased, here are some questions for you to consider. Type an X next to the questions that you used in making your decision:

- ☐ Who is presenting the information?
- ☐ What expertise and/or relevant experience does the speaker have?
- ☐ What biases does the speaker have and how might those biases affect the presentation of information?
- ☐ Does the information presented seem to be accurately reported?
- ☐ Are the claims made in the presentation supported?
- ☐ Do any facts or analyses seem to be misleading?
- ☐ Is there important information that has been left out?
- ☐ Is there any information that is unnecessary (particularly if the extra information makes the message misleading)?
- ☐ What biases, if any, could influence the science or social sources of information about the issue?
- ☐ What biases, if any, might influence your understanding of the information presented?

VII.



VIII. Penalty and Reasoning

Prepare your thoughts on what would be possible penalties based on your review of the evidence below:

Verdict	
Reasons	1.
	2.
	3.
Penalty <i>(if guilty)</i>	

IX. Final Questions

1. What parts of this case make it difficult to come up with a verdict?
2. Do you see science and engineering as a way to solve social problems? (Please support your response with details and/or examples)
3. What kinds of additional information would better support an evidence-based decision to remove the trees?
4. What kinds of additional information would better support an evidence-based decision to keep the trees?

