Authoritarianism and Its Impact on Well-Being

Europe

Abstract

In light of the global increase of authoritarian regimes and the human rights abuses they commit, we present 2 studies on how population-wide subjective well-being can be impacted by international organisations and the authoritarian manipulation of well-being research. In Study 1, based on representative data from the European Values Survey and the World Values Survey, we found that the subjective well-being of European countries showed sustainable improvements after joining the European Union, with no evidence of hedonic treadmill (N = 120,865). In Study 3, we describe the ways in which authoritarian regimes use well-being research, which grant them legitimacy and have allowed them to cause actual harm to vulnerable ethnic minorities. The talk will end with a reflection on the challenges and opportunities in the ethical use of subjective well-being in policymaking and recommendations to help prevent the abuse of well-being research.

Methods

Data Source:

Data come from the Integrated Values Survey 1981-2022, which merges the European Values Survey Trend File 1981-2017 (EVS, 2022) with the World Values Survey Trend File 1981-2022 (Haerpfer et al., 2022). For both surveys, data are collected from people over the age of 18 during face-to-face interviews with a structured questionnaire, though in some cases data may be collected over the phone or with those who are as young as 15. Data for each country are not collected yearly, but instead in waves with the following year ranges: 1981-1984, 1989-1993, 1994-1998, 1999-2004, 2005-2009, 2008-2010, 2010-2014, and 2017-2022. The European Values Survey and the World Values Survey have both incorporated an increasing number of countries with each wave, such that data collection has started at different years for each country. Each country-year typically has data from at least 1,000 respondents, though in rare cases there may be as few as 500 respondents. All data from the surveys are de-identified, and so our preregistered secondary data analysis did not require ethics approval from the University of Toronto, where the present study was completed.

Life Satisfaction survey question:

All things considered, how satisfied are you with your life as a whole these days? Please use this card to help with your answer. [Dissatisfied (1) - (10) Satisfied]

Countries included in study:

Non-Eastern Bloc countries:

- Austria
- Finland
- Malta
- Spain
- Sweden

Eastern Bloc countries:

- Bulgaria
- Croatia
- Czechia
- Estonia
- Hungary
- Latvia
- Lithuania
- Poland
- Romania
- Slovakia

Analysis

Each multilevel interrupted time series analysis included three independent variables: an intervention variable, a linear pre- and post-intervention time trend variable, and a linear post-intervention time trend variable. Each model also included three control variables: the gender, age, and marital status of respondents. Additionally, country was included as a random intercept, with the linear post-intervention time trend variable included as a random slope. This random slope was selected due to it resulting in a lower Akaike information criterion when compared against models that either did not include a random slope or included the linear preand post-intervention time trend as a random slope. Each model was fitted with sampling weights (variable So17 in the Integrated Values Survey). Prior to fitting each model, the dependent variable was standardised (scaled and centred) as was the moderator variable (in the case of confidence in the European Union, national pride, and subjective perceptions of freedom).

Exploratory follow-up analyses were performed using joint hypothesis tests. To examine whether the long-term effect of joining the European Union was positive, we tested whether the linear combination of the linear pre- and post-intervention time trend coefficient and the linear post-intervention time trend coefficient is greater than 0. This linear combination was tested as the linear pre- and post-intervention time trend coefficient estimate is interpreted as the pre-intervention trend, and the linear post-intervention trend coefficient estimate is interpreted as the difference between pre- and post-intervention trends. Consequently, their combination is interpreted as the linear post-intervention time trend coefficient.

To examine whether the short-term effect of joining the European Union was positive for each tested group, we specified the intervention coefficient as having a value of 1 and the interaction between the moderator and the intervention coefficient as 1 for analyses involving country alignment. We then tested whether the linear combination of these two coefficients was greater than 0 for each group. To examine whether any groups declined to a baseline after 10 years of being in the European Union, we specified the intervention coefficient as having a value of 1, the linear pre- and post-intervention time trend and the linear post-intervention time trend coefficients as having a value of 10, and the interaction between the moderator coefficient (in the case of country alignment this would be 1) and the respective independent variable coefficients (1 for the intervention variable and 10 for each of the two linear time trend variables). We then tested whether the linear combination of these six coefficients was greater than 0 for each group.

The analyses of population well-being changes before and after countries join the European Union (life satisfaction N = 120,865; happiness N = 119,455) includes 16 countries (Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czechia, Estonia, Finland, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Malta, Poland, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, and Sweden), and the analyses of subjective well-being changes before and after 10 countries joined the European Union in 2004 (life satisfaction N = 46,556; happiness N = 45,102) includes 8 countries (Finland, France, Sweden, Italy, United Kingdom, Netherlands, Spain, and Germany).

For our moderator analysis comparing non-Eastern Bloc countries with Eastern Bloc countries, we categorised countries based on whether they were a member of the Eastern Bloc during the Cold War. Former Eastern Bloc countries are those countries that were either part of the Soviet Union or within its sphere of influence during the Cold War, while non-Eastern Bloc countries are those that were either aligned with the West during the Cold War or were neutral (o = former Eastern Bloc; 1 = non-Eastern Bloc). Former Eastern Bloc countries include Latvia, Lithuania, Estonia, Slovenia, Hungary, Slovakia, Poland, Czech Republic, Bulgaria, Romania, and Croatia. Non-Eastern Bloc countries include Spain, Austria, Finland, Sweden, and Malta.

Detailed Results

Main effect

- Short term of after joining the European Union:
 - β = 0.247, *SE* = 0.011, p < 0.001
- Difference between pre- and post-event slope:
 - β = 0.018 , SE = 0.001, p < 0.001

Country Alignment Moderator

- Short term effect of joining the European Union:
 - Non-Eastern Bloc: β = 0.247, SE = 0.011, p = 0.318

- Eastern Bloc: β = 0.321, SE = 0.014, p < 0.001
 Sustained effect after 10 years:

 Non-Eastern Bloc: β = 0.009 , SE = 0.04, p = 0.418
 Eastern Bloc: β = 0.524 , SE = 0.027p < 0.001

Table 5

Descriptive statistics for life satisfaction by country-year

Country	Year	EU Join Year	LS (Mean)	LS (SD)	Pre- and Post-EU Mean LS (Country)	Pre- and Post-EU Mean LS (Overall)	Former Eastern Bloc Country
Austria	1990	1995	6.8	1.9	6.8	5.26	No
Austria	1999	1995	7.02	1.91	6.81	6.2	No
Austria	2008	1995	6.55	2.13	6.81	6.2	No
Austria	2018	1995	6.87	1.81	6.81	6.2	No
Bulgaria	1991	2007	4.04	2.29	4.06	5.26	Yes
Bulgaria	1997	2007	3.66	2.4	4.06	5.26	Yes
Bulgaria	1999	2007	4.34	2.69	4.06	5.26	Yes
Bulgaria	2006	2007	4.22	2.28	4.06	5.26	Yes
Bulgaria	2008	2007	4.84	2.73	5.03	6.2	Yes
Bulgaria	2017	2007	5.21	2.56	5.03	6.2	Yes
Croatia	1996	2013	5.18	2.14	5.55	5.26	Yes
Croatia	1999	2013	5.44	2.32	5.55	5.26	Yes
Croatia	2008	2013	6.03	2.41	5.55	5.26	Yes
Croatia	2017	2013	6.46	2.17	6.46	6.2	Yes
Czechia	1991	2004	5.69	2.16	5.72	5.26	Yes
Czechia	1998	2004	5.4	2.05	5.72	5.26	Yes
Czechia	1999	2004	6.06	1.95	5.72	5.26	Yes
Czechia	2008	2004	6.22	2.1	6.26	6.2	Yes
Czechia	2017	2004	6.52	1.96	6.26	6.2	Yes
Czechia	2022	2004	6.03	1.87	6.26	6.2	Yes
Estonia	1990	2004	5	2.13	4.63	5.26	Yes
Estonia	1996	2004	4	2.27	4.63	5.26	Yes
Estonia	1999	2004	4.89	2.19	4.63	5.26	Yes
Estonia	2008	2004	5.68	2.15	5.72	6.2	Yes
Estonia	2011	2004	5.25	2.07	5.72	6.2	Yes
Estonia	2018	2004	6.23	1.89	5.72	6.2	Yes
Finland	1990	1995	6.68	1.88	6.68	5.26	No
Finland	1996	1995	6.78	1.55	6.83	6.2	No
Finland	2000	1995	6.89	1.66	6.83	6.2	No
Finland	2005	1995	6.84	1.75	6.83	6.2	No
Finland	2009	1995	6.72	1.78	6.83	6.2	No
Finland	2017	1995	6.91	1.65	6.83	6.2	No
Hungary	1991	2004	5.03	2.45	4.86	5.26	Yes
Hungary	1998	2004	4.86	2.28	4.86	5.26	Yes
Hungary	1999	2004	4.69	2.45	4.86	5.26	Yes
Hungary	2008	2004	5.29	2.3	5.45	6.2	Yes
Hungary	2009	2004	4.91	2.14	5.45	6.2	Yes
Hungary	2018	2004	6.15	2.13	5.45	6.2	Yes

Latvia	1990	2004	4.7	2.44	4.29	5.26	Yes
Latvia	1996	2004	3.9	2.22	4.29	5.26	Yes
Latvia	1999	2004	4.27	2.39	4.29	5.26	Yes
Latvia	2008	2004	5.36	2.1	5.64	6.2	Yes
Latvia	2021	2004	5.91	1.98	5.64	6.2	Yes
Lithuania	1990	2004	5.01	2.35	4.36	5.26	Yes
Lithuania	1997	2004	3.99	2.62	4.36	5.26	Yes
Lithuania	1999	2004	4.09	2.63	4.36	5.26	Yes
Lithuania	2008	2004	5.45	2.25	5.61	6.2	Yes
Lithuania	2018	2004	5.76	2.05	5.61	6.2	Yes
Malta	1983	2004	6.96	1.89	7.15	5.26	No
Malta	1991	2004	7.28	1.98	7.15	5.26	No
Malta	1999	2004	7.21	1.62	7.15	5.26	No
Malta	2008	2004	6.91	2	6.91	6.2	No
Poland	1989	2004	5.65	2.35	5.49	5.26	Yes
Poland	1990	2004	5.53	2.18	5.49	5.26	Yes
Poland	1997	2004	5.42	2.42	5.49	5.26	Yes
Poland	1999	2004	5.37	2.48	5.49	5.26	Yes
Poland	2005	2004	6.02	2.08	6.22	6.2	Yes
Poland	2008	2004	6.21	2.02	6.22	6.2	Yes
Poland	2012	2004	6.09	1.97	6.22	6.2	Yes
Poland	2017	2004	6.56	1.96	6.22	6.2	Yes
Romania	1993	2007	4.88	2.33	4.43	5.26	Yes
Romania	1993	2007	3.86	2.48		5.26	Yes
Romania			4.23		4.43	5.26	Yes
Romania	1999	2007		2.77	4.43		Yes
	2005	2007	4.76	2.38	4.43	5.26	
Romania	2008	2007	5.79	2.52	5.95	6.2	Yes
Romania	2012	2007	5.7	2.39	5.95	6.2	Yes
Romania	2018	2007	6.36	2.25	5.95	6.2	Yes
Slovakia	1990	2004	5.16	2.17	5.27	5.26	Yes
Slovakia	1991	2004	5.81	2.48	5.27	5.26	Yes
Slovakia	1998	2004	5.07	2.24	5.27	5.26	Yes
Slovakia	1999	2004	5.03	2.22	5.27	5.26	Yes
Slovakia	2008	2004	6.27	2.06	6.14	6.2	Yes
Slovakia	2017	2004	6.31	1.89	6.14	6.2	Yes
Slovakia	2022	2004	5.83	1.95	6.14	6.2	Yes
Slovenia	1992	2004	5.29	2.21	5.67	5.26	Yes
Slovenia	1995	2004	5.47	2.13	5.67	5.26	Yes
Slovenia	1999	2004	6.24	2.15	5.67	5.26	Yes
Slovenia	2005	2004	6.24	1.95	6.45	6.2	Yes
Slovenia	2008	2004	6.54	2.09	6.45	6.2	Yes
Slovenia	2011	2004	6.35	1.95	6.45	6.2	Yes
Slovenia	2017	2004	6.68	1.69	6.45	6.2	Yes
Spain	1981	1986	5.6	2	5.6	5.26	No
Spain	1990	1986	6.14	1.93	6.1	6.2	No
Spain	1995	1986	5.61	1.97	6.1	6.2	No
Spain	1999	1986	6.09	2.01	6.1	6.2	No
Spain	2000	1986	6	1.81	6.1	6.2	No

Spain	2007	1986	6.32	1.5	6.1	6.2	No	
Spain	2008	1986	6.32	1.79	6.1	6.2	No	
Spain	2011	1986	5.79	1.75	6.1	6.2	No	
Spain	2017	1986	6.49	1.67	6.1	6.2	No	
Sweden	1982	1995	7.01	1.73	7	5.26	No	
Sweden	1990	1995	6.98	1.73	7	5.26	No	
Sweden	1996	1995	6.77	1,81	6.66	6.2	No	
Sweden	1999	1995	6.65	1.85	6.66	6.2	No	
Sweden	2006	1995	6.74	1.61	6.66	6.2	No	
Sweden	2009	1995	6.6	2.15	6.66	6.2	No	
Sweden	2011	1995	6.55	1.71	6.66	6.2	No	
Sweden	2017	1995	6.64	1.76	6.66	6.2	No	

Note. LS = Life satisfaction.

Summary results of base model (fixed effects only, without controls) Fixed effects:

	Estımate	Std. Error	d†	t value	Pr(> t)	
(Intercept)	-0.1060892	0.1003637	15.3890152	-1.057	0.3068	
years_before_after_eu	0.0045587	0.0009927	119819.9278679	4.592	0.0000043845736	***
years_after_eu	0.0076086	0.0075091	14.6582140	1.013	0.3274	
post_eu_status1	0.2214188	0.0115827	113862.9462223	19.116	< 0.00000000000000000002	***

Summary results of country alignment model (fixed effects only, without controls)

	Estimate	Std. Error	df	t value	Pr(> t)	
(Intercept)	-0.331244	0.079399	14.704850	-4.172	0.000851	***
years_before_after_eu	0.003087	0.001083	118163.145706	2.852	0.004349	**
years_after_eu	0.015926	0.004213	16.514339	3.780	0.001561	**
post_eu_status1	0.313108	0.013766	99691.683862	22.745	< 0.000000000000000000002	***
moderator1	0.706505	0.142073	14.720521	4.973	0.000176	***
years_before_after_eu:moderator1	-0.004250	0.002796	21529.380538	-1.520	0.128543	
years_after_eu:moderator1	-0.017986	0.007893	19.121948	-2.279	0.034341	*
post_eu_status1:moderator1	-0.249876	0.026311	117787.418203	-9.497	< 0.00000000000000002	***

- Non-Eastern Bloc: β = 0.247, SE = 0.011, p = 0.318
- Eastern Bloc: β = 0.321, SE = 0.014, p < 0.001

Bhutan

Lhotshampa

The Lhotshampa are a Nepali-speaking ethnic group that has historically resided in the southern regions of Bhutan. The term "Lhotshampa" literally means "southerners" in Dzongkha, the national language of Bhutan. This community is comprised of people of Nepalese origin who began migrating to Bhutan in the late 19th and early 20th centuries. They were attracted to Bhutan by the availability of arable land and the encouragement of the Bhutanese government, which sought to increase agricultural production. The Lhotshampa brought with them their own culture, language (Nepali), and Hindu religion, which distinguished them from the predominantly Buddhist Bhutanese population. Over time, they became a significant part of Bhutan's demographic makeup, particularly in the southern districts.

Driglam Namzha

Driglam Namzha is the traditional code of social etiquette in Bhutan. It encompasses a wide range of protocols and customs that dictate various aspects of daily life and behaviour for Bhutanese people, including dress, speech, and the proper way to conduct oneself in public and in the presence of others, especially elders and those in positions of authority. This code of conduct is deeply intertwined with Bhutan's efforts to preserve and promote its cultural identity and values, particularly in the face of globalization. Bhutanese are expected to wear traditional dress in public places and on formal occasions. For men, this means the "gho," a knee-length robe tied at the waist, and for women, the "kira," an ankle-length dress accompanied by a light outer jacket known as a "tego.".

Gross National Happiness

Gross National Happiness is a comprehensive well-being measure that ranges between 0 and 1. Originally having four pillars, there are now nine primary indicators, with each one having a number of sub-indicators:

- Psychological wellbeing
 - o Life satisfaction
 - o Positive affect
 - o Negative affect
 - o Spirituality
- Health
 - o Self-reported health status
 - o Number of healthy days
 - o Disability
 - o Mental health
- Time use
 - o Work
 - o Sleep
- Education
 - o Literacy
 - o Schooling
 - o Knowledge
 - o Value
- Cultural diversity and resilience
 - o Zorig chusum skills (artisan skills)
 - o Cultural participation
 - o Speak native language
 - o Dirglam namzha
- Good governance
 - o Political participation
 - o Services
 - o Governance performance
 - o Fundamental rights
- Community vitality
 - o Donation (time and money)
 - o Safety
 - o Community relationship
 - o Family
- Ecological diversity and resilience
 - o Wildlife damage
 - o Urban issues
 - o Responsibility to environment
 - o Ecological issues
- Living standards
 - o Income
 - o Assets
 - o Housing

Bhutan Timeline

- •1980: The 1980 Marriage act is introduced, making it more difficult to marry, and more inconvenient to be married to, someone who lacks Bhutanese citizenship.
- •1985: The 1985 Citizenship Act restricted who counts as a citizen, as only those who are born to two people with Bhutanese citizenship are granted citizenship at birth.
- •1988: A census is conducted in Souther Bhutan where the majority of Lhotshampa live, which removed the citizenship of many after they were unable to produce documents proving their citizenship.
- •1989: The king decrees that all Bhutanese people must adhere to a code of etiquette, called "driglam namzha", even though not all Bhutanese people traditionally follow this etiquette.

- •1989: The government removes the Nepali language from school curriculums, which is the language of the Lhotshampa.
- •1990: Some Lhotshampa begin to protest and are subsequently detained, interrogated, and tortured. Some are raped and even murdered.
- <u>•1990:</u> Bhutan forces the initial group of ethnic Nepalis to exit Bhutan by releasing some from prison under the condition of leaving the country. They offer others labelled as non-nationals in the 1988 census the ultimatum of departure or imprisonment, and compelled still others to flee to evade arbitrary arrest and detention. The majority of those that leave settle in refugee camps along the Bhutan-Nepali border.
- •2007: The UNHCR finally reaches an agreement with other countries, beginning the process of resettling refugees who had been living in refugee camps since the early 1990s.
- •2008: Gross National Happiness is enshrined in the Constitution of Bhutan.
- •2008: Bhutan's first Gross National Happiness survey is conducted in the country.
- •2008: Bhutan holds its first democratic election, featuring political parties hand-picked by the king. Jigme Thinley, who previously served in the king's administration as Prime Minister, becomes the first democratically Prime Minister, defeating the king's uncle, Sangay Ngedup.

Further reading on Bhutan, the UAE, authoritarianism, and well-being measures:

- Adler, A., & Seligman, M. E. P. (2016). Using wellbeing for public policy: Theory, measurement, and recommendations. *International Journal of Wellbeing*, 6(1), 1–35. https://doi.org/10.5502/ijwv6i1.429
- Al Maktoum, M. B. R. (2016, February 27). Why UAE ministers for happiness, tolerance, youth and the future? *Gulf News*. Retrieved from https://gulfnews.com/opinion/op-eds/mohammad-bin-rashid-why-uae-ministers-for-happiness-tolerance-youth-and-the-future-1.1680133
- Al-Azzawi, A. (2019). Dubai happiness agenda: Engineering the happiest city on earth. In W. A. Samad & E. Azar (Eds.), *Smart cities in the gulf: Current state, opportunities, and challenges* (pp. 195–221). Singapore: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Alexandrova, A., & Singh, R. (2018, November 23). Happiness and the truth: How to think about well-being. *TLS. Times Literary Supplement*, pp. 27–28. Gale Literature Resource Center. Retrieved from Gale Literature Resource Center.
- Alexandrova, A., & Singh, R. (2022). When well-being becomes a number. In C. Newfield, A. Alexandrova, & S. John (Eds.), *Limits of the numerical: The abuses and uses of quantification* (pp. 181–200). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Aljneibi, N. M. (2018). Well-being in the United Arab Emirates: How findings from positive psychology can inform government programs and research (Unpublished capstone project, University of Pennsylvania). University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA. Retrieved from https://repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1151&context=mapp_capstone
- Al-Yasin, Y., & Dashti, A. A. (2009). Foreign Countries and U.S. Public Relations Firms: The Case of Three Persian Gulf States. *Journal of Promotion Management*, 14(3-4), 355-374. https://doi.org/10.1080/10496490802637713
- Bardsley, D. (2023, March 30). UAE's National Genome Strategy praised as a major step forward for medicine. *The National*. Retrieved from https://www.thenationalnews.com/uae/2023/03/30/uaes-national-genome-strategy-praised-as-a-major-step-forward-for-medicine/
- Barnett, R. (2021, May 7). China is building entire villages in another country's territory. *Foreign Policy*. Retrieved from https://foreignpolicy.com/2021/05/07/china-bhutan-border-villages-security-forces/

https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fpos.2020.563351

- Bedock, C. (2020). Citizens' contrasting aspirations about their political system: Entrustment, participation, identification and control. *Frontiers in Political Science*, 2. Retrieved from
- Bertelli, A. M., Hassan, M., Honig, D., Rogger, D., & Williams, M. J. (2020). An agenda for the study of public administration in developing countries. *Governance*, *33*(4), 735–748. https://doi.org/10.1111/gove.12520
- Bilgrami, S., Boutenko, V., Bürkner, H.-P., Candelon, F., Cornette de Saint Cyr, P., Daniel, C., ... Zhu, H. (2023). *Cities of choice: Are people happier where they live?* Dubai, UAE: BCG Henderson Institute. Retrieved from BCG Henderson Institute website:

- https://web-assets.bcg.com/cd/dd/0bd5556140a6a4c13ccc43fef089/are-people-happy-where-they-live-feb-2023-r.pdf
- Bing, C., & Schectman, J. (2019, January 30). Inside the UAE's secret hacking team of American mercenaries: Ex-NSA operatives reveal how they helped spy on targets for the Arab monary—Dissidents, rival leaders and journalists. *Reuters*. Retrieved from https://www.reuters.com/investigates/special-report/usa-spying-raven/
- Blanchflower, D. G., Oswald, A. J., & Stewart-Brown, S. (2013). Is psychological well-being linked to the consumption of fruit and vegetables? *Social Indicators Research*, 114(3), 785–801. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11205-012-0173-y
- Boddice, R. (2019). A history of feelings. London, United Kingdom: Reaktion Books.
- Boston Consulting Group. (2019). *Towards a broader view of national performance: BCG's contribution on the Beyond GDP, Towards Well-Being topic.* Dubai, UAE: World Government Summit. Retrieved from World Government Summit website: https://www.worldgovernmentsummit.org/docs/default-source/default-document-library/bcg_v2-lq.pdf?sfvrsn=bccecgob_0
- Bothe, W. (2017). Gross National Happiness and inequality. In Johannes Dragsbæk Schmidt (Ed.), Development challenges in Bhutan: Perspectives on inequality and Gross National Happiness (pp. 49–68). Cham, Switzerland: Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-47925-5_4
- Bou Zeineddine, F., Saab, R., Lášticová, B., Kende, A., & Ayanian, A. H. (2022). "Some uninteresting data from a faraway country": Inequity and coloniality in international social psychological publications. *Journal of Social Issues*, 78(2), 320–345. https://doi.org/10.1111/josi.12481
- Cabanas, E., & Illouz, E. (2019). Manufacturing happy citizens: How the science and industry of happiness control our lives (English). Cambridge, United Kingdom: Polity Press.
- Cassani, A. (2016). Was it worth the trouble? Limited competition and citizen well-being under authoritarian rule. *Italian Political Science Review / Rivista Italiana Di Scienza Politica*, 46(1), 93–113. Cambridge Core. https://doi.org/10.1017/ipo.2015.27
- Chaulagain, R. (2023). Resettlement, racism, and resilience: Lived experiences of Bhutanese refugees in the city of Lethbridge. In C. Hodes & G. T. Bonifacio (Eds.), *Racism in Southern Alberta and anti-racist activism for change* (pp. 91–107). Athabasca, Canada: AU Press. Retrieved from https://www.aupress.ca/app/uploads/120315_Hodes_Bonifacio_2023-Racism_in_Souther
- n_Alberta_and_Anti-Racist_Activism_for_Change.pdf
 Cheng, C., & Brettle, A. (2019). How cognitive frameworks shape the American approach to international relations and security studies. *Journal of Global Security Studies*, 4(3), 321–344. https://doi.org/10.1093/jogss/ogz026
- Chettri, S. (2012a, October 12). In response to Dr David's critique of GNH Part 1 [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website: https://thebhutanese.bt/in-response-to-dr-davids-critique-of-gnh-part-1/
- Chettri, S. (2012b, October 17). In response to Dr David's critique of GNH Part 2 [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website: https://thebhutanese.bt/in-response-to-dr-davids-critique-of-gnh-part-2/
- Cingranelli, D. L., Richards, D. L., & Clay, K. C. (2021). *The CIRI Human Rights Dataset, Version 2014.04.14.* (Version V1) [Data set]. Harvard Dataverse. https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/UKCPXT
- Clark, A. E., Flèche, S., Layard, R., Powdthavee, N., & Ward, G. (2018). *The origins of happiness: The science of well-being over the life course.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Consultancy.uk. (2014, December 24). Dubai strikes business consultancy deal with BCG [News]. Retrieved 25 July 2023, from https://www.consultancy.uk/news/1243/dubai-strikes-business-consultancy-deal-with-bcg#:~:text=The%20Economic%20Council%20of%20Dubai,economic%2C%20financial%20and%20regulatory%20topics.
- Coppedge, M., Gerring, J., Knutsen, C. H., Lindberg, S. I., Teorell, J., Altman, D., ... Ziblatt, D. (2023). V-Dem [Country-Year/Country-Date] Dataset v13" Varieties of Democracy (V-Dem) Project (Version v13) [Data set]. https://doi.org/10.23696/vdemds23
- Davidson, C. M. (2021). From sheikhs to sultanism: Statecraft and authority in Saudi Arabia and the UAE. London, United Kingdom: Hurst & Company Ltd.

- Davidson, C. M. (2022). The United Arab Emirates: Evolving authoritarian tools. In Ö. E. Topak, M. Mekouar, & F. Cavatorta (Eds.), *New authoritarian practices in the Middle East and North Africa* (pp. 320–339). Edinburgh, United Kingdom: Edinburgh University Press.
- Davies, W. (2015). The happiness industry: How the government and big business sold us well-being. London, United Kingdom: Verso.
- Davis, A. E. (2023). The geopolitics of melting mountains: An international political ecology of the Himalaya. Singapore: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Deibert, R. J. (2022). Subversion Inc: The age of private espionage. *Journal of Democracy*, 33(2), 28–44. https://doi.org/10.1353/jod.2022.0016
- Deki, T. (2012, May 15). Forty-four teachers trained on Driglam Namzha [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website:

 https://thebhutanese.bt/forty-four-teachers-trained-on-driglam-namzha/
- Dema, T. (2017, May 23). 24 recommendations to preserve cultural heritage [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from Kuensel website:

 https://kuenselonline.com/24-recommendations-to-preserve-cultural-heritage/
- Drechsler, W. (2019). Kings and indicators: Options for governing without numbers. In M. J. Prutsch (Ed.), *Science, numbers and politics* (pp. 227–262). Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-11208-0_11
- Dukalskis, A. (2021). *Making the world safe for dictatorship*. Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oso/9780197520130.001.0001
- Dukalskis, A., & Gerschewski, J. (2017). What autocracies say (and what citizens hear): Proposing four mechanisms of autocratic legitimation. *Contemporary Politics*, *23*(3), 251–268. https://doi.org/10.1080/13569775.2017.1304320
- Elster, J. (2016). Sour grapes: Studies in the subversion of rationality (Cambridge Philosophy Classics). Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
- Ennis, C. A. (2018). Reading entrepreneurial power in small Gulf states: Qatar and the UAE. *International Journal*, 73(4), 573–595. https://doi.org/10.1177/0020702018809980
- European Parliament. The case of human rights defender Ahmed Mansoor in UAE: European Parliament resolution of 16 September 2021 on the case of human rights defender Ahmed Mansoor in the United Arab Emirates (2021/2873(RSP))., P9_TA(2021)0390 § (2021).
- EVS. (2022). *EVS Trend File 1981-2017* [Doi:10.4232/1.14021]. Cologne, Germany: GESIS Data Archive. doi:10.4232/1.14021 (doi:10.4232/1.14021).
- Fanti, A. (2020). Happiness imperialism. In D. Nehring, O. J. Madsen, E. Cabanas, C. Mills, & D. Kerrigan (Eds.), *The routledge international handbook of global therapeutic cultures* (pp. 55–70). Milton Park, United Kingdom: Routledge.
- Flavin, P., Pacek, A. C., & Radcliff, B. (2014). Assessing the impact of the size and scope of government on human well-being. *Social Forces*, *92*(4), 1241–1258. https://doi.org/10.1093/sf/sou010
- Frey, B. S., & Stutzer, A. (2012). The use of happiness research for public policy. *Social Choice and Welfare*, 38(4), 659–674. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00355-011-0629-z
- Frijters, P., Clark, A. E., Krekel, C., & Layard, R. (2020). A happy choice: Wellbeing as the goal of government. *Behavioural Public Policy*, 4(2), 126–165. Cambridge Core. https://doi.org/10.1017/bpp.2019.39
- Fund for Peace. (2023). *Fragile States Index 2023* (Version v2023) [Data set]. Fragile States Index. Retrieved from https://fragilestatesindex.org/excel/
- Gallup. (2023). *Gallup worldwide research methodology: Country data set details*. Washington, DC: Gallup, Inc. Retrieved from Gallup, Inc. website: https://www.gallup.com/file/services/177797/World_Poll_Dataset_Details_032023.pdf
- Gobierno Bolivariano de Venezuela. (2020). Despacho de Viceministro de la Suprema Felicidad Social del Pueblo. Retrieved 15 June 2023, from Despacho de Viceministro de la Suprema Felicidad Social del Pueblo website:

 http://www.presidencia.gob.ve/Site/Web/Principal/paginas/classVice_Suprema_Felicid
 - http://www.presidencia.gob.ve/Site/Web/Principal/paginas/classVice_Suprema_Felicidad_Social_Pueblo.php
- Graeber, D., & Wengrow, D. (2021). *The dawn of everything*. London, United Kingdom: Penguin Books
- Hassan, I. (2020). The UAE: A small state with regional middle power aspirations. In A. Saouli (Ed.), Unfulfilled aspirations: Middle power politics in the middle east (pp. 183–202). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

- Hassan, M., Mattingly, D., & Nugent, E. R. (2022). Political control. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 25(1), 155–174. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-polisci-051120-013321
- Hedges, M. (2021). *Reinventing the Sheikhdom: Clan, Power and Patronage in Mohammed bin Zayed's UAE.* London, United Kingdom: C. Hurst & Co. Ltd.
- Henrich, J., Heine, S. J., & Norenzayan, A. (2010). The weirdest people in the world? *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 33(2–3), 61–83. Cambridge Core. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X0999152X
- Hubbard, B. (2016, February 10). United Arab Emirates try to top world in joy, too. *The New York Times*, p. 6.
- Hull, G. (2008). Legitimating the state (Unpublished master's dissertation, University of London).

 University of London, London, United Kingdom. Retrieved from

 https://www.proquest.com/docview/1430189792?fromopenview=true&pq-origsite=gscholar
- Hutt, M. (2005). *Unbecoming citizens: Culture, nationhood, and the flight of refugees from Bhutan.* Oxford, United Kingdom: Oxford University Press.
- Hutt, M. (2017). Sociocultural and political change in Bhutan since the 1980s: Reflections from a distance. In Johannes Dragsbaek Schmidt (Ed.), *Development challenges in Bhutan:*Perspectives on inequality and Gross National Happiness (pp. 19–27). Cham, Switzerland: Springer International Publishing.
- Hvistendahl, M. (2021, 21). The price of happiness: U.N. power broker Jeffrey Sachs took millions from the UAE to research 'well-being'. *The Intercept*. Retrieved from https://theintercept.com/2021/12/29/jeffrey-sachs-uae-happiness/
- ISSP Research Group. (2019). International social survey programme: Social networks and social resources ISSP 2017 (Version 2.0.0) [Data set]. Cologne, Germany: GESIS. GESIS. https://doi.org/10.4232/1.13322
- Jenkins, M. (2016). Reasons to be cautious about 'well-being' in economic development (and elsewhere). *International Journal of Happiness and Development*, *3*(2), 108–124. https://doi.org/10.1504/IJHD.2016.079592
- Jones, C. W. (2017). *Bedouins into bourgeois: Remaking citizens for globalization*. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
- Jones, C. W. (2019). Adviser to the king: Experts, rationalization, and legitimacy. *World Politics*, 71(1), 1–43. Cambridge Core. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0043887118000217
- Kelley, J. G., & Simmons, B. A. (2019). Introduction: The power of global performance indicators. International Organization, 73(3), 491–510. Cambridge Core. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0020818319000146
- Layard, R. (2018, March 21). The Origins of Happiness, with Richard Layard. Retrieved 26 July 2023, from Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs website: https://www.carnegiecouncil.org/media/series/39/20180319-origins-of-happiness-richard-layard
- Layard, R. (2022). Wellbeing as the goal of policy. In T. Besley & I. Bucelli (Eds.), *Wellbeing:*Alternative policy perspectives (pp. 7–26). London, United Kingdom: LSE Press.
- Lhaden, Y. (2021, September 18). More buses with modern amenities in Thimphu Thromde from November [News]. Retrieved 9 September 2023, from Kuensel website: https://kuenselonline.com/more-buses-with-modern-amenities-in-thimphu-thromde-from-november/
- Lindholm, A. (2020). Does subjective well-being affect political participation? *Swiss Journal of Sociology*, 46(3), 467–488. https://doi.org/10.2478/sjs-2020-0023
- Luechauer, D. L. (2012, September 7). A critical view on GNH [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website: https://thebhutanese.bt/a-critical-view-on-gnh/
- Maduro, N. Decree no. 506., Pub. L. No. Gaceta oficial 40.280 Decreto N° 506, Decreto N° 506 Gaceta oficial 40.280 406.371 (2013).
- Masaki, K., & Tshering, J. (2020). Bhutan's policy of Gross National Happiness (GNH): A multidimensional experiment defying one-sided interpretations. *Journal of Asia-Pacific Studies*, 40, 61–77. https://doi.org/10.57278/wiapstokyu.40.0_61
- Masaki, K., & Tshering, J. (2021). Exploring the origins of Bhutan's Gross National Happiness. *Journal of South Asian Development*, 16(2), 273–292. https://doi.org/10.1177/09731741211039049
- Mazzetti, M., Goldman, A., Bergman, R., & Perlroth, N. (2019, March 22). New age of digital warfare, spies for any nation's budget. *The New York Times*, p. 1.

- Moosavi, L. (2020). The decolonial bandwagon and the dangers of intellectual decolonisation. International Review of Sociology, 30(2), 332–354. https://doi.org/10.1080/03906701.2020.1776919
- Munro, L. T. (2016). Where did Bhutan's Gross National Happiness come from? The origins of an invented tradition. *Asian Affairs*, 47(1), 71–92. https://doi.org/10.1080/03068374.2015.1128681
- Musikanski, L. (2018). Why a Muslim nation may save the world or the rising middle power of happiness. *The Solutions Journal*, 9(3). Retrieved from https://web.archive.org/web/20190612051932/https://www.thesolutionsjournal.com/article/muslim-nation-may-save-world-rising-middle-power-happiness/
- Nathan, A. J. (2020). The puzzle of authoritarian legitimacy. *Journal of Democracy*, 31(1), 158–168. https://doi.org/10.1353/jod.2020.0013
- OHCHR. (2019, May 7). UAE: UN experts condemn conditions of detention for jailed activist Ahmed Mansoor. Retrieved 3 July 2023, from United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner website:

 https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2019/05/uae-un-experts-condemn-condition
- O'Neil, J. (2018). How not to argue against growth: Happiness, austerity and inequality. In H. Rosa & C. Henning (Eds.), *The good life beyond growth: New perspective* (pp. 141–152). London, United Kingdom: Routledge.
- Pellegrini, L., & Tasciotti, L. (2014). Bhutan: Between happiness and horror. *Capitalism Nature Socialism*, 25(3), 103–109. https://doi.org/10.1080/10455752.2014.898673
- Phuntsho, K. (2013). The history of Bhutan. Noida, India: Random House India.

s-detention-jailed-activist-ahmed-mansoor

- Priest, D. (2021). A UAE agency put Pegasus spyware on phone of Jamal Khashoggi's wife months before his murder, new forensics show: The new analysis challenges NSO claims that the murdered journalist's wife, Hanan Elatr, 'was not a target'. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from
- https://www.washingtonpost.com/nation/interactive/2021/hanan-elatr-phone-pegasus/Rizal, D. (2015). *The royal semi-authoritarian democracy of Bhutan*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.
- Robinson, D., & Tannenberg, M. (2019). Self-censorship of regime support in authoritarian states: Evidence from list experiments in China. *Research & Politics*, *6*(3), 2053168019856449. https://doi.org/10.1177/2053168019856449
- Rød, E. G., & Weidmann, N. B. (2015). Empowering activists or autocrats? The Internet in authoritarian regimes. *Journal of Peace Research*, *52*(3), 338–351. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022343314555782
- Sachs, J. (2018, March 5). Governments play a key role in our happiness, but how do we get them to care? Retrieved 26 July 2023, from LSE Business Review Blog website: https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/businessreview/2018/03/05/governments-play-a-key-role-in-our-happiness-but-how-do-we-get-them-to-care/
- Saul, B. (2000). Cultural Nationalism, Self-Determination and Human Rights in Bhutan. *International Journal of Refugee Law*, 12(3), 321–353. https://doi.org/10.1093/ijrl/12.3.321
- Scharpf, F. (1999). *Governing in Europe: Effective and democratic?* Oxford, United Kingdom: Oxford University Press.
- Schectman, J., & Bing, C. (2022, February 17). Insight: How a Saudi woman's iPhone revealed hacking around the world. *Reuters*. Retrieved from https://www.reuters.com/technology/how-saudi-womans-iphone-revealed-hacking-aro und-world-2022-02-17/
- Schmidt, Johannes Dragsbaek, & Christensen, L. K. (2017). Policy synergies in health-promoting education in Bhutan. In Johannes Dragsbaek Schmidt (Ed.), *Development challenges in Bhutan: Perspectives on inequality and Gross National Happiness* (pp. 235–256). Cham, Switzerland: Springer International Publishing.
- Schmidt, V. A. (2013). Democracy and legitimacy in the European Union revisited: Input, output and 'throughput'. *Political Studies*, *61*(1), 2–22. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9248.2012.00962.x
- Schroeder, K. (2014). The politics of Gross National Happiness: Image and practice in the implementation of Bhutan's multidimensional development strategy (Unpublished doctoral thesis). University of Guelph, Guelph, Ontario.
- Schroeder, K. (2018). *Politics of Gross National Happiness: Governance and development in Bhutan.*Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan.

- SCIO. (2019). Seeking happiness for people: 70 years of progress on human rights in China (p. 41) [White paper]. Beijing, China: The State Council Information Office of the People's Republic of China. Retrieved from The State Council Information Office of the People's Republic of China website:
 - http://english.www.gov.cn/archive/whitepaper/201909/22/content_WS5d87752fc6dobcf8c4c13d32.html
- Scott, J. C. (1999). Seeing like a state: How certain schemes to improve the human condition have failed. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Scott, J. C. (2017). Against the grain: A deep history of the earliest states. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Scott-Jackson, W., & Mayo, A. (2018). *Transforming engagement, happiness and well-being:*Enthusing people, teams and nations. Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Seaford, C. (2018). Is wellbeing a useful concept for progressives? In I. Bache & K. Scott (Eds.), *The politics of well-being: Theory, policy, and practice* (pp. 97–120). Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Sharma, R. (2010, August 31). South Asia's rectangular triangle Nepal, Bhutan and India [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from South Asia Analysis Group website: https://web.archive.org/web/20190310051907/https://www.southasiaanalysis.org/paper 4012
- Singh, R., & Alexandrova, A. (2020). Happiness economics as technocracy. *Behavioural Public Policy*, 4(2), 236–244. Cambridge Core. https://doi.org/10.1017/bpp.2019.46
- Sokhey, S. W. (2020). What does Putin promise Russians? Russia's authoritarian social policy. *Orbis*, 64(3), 390–402. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.orbis.2020.05.003
- Strebel, M. A., Kübler, D., & Marcinkowski, F. (2019). The importance of input and output legitimacy in democratic governance: Evidence from a population-based survey experiment in four West European countries. *European Journal of Political Research*, *58*(2), 488–513. https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-6765.12293
- Stutzer, A. (2020). Happiness and public policy: A procedural perspective. *Behavioural Public Policy*, 4(2), 210–225. Cambridge Core. https://doi.org/10.1017/bpp.2019.44
- Subba, J. R. (2008). *History, culture, and customs of Sikkim*. New Delhi, India: Gyan Publishing House.
- Tannenberg, M. (2022). The autocratic bias: Self-censorship of regime support. *Democratization*, 29(4), 591–610. https://doi.org/10.1080/13510347.2021.1981867
- Tenzin, P. (2006, October 10). *Unabated religious discrimination*. Retrieved from https://www.bhutandnc.com/bhutantodaysep06.htm
- Teschl, M., & Comim, F. (2005). Adaptive preferences and capabilities: Some preliminary conceptual explorations. *Review of Social Economy*, *63*(2), 229–247. https://doi.org/10.1080/00346760500130374
- The Bhutanese. (2012a, September 12). Dr David's critique of Bhutan's GNH story Part 1 [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website: https://thebhutanese.bt/dr-davids-critique-of-bhutans-gnh-story-part-1/
- The Bhutanese. (2012b, September 14). Dr David's critique of Bhutan's GNH story 2 [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website: https://thebhutanese.bt/dr-davids-critique-of-bhutans-gnh-story-2/
- The Bhutanese. (2012c, September 19). Dr David's critique of Bhutan's GNH story Part 3 [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website: https://thebhutanese.bt/dr-davids-critique-of-bhutans-gnh-story-part-3/
- Thinley, L. J. Y. (1998). *Values and development: 'Gross National Happiness'*. Speech presented at the The Millennium Meeting for Asia and the Pacific, Seoul, South Korea. Seoul, South Korea.
- Uniacke, R. (2021). Authoritarianism in the information age: State branding, depoliticizing and 'de-civilizing' of online civil society in Saudi Arabia and the United Arab Emirates. *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, 48(5), 979–999. https://doi.org/10.1080/13530194.2020.1737916
- United Arab Emirates. (2022, November 23). The UAE soft power strategy. Retrieved from The United Arab Emirates' Government portal website:

 https://u.ae/en/about-the-uae/strategies-initiatives-and-awards/strategies-plans-and-visions/strategies-plans-and-visions-untill-2021/the-uae-soft-power-strategy

- United Arab Emirates. (2023, June 27). National Programme for Happiness and Wellbeing.

 Retrieved from The United Arab Emirates' Government portal website:

 https://u.ae/en/about-the-uae/the-uae-government/government-of-future/happiness/national-programme-for-happiness-and-wellbeing
- United Nations. (2017, March 20). Global Happiness Council launched at the United Nations. Retrieved 26 July 2023, from United Nations | UN Web TV website: https://media.un.org/en/asset/k1d/k1dpm4jl2d
- Ura, K. (2001). Perceptions of security. Journal of Bhutan Studies, 5, 113-139.
- Ura, K. (2007). Culture, liberty and happiness. *Proceedings of the Second International Seminar on Bhutan Studies*, 40–69.
- Von Soest, C., & Grauvogel, J. (2017). Identity, procedures and performance: How authoritarian regimes legitimize their rule. *Contemporary Politics*, *23*(3), 287–305. https://doi.org/10.1080/13569775.2017.1304319
- WAM. (2014, October 11). Mohammad launches public happiness index: Index to measure public's happiness and satisfaction with services on a daily basis. *Gulf News*. Retrieved from https://gulfnews.com/uae/government/mohammad-launches-public-happiness-index-1.1397039
- WAM. (2017, March 19). UAE sets up World Happiness Council. *Gulf News*. Retrieved from https://gulfnews.com/uae/government/uae-sets-up-world-happiness-council-1.1996776
- WAM. (2019, June 9). Quality of life: How the UAE seeks to lead the world (UAE Cabinet approves National Strategy for Wellbeing 2031). *Gulf News*. Retrieved from https://gulfnews.com/uae/quality-of-life-how-the-uae-seeks-to-lead-the-world-1.15600 82989765
- Ward, G. (2020). Happiness and voting: Evidence from four decades of elections in Europe. American Journal of Political Science, 64(3), 504–518. https://doi.org/10.1111/ajps.12492
- Ward, G., De Neve, J.-E., Ungar, L. H., & Eichstaedt, J. C. (2021). (Un)happiness and voting in U.S. presidential elections. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 120(2), 370–383. https://doi.org/10.1037/pspi0000249
- Welzel, C., & Inglehart, R. (2005). Liberalism, postmaterialism, and the growth of freedom. International Review of Sociology, 15(1), 81–108. https://doi.org/10.1080/03906700500038579
- Wintrobe, R. (1998). *The political economy of dictatorship*. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
- Witte, C. T., Burger, M. J., & lanchovichina, E. (2020). Subjective well-being and peaceful uprisings. *Kyklos*, 73(1), 120–158. https://doi.org/10.1111/kykl.12219
- Xi, J. (2017). Secure a decisive victory in building a moderately prosperous society in all respects and strive for the great success of socialism with Chinese characteristics for a new era. Speech transcript presented at the The 19th National Congress of the Communist Party of China, Beijing, China. Beijing, China. Retrieved from http://jo.china-embassy.gov.cn/eng/dtxw/201711/P020210618508266202906.pdf
- Xi, J. (2022). Hold high the great banner of socialism with Chinese characteristics and strive in unity to build a modern socialist country in all respects. Speech transcript presented at the The 20th National Congress of the Communist Party of China, Beijing, China. Beijing, China. Retrieved from
- https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/zxxx_662805/202210/t20221025_10791908.html Yangdon, S. (2017, March 6). Final Recommendations adopted by NC on three agencies [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website:
 - https://thebhutanese.bt/final-recommendations-adopted-by-nc-on-three-agencies/
- Yezer, Y. (2016). *Education policy reforms in Bhutan* (Doctoral dissertation, Aalborg University). Aalborg University, Aalborg, Denmark. Retrieved from https://vbn.aau.dk/en/publications/education-policy-reforms-in-bhutan
- Zangpo, T. (2015, April 11). Privy Council encourages surrender of post based Kabney and Patang before rules come in [News]. Retrieved 10 September 2023, from The Bhutanese website: https://thebhutanese.bt/privy-council-encourages-surrender-of-post-based-kabney-and-patang-before-rules-come-in/