

Assessment 2: Conservative vs. Progressive View of Education

Jacqueline Zamora

Doctorate Candidate in Educational Technology Leadership

EDTC 807: Implementation and Evaluation of Curriculum Spring 2024

Dr. Tracy Amerman

March 10, 2024

In the field of education, there exists a diverse array of theories and perspectives that have been shaped by the knowledge and research of experts in the field. This paper will compare two highly esteemed educational experts regarding education, Eric Donald Hirsch Jr. and John Dewey. This paper will identify the key differences in their expertise and present this information in table format titled Table 1. The table will outline their background knowledge, critical thinking, curriculum, standardized assessment, achievement gap, individualized learning, inclusivity, and educational goals.

Table 1

Idea/Concept	Eric Donald Hirsh Jr.	John Dewey
Background Knowledge	E.D. Hirsch Jr. has gained recognition as a prominent advocate of a rich and diverse curriculum that greatly emphasizes teaching students a comprehensive knowledge base (Giddings, 1998). He firmly believed that education should prioritize providing students with a profound foundation of knowledge that encompasses a wide range of topics and includes both factual information and traditional values (Giddings, 1998). Hirsch argued that a well-rounded education should not only cover the basics of reading, writing, and arithmetic but also include a deep understanding of history, science, literature, and culture (Giddings, 1998).	John Dewey, a prominent philosopher and educational reformer, had a different perspective on education that was quite different from the traditional approach. Dewey believed that education should focus on the individual student's needs and interests rather than on a fixed body of knowledge (Goodman, 2019). This approach, which he called "progressive education," was based on the idea that students learn best when they are actively engaged in the learning process and are encouraged to think critically and creatively (Goodman, 2019).
Critical Thinking	Hirsch advocates for "cultural literacy" in education, which focuses on the significance of a common cultural knowledge foundation (Giddings, 1998). He believes that in order to be active and valuable contributors to society, students must be familiar with a wide variety of cultural encounters and knowledge. Hirsch prioritizes	Dewey argued that students should be taught how to think critically and how to apply their knowledge to solve real-world problems (Williams, 2017). He created a progressive education theory that emphasized experiential learning and a child-centered approach to education to achieve critical thinking and

	memorization over critical thinking and problem-solving skills (Giddings, 1998).	problem-solving goals and that students are actively engaged in the learning process (Williams, 2017).
Curriculum	Hirsch argues for a content-rich, traditional curriculum that prioritizes fundamental concepts and skills across subjects and opposes differentiated curriculum, which he believes could hinder academic achievement and equity in education (Hirsch, 2016). Hirsch believed that educational standards should be established according to grade level, taking into account the knowledge and skills that students at each grade level should possess (Hirsch, 2016).	Dewey emphasizes that curriculum development should center on individual students' unique needs and interests. He believes that a student-centered approach to curriculum development would lead to a more meaningful and engaging educational experience for learners (Williams, 2017). Dewey highlights that by connecting different subjects, students would be able to see the relationships between them and develop a deeper understanding of the world (Williams, 2017).
Standardized Assessment	According to Hirsch's perspective on standardized testing, it is a useful tool that helps students acquire the skills necessary to confront the challenges of a constantly evolving global economy (Hirsch, 2016). Hirsch argued that standardized tests measure academic achievement where students can showcase their abilities and knowledge consistently and objectively. This approach ensures that students are evaluated based on their performance and not on subjective opinions or biases (Hirsch, 2016).	According to Dewey, standardized testing may not be the most reliable indicator of student learning and can often fail to provide a comprehensive assessment of student performance (Williams, 2017). He argued that such tests can be limited in terms of evaluating the depth and breadth of student knowledge and skills (Williams, 2017). Standardized tests alone shouldn't be used to evaluate student learning. Other assessments, like project-based evaluations should also be incorporated for a more complete picture of student achievement (Williams, 2017). Dewey advocated for an experiential approach to education that emphasizes problem-solving and reflection as the key pillars of effective learning (Dewey, 2007).
Achievement Gap	Hirsch was an advocate for ensuring that elementary schools in the country provided a uniform level of education to every child, irrespective of their background or socio-economic status	Dewey believed that students from disadvantaged backgrounds are often unable to perform well academically due to a lack of essential resources and support. He recognized that such

	<p>(Hirsch, 2016). Hirsch believed schools had a crucial role in shaping a child's future, and it was their responsibility to provide a high-quality education that would equip students with the necessary tools to succeed in life. He firmly believed that all children deserved a fair and equal chance to succeed in life, and access to quality education was a critical factor in achieving this goal (Hirsch, 2016).</p>	<p>students face systematic inequalities that make it difficult for them to access quality education, resulting in a significant achievement gap between them and their more privileged peers (Dewey, 2007). To close this gap, Dewey emphasized the need to address these structural inequalities and provide disadvantaged students with the necessary resources and support to succeed academically (Dewey, 2007).</p>
Individualized Learning	<p>Hirsch argues that acquiring knowledge is essential for students to understand complex ideas and make informed decisions (Hirsch, 2016). Hirsch also suggests that traditional methods such as direct instruction, which involves explicit teaching of subject matter, and rote memorization, which involves repetition of information until it can be recalled easily, are effective techniques for helping students build this knowledge base (Hirsch, 2016). Hirsch believes that these techniques in the classroom can help students develop a strong foundation of knowledge and skills and that traditional methods should be reintroduced to modern education (Hirsch, 2016).</p>	<p>Dewey believed that students should be allowed to explore and experiment, interact with their environment, and apply what they learn to real-world situations (Dewey, 2007). By doing so, students gain a deeper understanding of the subject matter and develop critical thinking skills, problem-solving abilities, and creativity. In essence, Dewey's approach to education emphasizes hands-on learning and encourages students to become active participants in their own learning journey (Dewey, 2007).</p>
Inclusivity	<p>Hirsch emphasizes the significance of traditional methods and teacher-led instruction (Hirsch, 2016). He argues that an excessive focus on individual interests and needs can lead to a fragmented learning experience where students lack an understanding of the subject matter (Hirsch, 2016). By doing so, students can develop a solid foundation of knowledge, which can serve as a basis for further exploration and learning in the future.</p>	<p>Dewey's philosophy of education emphasized the need to incorporate diverse perspectives and experiences into the education system, which would enable students to develop critical thinking skills and become well-rounded individuals capable of contributing positively to society (Dewey, 2007). By doing so, Dewey believed that the education system would be better equipped to prepare students for the challenges of the ever-changing world and help them become responsible and engaged</p>

		members of society.
Educational Goals	Hirsch, an advocate of educational conservatism, argues that the educational community should accept educational conservatism's principles and traditional practices (Stern, 2014). Hirsch's belief in educational conservatism implies that he favors the traditional, time-tested methods of teaching and learning rather than the more progressive and experimental approaches that have emerged in recent years (Stern, 2014).	Dewey's educational objective perspective was founded on his progressive education theory which emphasized the importance of experiential learning and critical thinking. He believed that education should not only be focused on acquiring knowledge but also on developing practical skills and abilities that would enable individuals to become active and productive members of society. Dewey sought to create a more student-centered approach to education through his theory that would foster creativity, innovation, and social responsibility (Williams, 2017).

In conclusion, E.D. Hirsch Jr. and John Dewey were two influential educators who had different ideas about education. Hirsch believed that a structured, knowledge-based curriculum was essential for students to succeed, while Dewey believed that education should be individualized and centered around the needs and interests of each student. Despite their differences, both Hirsch and Dewey shared a common goal of making education accessible and beneficial to all children. Ultimately, both educators recognized the importance of education and its ability to transform individuals and society as a whole.

Resources

Dewey, J. (1938). *Experience and education*. New York: Macmillan.

Dewey, J. (2007). *Experience And Education*. Free Press.

Giddings, L. R. (1998). Beyond E.D. Hirsch and Cultural Literacy: Thinking Skills for Cultural Awareness. *Community Review*, 16, 109.

Goodman, J. (2019). Willystine Goodsell (1870–1962) and John Dewey (1859–1952): history, philosophy and women’s education. *History of Education*, 48(6), 837–854.

<https://doi-org.draweb.njcu.edu/10.1080/0046760X.2019.1628311>

Hirsch, E. D. (2016). *Why Knowledge Matters: Rescuing Our Children from Failed Educational Theories*. Harvard Education Press.

Stern, S. (2014). Our conservative Core. *New Criterion*, 33(1), 26–28.

Williams, M. K. (2017). John Dewey in the 21st century. *Journal of Inquiry and Action in Education*, 9(1), 91–102