



**DELTA DEVELOPMENT GROUP
I N C .**

**COORDINATED PLAN – MAHONING & TRUMBULL COUNTIES
STEERING/PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING AND FOCUS GROUP MEETING
TUESDAY, AUGUST 17, 2021 – 1:00 P.M.**

AGENDA

I. STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBER UPDATE

STEERING/PLANNING COMMITTEE ROSTER	
MAHONING COUNTY	
Krista Beniston	Boardman Township
Jason Whitehead	Youngstown Metropolitan Housing Authority
Jack Daugherty	Youngstown Neighborhood Development Corporation
Mary Lou Reyes/ Lair Marin-Marcum	OCCHA, Inc. (Hispanic Cultural Organization)
Cora Lewis/Susan Kovach	MY Baby's 1st Coalition/ Mahoning County Public Health
Lori Murphy	Job and Family Services
Vikki Cunningham	Easter Seals
Tricia D'Avignon	Boardman Township
TRUMBULL COUNTY	
Mike Salamone	Trumbull County Transit Administrator
Kris Kriebel	Trumbull County Combined Health District
Kim Mascarella	Howland Twp. TC
Diane M. Siskowic-Jurkovic, CPA	Trumbull County Senior Levy
Matt Martin	Trumbull Neighborhood Partnership
Linda Kirkland	Community Member
Pam Davies	Western Reserve Independent Living Center
Paul Davis	Senior Levy Board
Carl Clemons	Individual Advocate & President of Consumer Advocate Team 41
Barbara Klingensmith	Country Neighbor Program, Inc.
Ginny Pasha	United Way
Miles Johnson	Trumbull Neighborhood Partnership
William Turner	Trumbull County Workforce Development
Edward Stark	Trumbull County Board of Developmental Disabilities
Zack Swette	Trumbull County Metro
Herman Breuer	Trumbull County Veterans Office
John Gargano	Trumbull County Department of Job & Family Services
Janet Hazlette	Transit Advocate
MAHONING AND TRUMBULL COUNTIES/MAHONING VALLEY	
Judy Rodriguez	Western Reserve Transit Authority
Mirta Reyes-Chapman	Eastgate Regional Council of Governments
Sara Boyarko	Youngstown-Warren Regional Chamber
Sarah Lowry	Healthy Community Partnership
Dave Mirkin	Comfort Care a Van
Kris Petrich	Garwin
Michelle Gennaro	Help Network of Northeast Ohio
Tony Cairo	Direction Home of Eastern Ohio

Donna Wells	Rescue Mission of Mahoning Valley
-------------	-----------------------------------

II. COORDINATED PLAN UPDATE

III. FINAL PRIORITIZED TRANSPORTATION NEEDS/GAPS

1. Funding
2. Safe Access to Transportation Services
3. Enhanced Transportation Services (fixed route and on-demand)
4. Regional Transportation Services
5. Multiple Service Delivery Modes (Fixed Route and Demand Response)
6. Centralized and Consistent Communication About Transportation Services
7. Education/Communication for Consumers, Operators, Community Members and Elected Officials
8. Collaborative Efforts to Maximize the Amount of Available Services and Provide Consistent Services
9. Process to Ensure Transportation Needs Are Being Met

IV. FINAL FOUR OVERARCHING STRATEGIES

1. **Strategy #1: Improve Safe Access to Transportation Route Services and Key Destinations.** Safe access includes sidewalks, lighting, signals, crosswalk, bus pull-out areas, automated digital cross signals, ADA curb cuts, shelters, and signage.
2. **Strategy #2: Employ A Regional Mobility Manager.** The regional mobility manager would assume the following responsibilities: provide clear and consistent transportation information; maintain inventory and coordinate transportation services (public and private); develop comprehensive funding strategies; provide training, education and support programs; obtain political support for transportation projects and programs; establish collaborative efforts among providers; political liaison; maintain Coordinated Plan and manage implementation of strategies; oversee comprehensive complaint and resolution process; policy and procedure manual to ensure standardize services; establish an advisory committee; and develop and implement comprehensive marketing strategies. The committee realizes that it will take time for this position to undertake all of the responsibilities and he/she may need assistance. The committee believes that the advisory committee is a critical element and at least two members need to be residents/riders to represent Mahoning and Trumbull Counties and make decisions to improve/address gaps in transit service.
3. **Strategy #3: Identify and Implement Transportation Service Enhancements.** Transportation enhancements includes increasing fixed route and shared ride services; public and private services; out-of-county and regional services; and vehicle replacements.
4. **Strategy #4: Implement A “One-Call-Center”.** The one-call-center would offer customers a centralized place to contact that manages information on all public and private transportation services. WRTA is exploring the possibility of undertaking a multi-county one-call-center for

public transportation services. If WRTA is successful with this initiative, there is the possibility that private transportations could be overlaid on the system.

V. SUMMARY OF STRATEGIES

STRATEGY	COST ESTIMATE	LEAD AGENCY/AGENCIES	TIME FRAME
<p>1. IMPROVE SAFE ACCESS TO FIXED ROUTE SERVICES AND KEY DESTINATIONS</p>	<p>5,500 to several hundred thousand dollars dependent on site and improvements</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - \$75 to \$110 for sidewalk installation and replacement per linear foot for a 5 foot wide sidewalk. - Shelters \$5,500 to \$12,000 \$8,600 to \$15,100 Shelter, lighting, signage, bench 	<p>Eastgate Regional Council of Governments</p>	<p>Year 1 – The focus will be funding. Working with the Mobility Manager, projects will be selected based on prioritized need and available funds.</p>
<p>2. EMPLOY A REGIONAL MOBILITY MANAGER</p>	<p>Annually \$50,000 to \$60,000 + benefits, office space with internet service (\$1,500 per month).</p>	<p>Trumbull County Transit Administrator and WRTA</p>	<p>Year1 – The focus will be funding and thereafter, initiatives will be based on funding and guidance from the advisory committee.</p>
<p>3. SERVICE ENHANCEMENTS</p>	<p>\$17,000 a year to add one hour of contracted on-demand service each weekday; Robust Trumbull County Public Transit System with fixed route and shared-ride services (\$2.3 to \$6.5 million).</p>	<p>Trumbull County Transit Administrator and WRTA</p>	<p>Year 1 and ongoing.</p>
<p>4. ONE CALL CENTER</p>	<p>Multi-County One Call Center \$1.5 to \$1.75 million over five years to complete.</p>	<p>WRTA</p>	<p>Stage approach beginning Year 1 with the objective to be fully operational in year 5.</p>

VI. PUBLIC COMMENTS (END 8/6/2021)

1. Changes made to the document based on comments received:
 - a. Added Easterseals as a transportation provider
 - b. A few minor edits to clarify text
 - c. Added a link to Eastgate’s Interactive Transit Map

- d. Added to potential funding sources: Rehabilitation Services Commission, Ohio Transit Partnership Program (discretionary State Fund) General Revenue Fund and Human Services Funding Sources.
 - e. Added for clarity - At a minimum, strategies will be reviewed and updated annually to ensure consistency with regionalization, funding and planning initiatives.
 - f. Changed Trumbull County Transit Board to Trumbull County Administrator.
2. We received 16 comments received by e-mail or telephone.
- Disabled rider prefers flag stops versus being required to board at a designated stop. Lack of sidewalks is problematic. Suggests naming routes with north, south, east or west.
 - *A rider with mobility issues indicated that he is not interested in taking two buses to travel five blocks and as such, no access to the Save-A-Lot.*
 - Need for dependable door to door services for people who are unable to drive (because of a disability) so that they can have reliable transportation to work.
 - *Make it easier to schedule door to door service - perhaps an online scheduling application.*
 - Use smaller more efficient vehicles. Large buses are rarely at capacity.
 - Disappointed in WRTA. Rides are free, not a good steward of tax monies. Buses are empty.
 - *New updated plan is still lacking 24/7, 365 days a year, door-to-door, and through-the-door services. It also fails to mention \$19.5 million unencumbered funds in Mahoning County. Please go back to the drawing board.*
 - Keep the buses going in Trumbull County especially for the low income, people with disabilities and people who are senior citizens. The big jobs left Trumbull County years ago. People who are on low income cannot afford to ride Uber and Lyft. WRTA only costs \$ 1.50 for all day bus pass. If the six bus routes were to stop going through Trumbull County that means the low income people will not be able to go to the store and shop for groceries and clothes and go out to eat. They would have to get deliveries and businesses will have to cut back. Keep the buses going it will bring people to businesses. Covid-19 hurt a lot of businesses especially those in Eastwood Mall Complex, Ponderosa Steakhouse on Elm Road in Warren and Walmart on Elm Road in Warren Ohio. WRTA should expand service to Hubbard Ohio and the Youngstown and Warren Regional Airport so people can get to where they need to go to. Start having the buses to take people to all of the libraries in Mahoning County.
 - A disabled rider uses the 70 series buses that operate in Trumbull County and loves it. She uses the service for doctors' appointments and the reduction of fixed routes has caused her to change doctors. The rider would like WRTA to restore route 73. She sees doctors in both

Trumbull and Mahoning Counties. She doesn't like using ADA because she cannot always get the right pickup time. Her other options would be Provide a Ride, Community Bus Services, or TCAP; however, does not like being required to make advanced reservations or being penalized for cancellations. Rider will send funds to help cover the cost of the rides although it is presently free.

- A shelter is needed at the Dollar General on Belmont Avenue.
- *I need the bus service in Trumbull County. I don't like to make reservations to ride to doctor's appointments and shopping.*
- Build a bus stall at the corner of Best Buy, Eastwood Complex and Niles Save-A-Lot.
- Service is needed to: Boardman Library, Canfield Library, Elizabeth Missionary Baptist Church and other churches in Mahoning and Trumbull Counties.
- *Federal Station needs to be opened for seniors to wait for the bus out of the varied weather conditions.*
- WRTA's services should all be every 30 minutes.
- Some WRTA bus drivers are not waiting for people when they turn around. Riders are being passed up.
- Rider lives in Warren and uses WRTA services. Suggests service on North Road to North River Road to 46 (Niles Cortland Road).
- WRTA should coordinate times with Greyhound at Federal Station.
- Shelters are needed at landmarks such as: Trumbull Hospital; North Park main connection in downtown warren; and Belmont in Youngstown.
- *Individual that is disabled and cannot drive stressed the needs for public transportation services to go shopping. She cannot afford to use Uber and Lyft - a short trip can cost \$10 to \$20. She feels stranded and wished Trumbull County would fund public transportation.*
- Prefers to remain anonymous. Concerns with the politics in Trumbull County. A senior that frequently rides WRTA's Countywide service. Pleased with the service. No complaints. Professional and skilled drivers. The service is needed. I like the service because I don't have to have a reason to ride and most of my rides are shared with other people and I've met great people. The service is needed and should be supported by the politicians. I support County services that I do not use.
- *Expressed concern that 436 public survey response may have "too high of an error rate" and was not sure that the 66 unique organizations surveyed offset the public survey return rate. His concern was whether or not subsidized tenants were aware of the Plan.*

- A policy is needed for shared-ride service that ensures a person does not get stranded if they miss a scheduled ride. Many seniors and disabled people have no alternative. Mistakes in recording time (by both parties) and watches can happen.

VII. ANY ADDITIONAL CHANGES OR ADDITIONS

1. Finalize Plan Document
2. Steering Committee Adopts Plan
 - Requires signature to adopt plan (e-mail/text)
3. Reviewed Annually and Updated Accordingly