

# NOTES | ccNSO Council | Meeting 201 21 December 2023 (21:00 UTC)

## 1. Welcome and roll call

<https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=228788177>

Apologies from 4 council members, Desiree, and Katrina and Patricio

Welcome by Alejandra

### a. Is the meeting quorate?

yes

### b. Statement of Interest by Councillors

no update.

kind reminder to please complete the form

SOI form: <https://forms.gle/79Jw4wSnNhn5W4Z46>

## Administrative matters

### 2. Relevant Correspondence (<https://ccnso.icann.org/en/about/statements.htm>)

- a. Letter Chair of the Board re consultation on Public Interest Commitments and Registry Voluntary Commitments in the New Generic Top-Level Domain (gTLD) Program (see item 18)

## Minutes & Action Items

1. **Minutes Meeting 200**: Circulated 18 December 2023
2. **Action items (Tentative, TBD'ed)**

**Action Item 200-01**: Councillors to complete SOI (**Ongoing**)

**Action Item 200-02**: Council to provide feedback ombudsman position description (**Completed**)

**Action Item 200-03**: IGLC is requested to gather information on what cc's are doing in respect to WSIS and provide simpler/more targeting messaging to the ccTLDs. (**Ongoing**)

WSIS+20 on agenda of IGLC in January  
since ICANN78, focus was on heat map, ICANN79 session on internet fragmentation, and admin matters

**Action Item 200-04**: Appointment of Olga Cavalli and Pablo Rodriguez to serve their second term on the Excellence Award selection committee. Inform ICANN org and publish resolution. (**Completed**)

**Action Item 200-05**: Monitor ICANN Board Fundamental Bylaw Amendment as it relates to CCWG-AP Recommendation 7. (**Completed, see item 13**)

**Action Item 200-06:** Inform ICANN org of the Council support for the simplification of the ABR process. (**Completed**)

**199-07:** Council ad-hoc to report on succession planning external roles and responsibilities by ICANN79 (**Ongoing**)

**199-08:** ccNSO leadership conversation with RySG leadership on exchange of liaisons (**Ongoing**)

We agreed last meeting that we would try to meet at ICANN79 in person, including Councillors/others who are active in both the ccNSO and RySG (Chris, Nick and David M)

**198-08:** Liaison to GAC to follow up regarding virtual joint meeting (**Ongoing**)

Alejanadra in touch with GAC chair to re-start the agenda liaison function again

### **3. Intermeeting Decisions (since meeting 200, November 2023)**

- a. Decision on comment to revised terms of reference Pilot Holistic review
- b. Decision to support GRC submission re Continuous Improvement Framework- CCG (CIP-CCG)
- c. Appointment Sean Copeland member CIP-CCG
- d. Decision to support GRC response on retirement of non-policy recommendations

### **4. Intermeeting decisions Triage Committee**

The Triage Committee has made no decisions since meeting 200.

## **Updates**

5. **Update IDN ccPDP4** (written update)
6. **Update ECA & CSC** (*written update*)
7. **Update WGs** (written updates or taken from the meeting)
  1. **IGLC**
  2. **GRC**
  3. **SOPC**
  4. **OISC** (*no meetings pending Review*)
  5. **TLD-OPS**
  6. **DASC**
  7. **Technical WG**
  8. **MPC**
  9. **UAC**
  10. **IRP Panel selection**
  11. **CCG WS 2 Implementation**
  12. **Prioritization Framework group**

Irina: ICANN published the draft ICANN FY25 Operating Plan and Budget and the draft PTI FY25 Operating Plan and Budget and the draft 5-Year Plans for Public Comments. For more details, go to <https://www.icann.org/en/public-comment>

SOPC kicked off its work regarding the comment procedures. additional budget request not separately, but to be integrated as public comment. It is time to do that now, before the public comment end on 12 February

Are there any such requests? does council expect it to be included in its submission? also, question regarding the template

Alejandra: understood we have until feb. no requests to date

Bart: SOPC is mandated to submit comments, as the only ccNSO WG/C. if there is a budget request, it has to go through Council.

Alejandra: SOPC to reinforce there is a need to have such a template. even if we do not have a request.

## **8. Update liaisons (written updates)**

- a. Update ALAC Liaison**
- b. Update GNSO Liaison**
- c. Update UASG Liaison**

## **9. Update OISC Review**

Nick: spirit of engagement in Hamburg was positive. objectives of the group remain important to the ccnsa. covid did not help in terms of planned outreach activities

More narrow set of outreach activities for that group.

Formal report to follow in the new year.

## **10. Update ad-hoc Council Group GAP Analysis**

As you know we are taking a deep and cautious dive into matters that were triggered by the end of the delegation of .lb to the manager at the time, which initiated the caretaker situation and the letter from Kim Davies to us. It is my understanding that the Board will look at the transfer of .lb today. (see: agenda special Board meeting 21 December transfer of the .LB (Lebanon) top-level domain to the Internet Society Lebanon)

Also recall the Council had a workshop on this topic and informed the community at ICANN78 that Council is undertaking a Gap Analysis, and promised to consult the community more extensively at ICANN79.

With this in mind I give the floor to Jordan to update us on progress to date by the ad-hoc group

Jordan: Ad-hoc met a few times since the Hamburg meeting to better understand issues and identify possible Gaps and how we want to suggest to address them:

In our view it is an iterative process. Sensitise the environment. Take a further look at what is in front of us so we ultimately suggest: there is no action needed, we can address the issue through implementation, or we need to address it through a PDP.

To date we have identified following:

- Need for overview of relevant ccTLD related policies and practices: ranging from RFC 1591 as interpreted through FoI to the Accountability Framework Guideline
- “Clean up” of RFC 1591: parts of it have become obsolete, for example limited number of gTLDs to principles like IANA is not in the business to determine what is and what is not a country.
- Gaps in current practice ( policy or implementation): case in point .lb

In addition we are looking at the various methods to handle the various issues, ranging from PDP to take no-action.

BY ICANN79 we hope to present to you an overview of the issues we have identified to date and path on how to address them and seek your and community feed-back. Over next weeks we will be further detailing the aspect  
Tribute to Bart for the excellent research and work done, and also Kim Davies

### **11. Update ccNSO Website redesign**

Bart: personas. Scenarios developed. How do certain people in certain scenarios find information on the ccnso website? e.g. how can a newbie find information on the ccnso website? You hardly find anything via the search function.

12 personas developed. lots of information is similar. high-level requirements and priorities. a good search tool is key. diverse group of people involved in the program.

### **12. Update Bylaw change repository**

As you recall we do maintain a repository for Bylaw changes. Recently Article 18 and 19 were adjusted. Last month we also discussed issues pertaining to recommendations 7 of the Auction proceeds WG. The Board resolution did provide for in depth discussion on Fundamental Bylaw changes, and one of the actions coming out of our discussion was a need to update our Bylaw Repository

Bart: see table with overview.

Latest fundamental bylaws change: no longer need for a non ccnso member (cctld manager not member of the ccnso) in CCWG.

Nick: limitation to accountability mechanisms. of concern? were the arguments by board justified to remove accountability mechanisms in certain circumstances? e.g. auction proceeds. understand the rationale, but the way it was implemented?

Jordan: good questions. the CCWG said the decisions about grants should be excluded from IRP. ICANN decided to solve that in a contractual way. hence the back and forth. but in the end agrees

Tatiana: it would be good to think about how this outcome was achieved. angle of accountability and change in the system. fine with either outcome, but instead of looking at the substance of the request in relation to auctions, we should also look at the process.

Bart: this was discussed also during the previous council meeting. there was no real issue with the substance in this particular case. concerns about the process. hence number 12 in this repository.

Jordan: it raises a bit of a question about how much community groups do in terms of 'monitoring implementation' or should be asked back about

Bart: initial recommendation was adopted. but probably not analysed thoroughly when it was presented to the board. good to keep monitoring it.

Tatiana: I don't think the system should be too rigid - there should be a room for flexibility if the solutions don't work

Nick: ultra-conservative approach, the bylaw change. AP is ongoing for a decade. avoid endless litigation on whether applications are submitted successfully.

Tatiana: request ICP. Could we reach out to the Ry/Rr? regarding how to enhance collaboration. change to have informal conversation with g-side registries?

Alejandra: role for liaison that we are seeking to have soon. but unsure whether to start the conversation now?

something that we observed last meeting. not deciding anything here and now. there is no decision to be taken. we monitor how to evolve this. if there is something we can do about it, let's reflection the if and how/when.

Jordan Carter (ccNSO Cncl) to Everyone (21 Dec 2023, 22:46)

In a practical sense, does this remain something to be monitoring? And @Nick Wenban-Smith .UK ccNSO council can you point to where one might find such commentary etc?

Tatiana Tropina - ccNSO council NCA to Everyone (21 Dec 2023, 22:49)

Yes it's probably not urgent and frankly I think Nick's point is very important 😊  
(About future thinking)

Jordan Carter (ccNSO Cncl) to Everyone (21 Dec 2023, 22:50)

I'll also observe that we don't have to support people to earn their support particularly, but we do have to be engaged and listening to them and understanding the issue - so I'll put that down as something to chat about with the GNSO people at the SO/AC chairs meet in January

Tatiana Tropina - ccNSO council NCA to Everyone (21 Dec 2023, 22:50)

Jordan, I agree - it's not a trade of "you scratch my back, I scratch your back". All contextual.

### **13. Update Chair, Vice-Chairs, Councillors, RO's and Secretariat**

- **Listening Session with the ICANN Board Ombuds Search Committee**

Listening session ICANN Board Ombudsman search committee

Create a safe environment. Proactive, not only reactive. Strengthening the ombuds office.

Confidence & confidentiality. Awareness of cultural and linguistic diversity.

Description of processes, roles of community, staff, etc. (Guidelines - How to handle complicated situations?)

- **Meeting with Interim CEO**

Meeting interim CEO - A few hours ago. Notes will be circulated when they are available.

Looking towards the upcoming roundtable: WSIS+20 & Role of SO/AC Chairs group

- **Upcoming in person Round Table**

Upcoming Roundtable 9 to 11 January in Washington DC - major topics:

- What goes well, needs to improve in relation between Board and community and Organisation and community
- Responsibility and mutual Expectations around SO/AC chair forum
- WSIS +20 : coordination of efforts
- Shared priorities

Biyi: we and Sally discussed the need to have the conversation regarding WSIS+20. community to understand the importance and how it affects the ecosystem

Jiankang: when decision regarding the new CEO?

Alejandra: believe they are still searching

Jordan:

ccNSO

council:

<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/timeline-ceo-search-17nov23-en.pdf>

## **Administrative Matters & Decisions**

### **14. Council Election and Board Nomination Process Reports**

#### **a. Adoption Board Nomination process report**

For Decision

Joke: update regarding content of the report, and nomination and election observations. 2 recommendations: council to advice GRC to check adjustments to guideline, to ensure alignment with other nomination procedures, and placeholders

Move? Irina

Second? Pablo

no questions or comments

Sean: abstain (because of GRC)

no objections. all in favour

#### **b. Adoption Council Election process report**

Joke: update regarding the content of the repor, including observations regarding lack of guidance in case quirom cannot be reached

Demi: move

Stephen: second

questions or comments? none

abstain: Sean

objections? none

adopted.

#### **15. Update 360 Review Councillors**

In January 2023 the ccNSO Council adopted the first version of the Terms of Reference ccNSO Council internal 360 review procedure. Following the procedure the first 360 review was conducted in the April- May 2023 timeframe. After concluding the review, the Council evaluated the procedure, including the question in Annex A, and agreed to limit the number and order of the questions.

Sean: order of the questions. they focused down, then wide, then down again. flow would make them easier to answer

Alejandra: helps with the evaluation

move? missing from notes

Second? missing from notes

all in favour

Heads up: next round soon. timeline for decision in January meeting

#### **16. Appointments to WG and Committees**

**a. Appointment Jenifer Lopez (.pa) SOs/ACs to Nominate Fellowship Program Mentors**

**b. Appointment Wafa Dahmani, Council NomCom appointee, as a member to the DASC, IGLC and SOPC.**

combined decisions

Move? Jordan

Second: Sean

Abstain: Wafa

object: none

approved

## **For Discussion and Decision, if needed**

### **17. Participation and/or comments ccNSO or Council in/on the Community Consultation on Public Interest Commitments/Registry Voluntary Commitments.**

Introduction of the topic: Like every SO and AC we have received a letter from Tripti to seek input from the ccNSO on:

Framework document, which proposes a path for implementing the Public Interest Commitments and Registry Voluntary Commitments, commitments in the New gTLD Program: Next Round, and

Submit written input to questions related to the framework document

At this stage want to have your view whether we should participate as ccNSO or Council

Note that to date we as ccNSO have not participated in the new gTLD Program: Next Round, individual ccTLDs have, but the ccNSO nor the Council has not.

Please share your views

Irina: suggestion for council not to be involved

Stephjen: agree.

Alejandra: will draft a letter with a response

### **18. Tentative Block schedule & meetings ICANN79**

Notes missing, lost connection for a brief moment

#### **Joint meetings:**

- **GNSO Council: two meetings a year of which one is virtual.**
- **Meeting with GAC- no progress.**
- **Meeting with ccNSO related Board members**

Topics? format? Any suggestions? let us know

Sean: GRC is looking at another continuous improvement session

Pablo: come early, we will make it worthwhile

### **19. Closure 20th Anniversary**

- **Review of anniversary: What went well , what did not go well, are there ways to address what did not go well**
- **Outcome world cafe: what to do with results?**
- **Closure anniversary team**

Pablo: good session, hard to keep people involved in December. we will continue to seek how else and what else we can do to improve the opportunities.

Nick: amazing series of events. feel like a relative newcomer. lots was looking backwards. when exactly was the anniversary?

Alejandra: june meeting.

Jordan: nice celebrations.

Bart: adoption bylaw article IX Montreal Meeting

Alejandra: closure of the ad hoc group. New OISC to take over outreach. Thank you all for time, activity, sponsors etc.  
20th anniversary activities concluded.

## **20. AOB**

Stephen: katrina's update on ccPDP3-RM  
GAC comments. happy with subject matter experts to be consulted regarding the board review

## **21. Next Council Meetings**

- a. Meeting 202, 18 January 2024 -12.00 UTC
- b. Meeting 203, 15 February 2024 - 18.00 UTC
- c. prep for ICANN79, 22 February 2024 -18.00 UTC
- d. Meeting 204, March 2024 - ICANN 79 (TBD)

## **22. Adjourn**

thank you all, happy holidays.