

Grading Rubric Project 1 Analysis and Response

Title and Introduction

Introduces the general topic, gives an idea of stance towards the topic, and "hooks" the reader's attention. Establishes ethos by explaining personal experience with the topic, referencing current events, and using a reasonable tone. Thesis statement/claim is not stated here. Including a full thesis statement in the introduction will cost significant points.

Maximum score: 20

Background

Begins with a transition that connects the general topic to the opinion column. Identifies the original opinion column; includes titles of the article and publication, type of article, author's name and author's role. Accurately and fairly summarizes the original opinion column following guidelines for summary style.

Maximum score: 10

Possible Positions

Identifies and explains several possible responses to the original opinion column, including further summary of the opinion column as needed. Ends by stating the main claim that the writer will support. Main claim adds to the conversation on the topic, meaning it goes beyond the obvious to give readers a different way to think about the topic. Is clear about whether the claim is challenging, supporting, or building on the aspects of the original opinion column. Is focused on responding to one main idea presented in the opinion column rather than critiquing the original article point by point.

Maximum score: 15

Support

Establishes logos by supporting the main claim with reasons and specific examples from personal experience, common knowledge, logic, or one outside source (outside source is optional). Most examples are real, not theoretical. Examples include current events. References the original essay as necessary with accurate paraphrase. Builds on points made in the original opinion column rather than simply restating or critiquing.

Maximum score: 15

Counterargument

Raises and refutes challenges to the student writer's main claim. Challenge may be hypothetical and/or come from the original article. May include concessions.

Maximum score: 10

Conclusion

Explains why the claim/position is important -- why readers should care -- and references how their position affects values that readers care about (pathos). Makes reference to the original article,

Maximum score: 10

MLA format and citation

Uses MLA format for layout of the paper. Includes a works cited entry in MLA style for the opinion column that you are responding to.

Maximum score: 10

Clarity and style

Attribution, first person passages, and transitional phrases help readers move between the opinions of the original text and the writer's response. Sentences are clear. Punctuation and capitalization follow conventions of Standard Written English. Pronoun use is limited; writer replaces pronouns with antecedents. Paragraphs have topic sentences and do or say one main thing. Questions are limited. If asked, a question is immediately answered.

Maximum score: 10

Basic requirements

Meets minimum word count; makes sufficient references to original essay; includes multiple paragraphs; uses no more than one outside source; accurately summarizes and paraphrases the original essay. Essays that do not meet the basic requirements will not be graded and will be returned.

Maximum score: 0