

EQO11E (IP1&IP2) Equity & Opportunity: Citizenship and Nationality in Context

August Term 2022

SYLLABUS

Meetings

CLASS TIME: 10:00 am - 12:30 pm EDT (IP2)
OR 2:30 - 5:00 pm EDT (IP1)
CLASS DATES: Week 1: August 15, 16, 18, 19 (M, T, Th, F)
Week 2: August 22, 24, 25 (M, W, Th)

Course Faculty

Meira Levinson and Alysha Banerji
meira_levinson@harvard.edu
alysha_banerji@g.harvard.edu

COURSE DESCRIPTION

Equity and Opportunity: Citizenship and Nationality in Context has been designed in coordination with the teaching teams for each of the Identity in Context modules. Students in every module will:

1. engage deeply with key concepts in equity, systems of oppression, cycles of socialization and privilege, and social identities within the context of education;
2. connect and build meaningful relationships with each other while recognizing the multiple intersecting identities, perspectives and differences people hold;
3. make progress in understanding and reflecting on our experiences; and
4. discuss and imagine tools of transformation for particular contexts and communities.

Students will delve into core theories, practices, and texts that apply to all social identities, while also probing identity-specific topics and challenges. In this light, this module will consider how schools distribute and restrict educational opportunities to students based on their diverse political, transnational, refugee, migrant, postcolonial, and other civic identities; we also consider schools as sites and sources of civic contestation, and young people's exercise of agency via civic activism both in and outside of school. Students can expect to interact with each other and the teaching team in asynchronous and synchronous individual, small group, and whole group settings. Pedagogies and assessments will reflect core principles in educating for equity and opportunity, including inclusive facilitated discussions, active listening and learning, journaling, and case study inquiry. Students are encouraged to select into a topic that they have not spent much time studying formally as a way to explore the foundational concepts of equity and opportunity through a relatively new frame.

A FEW WORDS ON LANGUAGE

Language is inclusive when we use words that affirm and respect how people describe, express, and experience themselves. Non-gender-inclusive language excludes the experiences of individuals whose identities may not fit the gender binary, and/or who may not identify with the sex they were assigned at birth. People may also choose various terms to signal their identities as members of racial, ethnic, tribal, caste, national, subnational, regional, religious, professional, and

other groups; their (our!) choices of terms may vary whether they are located within the group and talking only to other insiders, in a mixed setting, or solely with outgroup members. This fluidity is natural, but can also add complexity. We invite all class members to share their pronouns, names, and other identities with the expectation that these identities and expressions will be honored. We also hope that all class members will show grace when colleagues stumble, and will ask for guidance when they are unsure what language to use.

COURSE REQUIREMENTS AND EVALUATION

This course will be graded on a Satisfactory/No Credit basis.

Students earn a “Satisfactory” grade based on effort, attendance and participation, and the completion of all learning expectations detailed below.

Class Attendance, Preparation, and Participation

We expect you to attend class each day, complete readings and assignments on time, listen actively, participate thoughtfully in discussions and other activities, ask questions when you have them, and collaborate with your peers and the teaching team to co-construct focused, analytic, and reflective class discussions in a collaborative and inclusive framework. While having “peaks and valleys” of participation (i.e., days in which you participate a lot and others in which you participate less) is fine, total silence and lack of engagement will impede two of our central aims: building community and fostering our collective learning through our engagement with a diverse array of colleagues (you!) who have differing perspectives, lived experiences, and socialization. Because large chunks of each class will also be focused directly on the assigned texts, we encourage you to read “actively” – i.e., highlight the text, take notes, write marginal comments and flag important passages with sticky notes, ask questions, draw connections, etc. in order to comprehend and process the readings before class begins. These practices will help us dig into big ideas at the theoretical or conceptual level, and also (perhaps paradoxically) help us get to the personal connections and implications for action more quickly and deeply.

We will discuss these goals and how to achieve them in our first class session; we will also reflect upon our class culture and collective practices at various points throughout the two week module. If the teaching team has concerns about your participation, we will let you know as soon as possible; likewise, if you have any questions or worries, please be in touch with either of us.

Also, a specific reminder about attendance since this is both a compressed class and a required class. As the student handbook notes: “In the event of illness or an unanticipated emergency, students must notify their instructor(s) in advance that they will miss class. Any other excused absences from these courses must be approved in advance by the Degree Programs Office and typically will be approved only in the case of significant life events that require missing no more than a single day of the relevant course. Students with more than one unexcused absence from one of these Foundations courses will receive a grade of DRP for that course and be subject to withdrawal from HGSE.”

Journal Reflections & Responses (Two journal entries due in Week 1; two entries due in Week 2)

Each student will maintain a reflective journal throughout the course, as well as respond to one or two partners’ reflective journals. The purpose of the journal is to provide you an opportunity to reflect on your personal understanding, interpretation, and thinking about the sessions, core concepts, and

assigned content/materials AND to have an opportunity for a conversation with the teaching team and your peers. Journals can be expressed through written, oral or visual arts forms. If you include images or alternative forms of representation, we ask that you add a written caption or explanation of your chosen medium. We anticipate that each journal entry will be approximately 300-500 words or its equivalent, though depth of reflection is more important than breadth.

You will select two class sessions in Week 1 to which you want to respond, and two class sessions in Week 2. Those in IP1 (2.30- 5.00 pm) can sign up for those sessions [here](#), and those in IP2 (10am - 12.30 pm) can sign up [here](#). Journal entries will be due 24 hours following the end of the chosen class (so if you respond to Session I from 10-12.30 EDT on August 15, your journal entry will be due at 12.30 pm EDT on August 16). Your response to your partners' journals will be due by 12.30 pm EDT the day after they submit (so if your journal partner submits a journal entry to Session 1 by 12.30 pm EDT on August 16, you would need to read and respond to their entry by 12.30 pm EDT on August 17).

We recommend that you create a GoogleSlides or GoogleDoc file for your journal (if you take T550 this fall, you will learn how amazing a GoogleSlide journal can be!), or PowerPoint Online, or you might like [this template](#). You can also create a OneDrive or Microsoft Teams or Dropbox file, so long as the teaching team + your journal partners can access your journal and comment on it.

We encourage you to use the journal reflections as a space to process, challenge, extend, apply, reimagine, etc. any and all of the ideas and practices within the course, including ones that the teaching team puts forward. Feel free to challenge us and one another. We also recommend that you use the journal to challenge yourself, to interrogate your ideas from the perspective of someone who might intelligently disagree with you. In other words, your journal should be a place for you to discuss your opinions from several perspectives. We recommend that across the four journal entries you engage in at least two of the following areas of exploration:

Self-Reflection: Examples include self-critique or analysis, an awareness of self-and/or self-impact, and explaining and expanding on an 'aha!' moment you had related to the topic, session, and/or course content (readings, materials, etc.).

- What personal experiences does this raise for you?
- When was the first time you noticed this? What kind of impact did it have on you?
- What are you doing to combat, unlearn, or improve upon previous assumptions as a result of your 'aha' moment?

Intellectual Theorizing: Examples include integrating relevant thinking and information from academic sources/readings, bringing in related narratives from other sources (friends, family, etc.) and/or framing the conversation within a broader context of social justice.

- How do the topics from the readings and class session interact with the overall systems of society, especially in education?
- What new insights does this spark from your previous explorations on this identity topic?

Applications to Future-Work/Practice: Examples include considering how insights, questions, or ideas may inform your future work or practice in education.

- What am I learning about myself?
- How could what I am unearthing shape my work in the future?
- What are the implications for these topics/insights in my roles at HGSE and beyond?

- What specific topic do I find especially compelling and want to continue to explore in the future?

When you respond to your partners' journals, you may note differences/similarities between your own journey and your partners', draw on concepts discussed in our class conversations to extend or challenge their ideas, or raise questions to promote deeper reflection and learning.

Final Reflection: Identity in Context Synthesis (Due September 1 by 11:59pm EDT; submit via Canvas)

For the final assignment, you are asked to synthesize your personal takeaways, learning edges and lingering questions from your journals, class discussions and course readings by following one of the prompts below. Your final assignment can take the form of a written essay (suggested length 6-8 pages -- i.e. up to 2500 words), a podcast (suggested 10-15 minutes, with transcript), a collection of poems with a reflection on how the poems relate to the course content, a piece of visual art with explanation, or another medium of your choosing. Your work should reference at least three materials (texts, podcasts, videos, etc.) from the course and demonstrate clear connections to the course. In crafting your final project, consider the concepts and the conversations from class. You may choose between one of the following prompts for your synthesis:

1. Choose a practice or policy that you are now thinking about differently as a result of your learning from this course. How would you modify this practice or policy given what you learned in this course?
2. How does this course connect to your self, your practice, and your future? Use the following guiding questions to develop a personal reflective piece.

Connection to Self

- What have you learned and what new insights have you gained about this identity strand?
- What are you doing to combat, unlearn, or improve upon previous assumptions as a result of your 'aha' moment?
- How has your understanding of self changed as a result of engaging in this material?

Connection to Practice

- What reflections do you have about how the course content connects to social systems, especially through the lens of education?
- What new insights does this spark from your previous explorations on this identity topic?
- How does the course content connect to creating a more equitable education system?

Connection to Future

- How does this experience shape your work in the future?
- What are the implications for these topics/insights in your future roles?
- What additional topics are you hoping to explore and unpack during your time at HGSE?

ADDITIONAL COURSE POLICIES & EXPECTATIONS

In our course, we'll adhere to the overarching principles that guide HGSE as a community and which have been shared with you by our Dean Bridget Terry Long:

- Respect for the rights, differences, and dignity of others;
- Honest and ethical preparation and submission of all academic work;
- Honesty and integrity in dealing with all members of the community;
- Accountability for personal and professional behavior.

Impact Statement

In the discussion of politically complex and charged issues, interpersonal as well as intellectual discomfort may arise. It is necessary to engage in discussion of these issues in order to come to a comprehensive, critically conscious understanding of how prejudice and discrimination operate in our lives and the larger world around us. It is only by engaging in an open and honest discussion of inequity that we can learn how to build inclusive and socially just communities both on-campus and beyond. If you become particularly distressed about any discussion, please speak to Meira and/or Alysha immediately, and/or take advantage of the services offered by HUHS. You are also always welcome to check in with Tracie Jones or Kevin Boehm in OSA, both of whom can connect you to additional support services.

Mandatory Reporting Statement

An essential aspect of the dialogue process is to cultivate a learning environment in which you feel comfortable sharing information related to your life experiences in classroom discussions and assignments. As your dialogue facilitators, one of our responsibilities is to help create this space and to keep the information shared in our classroom private to the greatest extent possible ("take the lessons, leave the stories"). However, as Instructors at HGSE, we also have mandatory reporting responsibility to disclose any information regarding incidents or suspicion of sexual misconduct, abuse, or a crime that may have occurred to the Office of Sexual Assault Prevention & Response. If you would like to speak to someone confidentially about something that has occurred, please contact (617) 495-9100. If you would like to review the full Harvard University policy on Sexual Misconduct, please review it at <https://titleix.harvard.edu/policy>.

Academic Integrity

Academic work submitted for this course must be the work of the participant and any sources used in compiling must be accurately and thoroughly cited. Please, adhere to all expectations learned in the tutorial you already completed: [Using Evidence in Academic Writing](#).

Writing Resources and Support

HGSE Writing Services offer resources that are NOT TO BE MISSED! You can find lots of resources on their website and you are encouraged to make individual appointments to get individualized support on your academic writing. You can get valuable help on your writing if you plan ahead! <https://canvas.harvard.edu/courses/11528/pages/academic-writing-resources?titleize=0>

Accessibility and Accommodations

We are committed to creating a learning space where everyone can participate and engage as fully as possible. We strive to provide information and resources in multiple formats (text, visuals, audio,

independent reflection, group reflection, etc.) to enable more access possibilities for every student in this module. We recognize that there are many reasons students may need to adjust their pace and/or method of learning, including but not limited to disability, temporary or ongoing personal life circumstances, unexpected emergencies, or other learning differences.

- If you have any access needs that we can better support by redesigning any aspect of this module, you are welcome and encouraged to reach out to us to let us know how we can better support you.
- Students with disabilities/disabled students may choose to formally register with Student Support Services with KellyAnn Robinson, Associate Director of Student Support Services (Kellyann_robinson@gse.harvard.edu) as well for questions and support needs.
- **You do not need to have a specific reason or diagnosis to talk to us about your access needs.** Our goal is to support students in the way that makes the most sense for them at this point in time.

[Accessibility statement adapted from EQO11B and Lydia X.Z. Brown \(2020\).](#)

COURSE WEEKLY SCHEDULE

***Note: All assigned texts are available on Canvas under Library Reserves.**

SESSION 1 (8-15) Conceptualizing citizenship and nationality

What are citizenship and nationality, and how do these concepts interrelate? How do claims or attributions of citizenship and nationality reinforce, accommodate, or challenge systems of power and oppression? What are our own diverse identifications with and experiences of citizenship and nationality?

Note that the reading load for today's class is heavier than normal; we strongly suggest you begin reading a bit earlier than you otherwise might.

Young, I. M. (2000). Five Faces of Oppression. In Adams, M., Blumenfeld, W., Castañeda, C., Hackman, H., Peters, M. & Zúñiga, X (Eds.), *Readings for diversity and social justice* (pp. 35-49). New York: Routledge. [E&O Identity in Context Core Text]

Coates, T. (2015). *Between the World and Me*. One World. Ch.1, pp. 5-12, 23-56, 69-71.

Shachar, A. (2009). *The birthright lottery: citizenship and global inequality*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. Introduction, pp. 1-18.

Shankar, S. (2020, January 30). *India's Citizenship Law, in Tandem With National Registry, Could Make BJP's Discriminatory Targeting of Muslims Easier*. *The Intercept*.

[Asynchronous lecture](#) (here are the [transcript](#) and [slides](#)). Two notes: (1) We recorded this last year, so a couple of chronological references are off by a year (and Meira's children are now 19 and 16 – meaning that she has a new set of harrowing teaching-my-child-to-drive stories :-)). You can also ignore references to Meira's dog – last year we were teaching online, but this year is happily in person! (2) We had a slight technical mishap when

recording, and you can't hear Alysha's last few sentences. Not to worry, you aren't missing anything critical- just that we hope the lecture has given you some ways to think about conceptions of citizenship and nationality going into our conversation in our first class and how they might intersect with other dimensions of identity; as well as help you think about how some of the readings that we've assigned fit together.

Please also review our proposed course norms in the Modules tab under [Course Community](#). We will discuss these in our first class and make modifications as needed.

Also to prepare for class: Please bring a physical object (or photographic representation--don't go to great lengths to get your hands on it!) to share that reflects upon or illuminates something about your civic or national identity. You will have up to 2 minutes to share it with the class.

SESSION 2 (8-16) Schools as gatekeepers and bridges

How do schools distribute and restrict educational opportunities to students based on their diverse political, transnational, refugee, migrant, postcolonial, and other civic identities? How have our own educational trajectories been shaped by these identities, and how have these experiences shaped our sense of power and possibility in the past, and what we imagine for the future?

Read both E&O core texts and explore the Reimagining Migration website plus read any two of the other three readings (Dryden-Peterson, Gonzales, McKinney de Royston et al)

Tatum, B.D. (2010). The Complexity of Identity: "Who Am I?" In Adams, M., Blumenfeld, W., Castañeda, C., Hackman, H., Peters, M. & Zúñiga, X (Eds.), *Readings for Diversity and Social Justice* (pp. 5-8). New York: Routledge. [E&O Identity in Context Core Text]

Levinson, M., Geron, T., & Brighthouse, H. (forthcoming 2022). Conceptions of educational equity. *AERA Open*. [E&O Identity in Context Core Text]

[Reimagining Migration](#)

Read two of the three readings below:

Dryden-Peterson, S. (2017). Refugee education: Education for an unknowable future. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 47(1), 14-24.

Gonzales, R. (2016). *Lives in limbo: Undocumented and coming of age in America*. Oakland, California: University of California Press. Ch. 5, pp. 92- 119 and pp. 212- 217.

McKinney de Royston, M., Madkins, T.C., Givens, J. R., & Nasir, N.S. (2021). "I'm a Teacher, I'm Gonna Always Protect You": Understanding Black Educators' Protection of Black Children. *American Education Research Journal*, 58(1), 68–106. DOI: 10.3102/0002831220921119

SESSION 3 (8-18) Schools as tools for enslavement and colonialism

How have schools participated in and enabled white supremacy through enslavement, colonialism, neocolonialism, and settler colonialism? How should we think about these processes historically, and about the educational systems, institutions, and curricula that we have inherited as a result? What responsibilities do educational institutions have to recognise, address, and mitigate harm caused by these policies and practices? What are our own roles and responsibilities as survivors, perpetrators, beneficiaries, and/or challengers to these systems?

[Asynchronous lecture on colonialism](#) (we recommend starting here!). See [transcript](#) and [slides](#) here.

Pember, M.A. (2019, March 8). Death by Civilization. *The Atlantic*.

Stolen Children | Residential School survivors speak out (16 mins)

Callimachi, R. (2021, July 19). Lost Lives, Lost Culture: The Forgotten History of Indigenous Boarding Schools. *The New York Times*.

Mikander, P. (2016). Globalization as Continuing Colonialism: Critical Global Citizenship Education in an Unequal World. *Journal of Social Science Education*, 15(2), 70-79.

Harvard & the Legacy of Slavery: either watch [this film](#) or read Ch. 1 ("Introduction and Findings") of [the report](#).

SESSION 4 (8-19) Citizenship in the hidden curriculum

How do schools define and reinforce the values and cultures associated with "good citizenship," including which students are considered capable of being good citizens? In what ways do schools socialize students by flattening or rejecting some dimensions of their civic identities while elevating others? How do young people make sense of and experience their national, transnational, and intersectional identities in school settings?

Harro, B. (2013). The cycle of socialization. In Adams, M., Blumenfeld, W., Castañeda, C., Hackman, H., Peters, M. & Zúñiga, X. (Eds.), *Readings for diversity and social justice* (pp. 45-52). New York, NY: Routledge. [E&O Identity in Context Core Text]

Levinson, M. (2012). *No Citizen Left Behind*. Harvard University Press. Ch. 5, pp. 167-209.

Choose 2 of the following:

Acevedo, N., Bejarano, C., & Collazo, N.I. (2020). A Call for Intersectionality in US Schooling: Testimonios of Chicana Students in High School. *Harvard Educational Review*, 90(2), 269-281.

Abu El-Haj, T. R. (2007). "I Was Born Here, but My Home, It's Not Here": Educating for Democratic Citizenship in an Era of Transnational Migration and Global Conflict. *Harvard Educational Review*, 77(3), 285-316.

Reed, B. & Syed, H. (2021). [The Trojan Horse Affair](#). *Serial Podcast*. Episode 1, "The Letter in the Brown Paper Envelope."

SESSION 5 (8-22) Citizenship in the formal curriculum: Teaching history

What are the civic implications of how teachers and schools teach history? How does the formal history curriculum socialise students to the civic and political distributions of power within and across nation states, and how is it intended to do so? In what ways might individuals' identities influence their conceptions of history, sense of place within history, and beliefs about how, why, when, where, and by whom history should be taught?

Baldwin, J. (1963). A Talk to Teachers. (Note this is what his speech is always referred to as, although the full citation is as follows: Delivered October 16, 1963, as "The Negro Child – His Self-Image"; originally published in *The Saturday Review*, December 21, 1963, reprinted in *The Price of the Ticket, Collected*

Non-Fiction 1948-1985, Saint Martins 1985.)

Barton, K. C. (2012). Chapter 7: School History as a Resource for Constructing Identities: Implications of Research from the United States, Northern Ireland, and New Zealand. In Mario Carretero et al., (Eds.), *History Education and the Construction of National Identities* (pp.93-107). Information Age Publishing.

Keenan, H.B. (2021). The Mission Project: Teaching History and Avoiding the Past in California Elementary Schools. *Harvard Educational Review* 91 (1): 109–132. doi: <https://doi-org.ezp-prod1.hul.harvard.edu/10.17763/1943-5045-91.1.109>

Washington Post Live. (2022, July 8). [‘How the Word is Passed’ author Clint Smith on how slavery is remembered](#) (Full Stream 7/8). Youtube.

[History Wars- The Global Edition](#): Tensions over who and how history gets researched, written, represented, narrated, taught, passed down, revised, challenged are particularly fraught currently all around the world. We have curated a short set of resources to enable you to explore some of these tensions in various countries. **Please plan to spend 20 minutes exploring these resources**, and if you'd like, feel free to contribute resources for other countries, contexts, settings, and perspectives.

SESSION 6 (8-24) Citizenship in the formal curriculum: Civic Education

How do schools teach civic education? How does the formal curriculum socialise students to the civic and political distributions of power across and beyond the nation state, and to their roles as national, transnational, global, and digital citizens? How have these forms of socialization affected our own identities as learners and educators?

Dyrness, A. (2012). Contra Viento y Marea (Against Wind and Tide): Building Civic Identity among Children of Emigration in El Salvador. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, Vol. 43, Issue 1, pp. 41–60, DOI:10.1111/j.1548-1492.2011.01156.x.

Ho, L. (2012): Sorting citizens: Differentiated citizenship education in Singapore, *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, DOI:10.1080/00220272.2012.675359

Nussbaum, M.C. (1996). “Patriotism and Cosmopolitanism.” In Nussbaum, M.C. *For love of country: Debating the limits of patriotism*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Video of case + discussion for [Taking the Action Out of Civics](#)

SESSION 7 (8-25) Students’ activism

How are young people challenging the civic roles that they have been assigned and working across multiple borders to create change in the world? What can we learn from these youth as we develop our own repertoire of tools for transformation?

Freire, P. (2000). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (30th anniversary ed.). New York: Continuum. Ch. 2, pp. 71-86. [E&O Identity in Context Core Text]

McCullough Jr., A., Morrell Jr., F., Thomas III, B., Waugh, V., Shubert, N., & Donofrio, A. (2020). The EVAC Movement Story: Why Youth Storytelling Is Powerful . . . and Why It’s Dangerous. *Harvard Educational Review*, 90(2), 195-228.

You also may be interested in two followup articles about Amy Donofrio's subsequent suspension and firing:

<https://www.splcenter.org/news/2021/08/05/blm-reprisal-florida-school-district-terminates-teacher-who-stood-black-students>

<https://www.news4jax.com/news/local/2021/10/06/teacher-who-hung-blm-flag-outside-class-offered-extra-credit-for-activism-dcps-investigation-finds/>

Montpelier Case Study:

Note that these three videos are part of a free online course for educators called [Youth in Front: Understanding and Supporting Student-Led Activism](#). You may need to create an account in the course to access the videos.

[Video 1](#)

[Video 2](#)

[Video 3](#)

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES FOR E&O: CITIZENSHIP AND NATIONALITY IN CONTEXT

As you may already know, Celia Reddick and Carola Suarez-Orozco are also teaching a strand of Citizenship and Nationality in Context this August term. Their syllabus is similar to ours in many ways, but also includes additional resources for many of the sections. If you're interested in digging deeper into any of these topics, [this syllabus](#) might be a great place to start!