

Library Book Reconsideration Committee Summary

Book Title: Dear Martin by Nic Stone

Nov. 9, 2022

2:00 pm

Concern: A community member formally challenged the book *Dear Martin* by Nic Stone on July 22, 2022. Due to summer break and the lack of a formed committee, the Superintendent delayed the procedures outlined in district policy in order to develop a committee which includes employees of the district, until the school year began. The community member communicated that the content of the book should be removed due to the content of “teenage shooting, graphic rude language about women, racial themes unsolvable, teaching that counteract Martin Luther King’s wisdom, etc.”. The complainant sent a picture of page 31.

1. Reminder of the Ground Rules
2. Made sure all members had copy of the presentation
3. Reminder of SCOTUS rulings and opinions
4. Links to our policies
5. Ways that parents/guardians can protect their children/opt their student(s) out of books/make sure they don’t have access to them
6. Book challenge process and procedures
7. Reminder that this is not a new issue—book challenges

Agenda from last meeting. This agenda will not change from one book to another.

1. challenge/concern
 2. Options
 3. Vote
 4. Discuss (3 and 4 may be switched)
 5. Blind vote
 6. Discussion
 7. Summary
 8. additions/changes to procedure
 9. Next book
 10. Meeting date
-
1. Discuss options
 - a. Retain
 - b. Retain with restrictions
 - c. Remove
 2. Discussion: (These are brief notes and should not be considered a word for word dialogue)

Discussion

1—curious to the last challenge, complaint “teachings that counteract MLK’s wisdom, etc. I think the person should have given an example and their interpretation of MLK’s teachings

3—also had the same question. Also had questions about that

2—even the conversation he had at the end

1—If there weren’t racial themes that are unsolvable—that is always going to be present likely

1—going to be shootings. There is no question of the misogynistic language

5—Yes, if we pull books for controversial topics we won’t have any books.

2—

7—..... Whenever I read books I try to envision the scene and the characters. I thought the author did a good job with this. I loved the book, I couldn’t put it down. I didn’t like the language, such as popping the cherry. But I understand that this language happens in our society.

3—this language happens in our locker rooms and hallways

7— I liked the book but there were parts that were uncomfortable. That might be me and my beliefs// I thought the author did a good job of showing us racial and social inequalities

1—I thought she laid it on pretty thick

7—I don’t know what it’s like to be a black person driving through Atlanta, GA. There both sides of being judged—being white women, being black youth, etc.

3—This book came out in 2017, so this mentions things that happened in our society, Trayvon Martin, etc. There was a lot of curiosity on the part of students surrounding this topic. I thought the teacher did a good job of allowing students to discuss this and ask questions about these complex questions (in the book). The author did a good job addressing the issues....Not acceptable to...

1—Part of our library’s mission to expose students to a wide range of issues...

4—I also liked the book. His first pen to MLK. He wanted to be closer to MLK. He researched and he doesn’t have a father figure so his outlet is MLK. I love Dr. asking what his point of writing to MLK was. And the character’s response....I also like that he called out the prejudice on his mom’s. The second set of police officers because he’s white she doesn’t want to shake his hand and he explains to his mom that just because the officer is white, not all white people are bad, this officer is not the one who caused harm....

3—just other info about the book. Reading age is 14+ and it is not taught in any classroom. The whole second part of the novel shifts to Manny.

1—My daughters middle school English teacher

4—Its close to an understanding for someone who—for someone to understand what it’s like to be an intercity AA. and choosing between gangs, etc.

5—Getting into college. The perspective you might have depends on the color of your skin and getting into college and whether it will be based on merit, skin color...

3- They had a conversation about affirmative action. Young people are having those conversations....When you have things stacked against you whether it’s race, gender, socio economic status.

6—I thought the book was terrible. It was at about a third grade reading level. Other than that, I thought it was too simple. It could have been written more sophisticatedly. Other than that I don’t have much to say about this book.

3—Pointed out that the Lexile level is low. Designed to be accessible for reluctant readers.

6–Disappointed in the simplicity. I have lived in a big city and seen these problems. I just wish it could have been written with more complex language

7–Talks about having it read in class...

2–How many kids know about what MLK stood for? My child read this book and it led her to want to know more about MLK.

7–

5–We do live in a bubble here.

7–I have a family member who was shot on his porch in drive by and they still don't know who killed him. This book could help us understand the issues present in the city.

I'm ready to vote whenever everyone else is.

3–I think it's valuable information to know that the last book was also brought forward by the same person who challenged this book.

7–On the complaint form is there a place to record whether they have read the book.

5–It is not on the form

7–Can we add it? We have to read it so the complainant should have to read it.

5–I've talked to ____ about seeing some of the complaints brought out and taken out of context.

It can seem bad, but once you read the book...

2–This is the fourth time I've read this.

General group discussion about if there is a graphic novel based on this book. The group is unsure if such a version exists.

7–Remind of what the choices are for voting.

Clarification that this is only available at the high school. So if you want "with restrictions" it is already in place. Yes, so it will remain in the high school section of the library.

VOTE

retain, don't remove, retain, retain, retain, retain HS section of library

1.Decision:

In summary, the vote is to retain with five votes to retain, one to retain in the HS section, and one not remove I would consider retain as well.

2. Next book- *This One Summer* by Mariko Tamaki, Jillian Tamaki

2. Next meeting- Dec 14, 2022