

Case Study 3: Box Protocol Common Source Analysis

Based on a 30–45 minute class.

Guiding Question: What role did the government play in segregating our community?

Social Studies Framework Reference

4.4c Government in New York State is organized into counties, cities, towns, and villages.

- Students will identify the county in which they live, noting where their city, town or village is within that county.

4.7b Beginning in the 1890s, large numbers of African Americans migrated to New York City and other northern cities to work in factories.

Students will investigate the reasons that African Americans moved into northern cities.

Students will investigate artists, writers, and musicians associated with the Harlem Renaissance.

S.S. Practices: Gathering, Interpreting and Using Evidence, Comparison, and Contextualization

New York State Standards: English Language Arts

4R1: Locate and refer to relevant details and evidence when explaining what a text says explicitly/implicitly and make logical inferences.

Teaching Tolerance Standards

Diversity 9 Students will respond to diversity by building empathy, respect, understanding and connection

DI.3-5.9 I feel connected to other people and know how to talk, work and play with others even when we are different or when we disagree.

Justice 12. Students will recognize unfairness on the individual level (e.g., biased speech) and injustice at the institutional or systemic level (e.g., discrimination).

JU.3-5.12 I know when people are treated unfairly, and I can give examples of prejudice words, pictures and rules

Social Studies Practice: Compare & Contrast

Overview

Each student will have a copy of the Common Reading which will focus on redlining and a brief overview of housing segregation through several sources. The teacher and students will read and analyze the first part of the common reading “Rochester Redlining Map 1938” together. Then, they will analyze the remaining parts of the common reading including an excerpt from the National Housing Act. In their teams of four, students will each be assigned a collaborative role (Capt. Context, Mister E, The Connector, or Credible Hulk) and will answer the corresponding questions on the Common Source. When all students have completed the reading a second time independently, they will record information in the Round 2 area of the Box Protocol (instructions pictured on slide below). As the instructions note, students can record information that helps to clarify the first document (the Round 1 Mystery Source [2010 Monroe County Pop. Map]), or information related to the lesson question for the day (“What role did the government play in segregating our community?”), or they can record new information they find interesting or possibly relevant to the general topic of the day. Finally, students will gather in a restorative circle and share their observations and inferences about the question for the day.



Learning Target: I can analyze a map and primary sources to learn how redlining has affected where I live.

Teacher Resources



Day 3 Case Study

Day 3 Case Study Slide Deck

Share with Students



4 Separate Superhero Handouts: Captain Context, Mister E, the Credible Hulk, and the Connector

Sequence of Instruction

Pre-Teaching/Introduction

Consider the following instructional strategies and suggestions as part of this Case Study. There is a Quizlet that could be used as part of this vocabulary focus and introduction.



Vocabulary Teaching Tip

Students may benefit from an Anchor Chart that introduces the vocabulary for the case study. Consider picture books, flash cards and other scaffolds that best meet the needs of your learners. Here is a list of terms, concepts, and ideas for all case studies. Here is a list for the Jigsaw case study.

Vocabulary		
Hazardous Racial	Negro Act (Law)	Class



Social-Emotional Teaching Tip

The common source contains explicit racist language and rules. Strong feelings often come up for students when reading this source. It is essential to remind students at the beginning of the lesson of the group norms they agreed to on day 1 of this unit. The academic circle at the end offers students a structured and safer way to share their thinking and feelings about the common source. Encourage students to use ‘I’ statements when constructing notices and wonders about the common source during group discussion. For example: ‘I notice the Cornhill neighborhood has more people of color than Pittsford.’



Culturally Responsive Teaching Tip

The word ‘Negro’ is used in this document. It is important to tell students before the lesson begins that this is a word that used to be a respectful way to refer to people of color. Words often change their meaning. Today this word is not a respectful way to refer to a black person and in our classroom we will show respect by refraining from saying it out loud. It is also important to point out that the text being read today is an unfair and unjust law based on untrue racist ideas. The central racist idea is that black people living in a neighborhood lowers a neighbor’s property value. Giving students language to talk about this is an important way to help them engage with the text.

Diversity 9 Students will respond to diversity by building empathy, respect, understanding and connection.

Justice 12. Students will recognize unfairness on the individual level (e.g., biased speech) and injustice at the institutional or systemic level (e.g., discrimination)

Teaching Tip



Consider introducing the Sourcing Superhero Roles before the Boxing Protocol so that they can focus on their assigned role and the challenging source. However, it is possible to introduce the roles for the first time and complete the case study.

Class Activity 1/3: Warm-Up/Introduction

5 minutes

Students will analyze the Learning Target for the Case Study. Teachers can guide this analysis by focusing on words and activities which are embedded in the Learning Target. Here is the Learning Target (**Slide 4**):



Learning Target: I can analyze a map and primary sources to learn how redlining has affected where I live.



Teaching Tip

Students may not understand or be familiar with redlining. Rather than defining the word for students, they will construct meaning throughout the lesson.

Class Activity 2/3: Introduce Common Source

20 minutes

Set-Up

Slides 5–10: The next round of the boxing protocol is the common source. Have students review the analysis, insights, and notices and wonders from the mystery source case study. Introduce the common source and the four roles they will be using to interpret it. The slide deck is set up to draw attention to each part of the common source and focus on the Social Studies Practice of “compare and contrast” (**Slide 9**). After reminding students where they are in the box protocol, show them that they will be comparing and contrasting four different neighborhoods on the map. First display the population map from the mystery source that is marked with neighborhoods 1 and 2 (**Slide 10**). Ask the students to make observations and then to compare and contrast the demographics of the two neighborhoods. Reintroduce the term ‘segregation’.

Slide 11: Briefly show students the entire common source to let them see the whole picture prior to breaking it down into parts.

Slide 12: On the next slide show them the 1935 Residential Security Map for Rochester, NY. Ask them to write down 5 things they notice on the Student Handout, a sticky note, or their box protocol chart paper; then have them turn and talk to a neighbor. Ask students to share out what they are noticing and to compare and contrast different areas of the map.

Slide 13: On the next slide they will see neighborhoods 1 & 2 on the map, as well as the key for the map. Invite students to make observations about how each neighborhood is described or labeled. Number 1 is green and labeled 'best' while neighborhood 2 is labeled red and 'hazardous'.

Slide 14: Ask students why might this map have also been called a 'redlining map'?

Slide 15: Slide 15 shares that neighborhood 1 is Cornhill and 2 is Pittsford.

Slide 16: Show the area descriptions for neighborhoods 1-4. Invite students to notice and share what is similar and different and infer why 1 is 'hazardous' and 2 is 'best'. Again, they can record answers on the Student Handout or facilitate the conversation at tables or as a whole class.

Slide 17: The next slide shows the President signing the law that created this map (National Housing Act 1934). Ask the students to share what they notice about these people and what inferences they can make about who, what, when, where, and why this is taking place. They should notice that they are white men. 'Think pair share' would work as a protocol also. Make space for students to ask questions.

Slide 18: This is an excerpt from the FHA Underwriting Manual that came out of the 1934 National Housing Act. The law included these rules about why a neighborhood might be labeled good and worthy of government investment. Invite students to notice what makes a neighborhood 'good'.



Teaching Tip

If students have trouble at this stage, encourage them to work together with a peer who has the same superhero role. Expect really tough questions from students. You can provide them with a small notebook and/or post-its to write down questions and unknown vocabulary and submit ANONYMOUSLY to you so you can address the class as a whole. This will give students the opportunity to think and ask freely without hesitancy due to potential concerns about peer judgement.

Class Activity 3/3: Common Source Independent Work and Circle

10 minutes

Divide students into the same table groups of four students from the mystery source round and give each group markers and a large piece of butcher paper, chart paper, or the like. There is also a special

[Distance Learning Boxing Protocol Handout](#) so the lesson can be done virtually. Be sure to share it with students and adjust settings so that it can be edited by anyone.

Slides 20-24: Each student will be assigned a superhero role to examine the source with. Walk through these slides introducing each of the roles and the rationale behind them. These roles are adapted from Cheryl Becker Dobbertin's book [Common Core, Unit by Unit](#): 5 Critical Moves for Implementing the Reading Standards Across the Curriculum.

- **The Credible Hulk's** job will be to determine if we can trust this source.
- **Mister E** will determine what the purpose of the source is, whose voices are missing and not included.
- **Captain Context** determines when the source was made and looks into what they know about this time period.
- **The Connector's** job is to find the main idea of the source and to connect it to larger issues. This role generally needs the least support and may be a good role to assign to a student who may struggle with this activity.

Assign each student their role and send them back to their desks to work individually. Here is the independent work broken down:

1. Break students into groups of 4
2. Provide each group with a link or physical folder of the SUPERHERO roles and directions (prepare beforehand)
3. Provide each group with the common source
4. Students read over their role prior to analyzing the common source
5. Students analyze the source individually and take notes on the round 2 box of the Box Protocol
6. Share out in small groups and can debrief as a whole class if time permits

Check for Understanding: Academic Circle

10 minutes

Slides 26-29: Invite students to sit in a circle. Remind them of the group norms set during the previous circle. Reread the learning target. Students can share what conclusions they have come to after analyzing the Common Source (and Mystery Source from the previous day). This is also a time when

students might raise questions they have. Another question to pose or possible enrichment could encourage students to consider the role the government played in segregating our community.

**Teaching Tip**

Planning to leave time for individual student reflection and time to debrief their answers collaboratively at tables and/or with the whole class can lead to rich insights and questions