

# CARE FOR INCLUSION AND EQUITY ONLINE

## Table of Contents

*The instructional practices below offer five dimensions along which to foster an inclusive and equitable learning environment for your students, especially during online/remote instruction. Mark practices that you would like to explore further or commit to implementing the next time you teach.*

**C**OMMUNITY

**A**GENCY

**R**EPRESENTATION

**E**QUAL ACCESS

Pedagogies of CARE

Stanford Resources

References

## C: COMMUNITY

*Research into the social and emotional dimensions of learning, as well as [Spring 2020 feedback from Stanford students](#), indicates that a sense of social disconnection from instructors and peers impedes learning, and disproportionately impacts underrepresented students. How can you create community and social presence in your online course to benefit all of your students?*

- Communicate early, often, and if possible 1:1, with students (e.g., [pre-course survey](#),\* welcome video, Canvas Announcements, assigned time for each student to visit office hours)
- Provide synchronous and asynchronous opportunities for students to work together and get to know each other (e.g., Canvas intros, icebreakers (ideas [here](#) and [here](#)), [group work](#), [peer feedback](#) on work, informal time before or after class to socialize).
- Create opening, midpoint, or closing class rituals (e.g., opening check-ins, midway music breaks, ending shareouts).
- Convey recognition and value for each student's identity and circumstances (e.g., confirm name pronunciations [and attend to pronouns](#), set flexible deadlines to accommodate time zones, invite but do not require video participation, encourage Chat contributions)

**What other ideas can you think of?**

**What would you like to try, and what next steps will you take?**

**What questions do you have, or what challenges do you anticipate?**

\*You need to be logged into Stanford Canvas Commons to access the survey through the link.

## A: AGENCY

*Research on universal design for learning, and trauma-informed instruction, indicates that students benefit from being given choice and control in how they encounter, engage, and express their learning. How can you give students more agency in your online course?*

- Solicit student questions, contributions, and feedback on your syllabus before finalizing it.
- Empower students to choose how they engage and express their learning (e.g., via text, video, or audio, by connecting course goals to life goals, through contributing readings, leading discussions, selecting among assignment or [assessment options](#)).
- Co-create [class norms](#) with students (e.g., how to contribute, how to voice disagreement, how to raise concerns, how to participate equitably in discussions and group work)
- Support students in [controlling the feedback they receive](#) and assessing or grading themselves (e.g., through [rubrics](#), reflections, [exam wrappers](#)).
- Solicit frequent feedback from students on their course experience (thumbs up/down, [exit tickets](#), [midterm feedback](#)).

**What other ideas can you think of?**

**What would you like to try, and what next steps will you take?**

**What questions do you have, or what challenges do you anticipate?**

## R: REPRESENTATION

*Research on stereotype threat and (online) learning environments indicates that student learning is impacted by visual and other cues that send implicit signals about who belongs and who can succeed. How can you create an online course that represents and affirms all of your students?*

- Represent individuals of varied race, gender, religion, ability, etc. in your course slides, course site, and other course materials.
- Avoid using symbols or imagery that might trigger stereotypes or be perceived as exclusive (e.g., a national flag, women performing housework, people of color in service positions)
- Include explicit statements in your syllabus, course site, and assignments acknowledging that the work is challenging and expressing your confidence that every student can succeed with consistent effort and the teaching team's support.
- Diversify your curriculum so that students can see themselves reflected in the researchers, scholars, practitioners, and other figures upheld in the discipline.

**What other ideas can you think of?**

**What would you like to try, and what next steps will you take?**

**What questions do you have, or what challenges do you anticipate?**

## E: EQUAL ACCESS

*Research on the accessibility of college learning, as well as [Spring 2020 feedback from Stanford students](#), indicates that barriers to equitable learning are stronger during online/remote learning and disproportionately impact underrepresented students. How can you enable all of your students to equally access and benefit from your course's learning experiences?*

- [Organize your course online](#) to guide students along the learning path and explicitly offer multiple means for seeking help (e.g., email, office hours, questions through Canvas).
- Make materials financially accessible (e.g. by [submitting course reserve requests](#) to The Stanford Libraries, locating materials in the Internet Archive's [National Emergency Library](#), using free, [open-source](#), copyright-unrestricted online materials, posting materials on Canvas [without violating copyright](#)).
- Make materials technologically accessible (e.g., by ensuring they are [mobile-friendly](#), keeping file sizes small, turning off the default HD video in your Zoom settings to [help those who might not have reliable bandwidth](#)).
- Make materials accessible through multiple modalities (e.g., provide [image descriptions and alt-text](#) for all images and videos, narrate visual information when you share your screen, live caption your [Powerpoint](#) or [Google](#) slides, post [transcripts that can be automatically generated from Zoom sessions](#) recorded to the Cloud, use [PDFs with OCR \(Optical Character Recognition\)](#), confirm screen reader accessibility with a tool such as [Webaim](#)).

**What other ideas can you think of?**

**What would you like to try, and next steps will you take?**

**What questions do you have, or challenges do you anticipate?**

## Pedagogies of CARE

*Research on trauma-informed instruction and pedagogies of care, as well as [Spring 2020 feedback from Stanford students](#), indicates that demonstrations of caring from instructors enhance student motivation and learning. How can you show that you care about your students as whole people?*

- Build flexibility into your course design and course policies (e.g., provide due date ranges, offer multiple avenues for getting points/credit, allow for a certain number of absences or late submissions without requiring explanations or imposing penalties).
- Include explicit statements in your syllabus and course site, acknowledging that students might find coursework challenging at this time, expressing a commitment to support students without requiring personal details, and including [Stanford resources on well-being](#).
- If you notice students who stop attending class or submitting work, take the initiative in reaching out and expressing concern for their well-being and willingness to help.
- Familiarize yourself with [signs of student distress and steps you can take to help](#).

**What other ideas can you think of?**

**What would you like to try, and what next steps will you take?**

**What questions do you have, or what challenges do you anticipate?**

## Stanford Resources

## **Center for Teaching and Learning**

[10 Strategies for Creating Inclusive and Equitable Online Learning Environments](#)

[10 Strategies for Promoting Student Flourishing](#)

[10 Strategies for Engaging Discussions Online](#)

[10 Strategies for Making Virtual Office Hours More Effective](#)

[10 Strategies for Collegial Videoconferencing](#)

[Structuring Short-Term Group Work Online, with Zoom Breakout Rooms](#)

[Supporting Student Metacognition](#)

[Growing the Growth Mindset: Best Practices for College Instructors](#)

[Example PollEverywhere Activities](#)

[Course Design Strategies to Address Challenges Identified by Spring 2020 Stanford Students](#)

[Working Effectively with Teaching Assistants Online](#)

[10 Strategies for TAing Online](#)

[Course-Specific, Academic Skills Workshops for Students](#)

[Teaching Consultations](#)

[Remote Learning Guide for Students](#)

[Academic Skills Coaching for Students](#)

## **Additional**

[Teaching Students in Multiple Time Zones and Countries](#)

[Creating an Online Classroom Environment to Support Open Student Conversations](#)

[Inclusive Teaching in Zoom](#) (SOAP)

[Read and Write](#) Software, and [BeeLine Reader](#) (UIT)

[Lathrop Learning Hub](#) (VPSA)

[Stanford Teaching Commons](#)

[Stanford Universal Design for Learning](#)

[Red Folder Spring 2020](#), Stanford Vaden Health Services

[Stanford First-Generation and/or Low Income](#) (FLI)

[Stanford Queer Student Resources](#)

[Gender Inclusive Stanford](#)

[Stanford Office of Accessible Education](#)

[Stanford Online Accessibility Program](#)

[Undocumented at Stanford](#)

[Stanford Immigration Issues and Resources](#)

[Stanford Faculty Staff Help Center](#)

[Teach Anywhere](#)

[Stanford Canvas](#)

[Canvas Zoom](#)

## References

### Community

- [1] Berry, S. (2019). [Teaching to Connect: Community-Building Strategies for the Virtual Classroom](#). *Online Learning*. 23(1): 164-183.
- [2] Richardson et. al. (2017). [Social Presence in Relation to Students' Satisfaction and Learning in the Online Environment: A Meta-Analysis](#). *Computers in Human Behavior*. 71: 402-417.
- [3] Cleveland-Innes and Campbell. (2012). [Emotional Presence, Learning, and the Online Learning Environment](#). *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning*. 13(4): 269-292.
- [4] Swan and Shih (2005). [On the Nature and Development of Social Presence in Online Course Discussions](#). *Journal of Asynchronous Learning Networks*. 9(3): 115-136.
- [5] Theobald et. al. (2017). [Student Perception of Group Dynamics Predicts Individual Performance: Comfort and Equity Matter](#). *PloS one* 12(7).
- [6] Li et. al. (2020). [Does Peer Assessment Promote Student Learning? A Meta-Analysis](#). *Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education*. 45(2): 193-211.
- [7] Ozenc and Haga. (2019). [Rituals for Work: 50 Ways to Create Engagement, Shared Purpose, and a Culture that Can Adapt to Change](#). John Wiley & Sons, Inc.



- [8] Cooper et. al. (2017). [What's in a name? The importance of students perceiving that an instructor knows their names in a high-enrollment biology classroom](#). *CBE—Life Sciences Education*. 16(1): 1-13.
- [9] Gopalan and Brady (2019). [College Students' Sense of Belonging: A National Perspective](#). *Educational Researcher*. 49(2): 134-137.
- [10] Cohen, Z. (2018). ["Small Changes, Large Rewards: How Individualized Emails Increase Classroom Performance,"](#) *The EvoLLLution*.
- [11] [Community Building Activities](#), *OneHe and Equity Unbound*.

## Agency

- [12] Dell, Dell, and Blackwell. (2015). ["Applying Universal Design for Learning in Online Courses: Practical and Pedagogical Considerations"](#). *The Journal of Educators Online (JEO)*: 13(2), 166-192.
- [13] Tanner, K. (2013). [Structure Matters: Twenty-One Teaching Strategies to Promote Student Engagement and Cultivate Classroom Equity](#). *CBE Life Sciences Education*. 12(3): 322-331.
- [14] Brookfield and Preskill. (2016). [The Discussion Book](#). Jossey-Bass.
- [15] Andrade, H. (2019). [A Critical Review of Research on Student Self-Assessment](#). *Frontiers in Education*. 4(87): 1-13.
- [16] Andrade, H. (2008). [Self-Assessment through Rubrics](#). *Educational Leadership*. 65(4): 60-63.
- [17] Crowell, T. (2015). [Student Self Grading: Perception vs. Reality](#). *American Journal of Educational Research*. 3(4): 450-455.
- [18] McMurtrie, B. (2020). [What Does Trauma-Informed Teaching Look Like?](#) *The Chronicle of Higher Education*.
- [19] Gillen, A. (2020). [A Different Way to Deliver Student Feedback](#). *Inside Higher Ed*.
- [20] Lerman, L. [Critical Response Process](#).
- [21] Venet, A. (2020). [The Value of a Camera-Optional Policy](#). *Edutopia*.

## Representation

- [22] Kizilcec, R. F. & Saltarelli, A. J. (2019). [Psychologically Inclusive Design: Cues impact women's participation in STEM education](#). In *Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI)*.

- [23] Metaxa-Kakavouli, D., Wang, K., Landay, J. A., & Hancock, J. (2018). Gender-Inclusive Design: Sense of Belonging and Bias in Web Interfaces. *Proceedings of the 2018 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems*, 614:1–614:6. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3173574.3174188>
- [24] Kizilcec, R. F., Saltarelli, A. J., Reich, J., & Cohen, G. L. (2017). [Closing global achievement gaps in MOOCs](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aag2063). *Science*, 355(6322), 251–252. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aag2063>
- [25] Cohen et. al. (2012) [Empirically Validated Strategies to Reduce Stereotype Threat](#).
- [26] Taylor and Walton (2011). [Stereotype Threat Undermines Academic Learning](#). *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*. 37(8): 1055-1067.
- [27] Richards, B. (2020). [Help-Seeking Behaviors as Cultural Capital: Cultural Guides and the Transition from High School to College among Low-Income First Generation Students](https://doi.org/10.1093/socpro/spaa023). *Social Problems*, spaa023, <https://doi.org/10.1093/socpro/spaa023>
- [28] Millea et. al. (2018). [What Matters in College Student Success? Determinants of College Retention and Graduation Rates](#). *Education*. 138(4): 309-322.

### Equal Access

- [29] Wieck, Lindsey Passenger. 2020. [“An Equitable Transition to Online Learning: Flexibility, Low Bandwidth, Cell Phones, and More.”](#) *Pedagogy Playground*.
- [30] Gonzalez, et. al. (2018). [Technology Problems and Student Achievement Gaps: A Validation and Extension of the Technology Maintenance Construct](#). *Communication Research*. 47(5):750-770.
- [31] Kim, W. and Lee, J. (2015). [The Effect of Accommodation on Academic Performance of College Students with Disabilities](#). *Rehabilitation Counseling Bulletin*. 60(1): 40-50.

### Pedagogies of Care

- [32] Smith, E.N. (2020). *Expansive Care Theory: Can messages of inspiring expectations and broad regard promote students' identity safety and academic success?* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Stanford University.
- [33] Carello, J., and Butler, L. (2014). [Potentially Perilous Pedagogies: Teaching Trauma is Not the Same as Trauma-Informed Teaching](#). *Journal of Trauma and Dissociation*. 15(2): 153-168.
- [34] Bisz et. al. (2020). [Pedagogies of Care: Open Resources for Student-Centered and Adaptive Strategies in the New Higher Ed Landscape](#). West Virginia University Press Teaching and Learning.
- [35] Mortari, L. (2016). [For a Pedagogy of Care](#). *Philosophy Study*. 6(8): 455-463.
- [36] McBee, R. (2007). [What It Means to Care: How Educators Conceptualize and Actualize Caring](#). *Action in Teacher Education*. 29(3): 33-42.

