TEI Technical Council
Online "VF2F", 2020-10-24 / 10-26

plus add-on sessions ??

Zoom-Meeting — all
1. Mon morning Zoom link = https://duke.zoom.us/j/8407352885

Sunday US Zoom Link:

https://duke.zoom.us/j/8407352885

Saturday, Oct 24	09:00–13:00 EDT 14:00–18:00 BST 15:00–19:00 CEST	Council meeting
Sunday, Oct 25	09:00–12:00 GMT 10:00–13:00 CET	European break-outs
	09:00–13:00 EDT 13:00–17:00 GMT 14:00–18:00 CET	Council meeting
	14:00–16:30 EDT	American break-outs
Monday, Oct 26	09:00–13:00 EDT 13:00–17:00 GMT 14:00–18:00 CET	Council meeting

(all times UTC)	Sat 24 Oct, 13:00–17:00	Sun 25 Oct, 09:00–12:00	Sun 25 Oct, 13:00–16:45	Sun 25 Oct, 18:00–20:30	Mon 26 Oct, 13:00–17:00
Syd Bauman	✓		✓	✓	✓
Meaghan Brown	✓		✓	✓	✓
Elisa Beshero-ro-Bondar	✓		✓	✓	✓
Hugh Cayless	✓		✓	✓	✓
Nicholas Cole	✓	✓	✓		✓
Vanessa Bigot Juloux					
Jessica H. Lu					✓
Martina Scholger	✓	✓	✓		✓
Peter Stadler	✓	✓	✓		✓
Magdalena Turska	✓	✓	✓		✓
Raff Viglianti	✓		✓	✓	✓
Martin Holmes			✓		
Satoru Nakamura			✓		
Kazuhiro Okada			✓		
Kiyonori Nagasaki			✓		
Laurent Romary					✓

Collection of topics

- Stylesheets issues
- Guidelines issues
- Guidelines redesign
- Proposal on ruby glosses (invite proposers)
- Proposal on CMC
- ISO
- Proposal on Vanilla (codename) customization - report from the online meetup (MT)
- remove @version on <TEI> and <teiCorpus>
- Status P6

Saturday, 24 — full council

- Proposal on Vanilla (codename) customization - report from the online meetup (MT)
  - related issue: naming and description of TEI Simple Print and TEI Lite
  - more introductory material is needed. (much is outdated, examples and available tooling)
  - no linear progression through the body of TEI materials. Reference material can be baffling for beginners.
  - Examples should be complete documents (e. g. as provided by TEI Publisher community). (Problem of relying on small code blocks and need to see the bigger picture).
    - Need for a curated repository of examples in different languages (as discussed in i8n group too)
    - Spanish (TTHub) and Japanese training materials are very good: can these be brought together on the TEI website?
    - Can the TEI website be a better resource for this? Invite community members to contribute to a series of Wordpress posts.
    - (Yes, TEI website has a list of pointers to projects, but that is less than ideal for this purpose for a variety of reasons.)
  - schema is a secondary matter
  - SB, at least, strongly objects to the name "Vanilla"
  - Potential Next Steps?
    - TEI Council should review the current introductory material and try to curate and filter some of the older material to ensure that it is relevant to current guidelines.
    - Encourage creation of 'Road Not Taken' examples? Explanations of decisions and alternates not chosen
    - Can we encourage some material to be written on presenting TEI documents (as a technical matter)
- Report: remove @version on <TEI> and <teiCorpus>
  - Late-breaking objection
  - Council will proceed with standard 2-year deprecation for removing @version from <TEI> and <teiCorpus>
  - Continue developing datatypes for semantic, and maybe calendar, versioning
- Next release — milestones
  - next release on February, 25 (Thursday): Refrig: Friday 2021-02-12. Freeze: Friday 2021-02-19.
  - Release techs (tentative): lead tech JL?, NC (assist), note taker?
  - Advise Ruby and CMC groups that publication in next release is a reasonable (although not guaranteed) goal
- Proposal on CMC
  - CMC subcommittee report: source (or XHTML)
  - SB thinks issue #2010 probably should be part of CMC (if not sooner)
  - discuss in next Council meeting
- Redesign of Guidelines HTML representation
  - https://github.com/TEIC/TEI/issues/2023
  - old HTML styles, use of tables for formatting
  - bring them up to date, mobile friendly, **accessible for screen readers**

- - ○ needs user testing; get **external advisor**
    - ○ do we want to do major redesign
      - ■ Screen reader compatibility
      - ■ Compliance with EU, USA accessibility guidelines & legislation.
      - ■ Layout that is easier for people with limited vision or other issues with readability.
    - ○ Retain simplicity of production process: no JS library dependency
    - ○ Accessibility -- Alexandra von Criegern
    - ○ **Action** on **MS, HC, RV**: Circulate (to TEI Council) a draft proposal to the TEI Board for funds for consulting help (particularly with accessibility) **by Tue 01 Dec 20**.
  - Status P6 (MS: quick question)
    - ○ HC: discussion of P6 largely driven by technological stack issues, e.g. XML + JSON + HTML custom elements vs. only XML.
    - ○ PS: perhaps P6 would rewrite the class system so there's proper inheritance
    - ○ NC: perhaps could P6 permit overlap.
    - ○ NC: What if we had a Blue Skies meeting once or twice a year?
  - Any Other Business
    - ○ SB suggests that, because our VF2F meetings are significantly shorter than real F2F meetings, we should increase the frequency of meetings.
    - ○ Consensus is to add a VSF2F (virtual short face-to-face) in late January or early February:
      - ■ Americans meet Friday afternoon / evening
      - ■ Europeans meet Saturday morning
      - ■ Council convenes as a whole on Saturday (morning for Americans, afternoon for Europeans)
      - ■ no meeting Sunday
    - ○ brief ISO 8601 report (SB, 2 mins)
      - ■ date and times issue
      - ■ SB has an official searchable PDF copy thanks to the Northeastern University Libraries (cost ~450 USD).
  - [Review Guidelines Issues from the spring F2F](#)

Sunday, 25

European Break-outs (3 hours)

- Guidelines Issues

Full Council

- 13:00Z Proposal on ruby glosses (with Kiyonori Nagasaki)

- - https://docs.google.com/document/d/1rRgBRYpxUlsnMEHbOPW-92u_AIMNwq9axGtpI1UGgz8/edit#heading=h.xjusjhhdlit2
  - Use @place instead of @rend
  - Nagasaki: Adding suggested values 'right' and 'left' to @place in att.placement would be useful for this proposal, but also for vertical aligned text in general
  - Discussion of @type primary | secondary. SB thinks it may be not entirely accurate. MH suggests default | additional. List of values should nonetheless be open.
  - Discussion on fragmentation of the ruby text (e.g. kanji) to align the ruby reading to it (e.g. hiragana). The proposal with anchor as a divider is not favored.
    - Suggestion (action on: SIG?) to show the same example encoded in the various models being proposed.
  - MH: there will likely be two forms, one with nesting structure and one relying on standoff in order to cover the most complex cases.
  - MH: where should it go in the Guidelines.
  - SB: One possibility would be in the core module next to the note element.
  - **Action on MS**: open an issue on GitHub, linking to the proposal from there **by** 2020-11-01. Work on different examples and the ODD should take place there.
  - **Action on SB**: post first draft ODD and instance on GitHub ticket **by** one week after MS has created it. Syd's-note-to-self: ~/Documents/tei-work/ruby.odd and ~/Documents/tei-work/ruby01.xml.
- Review Guidelines Issues from break-outs

American Break-outs (3 hours)

- Guidelines Issues

Monday, 26

- ISO (with Laurent Romary)
  - TC37/SC3 does terminology management systems
  - TBX format for exchanging terminological information used in translation management systems.
  - New chair of SC3 wants to establish better interfaces and liaisons with other groups
  - LB was liaison w/ SC4
  - Liaison could be appointed each year w/in Council, skim/read proposals and messages, and keep Council updated
  - Can provide feedback on ISO proposals
  - Some proposals are about defining TBX in ODD. TEI could bring in some ISO terminology for the Dictionary chapter for example.

- ○ SB: is SC3 reviewing documents on their own? LR: they would inform representatives. contact person has responsibility to ask back in own organisation. We have to appoint someone.
  - ○ General meetings are every 6 months. Working groups may meet more frequently depending on projects. There's a plenary every June on terminology and term extraction systems/methods.
  - ○ (Other TEI connections: SC4: feature structures. Others, Lexical Markup Framework (for lexical databases) mention TEI.) TEI already had a liaison with SC4.
  - ○ Request is for a liaison w/ SC3 working group, but probably our liaison would be connected w/ SC4 too. Lou Burnard has already agreed to step aside.
  - ○ Timeframe: when do they need a liaison? Maybe as soon as we have Council election results.
  - ○ NC is interested, pending re-election to Council.
  - ○ Council should check every January about the status of our ISO liaison, and make the liaison(s) public on TEI website.
  - ○ Other liaisons to investigate: DocBook? JATS?
  - ○ Action on MS to write Kathryn Tomasek -> NC will be the representative of TEI-C
- ● We could make a list of liaisons
  - ○ official
  - ○ unofficial (those Council need not appoint/update)
  - ○ strategic partnerships/liaisons
- ● Internationalization report
  - ○ RV put together an airtable for the glossary of terms of the TEI from German and Japanese glossary + i18n.xml file. Discussed how to use the glossary. Start translation work on specs and if we encounter something to translate add it to the glossary.
    - ■ Glossary https://airtable.com/tblzh2JnHxAy44ThO
  - ○ Gimena del Rio Riande wants to start with first steps at a workshop in November.
  - ○ MT organisational question - plan for the translation work?
    - ■ Spanish, German, and Japanese groups were the first to get involved, but there's no plan yet. i18n is very open, but hard to organize. Japanese group is very active. Hard to coordinate due to time zone differences.
    - ■ Need to work out how the TEI website can be a better hub for finding out ongoing translation efforts. And have multilingual landing pages.
    - ■ Should become an internationalization SIG instead of working group eventually.
    - ■ MT: TEI Publisher (with 17 languages involved): crowdsourcing translation workflow: atomized particles for translation for interface. Bracket off untranslatable code like {{count}}. Make it easy for people to contribute: Need a lot of preparation for that including good access to open source tools like Crowdin, and lots of motivational work to find people!

- ■ PS and HC: how to work on specs translations. Crowdin wouldn't work so well for this. But we will need to work on interface translation, too. Is there GitHub integration for translation crowd-sourcing software?
- Review Guidelines Issues from break-outs
- get rid of outdated directory "genetic" from the TEI directory, see https://github.com/TEIC/TEI/issues/2043

Status: Needs discussion

Guidelines Issues from the spring F2F

No.	Group	Title	Comment
#1921	C	Remove <schemaSpec> from model.divPart and add to small set of elements	Subgroup totally agrees with JC. We really need to de-class-ify this. However, Council agreed to deprecation (with some dissent). → MS: SB put schemSpec into model.frontPart instead of model.divPart, and in turn add it directly to content models of body and div(s). 2020-10-24: green
#1925	D	<equiv> should get the @predicate attribute	Subgroup suggests Status:Go, with @predicate put in a class. 2020-10-24: green for PS
#1928	C	Substring highlighting for egXML	Great idea (saith JC). We should close one of these tickets as superfluous. 2020-10-24: HC or EB will prod James Cummings about #1632 if he wants to develop it. If not close#1632 and continue work in #1928.. (PS: Consider whether this is "student-friendly" with mentorship from one of us.)
#1929	D	What is a paragraph, really?	Subgroup greenlights EB to revisit definition/description of <p>, but any concrete change to the Guidelines would warrant further discussion. 2020-10-24: Consider putting ab in core would resolve some issues: <ab> should be able to be encoded like <p>. <p> is an artefact of Western culture, and <ab> could really be primary, with <p> as a special instance.

#1931	C	Examples min P5 are unnumbered	Subgroup recommends that we rethink how we deal with examples generally (connected with highlighting, too, and i8n group's needs to prioritize examples in particular languages). For now, we should consider it low priority. JC notes he is writing an article for jTEI about some of the issues with examples. 2020-10-24: Permalinks help, but would encourage people to link to old versions. So could be twinned with an alert if the user is looking at old versions to be displayed on old versions of the guidelines.
#1933	D	exemplum and language	Subgroup suggests this ticket for consideration by i18N SIG. 2020-10-24: HC: examples are on the agenda for future discussion of i8N group. RV: What would we be asking i18n? Shouldn't Council be doing the mechanism of this work on advice of i18n? - Maybe we need an attribute or an exemplumGroup element to say: include this exemplum in X language version of the Guidelines, even if it's not in that group. @xml:lang can be set to "mul" or "und" (undetermined), always output. - PS: Perhaps best to output all, and on the interface make the examples collapsible. Burden of processing should be on the interface, not the output. - MB/MS: Do some examples only have relevance within a specific language? Should we reserve xml:lang for those special cases? (No, b/c we want a way to access all examples in a given language.) Maybe a different attribute

			● SB: We should generate an internal version of GLs that displays all the examples in all languages, just to see if it looks acceptable. (SB suspects it will not, others suspect it will.) ● Change the logic of how exemplum is output. This is a good Stylesheets Group meeting activity.
#1934	C	Categories of uncertainty	Greenlight to add to att.typed 2020-10-24: greenlight, add \<certainty> to att.typed
#1939	C	Content models for \<front> and \<back> identical?	Subgroup agrees that \<front> and \<back> should be identical, and that model.divBottom does indeed belong in \<front> as well as \<back>. We should greenlight to try to implement. 2020-10-24: Wait, we should greenlight to find a way to implement making front and back identical. There may be a few options for this, so Needs discussion and Go.
#1942	D	Unused test files should be removed	Subgroup changed to Status:Go. 2020-10-24: SB will go ahead
#1943	C	Allow \<bibl> in \<label>	HC will write to Scott to prod him for an example. → MS: no reaction from Scott 2020-10-24: closed
#1945	D	lg element content model prevents accurate encoding	Subgroup thinks this ticket can be deferred in favor of #1877, which may solve the issue. 2020-10-24: deferred
#1946	C	No column- nor row-spanning examples?	Subgroup likes the example and thinks this needs to be greenlighted. 2020-10-24: greenlighted

#1953	D	improve example	Subgroup suggests change Status:Go. [Note: Very American example] 2020-10-24: greenlighted **Action on SB by 2020-11-01:** Generate a version of example that does not use (the very clever) empty naming elements, or refer to <place> entries not in evidence. **DONE, 2020-10-24.**
#1957	C	FR: Declarative Citation Structure	Subgroup likes this and observes we need to review HC's PR. Assigned EB, MS, and PS to review. 2020-10-24: ping EB, MS, and PS to review PR
#1961	D	inconsistent indication of elided content in examples	Subgroup suggests greenlighting this ticket and assigning it to a new Councilmember (JL). 2020-10-24: greenlighted, maybe assign a brand-new Council member to this in January? (good for a beginner w/ Council)
#1962	C	Make Licensing explicit in repo	Subgroup totally agrees with this; it should be green. We need to add BSD-2 and CCBY to the TEI repo. Should it apply to other repos in TEI-C as well? (There is one already on Stylesheets repo.) Tite is under GPL2 Guidelines is BSD-2 and CCBY 2020-10-24: need proper license on the Guidelines. We should add the license files to the top level of the GitHub repo. AND remove (or make more explicit) what the current licence at https://github.com/TEIC/TEI/tree/dev/P5/Legal is about
#1966	C	Inconsistency in character representation	Subgroup agrees with SB that this needs careful investigation to determine whether some of these

			inconsistencies are actually appropriate/deliberate. 2020-10-25: NC will work on prose for explaining when that U+hex will be interpreted as a character point, and any other text will be interpreted literally.
#1986	C	add altIdentifier to att.datable	Subgroup agrees that altIdentifier should be added to att.datable, but NOT msIdentifier because that should always be the current one. No-one Asked For It (HC wants this to become a new doctrine). 2020-10-25: SB notes that msIdentifier can't be used more than once, but altIdentifier should be used instead.
#1988	C	Schematron constraint for ab is too crude	Subgroup agrees with the recommendation to amend the Schematron to recognize the special "floating-text-like" contexts for things like <ab> and <p>. Recommend greenlighting. 2020-10-25: Greenlight to modify the Schematron rule as Martin suggests.

New Guidelines issues (since May) Group A: PS, MS, MT, NC Group B: EB, HC, MB, PS, RV			
#1981	A	att.declaring and att.declarable need constraints and better explanation	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup suggests that the ticket should be split: the typos and unclear explanations should be corrected now, but the several substantive issues should be split into new tickets. Council: Go for cleaning up the typos and unclear explanations first.
#1987	A	Remove unnecessary comments from ODD customization exemplars	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup agrees with SB's proposal to turn comments in a proper documentation. MARK as GREEN, Status GO

#1989	A	idno: different desc for English and other languages	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup assigned MS to prod native speakers for updating the descriptions Green: Raff should add the Italian translation.
#1991	A	Requirements for New Sanity Checker	2020-10-25: Great ticket for collecting ideas for a useful utility, but not necessarily Council's priority. If someone wants to build this, Council would be happy to give advice. Council discussion: Listing out things that need to be checked, and offering it as a project for continued work seems a good idea. Where to post such a list? Raff could work on ticket for romabeta sanity checking. EB opens a new ticket on the Documentation repo to deal with the horror that is https://tei-c.org/guidelines/customization/getting-started-with-p5-odds/
#1992	A	Some titleStmt children should be members of att.datable.	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup discusses the issue for a long time +over the datable 'role' of author (and editor). In general we agree. We also think that this is a theoretical issue, and of low priority. Council: Go Green and low priority.
#1994	A	Description of desc needs to be expanded	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup thinks that an example outside the TD module should be added to the specs. Discuss if there should also be a subchapter in the prose (core module). Our proposal is to shorten the description to: "contains a brief description of its parent element." https://tei-c.org/release/doc/tei-p5-doc/en/html/CO.html#COHQU

			Council greenlights for NC and EB to proceed.
#1999	A	why is <graphic> not a member of att.typed?	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup agrees to add att.typed, greenlight Council agrees, also improve the example.
#2000	A	Permit <row> and <cell> within <rdg> and <lem>	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup thinks that it's a valid use case to encode the structural difference of tables (and lists!) between witnesses. Thus we propose to a) permit row and cell within app; b) permit app within row; c) add item to app; d) ask OP for a real world example Council: Green. Assign to MT, also to supply examples. Work on both lists and tables.
#2001	A	listPrefixDef and prefixDef – problems with wording of prose and usage	2020-10-25: F2F subgroups - improve prose and use "private URI scheme" instead of "prefixing scheme", as OP requested. We are not aware of examples within the guidelines of the second issue raised by this ticket. Green and Yellow: Try reworking the language and discuss, add HC
#2002	A	FR: Allow @period to have Datatype of "1–∞ occurrences of teidata.pointer separated by whitespace"	2020-10-25: F2F subgroups agrees to change teidata.pointer to 1–∞ occurrences (without the remark proposed by Syd). Green to proceed.
#2003	A	FR: <surfaceGrp> should contain model.graphicLike	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup tends to disagree. What is a group without its members? Additionally, the OP is not forced to use a group but might use facsimile or surface (with a graphic) to link to the PDF. Council: surfaceGrp wasn't modeled for this. Suggest to use facsimile instead and close the ticket.

#2006	A	Guidelines wrongly document @wit as attribute for <rdgGrp>	2020-10-25: F2F subgroup tends to agree with Hugh and "ralessi" that the way forward is to fix the prose rather than reintroduce @wit on rdgGrp. Consensus: Fix the prose.
#2007	A	Expand translation spreadsheet and generate glossary	2020-10-25: superceded by the installation of the i18n group; closed issue
#2010	A	Proposal: new element <persPronouns>	2020-10-25: We agree this is a good proposal. We think that an open list of space separated values (for the @value attribute) is probably the right solution, and that the nominative case only is probably sufficient, so for a person who goes by two sets of pronouns: "she/her/hers they/them/theirs" can simply be: "she they". Council: SB: this is useful for the CMC group. What module is best for this? Add SB to ticket to help MB. Make ticket green/orange.
#2011	B	<pubPlace> vs <place>	VF2F subgroup thinks <place> should not go in <bibl>, and that duncdrum's example should be encoded with <pubPlace>; or, if he is uncomfortable calling a performance a publication, then <placeName> (also allowed in bibl) Closed with a comment.
#2012	B	revamp att.interpLike	VF2F subgroup thinks this should simply be green, go (for option #3) Green for SB to proceed with option 3.
#2013	B	Add more elements to att.docStatus	VF2F subgroup thinks if we do this (as most of us think we should) it should be added to att.global.responsibility. Council: Maybe we need a better name than `att.docStatus` for a global (or larger set). `@status` is

			already specified for certain elements. Maybe `@encStatus`? Possibly we revisit @status on att.transcriptional: att name is not appropriate to what it's for. Possibly: change att.docStatus, such that we redefine the @status attribute, and change <correction>. The @status defined on that element is a narrowed-down version of what we'd want on a global scale. HC: Better to work towards it, and accomplish it fully after a deprecation period. Or just change att.docStatus as the ticket requests, for gradual solution. Work on describing what would need to happen to make att.docStatus global and revisit.
#2015	B	indefinite articles	VF2F subgroup notices this is already underway and makes it green
#2016	B	<place> should be allowed to contain <address> as a child.	VF2F subgroup thinks <location> serves to signal <address> as a specific location just like a geo-coordinate reference, and does not think we should allow <place> to contain <address> as a direct child. Location info could be subject to change in reference to a place (volcanic eruption/geopolitical change of streetnames, etc) 13.3.4 "Places" defines place as having a name and a location. Country, region, and settlement are all specializations of the generic placeName element and are therefore allowed as children of place. address is not semantic sugar for placeName so it should remain in <location>

			However, HC notes that this section is unsophisticated and may need updating. Subgroup recommends we reject James' idea for now, and also consider revisiting the language about place and location in 13.3.4 Council: Close with explanation. Open a new ticket for HC to to work on 13.3.4
#2019	B	ptr element should allow desc child	Subgroup agrees with LB's comment and thinks this should be rejected.
#2023	full Council	Guidelines Redesign	2020-10-25: briefly discussed on Saturday: **Action** on **MS, HC, RV**: Circulate (to TEI Council) a draft proposal to TEI Board for funds for consultant help (particularly with accessibility) **by Tue 01 Dec 20**.
#2026	B	Build process linkchecker needs replacing	Yup. Subgroup recommends greenlighting
#2027	B	<eg> element should have more explanation and at least one example in the chapter it comes from	Subgroup agrees that there need to be more examples of the examples
#2028	B	`@calendar` should allow multiple values	Subgroup does like the idea of multiple values on `@calendar` but we note a larger issue: We wonder if `@calendar` should be removed from att.datable because too many elements can take it. It should only be on `<date>` and dateTime elements.` @calendar` is explicitly for defining text coded in date form (it shouldn't be used on placeName, persName, etc.) We added MB to the ticket b/c she has a good example from her work. Council: Green (not yellow). Open a new ticket to address att.datable.calendar about the removal of @calendar from too many places

#2029	B	Permit \<licence\> within \<docImprint\>	Subgroup asks, wouldn't \<imprimatur\> do what you want, Lou? JL will close in a few days if LB hasn't responded / invite LB to respond in closing.
#2033	B	various concerns with 13.3.7 Dates and Times	Subgroup thinks this is green for minor corrections, but if SB wants to restructure the whole chapter, that needs a new ticket.
#2034	B	Nested vColl elements	Subgroup leans toward clarifying the Guidelines prose to match the content model, which permits indirect nesting of vColl within fs. Because TEI feature structures are assoc with ISO standards, we should check w/ Laurent or Lou before making changes here. Ch 18 identifies ISO 24610-1:2006 standard as corresponding w/ our Guidelines. Council at VF2F agrees that the schema should be adjusted to allow to nest.
#2035	full Council	naming and description of TEI Simple Print and TEI Lite	already discussed that on Saturday
#2036	B	versionDate attribute needs more constraint	Subgroup thinks this should be green to implement the Schematron solution to constrain `@versionDate`, after 2008 or at least a 4-digit date, and before the day after tomorrow. Also, that we need to change the description of `@versionDate`. Council agrees that the constraint is important for the schema that constraints P5 and its customizations (i.e., p5odds and tei_customization), but is split on whether it should be *a part* of P5 or not. Might be good to have a more restrictive datatype, maybe like teiData.dateTime, for use in documentation. Require a full date or

			a dateTime, four-digit year. Post Unix start date: 1970-01-01? Green + Yellow: Ask SB + MB to come up with a good plan for combining a datatype + Schematron check.
#2037	B	Element/@ident without English glosses or descs	Subgroup thinks that everything about att.translatable is wrong and needs to be rewritten. Subgroup also is mildly in favor of requiring an English <gloss> for every specification element, whether it is "needed" or not by the current rules. That would a) give us a place to put the @versionDate for the translators, b) make it so that all languages are treated equally, and c) allow p5odds to require a <gloss> child of <elementSpec>, etc. It does mean someone would have to write XSLT to generate the needed <gloss xml:lang="en">, which is easy, but what would their @versionDate values be? (Suggestion: take the newest of all the other <gloss>es. Yes, there is a small chance it has been changed since, but how would we catch that?) d) Having an English gloss present where it wasn't before will help the i8n translation process to have a "hook" for translations. SB thinks that a blue sky conversation is needed about idents and namespaces in general (may be a P6 thing) PS: Maybe wait for 18n group to share their workflow for identifying what needs translation? Discussion: Adding glosses should help the 18n group... SB: What we really need is the date the `@ident` was last changed?

			PS: We'll need to change our styleguides for updating the Guidelines to ensure English gloss is present. Council: Green for SB to require the English gloss
#2040	B	elementRef cannot reference a namespaced elementSpec	Subgroup thinks this may not be a problem because of prefixes. RV to investigate and respond. Council: Green + Yellow for RV to investigate and respond.
#1911		material element should be in att.typed	Council likes `@function`.
not labeled			
#1691		<said>, <q>: att classes and behavior in context of Overlapping Hierarchies	
#1717		content complaints	
#1743		Infrastructure documentation	
#1780		Inviting translation of descs, glosses, remarks: workflow	
#1884		xenodata	
#1931		Examples in P5 are unnumbered	
#1932		Example error in 16.1.2 Using Pointers and Links (first example following Dunciad image)	
#1977		Finalize the content model of standOff	
#2042		evisit language about place and location in Ch. 13	

Discussion of table/app scenarios

Noting that we already allow using app to express structural differences between witnesses (e.g. using p within an app/rdg). Allowing to do so for tables seems a natural consequence. What follows, similar provisions should be made for lists.

Scenario 1

Witness 1 presents content in 3 columns, while other only in 2, eg.

wit 1:

Name	Surname	Credit
John	Wick	0
Bertrand	Gross	123
Lou	Crompton	50

wit 2:

Name	Surname
John	0
Bertrand	123
Lou Crompton	50

You might want to encode this difference at every row level

```xml
    <table>
      <row>
        <app>
          <rdg wit="s1">
            <cell>Name</cell>
            <cell>Surname</cell>
            <cell>Credit</cell>
          </rdg>
          <rdg wit="s2">
            <cell>Name</cell>
            <cell>Credit</cell>
          </rdg>
        </app>
      </row>
      <!-- ... -->
      <row>
        <app>
          <rdg wit="s1">
            <cell>Bertrand</cell>
```

```
              <cell>Gross</cell>
              <cell>123</cell>
            </rdg>
            <rdg wit="s2">
              <cell>Bertrand Gross</cell>
              <cell>123</cell>
            </rdg>
          </app>
        </row>
      </table>
```

Scenario 2

Witness 1 presents 3 rows, while the other misses middle row

 wit 1:

Name	Surname	Credit
John	Wick	0
Bertrand	Gross	123
Lou	Crompton	50

wit 2:

Name	Surname	Credit
John	Wick	0
Lou	Crompton	50

```xml
    <table>
      <row>
        <cell>Name</cell>
        <cell>Credit</cell>
      </row>
      <!-- ... -->
      <app>
        <rdg wit="s1">
          <row>
            <cell>Bertrand Gross</cell>
            <cell>123</cell>
          </row>
        </rdg>
```

```
      <rdg wit="s2">
        <!-- this row not present in wit2 -->
      </rdg>
    </app>
  </table>
```