

HIGURASHI WATANAGASHI THEORY SHEET



Introduction

Hello my name is Aidan and this sheet will be explaining some of the theories I have formed after reading Watanagashi. If you are interested in watching my readthrough, it is posted at <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC7P43zwpAQyyVguzaRk2cOQ?> Along with a video discussing this theory sheet in a more informal way. I suggest both reading and watching the video to get a more complete view of my ideas.

If you have been following my channel you should know that I made a theory sheet for Onikakushi. Personally while I was happy with the theories themselves I thought the formatting was really hard on the eyes. So this time I've reformatted it for the better (with some help from some suggestions from viewers).

Format:

- Theory name
- Description of theory
- Evidence in support of theory
 - List evidence
- Evidence against the theory
 - List evidence
- Concluding thoughts on theory.

If you wish to leave feedback on any of the theories or just in general feel free to leave a comment on the youtube video or my playthrough channel on the Hinamizawa discord. Obviously I'd ask you not to spoil anything when commenting, but I am fine with questioning my theories (since I had fun interactions in the past with that). But if you feel that you might be typing information that I should not have but you're not sure, then it's probably better if you don't tell me.

Hope you enjoy!

Curtain Call Theories

After the arc ended the characters gathered up to discuss what they thought. In this section I will be talking about some of the theories given by the character's themselves.

Satoko's "Mion was possessed by a demon theory"

- Satoko states that Mion was possessed by a demon in the story, which is why she committed the crimes. I'm well aware that Satoko is probably the last person out of the participants in the curtain call that should be taken seriously. But I think a possession theory is something that should be explored, since in the arc itself does state that Mion was taken over by a "demon". Also looking back to Onikakushi the idea of possession in this story is not that far fetched.

Evidence supporting the theory

- The idea of possession has been supported by the events in Onikakushi, where characters' eyes lose their light and change their personality. It also seems like they're being controlled by something/one from the way they talk. So if I believe that the act of possession is a possibility in another arc I should consider it for this one.
- Mion's character does dramatically change her personality to the point where it can be responsible to describe it as unnatural. Describing Mion as acting Demonic is a fair assumption.
- The event where Mion stabs Keiichi while Ooishi confirms she died before the events can also be supported by the possession theory, using the idea that Mion may have died but the demon controlled her corpse to commit the stabbing.

Evidence against the theory

- Even if you compare the possible possession from Onikakushi, Mion herself acts differently than her Onikakushi self which at least shows its not the exact same thing. This includes personality, actions, and even motive. The Mion from Onikakushi feels like she's following orders from someone, while the Watanagashi Mion feels like a lone wolf and a lot more wild.
- Also thematically I feel that Watanagashi presents itself as an opposite to Onikakushi, where Onikakushi left the reader with a lot of unanswered questions and repeatedly gave the idea that supernatural forces could be at work. While Watanagashi answers most of the questions and leaves almost no room for supernatural occurrences. With this in mind the idea that Mion was possessed feels unlikely.
- Using the point above I believe that the final question about moving corpses is not due to possession, and personally I would feel a little disappointed if it were the reason.
- There was really good character development leading to the changes in Mion, and making it due to possession feels counteractive to good writing by the author.

Conclusion

- While I think possession is not the worst idea I just don't think it fits with the image the arc presented itself with. Also it seems pretty different from the more reasonable examples of possession, and the hints in the changes of her characters makes this theory unlikely.

Mion's "Mion was covering for the true culprit theory"

- Mion make the statement that she believes her character in the arc is not the mastermind for the murders, and that she was ultimately covering for the real culprit/mastermind. I believe that the claim that Mion is not the one planning all the murders throughout the series including Onikakushi is pretty strong. But I do think that for the majority of the arc Mion was the mastermind.

Evidence supporting the theory

- The fact that committing multiple murder's would be hard to do with one person, especially a teenage girl.
- When cornered she gave details, mixing the truth of the murders she committed (which is almost certain) with claims of why older Watanagashi murders took place (which is a lot less certain) to make the claims sound stronger than they actually are.
- Her motives for committing the murders are also suspicious as she seems genuine when talking about it but leaves out the fact that she murdered her grandmother.
- Her insane nature after the discussion while attempting to torture Keiichi also hurts the strength of her previous claims.
- Mion actually killing someone was not witnessed by Keiichi (but Shion claims she saw her murder the victims)
- Rika's talk with Keiichi about how a dog killed the mayor. She referred to Mion as a big cat not a dog.

Evidence against the theory

- The fact that the murders seemed a lot less clean as the previous ones, which shows that the people involved in the older cases are probably not involved in this one.
- Also the fact that 2 people were initially killed instead of the usual 1 killed 1 missing pattern. And the fact that when people started to go missing it was not immediate unlike the older cases also show a difference in pattern.
- There is a lack of hard evidence that shows somebody else carrying out the murders, while a large amount of evidence points to Mion.
- It also undermines the character development Mion got throughout this arc, having her willfully covering up for someone really does not feel like a good plot point (Not really evidence, just my opinion that it would sort of be bad writing)

Conclusion

- While I believe that a Mastermind did carry out the older Watanagashi murder's I find it really hard to believe that he/she was responsible for this arc's main murders. Also just reading the story it should be fairly easy to determine that Mion was the murderer and

was carrying them out with a different objective than the past Watanagashi murders. With that in mind I do not agree that Mion willingly cooperated with a mastermind and ultimately covered for him/her. But the idea of her doing it without her knowing that is interesting and can be explored further.

Shion's "The Sonozaki sisters are the culprits"

- This theory revolves around the idea that not only Mion, but Shion assisted in the murders. She claims that goal was to commit the murders and get caught to end the cycle of the yearly Watanagashi murders after finally catching the culprit. Personally I really like this theory because it supports the idea that Mion did commit the murders without the orders of a mastermind and gives a pretty reasonable conclusion.

Evidence supporting the theory

- Having an assistant for the murders does make it more believable that Mion could single handedly carry out the murders.
- All the evidence given through reading the series that Mion is the murderer does not clash with this theory.
- It is shown that both Mion and Shion are good actors, so it is possible that their interactions at the end were staged.
- The motivation does make sense with Mion's character as she is depicted to really love the village and the end result would eventually get rid of the curse stigma surrounding it.
- The killings of the Mayor, Rika, and the Grandmother could be seen as a reset for Hinamizawa by getting rid of the people controlling it

Evidence against the theory

- Again this theory goes against the mental damage both of the characters faced, which could be acted but it would be on a whole new level.
- The fact that more people were killed than the previous cases does seem odd if the goal is to get themselves caught and wrap up the ongoing idea that the village is cursed since it doesn't fit the pattern so it looks like an outlier.
- Also the idea of killing Satoko seems odd since keeping her alive would probably increase the probability of getting caught.
- It also doesn't really make sense why Mion attempted to kill Keiichi at the end (assuming that was Mion).

Conclusion

- Overall I really like this theory. I think it fits really well with my interpretation of the story, and it's flaws seem pretty small. It doesn't really explain the moving corpses thing but that could easily be classified as another issue.

My Theories

The following theories are ones that I have crafted to answer some of the story's questions. Some of the theories may counter each other and each should be taken as its own thing rather than being connected (unless stated otherwise).

“Hospitals are bad” theory

- This theory would state that the hospital either houses the outside group I theorized in the last theory sheet, or whoever the mastermind is. This theory is based on small points that would direct suspicion to the hospital with being thought about by any of the characters. I created this theory after Rika posed the question of why Keiichi was being targeted in both arcs. Unlike the other characters who tried to connect the main murders of both arcs, I'm firmly of the opinion that Mion (or at least not the mastermind) was not responsible for the murders, but Keiichi being stabbed at the end feels isolated from the other murders and has an Onikakushi feel. This made connect this instant with Keiichi with the targeting from Onikakushi which lead to my conclusion about the hospital which will be shown by the evidence below.

Evidence supporting the theory

- After connecting the two incidents I used the “chessboard thinking” method from Umineko where you try to look at something from the opponent's point of view. With this I tried to find out the objective of assaulting Keiichi by looking at the end result of both attacks. In Onikakushi Keiichi suffered critical self inflicted wounds and died offscreen in a hospital. In Watanagashi Keiichi received a critical stab wound and was sent to the hospital. It was shown that he survived it, but his fate in the ending was ambiguous, which I personally think he either went crazy or was killed offscreen. So after looking at these outcomes I conclude that the objective might not have been to kill Keiichi but to send him to the hospital. Even if he does die there it is just either word of mouth from a police report or up to interpretation so I don't believe that Keiichi dieing should be taken as a fact.
- Miyo Takano is a suspicious character throughout both of the arcs. I will admit that initially I actually let go of some of my suspicion of her in Watanagashi after interacting with her, but that changed after Ooishi's knowledge bomb at the end. Also she is very close with Tomitake who is also extremely suspicious mainly because he's using a fake alias. The fact is that Miyo works as a nurse in the hospital, which should make the hospital suspicious.
- At the end of Onikakushi a doctor and a group of other people tried to take Keiichi away. Keiichi thought that the doctor was someone in disguise to go along with Mion's story that she called a doctor to visit him. While I agree that the person was probably someone working for the mastermind I think that the person might have really been a doctor. It would make sense again if we go with the theory, as well as Mion tried to inject Keiichi

with the mysterious drug moments before and maybe the doctor was there to check if it was working properly.

- Another point would be the drug itself. While there has not been any real clue to point to where and who created the drug, if you think about it the only real place to develop it would be the hospital. And if my guess that the outsider group is responsible for the drug this would fit real nice.
- The next point isn't real evidence, more of just a weird thought from Keiichi that fits oddly well with this theory. This is referring to when Keiichi meets with Mion before she stabs him, he made a remark when describing her appearance "It was almost like...she was a patient who had gotten tired of staying in the hospital and snuck out." At first glance this looks like a good way to describe Mion as she was currently on the run, but I'd like to believe that it was either a hint by the author or some weird subconscious thing with Keiichi knowing about the hospital.
- Another point is that there is a clinic in Hinamizawa that Keiichi visited in Onikakushi. Even if this isn't where Keiichi ends up in at the end it is probably fair to assume the clinic is where some of the outsider group resides since it's located in Hinamizawa itself and since the hospital is fairly close by. Anyway, the point is that Keiichi actually took shots there during an examination. I find that pretty suspicious, especially since Keiichi seems to start going crazy from that point on. It is a pretty safe assumption that the injections may have been something that caused that with the other stressful factors.

Evidence against the theory

- Most of what was said is just speculative and not a solid fact.
- There has been a more reliable source of evidence that the drug was created by the Sonozakis from Ooishi.
- None of the characters have even talked about the medical establishments at all, making this kind of sound like a stretch.

Conclusion

This is probably my favourite theory and I personally am very confident in it. While I do admit that a lot of it is just speculation it feels really good and I would be pretty happy if this had some sort of truth in it. As a side note I actually thought Keiichi took the shot from the hospital not the clinic so some of the points I made might be referring to the clinic and not the hospital. But since I made the point that there might be members working together from both I don't think it really matters.

"Mion's motives" theory

- This theory was created as an alternative to explain why she committed the murders. The reasons Mion give are that she was following the duties that the Sonozaki's must carry out by killing the threats to the village, which all of the victims can be classified as such. While this sort of gets twisted after learning about Mion's sadistic nature in torturing people in earshot of Shion, I don't think that means that she was lying about her reasons. Personally I feel fine with accepting Mion's explanation as the truth (or at least somewhat truthful) but I thought of an alternative motive which fits well. That would be

that Mion wanted to do a powerplay and gain control of Hinamizawa by murdering it's leaders.

Evidence supporting the theory

- In Mion's victim pool, the representatives of the three families that govern over Hinamizawa were murdered. With Mion being the heir to the Sonozaki family she would have complete control of Hinamizawa.
- The murders of Tomitake and Takano were not explained in Mion's explanation to why she chose to show both of the murders instead of hiding one of the bodies. I believe this could be a way to rebel against the outsider group who obviously also has some sort of a hold on Hinamizawa and this might be a way to reject their power which might explain why they did not really act in this arc like they did in Onikakushi. This also might be what led to the murder of her grandmother since she was probably working with the mastermind throughout the years, which would lead her to disagreeing with Mion's actions.
- This also supports Satoko being killed unlike the "Sonozaki Sisters" theory since she would want to cover her tracks.
- It also goes well with the fact that Mion is a good actor, and making the confession an act would fit really well with how her character has been fleshed out.
- Mion has been consistently shown as a charismatic person with good leadership traits, who loves Hinamizawa. These traits go well with the theory and shows that her desire for power may lead to a better future for Hinamizawa.

Evidence against the theory

- Like the others does not explain the attempt at Keiichi's life at the end.
- Probably just as viable as the other two theories, doesn't really stand out since it's just another interpretation of what the evidence against Mion means.

Conclusion

- Like the other two theories this is just another possible reason for why Mion committed the murders. I think it's not really possible to determine what Mion's true motives were with the current information but I believe this theory along with the Mion's statements and the "Sonozaki Sister" theory are the best interpretations of it.

"Soft reset" theory

- This would be a claim that instead of a hard reset throughout the arcs it is actually just a soft reset. This means that instead of a completely new story that has no real connection to the past arcs, the stories are actually connected and could be seen as a continuation instead of its own instance. This theory came from my realization that they don't actually explain why the story resets, unlike Umineko which gave a solid reason. Also a point made by Takano in the curtain call where she name drops a different arc, which made me think that maybe a future arc would actually be chronologically be before Watanagashi which would not really matter if it did hard reset. A view later informed me

that was part of a prologue series and edited in for the steam release which makes it a dead point but it still made me think of this theory, so I guess it's still worth noting. Finally this theory formed while I was thinking of a way to answer the moving corpses question, which one of the answers led me to this theory.

Evidence supporting the theory

- Like stated above Higurashi does not a real reason to why the resets are happening unlike it's sequel. Obviously this can just be interpreted as a writing choice and in Umineko he wanted to switch it up by giving it a reason but since I think this could also be a part of the overall mystery to what's happening.
- This kind of meshes well with the "Hospitals are bad" theory since it could be tied in to what happens to Keiichi after he enters the hospital. Maybe the operation they conduct on Keiichi could be what causes the soft reset.
- This also works well with the mystery of how corpses are moving for the final question of the arc, specifically Mion. Using the idea of a soft reset the corpse that the police found could be the Mion from the Onikakushi since she probably had similar wounds to a person who would have been smashed up from falling. A hard reset would not let this trick happen since the world would not be connected. While the real Mion would be in the custody of the outsider group who would be preparing her for the soft reset.
- It also kind of fits well with the curtain call since in Umineko it was again sort of explained while in this one there is not one given. The fact that the characters have a sense of time supports soft reset. And the fact that they're treating it like a show where they have to rehearse lines also can be interpreted that all the arcs are just part of a plan, which would be connecting them together, which is a soft reset.

Evidence against the theory

- Everything is really just speculation and there is no hard evidence
- This could just be a product of me reading Umineko and thinking too deeply because of it.
- This is probably way to meta

Conclusion

- This theory is kind of a meme. There is no real evidence to support it, and it's more of an idea than a real theory. That being said I do kind of like the idea, and think that because of my knowledge from Umineko this could actually be revealed to be true later. But I think it definitely needs more evidence for. On a side note the part explaining how Mion's part of the moving corpse question is really cool imo and one of the only real answers I could come up with for that.

"Miyo Takano's moving corpse!" theory

- This theory would be my attempt at explaining how Takano could have possibly met with Keiichi to sneak into storehouse when she was apparently already dead. The only logical answer for this would be that the person that snuck in with Keiichi and the others was not

Miyo but somebody pretending to be her. While this seems like the obvious answer it seems like a hard answer to accept, hopefully the points of evidence are somewhat satisfying.

Evidence supporting the theory

- The fact that she is close friends with Tomitake, a character using a fake alias, so the fact that she is using one does not seem that far fetched especially if they are working together and needed to have aliases for their job.
- If you connect this to the “Hospital is bad” theory then connecting Miyo to the outsider group is reasonable. There is also good reasons to infer that the group is has a lot of power. With the assistance of the group Miyo stealing somebody's identity seems possible.
- There is also the fact that the body was found burnt and unrecognizable, to the point where the police had to identify the body using dental matches. This might have been to hide the appearance of the corpse, which could have revealed that she looked different than the Miyo the others knew about.
- The fact that there is no real other explanation for this case

Evidence against the theory

- Again no hard evidence provided.
- There is also the fact that the majority of the villagers accepted that woman as Miyo Takano (though that would not matter if she already stole the identity before moving there).
- The fact that the person posing as Tomitake actually died while this theory supports that Tomitake's accomplice lives does kind of poke a hole in it.

Conclusion

- I strongly believe in this theory since I can not even think of something else that's not related to some magical or meta stuff. I think the fact that the body is burnt to a crisp really supports this theory.

Onikakushi Revisited

In this section instead of giving new theories I'm just changing some of the past theories after reading Watanagashi since some of my opinions have changed

On Ooishi

- On my Onikakushi theory sheet I had a suspicion that Ooishi was somehow integral to the main mystery/mastermind of the series. But now I have done a 180 and think that there is almost no way he's connected. It still shows that Ooishi is a manipulative and cold person, but in this arc his focus seemed extremely tunnel visioned on arresting the Sonozakis. From this it seems more likely that he just wants to solve the mystery using somewhat questionable methods, rather than being a part of the mastermind's plan.

Though I still don't think he's 100 percent off the hook since there were some sketchy things he did in Onikakushi and I have a decent meme theory below.

On the Curse

- In this arc the curse hasn't been touched upon as much. But because of this it makes me lean toward the fact that if a curse was real, it would show itself either in Onikakushi or future arcs just for thematic reasons. And while the curse was not present in this arc (except for maybe the end) there was a lot more information gained about the curse, specifically how the curse actually affects the village.
- My new curse theory would be that there was a case of mass possession, which is why multiple people acted like they were controlled by someone. This comes from the fact that in one of the hints it states that the curse activates when the village doesn't properly sacrifice when they commit a taboo. With this in mind it's reasonable to state that the curse doesn't actually kill people, rather the village commits the murder than sacrifice to stop the curse from happening. I think that in Onikakushi a taboo was broken without a proper sacrifice which led to the curse activating. I believe it's possession because the hint described the curse as "demon's awaken and descend upon Hinamizawa", which I infer that instead of real demons it's talking about waking the demon blood within the villagers.

On the village as a cult

- I made the claim that the village could actually be a cult like entity but I have changed my view on that. After some explaining from Mion, it was shown that the village is a really close knit community that has faced a lot of hardships from outsiders. That along with the teachings from Mion's grandmother who taught them to pay back the trouble caused by the outsiders two fold I believe that the village's nature is more exclusive than cult like.
- I also believe that the majority of the villagers probably don't have anything to do with the murders from how they acted when people went missing throughout the arc. It is possible that they might have some understanding of what's happening, but for the most part I think it's better to look at individuals instead of playing with the idea that the whole village is in on it.

On the outsider group

- A lot of the theories written here have to do with this group so I'm not going to repeat it again. But it's not like I had a real solid theory on them from Onikakushi anyways.

Meme theories

These theories are points that I think might exist, but not enough to write a full theory in the above section because of lack of information. While others are just memes. Not using the full format since these theories aren't as prominent to me.

“Ooishi is part of the mastermind group” theory

- While Ooishi does not show any signs that he is a part of the group in this arc, his actions in Onikakushi were really suspicious, especially his dismissal of the needle and when he randomly told Keiichi he believes in the curse when he was fully on the human culprit side. I think that if you want to believe Ooishi is part of the group the way to describe his actions in Watanagashi would be to connect them to Mion's actions. Mion clearly was not following the mastermind's plan, so Ooishi did not have to act on the plan since it was kind of ruined this year. In fact you could make the connection that Ooishi really wanted to arrest Mion for rebelling the group rather than wanting to carry out justice.

“Rika is part of the mastermind group” theory

- Rika has showcased throughout both arcs that she knows a lot more than she lets on. It is known that she does have some influence over Hinamizawa so it wouldn't be a surprise that she knows about the outsider's group. It is possible that the confused dog she was talking about with Keiichi was the outsider group if she didn't know that Mion was the murderer at the time. There is also the fact that she was carrying a syringe when she went to Mion's house to get soy sauce, and since I'm in favour of connecting the drug to the outside group I find this incredibly suspicious. She might have gotten orders to inject Mion with it while she was distracted because of her betrayal.

“Shion and Mion switch” theory

- I was thinking of putting this as a main theory but changed my mind.
- My first version would be that Mion switched places with Shion after knocking out Keiichi and threw her down the well. After that she assaults Keiichi than kills herself by jumping out of Shion's apartment. This theory only works since Ooishi did not specify on how he identified Mion's dead body, whether they did tests to match the corpse or if they just eye'd it. Also they insinuated that Shion killed herself before Keiichi got stabbed which also hurts the theory. While this theory sounds kind of cool it's weaknesses are way to big for me to really believe this happened.
- The other version was that Shion was actually the murderer and psychologically broke Mion into believing she was Shion when she captured her. This would help explain Mion's corpse since Mion wasn't the murderer anyways. But it fails if Shion died first, and it's more of a meme since there is literally no evidence except for the fact that Shion is a good actor.

“Clones...” theory

- This meme makes a return from the last theory sheet. Obviously if there was a way to clone people, the moving corpses question can be answered easily. Also the fact that if the outsider group can make an unknown drug, a clone shouldn't be that far fetched. It also ties into the “Soft reset” theory as a way for it to actually happen.

“Satoko is the mastermind” theory

- True!

FINISH

Thanks for reading, hopefully it was enjoyable. Again if you want to talk about anything click the link in the introduction section and just leave a comment anywhere and I will get to it eventually.