Note: This <u>letter</u> is also circulating. Sign one or both! We used that letter as a base, but thought it worthwhile to add a few points. We're all in touch, on the same team and going to send the letters together to JDS. Thank you for your support!

December 16, 2023

Dear CESJDS Students, Alumni, Parents, Administration, Faculty and Board of Directors,

On October 7th our world changed. We watched with horror as Hamas initiated war, invading Israel and carrying out the most barbaric attack against Jews since the Holocaust. We saw overwhelming enjoyment of murdering, burning people alive. We heard stories of torturous rape and disfiguration. We helplessly watched while over 200 innocent people were kidnapped and saw body parts paraded through the streets of Gaza to cheering crowds. Over 70 days later, while brave Israeli soldiers have been putting their lives at risk on a daily basis, some of whom have been killed, which includes siblings of CESJDS alumni, we find ourselves facing hate speech and disrespect from our community. Rather than have a meaningful conversation about Israeli policy, the "Community Open Letter" reflects sanctimony rather than empathy towards a people in profound mourning and utterly lacks nuance and critical thought. The letter also fails to respect the agency of the Palestinian people, who govern their society in Gaza; it is patronizing.

Hamas knew that Israel could not sit by while its people were slaughtered. Israel could not risk continued slaughter - an existential threat. Their goal is to eradicate Jews because of who we are – the very concept of genocide, defined by the UN as a "proven intent on the part of perpetrators to physically destroy a national, ethnical, racial or religious group." We need not prove this; Hamas publicly embraces this intent. Israel has a stark choice: to accept victimization and invite eradication or to fight back as an "oppressor" and eradicate Hamas. It is tragic that Hamas leaders hide in tunnels, deliberately risking civilian Palestinian lives with impunity, particularly children, as they cowardly retreat behind them. This is a tactic to elicit enormous criticism from the world. If there was another viable choice, Israel would no doubt take it. There is not.

It's vital the CESJDS community understands the "community" letter was written by a minority of alumni and is attempting to control a narrative and speak for the majority of us. This small group of peers speak from a lofty position of privilege, in which they have the luxury to live well, be safe, which not all of us feel these days. Meanwhile, Israeli mothers and fathers must face the hard reality of a neighbor intent on killing them; accordingly, they must send their children into a war for our people's survival.

This "open" letter *directly* adopts terminology created to define the incomprehensible and horrific scapegoating and murder of millions of Jews by the Nazis. Today this language is absurdly turned on its head by the world's most abhorrent terrorist groups and human rights abusers. This is very deliberate. It is the classic approach to argument and publicity that is adopted when its advocates have no real foundation for the assertions they make. The "open" letter parrots their mindset and empty arguments.

Judaism advocates education, not proselytization. The purpose of receiving an education is to question, think critically, debate and understand nuance. The letter agrees with that conceptually yet goes on to directly abuse language - a core tool of critical thinking and argument - and uses language definitionally in a different way when it comes to Israel than how the same language is used elsewhere as well as historically. The following are singular illustrations of how this language makes no sense given the current circumstances:

- Genocide: In the 1930s, there were ~300k Jews in Belgium. In 1967, there were 300k Palestinians in Gaza. Today, there are ~40k Jews in Belgium and ~2.3M Palestinians in Gaza. If Belgium had not had an actual genocide, at the Palestinian growth rate there would be about ~6M Jews in Belgium. Obviously, if Israel's intent was genocide, it has the means, without a single Israeli soldier dying, to have ended this war on October 8th. This is not genocide.
- Colonialism: Colonists have a home nation. They seek to extract resources for economic purposes from a foreign land in which they are not the indigenous people. Jews did not have any other home when the State of Israel was created. They were ethnically cleansed from the rest of the Arab world over decades, Jews are indigenous to Israel, and have not extracted economic resources. This is not colonialism.
- Apartheid: Apartheid refers to racial wars with segregated entities and governing bodies. We are ignoring the fact that 2M of the 10M people in Israel are Arabs who vote, attend the same universities, and work at the same companies as Jews. In fact, many Arab towns on the border of Palestinian territory during conversations about two-state solutions pushed to stay in Israel's territory because of the life and opportunities Israel provides to them. This is not apartheid.

It comes as a shock to many of us that our fellow alumni would spread vicious blood libels about Israel like calling it an apartheid or colonial state or characterizing the war in Gaza as fueled by "genocidal intent." Any good human being would abhor colonialism, apartheid, and genocide. Using that language to indict Israel and in a form that is definitionally wrong is extremely dangerous. It is incumbent upon us to remember that these blood libels, which for centuries have been used to fuel persecution, continue to

fuel anti-Semitic attacks around the world. We are horrified to see the promotion of insidious anti-Semitic conspiracy theories coming from those in our own community.

As human beings, we mourn the loss of any innocent civilian killed in armed conflict. We take pride in the IDF practicing judicious care, increasing the risk to our own soldiers, to minimize civilian casualties. As of today, the estimates, notably from the notoriously unreliable Hamas-run health ministry, are that 17k Palestinians have died, about 7-8k of whom are Hamas. The majority of the 50k Hamas and Islamic Jihad fighters are underground and hard to reach, while the 2.3M civilians are their human shields above ground. If Israel were using "deliberate oppression" or "indiscriminate tactics," the ratio of terrorists to civilians would be 1:50 or greater given the tunnel systems in which Hamas operates; instead it is 1:2.5. Again, this is due to brave soldiers going by foot into Gaza, dying to fight with Jewish values, preserve innocent Palestinians lives and comply with international law. Sacrificing one's own life as a soldier reflects the utmost commitment to Jewish values. A letter that ignores facts, which are increasingly ignored in today's media and universities and which a school like CESJDS must teach, does not reflect Jewish values.

It's also incorrect to state that Judaism and Zionism are somehow separate. The reason Israel exists and everything that it stands for as a nation cannot be disconnected from our religion, ethnicity and history. Criticism of the State of Israel is the Jewish way, and having debates about the best policies moving forward is how we will progress as a society; but this letter departs from productive discussion. It is difficult to comprehend how Jews can become so detached from reality that they resort to using Holocaust terminology like 'Never Again' against their own people. 'Never Again' means that we as a people will never stand idly by while we are slaughtered like they were on October 7th. It means that we will never hesitate to defend ourselves against our enemies who are the true practitioners of genocide and oppression.

It is essential as a community that we stand firmly together, which does not mean we agree about every policy. It means that in times of distress - as in a marriage - we do not abandon our people. If there has ever been a time that we should appreciate the Jewish education we had at CESJDS, it is now. In today's world, young people are quick to stand up against the "oppressed" without any knowledge or nuance. While nice in theory, that is a dangerous and simplistic narrative. Education exists to think intensively and critically. The mainstream hashtags on Tiktok and the "Community Open Letter," which reflect the same sentiments, do not do this. The challenge CESJDS has in the years ahead, including its alumni, is to maintain its steadfast moral clarity on these matters.

May God protect our Soldiers. May God protect our hostages. May all return home.

עם ישראל חי - Am Israel Chai

Please show your solidarity by signing here! Go Lions!

Gabrielle Charnoff, Class of 2010 Audrey Richardson, Class of 2010 Barak Balva, Class of 2010 Ayle Karvani, Class of 2007 Alex Smith Lipp, Class of 2011 Sam Krosnick, Class of 2010 Jenna Jach, Class 2011 Michelle Amsellem, Class of 2006 Michael Kader, Class of 2010 Ben Shemony, Class of 2014 Thomas Gutterman, Class of 2010 Arielle Weiss, Class of 2010 Saul Krosnick, Class of 2007 Olivia Susskind, Class of 2010 Talia Evans. Class of 2010 Jon Galitzer, Class of 2013 Amy Zitelman Hersche, Class of 2007

Ben Block, Class of 2010

Natan Haramati, Class of 2009

Ethan Walfish, Class of 2013

Jake Akman, Class of 2010

llan Goldstein, Class of 2014

Dean Bregman, Class of 2014

Gabi Amige, Class of 2013

Max Shrier, Class of 2009

Staci Smith, Class of 2011

Naomi Sapiro, Class of 2010

Justin Galizter, Class of 2019

Lerone Beroukhim. Class of 2006

Arielle (Fradkin) Poliakoff, Class of 2010

Alex Inger, Class of 2013

Corinne Bregman, Class of 2018

Daniel Greenblum. Class of 2009

Yaniv Hoffman, Class of 2009

Adam Cohen, Class of 2002

Alex Ingber, Class of 2014

Alexa Sarfati (Bennaim), Class of 2013

Freda Krosnick, Parent of 2 JDS Alumni (Saul, '07, Sam, '10)

Alexandra Niakani, Class of 2010

Haley Cohen, Class of 2012

Thomas Gutterman, Class of 2010

Jessica Berger Weiss, Class of 1980

Ben Greenblum, Class of 1997

Koral Chen, Spouse of Thomas Gutterman, '10

Doni Cohen, Class of 2010

Davitta Niakani Bartlow, Class of 2007

Ryan Bartlow, Spouse of Davitta Niakani, '07

Jacob Sadoun, Class of 2009

Gabi Cohen, Class of 2014

Zach Roth, Class of 2010

Paige Siegel, Class of 2012

Madeline Moss, Class of 2010

Jeremy Lynn, Class of 2010

Erik Sellouk, Class of 2008

Nir Levy, Class of 2011

Ashley Silver, Class of 2010

Shirel Altmann, Class of 2014

Josh Dalva, Class of 2011

Lila Berger, Class of 2021

Simon Albert, Class of 2024

Shana Bar Adon, Class of 2010

Orly Mechaly, Parent of Audrey Richardson, '10

Liat Fine (Gutin), Class of 2006

Eyal Balva, Father of Barak '10, Shahar '14, and Omer Z"L '19

Lisah Sandler Bernstein, Class of 1982

Ariana Heideman Tipograph, Class of 2000

Danielle Galitzer, Class of 2015

Lilah Bennaim, Parent of Alexa '13, Zoey '16, and Skye '25

Shira Gould, Class of 2016

Aviva Braier, Class of 2015

Frederick Richardson, Parent of Audrey, '10

Yaly Levy, Class of 2013

David Bennaim, Parent of Alexa '13, Zoey '16, and Skye '25

Shai Mesika, Class of 2015

Dr. Elana Heideman, Class of 1992

Shalom And Miriam Mesika, Parents, '20, '22, '15

Miriam (Duffy) Cohen, Class of 2011

Steven Michael Elenberg, Class of 2010

Joseph Tipograph, Class of 1998

Michelle Bronsky, Class of 2008

Drs. Efraim Kessouss and Sara Brooks

Dani Offer, Class of 2019

Daphna Hoffman, Class of 2015

Ben Kestenbaum, Class of 2016

Dean Arabov. Class of 2012

Zachary Cytryn, Class of 2010

Ilana Soumekhian, Class of 2012

Dana Levit, Class of 2008

Sydney Liss, Class of 2010

Frankie Sadoun, Class of 2010

Jay Krosnick, Parent of Saul, '07, and Sam, '10

Allison Jacobs, Class of 2011

Eden Gal, Class of 2014

Melissa Levit, Class of 2004

Jordan (Kovalsky) Nathan, Class of 2010

Raymond Moussazadeh, Class of 2009

Gila Bash Katz, Class of 1982

Noam Weinblatt, Class of 2008

Benjy Singer, Class of 1986

Ted Sandler, Class of 2010

Daniel Ilkovich, Class of 2001

Sam Charnoff, Class of 1981

Shoham Lewin, Class of 2016

Netan Rosenthal, Class of 2010

Michal and Michael Niakani, Parents of Davitta '07 and Alexandra '10

Michael Morgenstern, Class of 2007

Daniel Grossman, Class of 2014

Jayden Kasheri, Class of 2023

Ilya Lofin, Class of 1995

Ethan Evans, Class of 2008

Robert Bash, Class of 1981

Briana Felson, Class of 2012

Michelle Azhdam, Class of 2011

Penni Perlmutter, Class of 2000

Jeni Yaghoubi, Class of 2001

Dodie Katz, Class of 2001

Sara Sporkin, Class of 2019

Katie Chabbott Btesh, Class of 2001

Michael Gould, Class of 2013

Daniel Charnoff, Class of 2007

Dr. Devora Bita Azhdam, Class of 2001

Stuart Tipograph, Class of 2001

Josh Rosenberg, Class of 2011

Zach Rosenberg, Class of 2006

Rebecca Cutler (Rosenberg), Class of 2007

Talia Gutin, Class of 2008

Coby Malkus, Class of 2023

Meryl Berger Rosenberg, First Class of JDS

Dani Bernstein, Class of 2018

Dubi Bernstein, Class of 1982

Josh Schooler, Class of 2010

Brooke Cohen, Class of 2018

Elliot Azhdam, Class of 2008

Elliot Blask, Class of 2007

llan Blask, Class of 2016

Uri Schwartz, Class of 2016

Rachel Racoosin, Class of 2007

Dr. Galina Kadosh Tobin, Class of 2007

Emma Enig, Class of 2016

Karlee (Lichtenstein) Yonowitz, Class of 2007

Michael Lichtenstein, 2007 Parent

Ari Charnoff, Class of 2014

Denise and Sheldon Iskow, Parents of Jon '10, and Hannah '14

William Gutterman, Class of 2007

Megan Orbach, Class of 2016

Ben Berman, Class of 2008

Jeremy Schooler, Class of 2016

Jonathan Leener, Class of 2006

Ari Blask, Class of 2010

Perah Zohar, Class of 2023

David Hartzman, Class of 2010

Juliet Azhdam, Class of 2010

Ari Kestler, Class of 2001

Aimee Avissar Lyani, Class of 1995

Maiyan Lyani, Class of 2023

Hedi Sandberg, Class of 2008

Zion Avissar, Parent of '95

Cookie Avissar, Parent of '95

Allison Levy, Class of 2008

Edmond Andoot, Class of 2001 Elianna Bernstein, Class of 2016

Marcy Stein, mother of Andrew Stein and Jill Stein Toledo, '04 and '07

Moshe and Linda Bregman, Parents of Dean '14, Liat '16, and Corinne '18

Rebecca (Grunberger) Ben-Atar, Class of 2002, and parent of class of '32

David Herman, Class of 2011

Devir Bitton, Class of 2016

Talia Cohen, Class of 2018

Noah Soumekhian, Class of 2014

Liat Cohen, Class of 2003

Oren Goodman, Class of 2008

Andrew Stein, Class of 2004

Sarah Schecker, Class of 2015

Jill Toledo, Class of 2007

Ari Sporkin, Class of 2017

Josh Brandes, Class of 2008

Nathan Schachter, Class of 2015

David Pollak. Father of Miriam Pollak

Jonathan Cutler, Class of 1992

Jesse Bernstein-Ansaldi, Class of 2006

Ross Nachbi, Class of 2006

Jill Gould, Parent of Shira and Michael Gould

Aliza (Fishbein) Silver, Class of 2007

Courtney Cohen, Class of 2019

Dan Kestenbaum, Class of 2018

Eran Kestenbaum, Parents of '12, '16, '18

Andrew Hirsch, Class of 2001

Josh Liberneman, Class of 2007

David Roumani, Class of 2010

Hannah Rosenberg (Iskow), Class of 2014

Ben Arie, Class of 2018

Alexander Khalap, Class of 1997

Daniel Feith, Class of 2002

Jon Mervis, Class of 2001

Sharon and Samuel Galitzer, Parents of '13, '15 and '19

Yael Azrad, Class of 2016

Yamit Azrad, Class of 2011

Kathy Katz, Parent

Rebecca Mogil, Spouse of Jon Galitzer ('13)

Deborah Charnoff, Parent of '01, '07, '10

Mark Arking, Class of 1988

Melissa Arking, Class of 1988

Alex Arking, Class of 2021

Zack Arking, Class of 2022

Ella Arking, Class of 2026

Anat Chemerinski, Class of 2007

Lee Bermanis, Class of 2001

Eli Lerner, Class of 2016

Aiden Melkin, Class of 2023

Gilly Arie, Parent of Ben '18 and Maya '21

David Weinberg, Class of 2011

Susan and Dan Orbach, Parents

Yael Fishbein, Class of 2010

Renee and Mike Bernstein, Parents of '02, '05, and '09

David Feith, Class of 2005

Josh Teichman, Class of 2009

Michael Gittleson, Parent 2011

Ruben Lamdany, Parent 2008/2011

Adam Hammerman, Class of 2011 Jonathan and Alexa Lerner, Parents

Shirel Altmann, Class of 2014

Olivia Lerner, Class of 2016

Eliana Sandler (Berry), Class of 2006

Roy Kestenbaum, Class of 2012

Emily Eistenstadt, Class of 2001

Nira and Philip Berry, Parent '06, '09

Sani Nabatkhorian, Class of 2014

Steve Jacobson, Parent '07

Noga Meiry Lewin, Parent '00, '16

Hillary Aronoff, Class of 2007

Michaela Wilkes Klein, Class of 2007

Daniela Misri, Parent of Zaqui and Melina

Noah Arber, Class of 2009

Peshi Kadosh, Parent '03, '06, '07

Belly and Ernesto May, Parents of '02, '05, and '06

Liat Bregman, Class of 2016

Jeremy Etelson, Class of 2014

Sari Stahler, Class of 2008

Edieal Pinker, Class of 1985

Liz Kagan, Parent '11

Anna and Jerry Blask, Parents of Elliot '07, Ari '10, and Ilan '16

Andrew Block, Parent of Benjamin '10, Jonathan '12, Harris '16 and Rebecca '18

Jonathan Polon, Class of 1992

Ashleigh Kades, Class of 2006

Terry and Penny Duffy, Parents of '01, '08, and '11

Ariella Kestenbaum, Parent of '12, '16, and '18

Yossi Shemesh, Parent of '10, '14, '19, and '26

Louise Schneider, parent of Lindsay Schneider Barsky '10

Sara Polon, Class of 1995

Marilyn and Iran Polon, Parents Class of '92, '95

Tova Stein, Class of 2000

Sanam Zadeh, Class of 2015

Dore Feith, Class of 2014

Abigail Bortnick, Class of 1999, Current Parent

Seth Cohen, Class of 2014

Hannah Elster, Class of 2018

Avner May, Class of 2005

Haley Lerner, Class of 2014

Arielle Hazut. Class of 2014

Danya Dzarnolewski, Class of 2012

Jazmin Gelbart, Class of 2014

Joshua Eisdorfer, Class of 2013

Zachary Subar, Class of 2004

Yediel Kadosh, Class of 2003

Nathan Bortnick, Class of 2001

Odelya Kadosh, Class of 2006

Lindsey Blask, Wife of Elliot Blask, '07

Edna Gordon, Class of 2012

Samantha Trenk, Class of 2010

Stacy Smith Liss, Class of 2000

Michelle Kahen, Class of 1992

Rabbi Adam Raskin, Parent of Ezra '25

Danni Freedman, Class of 2011

Emily Hamburger, Class of 2009

Kevin Brooks, Class of 2011

Jonathan Ben Harosh, Class of 2012

Gene and Amy Kaufman Goott, Parents '02 and '05

Tsippora Dingott Rosenberg, Parent '07 and '11

Jillian Racoosin Kornmeier, Class of 2010

Minna Shezaf (Jacobson), Class of 2011

Rand H. Fishbein, Ph.D., Father of Eitan Fishbein '04, Aliza Fishbein Silver '07, and Yael Fishbein '10

Sarah Freedman Klein (formerly Sarah Freedman), Class of 2013

Micha Weinblatt, Class of 2001

Josh Akman, Class of 2007

Caryn Stark, Class of 2009

Robert and Yonit Eisdorfer, Parents of David '07, Sarah '10, Joshua '13

Lisa & Arnold Rosenthal, Parents of Netan '10

Marc Lieber, Parent of 4 alumni

Vida Yazdi, Class of 1997

Rami Kandel, Class of 1987

Rebecca Jaffe (Block), Class of 2018

Dror Ben-David, Class of 1985

Danielle Arabov, Class of 2012

Alice & Michael Ra'anan, Parents of '07 and '10

Dan Schnitzer, Class of 1998

Shahar Balva, Class of 2014

Daniel Brujis, Class of 2005

Evonne and Elliot Schnitzer, Parents and Grandparents

Margo Cohen, Parent of '02, '07, and '10

Josh Simmons, Class of 1997

Eric and Helen Kestler, Parents of Ari '01, Misha '05

Alex Frommer Schnitzer, Class of 1998

Maytal Polonetsky, Class of 2022

George Abrham, Parent '09 and '16

Michal Abraham, Class of '09

Alizah Lowell Schall, Class of 1998

Tamar Bar-Ilan, JS teacher

Susan and Arnie Schwartz, Parents '93

Juliana Gildener-Leapman, Class of 2004

Lisa & Danny Akman, Parents of Josh 2007 & Jake 2010, Danny 1978

Rob Jacobs, Parent '25

Allegra Ravitz, Class of 2019

Eric Kruglak, Class of 2011

MollyBeth Rushfield, Teacher, Parent Classes of '17, '21

Paula and Michael Lefkowitz, Parents '21 and '24

Jessica Enig, Parent '16 and '21

Ronit Miller, Teacher

Ryan and Jared Bauman, 2020 and 2017

Rebecca Schnitzer Kotok, Class of 1995 and Parent '23, '26, '28 and '28

Rebecca Kotok

Yael Uhr. Class of 1995

Mia Pearce, Class of 2020

Todd Rosenberg, 1989 and parent of members of '20 and '24

Hadas Heyman, Parent and teacher Avigyle 2020 & Elad 2025

Laura Citren, Class of 2011

Yael Gutin, Class of 2010

Benny Rushfield, Class of 2021

Leah Stroller, Class of 2009

Jessica Exelbert Rubin, Class of 1997

Ilana Braier, Class of 2012

Azriel and Eliana Levy, Parents, class of 2011, 2013, 2016

Jacob Chanin, Class of 2017

Jared Horwitz, Class of 2017

Gabriel Cohen. Class of 2017

Michael Citren, Parent '11

Matthew Altman, Class of 2006

Jacob Salzberg, Class of 2015

Danielle Wentworth (Kruglak), Class of 2007

Patrick Bensimmon, Class of 1993

Shira Kandel Leeds, Class of 1992

Tracy Krantz, Parent of Parent of Stu '14, Gabe '18, Sophie '21 & Jake '26

Oscar Chemerinski, Father of Anat And Eitan

Elizabeth Davis, Parent Class of 2025

Marc and Emily Lurie, Parents of '96, '98, and '05

Julie Fishbein, Mother of Eitan '04, Aliza '07, and Yael Fishbein '10

Moses Lisker, Class of 2015

Nina (Azhdam) Kayce, Class of 1999

Jeremy Perler, Class of 1994

Rachel Silverman, Class of 2015

Naomi Mirman, Class of 1998

Eli & Deborah Shemony, Parents of '14, '19, '24, '25

Jeremy Perler, Class of 1994

Cheryl Klaff Pearce, Class of 1987

Rachel Pinker, Parent of '82 and '85

Joel Vardon, Class of 2017

Les Ulanow, Parent '11

Cheryl Klaff Pearce, Class of 1987

Max Nissen (Yadin), Class of 2007

Adam Lazrus, Class of 2008

Kim Wilkins, JDS college counselor 2011-2022

Jamie Blum (formerly Siegal)- parent of Andrew '14 and Melanie '16

Ilana Greenblum Recca, Class of 2006

Evan Gerstenblith, Class of 2023

Shelly Finkel, Class of 1988

Ezra Loeb, Class of 2018