

OPTA Conference: Monday, April 29, 2019: 9:15-10:15 am in JHB100A
Alistair Macrae (macraealister@gmail.com)

**Teaching Ethics with the help of two immoral literary characters:
Plato's Calicles and J.K. Rowling's Lord Voldemort**

Translations of Plato's *Gorgias*...

Cope, E.M. Plato: *Gorgias*, 1932.

(https://archive.org/stream/platosgorgias00plat/platosgorgias00plat_djvu.txt)

Helmbold, W.C. Plato: *Gorgias*: The Library of Liberal Arts, 1952.

Jowett, Benjamin. Plato: *Gorgias* and *Timaeus*: Dover Publications, 1892.

(This translation is available online:

<http://www.gutenberg.org/files/1672/1672-h/1672-h.htm> and

<http://classics.mit.edu/Plato/gorgias.html>)

Cooper, J.M. (ed.). *Plato: Complete Works*: Hackett Publishing, 1997.

Nichols, James H. Jr. Plato: *Gorgias*: Cornell University Press, 1998.

Waterfield, Robin. Plato: *Gorgias*: A new translation: Oxford University Press, 1994.

Zeyl, Donald. J. Plato: *Gorgias*: Translation with Introduction and notes: Hackett Publishing Company, 1987.

Plato's *Gorgias*: a reading list:

Adamson, Peter. "Virtue meets its match: Plato's *Gorgias*." In *Classical Philosophy: A history of philosophy without any gaps, volume 1*, 2014, 116-122.

Adamson has made this seven-page article into a 17-minute video called "Virtue meets its match: Plato's *Gorgias*." www.youtube.com/watch?v=SNOYANKvN14

Archie, Joseph Patrick. "Calicles' Redoubtable Critique of Polus' Argument in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Hermes* 1984, vol. 112: 167-176.

Austin, Emily A. "Corpses, Self-Defense, and Immortality: Calicles' Fear of Death in the *Gorgias*." *Ancient Philosophy*, 2013, vol. 33:33-52.

Avnon, Dan. "'Know Thyself': Socratic Companionship and Platonic Community." *Political Theory*, 1995, vol. 23: 304ff.

Balla, Chloe. "...Plato and the Sophists on Greed and Savage Humanity." *Polis: The Journal for Ancient Greek Political Thought*, 2018, vol. 35(1) 88-101.

Balot, Ryan K. "Subordinating Courage to Justice: Statecraft and Soulcraft in fourth-century Athenian Rhetoric and Platonic Philosophy." *Rhetorica: A Journal of the History of Rhetoric*, 2007, vol. 25(1), 35-52.

Barney, Rachel. "Gorgias' Defense: Plato and His Opponents on Rhetoric and the Good." *Southern Journal of Philosophy* 2010, vol. 48: 95-121.

Barney, Rachel. "Callicles and Thrasymachus." *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Fall 2017 edition. (<https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/callicles-thrasymachus/>)

Barney, Rachel. "Gorgias' defence: Plato and his opponents in rhetoric and the good." *Southern Journal of Philosophy*, 2010, vol. 48(1): 95-125.

Beaumont, Tim. "J.S. Mill on Calliclean Hedonism..." *Dialogue: Canadian Philosophical Review*, 2018, 1-26.

Beaumont, Tim. "J.S. Mill's hedonism: activism, experientialism and eudaimonism." *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 2018.

Benardete, Seth. *The Rhetoric of Morality and Philosophy: Plato's Gorgias and Phaedrus*, 1991.

Benson Cain, Rebecca. "Shame and Ambiguity in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Philosophy and Rhetoric*, 2008, vol. 41:212-237.

Berman, Scott. "How Polus was refuted: Reconsidering Plato's *Gorgias*, ss. 474c-475e." *Ancient Philosophy*, 1991, vol. 11(2): 265ff.

Berman, Scott. "Socrates and Callicles on Pleasure." *Phronesis: A Journal for Ancient Philosophy*, 1991, vol. 36(2) 117-140.

Bernard, Jacob E. "What Socrates said and why Gorgias and Polus did not respond: A reading of Socrates' defense of rhetoric in *Gorgias* 461-466." *Rhetorical Society Quarterly*, 1999, vol. 29(1): 77-98.

Boyd White, James. "The ethics of argument: Plato's *Gorgias* and the modern lawyer." *The University of Chicago Law Review*, 1983, vol. 50: 849-895.

Brickhouse, Thomas C. and Nicholas D. Smith. "Socrates on how wrongdoing damages the soul." *The Journal of Ethics*, 2007, vol. 11(4): 337-356.

Buzzetti, E. "The Injustice of Callicles and the Limits of Socrates' Ability to Educate a Young Politician." *Ancient Philosophy*, 2005, vol. 25:25-48.

Carone, G. "Calculating machines or leaky jars? The moral psychology of Plato's *Gorgias*." *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*, 2001, vol. 26: 55-96.

Clerk Shaw, J. "Punishment and Psychology in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Polis: The Journal for Ancient Greek Political Thought*, 2015, vol. 32(1) 75-95.

Cooper, J.M. "Socrates and Plato in Plato's *Gorgias*." In J. Cooper. *Reason and Emotion: Essays in Ancient Moral Psychology and Ethical Theory*, 1999, 29-75.

Crotty, Kevin M. *The City-State of the Soul: Constituting the Self in Plato's Republic*, 2016. (Part One includes a discussion of Thrasymachus' remarks about justice.)

Demulder, B. "The philosopher coming out of the corner: philosophical friendship in Plato's *Gorgias* and some echoes from Plutarch to Damascus." *Athenaeum: Studi Periodici di letteratura e storia dell'Antichita*, 2017, vol. 105, 43-84.

Doyle, James. "On the first eight lines of Plato's *Gorgias*." *The Classical Quarterly*, 2006, vol. 56(2): 599-602.

Doyle, James. "The Fundamental Opposition in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*, 2006, vol. 30: 87-100.

Duncan, Roger. "Philia in the *Gorgias*." *Apeiron: A journal for ancient philosophy and science*. March 1974, vol. 8(1): 23ff.

Egan, Danielle. "Conversion experiences and the *Dr. Phil Show*." *Journal of Religion and Popular Culture*, Summer 2005, vol. 10(1): 5ff.

Franklin, Lee. "Techne [= expertise, skill] and Teleology in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Apeiron: A journal for ancient philosophy and science*. March 2005, vol. 38(1): 229-255.

Fussi, Alessandra. "The myth of the last judgment in the *Gorgias*." *The Review of Metaphysics*, March 2001, vol. 54: 529-552.

Futter, D.B. "Shame as a Tool for Persuasion in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, 2009, vol. 47: 451-461.

Gaita, Raimond. "Callicles' Challenge." *Critical Quarterly*, 2005, vol. 47(1-2): 40-52.

Gentzler, J. "The Sophistic Cross-Examination of Callicles in the *Gorgias*." *Ancient Philosophy*, 1995, vol. 15: 17-43.

- Jenks, Rod. "The Power of Shame Considerations in Plato's *Gorgias*." *History of Philosophy Quarterly*, October 2102, vol. 29(4): 373-390.
- Johnson, Curtis N. "Socrates v. Callicles Part I: Natural Justice." In Curtis N. Johnson, *Socrates and the Immoralists*, 2005: 93-108.
- Johnson, Curtis N. "Socrates v. Callicles Part II: Unqualified Hedonism." In Curtis N. Johnson, *Socrates and the Immoralists*, 2005, 109-128.
- Kahn, C.H. "Drama and Dialectic in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*, 1983, vol. 1: 75-121.
- Kamtekar, R. "The Profession of Friendship: Callicles, Democratic Politics, and Rhetorical Education in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Ancient Philosophy*, 2005, vol. 25: 319-339.
- Klosko, George. "The Refutation of Callicles in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Greece and Rome*, 1984, vol. 31: 126ff.
- Kochan, Jeff. "Rescuing the *Gorgias* from [Bruno] Latour." *Philosophy of the Social Sciences*, December 2006, vol. 36(4): 395-422.
- Levy, David. "Techne and the Problem of Socratic Philosophy in the *Gorgias*." *Apeiron: A journal for ancient philosophy and science*. March 2005, vol. 38(1): 185-228.
- Martinez, Joel A. "Socrates' aversion to being a victim of injustice." *The Journal of Ethics*, 2018, vol. 22(1): 59-76.
- Moss, Jessica. "Shame, Pleasure and the Divided Soul." *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*, 2005, vol. 29: 137-170.
- Moss, Jessica. "The Doctor and the Pastry Chef: Pleasure and Persuasion in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Ancient Philosophy*, 2007, vol. 27, 229ff.
- Neumann, Harry. "Plato's defence of Socrates: An interpretation of Ancient and Modern Sophistry." *Liberal Education*, 1970, vol. 56:458-475.
- Penner, Terry. "Desire and Power in Socrates: The Argument of *Gorgias* 466a-468e that orators and tyrants have no power in the city." *Apeiron: A journal for ancient philosophy and science*, 1991, vol. 24(3): 147-202.
- Principe, Michael A. "Restraint of Desire in the *Gorgias*." *The Southern Journal of Philosophy: A Quarterly Journal*, Spring 1982, 121-132.
- Robertson, _____. "Polos Euergetes: Rhetoric and poetry in the *Gorgias*." *Mnemosyne*, 2008, vol. 61(3): 353-364.

Rudebusch, George. "Callicles' Hedonism", *Ancient Philosophy*, 1992, vol. 12 (1): 53–71.

Russell, Daniel C. "Misunderstanding the Myth in the *Gorgias*." *Southern Journal of Philosophy*, 2001, vol. 39: 557-573.

Russell, Daniel C. "Pleasure, Virtue and Happiness in the *Gorgias*." In Daniel C. Russell's *Plato on Pleasure and the Good Life*, 48-76.

Ryan, Alan. "Gorgias." In Alan Ryan *On Politics: A History of Political Thought from Herodotus to the Present*, 2012, 38-47.

Saxonhouse, Arlene. "An Unspoken Theme in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Interpretation: A Journal of Political Philosophy*, 1983, vol. 11:139-169.

Segvic, Heda. "No one Errs Willingly: The Meaning of Socratic Intellectualism." *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*, 2000, vol. 20: 1-45.

Sermanoglou-Soulmaidi, Georgia. "The refutation of Polus in Plato's *Gorgias* Revisited." *Apeiron: A journal for ancient philosophy and science.*, 2017, vol. 50(3): 277-310.

Sharples, R.W. "Plato on democracy and expertise [= techne/skill, as opposed to knack/flattery]." *Greece and Rome*, 1994, vol. 41(1): 49-56.

Smith, Nicholas D. "Some thoughts about the origin of Greek ethics." *The Journal of Ethics*, 2001, vol. 5(1): 3-20.

Sommerville, Brooks. "The Image of Jars in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Ancient Philosophy*, 2014, vol. 34(2): 235-254.

Stauffer, Devin. "Socrates and Callicles: A Reading of Plato's *Gorgias*." *Review of Politics*, 2002, vol. 64: 627-657.

Stauffer, Devin. *The Unity of Plato's Gorgias*, 2006.

Svoboda, Michael. "Athens, the Unjust student of Rhetoric: A dramatic historical interpretation of Plato's *Gorgias*." *Rhetorical Society Quarterly*, 2007, vol. 37(3), 275-305.

Tarnopolsky, Christina H. "Prudes, Perverts and Tyrants: Plato and the Contemporary Politics of Shame." *Political Theory*, 2004, vol. 32: 468-494. (For a review of this article, see "The shame of being a philosopher: Critical response to Tarnopolsky." *Political Theory*, 2005, vol. 33(2): 266-272.)

Tarnopolsky, Christina H. *Prudes, Perverts and Tyrants: Plato's Gorgias and the Politics of Shame*, 2010.

Teloh, Henry. "Rhetoric, Refutation and What Socrates Believes in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Proceedings of the Boston Area Colloquium in Ancient Philosophy*, 2007, vol. 23: 57-77.

Tschempelik, Andrea. "Callicles: from "Here" to Hades." *Polis: The Journal for Ancient Greek Political Thought*, 2008, vol. 25(1), 79-93.

Urstad, Kristian. "Nietzsche and Callicles on Happiness, pleasure and power." *Kritike: An Online Journal of Philosophy*, 2010, vol. 4(2), 133-141.

Vasiliou, I. "Disputing Socratic Principles: Character and Argument in the Polus episode of the *Gorgias*." *Archiv fur Gesschichte der Philosophie*, 2002, vol. 84(3): 245-272.

Wallach, John R. "Platonic power and Platonic realism." *Polis: The Journal for Ancient Greek Political Thought*, 2014, vol. 31(1): 28-58.

Weiss, Roslyn. "...The fraternity of rhetoric and philosophy in Plato's *Gorgias*." *Interpretation: A Journal of Political Philosophy*, ____, vol. 30(2):195-206.

Whedbee, Karen. "An English Plato: J.S. Mill's *Gorgias*." *Rhetorical Society Quarterly*, 2007, vol. 37(1): 19-41.

White, F.C. "Plato's last words on pleasure [in the *Gorgias*, the *Republic* and the *Philebus*]." *Classical Quarterly*, 2010, vol. 51(2): 458-476.

Woolf, Raphael. "Callicles and Socrates: Psychic (Dis)harmony in the *Gorgias*." *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*, 2000, vol. 18: 1-40.

Zuckert, Catherine H. "*Gorgias*: Socrates as Sole Practitioner of the True Political Art." In Catherine H. Zuckert, *Plato's Philosophers: The Coherence of the Dialogues*, 2009, 531-561.

Shame: a reading list...

Abramson, K. "A sentimentalist's defense of contempt, shame, and disdain. In P. Goldie (Ed.). *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy of Emotion*, 2010, 189-213.

Baima, Nicholas R. "Playing with Intoxication: On the Cultivation of Shame and Virtue in Plato's *Laws*." *Apeiron: A journal for ancient philosophy and science*, 2018, vol. 51(3): 345-370.

- Calhoun, C. "An Apology for Moral Shame." *The Journal of Political Philosophy*, 2004, vol. 12(2): 127-146.
- Creighton, M.R. "Revisiting Shame and Guilt Cultures: A Forty-Year Pilgrimage." *Ethos*, 1990, vol. 18:279-309.
- Deonna, J and Teroni, F. "The self of shame." In M. Salmela and V. Mayer (Eds.), *Emotions, Ethics, and Authenticity*, 2009, 33-50.
- Eisenstadt, Oona. "Shame in the *Apology*." In Zdravko Planinc (ed.) *Politics, Philosophy, Writing: Plato's Art of Caring for Souls*, 2001, 42-59.
- Fussi, Alessandra. "Aristotle on Shame." *Ancient Philosophy*, 2015, vol. 35, 113-135.
- Hacker, Peter. "Shame, Embarrassment, and Guilt." *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, 2017 vol. 41: 202ff.
- Heller, Agnes. "Five Approaches to the Phenomenon of Shame." *Social Research*, Winter 2003, vol. 70(4): 1015-1030.
- Hooker, J.T. "Homeric Society: A Shame-Culture?" *Greece and Rome*, 1987, vol. 34: 121-125.
- Kilborne, Benjamin. "Wrestling with Proteus: The main forms of shame." *Psychoanalytic Inquiry*, October 2009, vol. 19(3): 362-372.
- Konstan, David. "Shame in Ancient Greece." *Social Research*, Winter 2003, vol. 70(4): 1031-1060.
- Hollander, Martha. "Losses of Face: Rembrandt, Masaccio, and the Drama of Shame." *Social Research*, Winter 2003, vol. 70(4): 1327-1349.
- Lansky, Melvin R. "Shame and Suicide in Sophocles' *Ajax*." *Psychoanalytic Quarterly*, 1996, vol. 65: 761-786.
- Maibom, Heidi L "The Descent of Shame." *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, May 2010, vol. 80(3): 566-594.
- Riesman, David. *The Lonely Crowd*. 1950. (See also Wilfred McClay's "Fifty years of the lonely crowd..." *Wilson Quarterly*, 1998, vol. 22(3), 34ff. and Joseph Galbo's "From the lonely crowd to the cultural contradictions of capitalism and beyond..." *Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences*, 2004, vol. 40(1): 47-76.)

Rukgaber, Matthew Stewart. "Philosophical Anthropology and the Interpersonal Theory of the Affect of Shame." *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, 2018, vol. 49: 83-112.

Saenz, Victor. "Shame and Honor: Aristotle's *Thumos* as a Basic Desire." *Apeiron: A journal for ancient philosophy and science*, 2018, vol. 51(1): 73-95.

Satkunanandan. Shalini. "Drawing Rein: Shame and Reverence in Plato's Law-Bound Polity and Ours." *Political Theory*, 2018, vol. 46(3), 331-356.

Sokolon, Marlene K. "The Shameless truth: Shame and friendship in Aristotle." *European Journal of Political Theory*, 2013, vol. 12(4): 447-465.

Williams, Bernard. *Shame and Necessity*, 1994.

The Lawyers' Paradox:

Let PA = the private argument between Protagoras and the student named Euthlus
Let ROTC = the ruling of the court

Here is a summary of the student's argument:

1. The judge can rule in favour of Protagoras or he can rule against Protagoras.
2. If the judge rules in favour of Protagoras, then according to the ROTC, the student does not have to pay his tuition fees.
3. On the other hand, if the judge rules against Protagoras, then according to the PA, the student does not have to pay his tuition fees.
4. In conclusion, regardless of what ruling the judge makes, the student does not have to pay his tuition fees.

Here is a summary of Protagoras' argument:

1. The judge can rule in favour of Protagoras or he can rule against Protagoras.
2. If the judge rules in favour of Protagoras, then according to the ROTC, the student must pay his tuition fees.
3. On the other hand, if the judge rules against Protagoras, then according to the PA, the student must pay his tuition fees.
4. In conclusion, regardless of what ruling the judge makes, the student must pay his tuition fees.

Articles about the lawyers' paradox [a.k.a. the paradox of the courtroom]:

Falleta, Nicholas. "Lawyers' Paradox." In Nicholas Falleta *The Paradoxicon: A Collection of*

Contradictory Challenges, Problematic Puzzles, and Impossible Illustrations, 1983, 70-74.

Lenzen, Wolfgang. "Protagoras and Euthlus: Reflections on a so-called paradox." *Ratio*, 1977, vol. 19(2): 176ff.

Lisanyule, Elana. "Why Protagoras gets paid anyway: A practical solution to the paradox of the court." *Schole*, 2017, vol. 11(1): 61-77.

File: OPT19_Bibliog