

Feedback Support Packet

Adapted from They Say/I Say: The Moves That Matter in Academic Writing by Gerald Graff and Cathy Birkenstein. Norton, 2006.

Directions: Read through this entire packet carefully. Fill out the boxes shaded in **yellow** that correspond to your feedback on the exam. You only need to complete the boxes referenced in your feedback.

I. ARGUMENTATION: THESIS & TOPIC SENTENCES

Thesis = Claim (<i>They Say</i> + <i>I Say</i> ¹) + Evidence Pattern + Broad Significance	
Template #1 <i>Disagree & explain why</i>	At first glance, readers might think [THEY SAY] about [THEMATIC CONCEPT], but [EVIDENCE PATTERN] shows [LOCAL CLAIM/I SAY], revealing that [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE].
Template #2 <i>Agree & add complexity</i>	While [EVIDENCE PATTERN A] does indeed suggest [THEY SAY] about [THEMATIC CONCEPT], [EVIDENCE PATTERN B] also shows [I SAY], illustrating that [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE].
Template #3 <i>Emphasis on comparison</i>	We tend to think of [THEMATIC CONCEPT] as [THEY SAY]; however, [CHAPTER X] and [CHAPTER Y] depict [EVIDENCE PATTERN] as [CLAIM/I SAY], illuminating [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE].
Template #4 <i>Emphasis on contrast</i>	As Tim O’Brien’s representation of [EVIDENCE PATTERN] in [CHAPTER X] suggests, we tend to think of [THEMATIC CONCEPT] as [THEY SAY]. In contrast, [CHAPTER Y] depicts [EVIDENCE PATTERN] as [CLAIM/I SAY], illuminating [SIGNIFICANCE].
Template #5 <i>Start with with this one!</i>	Americans tend to assume [THEY SAY]; however, Tim O’Brien’s <i>The Things They Carried</i> portrays [LOCAL CLAIM / I SAY]. Specifically, in [CHAPTER X], O’Brien grapples with [EVIDENCE PATTERN] to show how [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE A]. In [CHAPTER Y] and [CHAPTER Z], on the other hand, he deploys [EVIDENCE PATTERN] to emphasize [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE B].
Isolate & sharpen the elements of your thesis here:	<p>Claim / <i>They Say</i>:</p> <p>Claim / <i>I Say</i>:</p> <p>Evidence Pattern:</p> <p>Broad Significance:</p> <p>Highlight one: Does your “I Say” <u>DISAGREE & EXPLAIN WHY</u> or <u>AGREE & ADD COMPLEXITY</u> to your “They Say”?</p>

¹ You have two options for your “I say” claim. You can agree & add complexity or you can disagree & explain why.

Feedback Support Packet

**Revise your
thesis
statement here:**

They Say - Introducing “Standard Views”

- Americans tend to believe that _____.
- Conventional wisdom has it that _____.
- Common sense seems to dictate that _____.
- The standard way of thinking about [topic] has it that _____.
- It is often said that _____.
- My whole life I have heard it said that _____.
- You would think that _____.
- Many people assumed that _____.

Establishing why your claims matter

- X matters/is important because _____.
- Although X may seem trivial, it is in fact crucial in terms of today’s concern over _____. Ultimately, what is at stake here is _____.
- This analysis has important consequences for the broader domain of _____.
- My discussion of X is in fact addressing the larger matter of _____.
- These conclusions/This analysis will have significant applications in _____ as well as in _____.
- Although X may seem of concern to only a small group of _____, it should in fact concern anyone who cares about _____.

Feedback Support Packet

Topic Sentence Templates (Comparison/Contrast)	
<i>Topic Sentence = Local Claim (They Say + I Say) + Evidence Pattern + Significance</i>	
Template #1 <i>Disagree & explain why</i>	Readers might think that [EVIDENCE PATTERN IN CHAPTER X] indicates [THEY SAY] about [THEMATIC CONCEPT]; however, [EVIDENCE PATTERN] shows [LOCAL CLAIM / I SAY], revealing [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE].
Template #2 <i>Agree & add complexity</i>	While [EVIDENCE PATTERN A] does indeed suggest [THEY SAY], [EVIDENCE PATTERN B] also shows [I SAY], illustrating that [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE].
Template #3	Just as [CHAPTER X] explores [THEMATIC CONCEPT] with [EVIDENCE PATTERN], so [CHAPTER Y] also shows [LOCAL CLAIM / I SAY] via [EVIDENCE PATTERN], revealing [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE].
Template #4	Unlike [CHAPTERS X & Y], which represent [THEMATIC CONCEPT] as [THEY SAY], [CHAPTER Z] frames the issue as [LOCAL CLAIM / I SAY] through [EVIDENCE PATTERN], showing how [BROAD SIGNIFICANCE].
Isolate & sharpen the elements of one T.S. here:	Claim / <i>They Say</i> : Claim / <i>I Say</i> : Evidence Pattern: Broad Significance: Highlight one: Does your “I Say” <u>DISAGREE & EXPLAIN WHY</u> or <u>AGREE & ADD COMPLEXITY</u> to your “They Say”?
Revise T.S. 1 here:	
Revise T.S. 2 here:	
Revise T.S. 3 here:	

II. EVIDENCE & ANALYSIS

Quote Integration
<p>Structure 1: Intro Sentence (Full Sentence) + Colon (:) + Quote</p> <p>Structure 2: Intro Phrase (NOT a Full Sentence) + Comma (,) + Quote</p> <p>Structure 3: Intro Phrase + “That” + No Punctuation + Quote</p> <p>Structure 4: Your Words + Their Words (Short Quote) + Your Words</p>
<p><i>Examples:</i></p> <p>Structure 1: While Amelia and Marvin prepare for the fight, Cousin Lymon finds a way to keep himself entertained. He begins painting Amelia’s house a bright green: “It was a loblolly job, and he smeared himself all over” (McCullers 63).</p> <p>Structure 2: When Lymon first comes to town, Miss Amelia gives him dinner and a room to stay in. As they go up to the bedrooms, the narrator states, “The hunchback hovered so close behind her that the swinging light made on the staircase wall one great, twisted shadow of the two of them” (McCullers 12).</p> <p>Structure 3: The narrator explains the apparently heartless, joking response of the soldiers to Lavender’s death with the observation that “[t]hey used a hard vocabulary to contain the terrible softness” (O’Brien 19).</p> <p>Structure 4: O’Brien explains that the soldiers of Alpha Company “carried all they could bear, and then some, including a silent awe for the power of the things they carried” (O’Brien 7).</p>
<p><i>Select quotes from your paper and integrate them into your own language using each of the four structures:</i></p> <p>Structure 1:</p> <p>Structure 2:</p> <p>Structure 3:</p> <p>Structure 4:</p>

Feedback Support Packet

Capturing Authorial Action

- | | |
|---|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ X acknowledges that _____.➤ X agrees that _____.➤ X argues that _____.➤ X believes that _____.➤ X denies/does not deny that _____.➤ X claims that _____.➤ X complains that _____.➤ X concedes that _____.➤ X demonstrates that _____.➤ X deplores the tendency to _____. | <ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ X celebrates the fact that _____.➤ X emphasizes that _____.➤ X insists that _____.➤ X observes that _____.➤ X questions that _____.➤ X refuses the claim that _____.➤ X reminds us that _____.➤ X suggests that _____.➤ X urges us to _____. |
|---|--|

Literal vs. Non-Literal Evidence

Literal evidence conveys meaning via denotation (dictionary-definitions of the language). **Non-literal evidence** deploys **figurative language** and **stylistic devices** (review your literary terms!) to imply meaning. Non-literal evidence tends to offer richer opportunities for analysis. If we wish to characterize Norman Bowker, the following are examples of literal and non-literal evidence:

- ➔ **Literal evidence:** “Norman Bowker was in no way responsible for what happened to Kiowa” (O’Brien 154).
- ➔ **Non-literal evidence:** “[Bowker] walked down to the beach, and waded into the lake without undressing. The water felt warm against his skin. He put his head under. He opened his lips, very slightly, for the taste, then he stood up and folded his arms and watched the fireworks” (O’Brien 148).

Templates for Quote Analysis

- In describing _____, [AUTHOR] draws attention to _____.
- [AUTHOR] shows _____ about [CHARACTER] through the inclusion of _____.
- Another facet of _____ is _____, as evidenced by [EXAMPLE].
- The word/phrase _____ implies _____, suggesting _____.
- The image of _____ depicts _____, emphasizing how _____.
- [AUTHOR] emphasizes _____ by describing how _____.

Feedback Support Packet

Helpful Verb Bank for Analyzing Literature				
Alludes to	Critiques	Establishes	Indicates	Shows
Attests	Denotes	Exemplifies	Illustrates	Signifies
Clarifies	Depicts	Explains	Imagines	Substantiates
Conceives of	Determines	Exposes	Implies	Suggests
Confirms	Develops	Expounds	Portrays	Typifies
Connotes	Displays	Grapples with	Questions	Understands
Conveys	Emphasizes	Highlights	Represents	Underscores
Creates	Entails	Hints	Reveals	Uses

Sample Analysis

O'Brien's nurses jokingly diagnose his gunshot wound with "diaper rash." "An in-joke, I suppose," he explains, "[b]ut it made me hate Bobby Jorgenson the way some guys hated the VC, gut hate, the kind of hate that stays with you even in your dreams" (O'Brien 182). Making light of his injury, O'Brien's nurses appear to infantilize, and perhaps even emasculate, their patient, likening a soldier's gunshot wound to the skin irritation of a baby in diapers. Indeed, by referring to the wound as a "diaper rash," O'Brien's nurses highlight the embarrassing anatomical location of his injury on "the butt" (181). Of course, while O'Brien's wound along with the accompanying state of shock, are potentially fatal, diaper rash is a minor inconvenience, making the comment all the more emotionally injurious. What he wishes would be perceived as an act of masculine bravery is mocked as a baby's discomfort. Babies, in fact, are a cultural symbol of cowardice, and O'Brien's angry response to the joke illuminates how badly he wishes to be perceived as a courageous soldier, fully grown, and fully capable of battle.

Practice Analysis: Select one piece of non-literal evidence from your paper. Using the templates provided, write 3-4 sentences of rich analysis here:

III. ORGANIZATION, TRANSITIONS, & STYLE

Commonly Used Transitions	
Addition	also, and, besides, furthermore, in addition, indeed, in fact, moreover, so too
Example	after all, as an illustration, for example, for instance, specifically, to take a case in point
Elaboration	actually, by extension, in short, that is, in other words, to put it another way, to put it bluntly, to put it succinctly, ultimately
Comparison	along the same lines, in the same way, likewise, similarly
Contrast	although, but, by contrast, conversely, despite the fact that, even though, however, in contrast, nevertheless, nonetheless, on the contrary, on the other hand, regardless, whereas, while yet
Cause & effect	accordingly, as a result, consequently, hence, since, so, then, therefore, thus
Concession	admittedly, although it is true, granted, naturally, of course, to be sure
Conclusion	as a result, consequently, hence, in conclusion, in short, in sum, therefore, thus, to sum up, to summarize

Grammar & Style Issues (w/ links for how to correct them)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Comma Rules ➤ Semicolons ➤ Colons, Semicolons, & Dashes ➤ Comma Splices ➤ Sentence Fragments ➤ Punctuating Titles ➤ Passive Voice vs. Active Voice 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Conjunctions (THAMO, SWABI, FANBOYS) ➤ Awkward Syntax ➤ Concision ➤ Writing Clearly & Concisely ➤ MLA Style ➤ How to quote dialogue ➤ Ending the Essay: Conclusions

Select 2-3 grammatically incorrect sentences from your paper and rewrite them correctly here:

IV. WRITER'S SELF-EVALUATION

Part I. To get a bird's-eye view of your paragraph's structure, identify the following components of your analytical paragraph and highlight each in the color specified:

- Thesis statement: **Green**
- Introductory phrase (including context) for quote: **Yellow**
- Evidence/Quotes: **Red**
- Explanation & Analysis: **Blue**
- Transitions: **Orange**
- Concluding sentence: **Purple**

Part II. Evaluate your paragraph for the following :

1. Logical Structure

- Does the evidence & analysis in your paragraph CLEARLY & EXPLICITLY support the thesis sentence?
- Is the evidence presented in an ORDER that supports the thesis sentence?

2. Quote Integration

- Is each quote introduced with sufficient and relevant context?
- Is each quote grammatically integrated into the writer's sentence(s)?
- Is each quote trimmed down to only the NECESSARY information? If not, what could be cut out?
- If you were to remove the quotation marks, would each sentence still make sense?

3. Analysis

- Does the analysis of each quote *focus on* HOW the evidence creates meaning beyond the literal/surface-level?
- Does the analysis of each quote CLEARLY & EXPLICITLY *explain* HOW the specific language develops meaning beyond the literal/surface level?

Writer's Goals: Identify your goals for your next writing project and write them here: