Visual Indicators COGA Comments

Background Links

- **Document**: https://docs.google.com/document/d/1WhZAbswvPHs7A3stfqM_ATsaBHPeGbHtARcmaKMck1U/edit#heading=h.h396o26fcc3u

- **Survey Results:** https://www.w3.org/2002/09/wbs/35422/Visual_indicators/results

Issues

Research Links:

There is a summary in our gap analysis at
https://www.w3.org/TR/coga-gap-analysis/#flat-design

Comments from UX experts

- **"Flat design makes it harder to differentiate things." ~Don't Make Me Think Revisited by @SKrug p153**
- **"Another needless source of question marks over people's heads is links and buttons that aren't obviously clickable. As a user, I should never have to devote a millisecond of thought [cognitive load] to whether things are clickable - or not" Don't Make Me Think Revisited by @SKrug p15**
- **"Flat design hides calls to action" - Neilsen Norman Group**

References

- **Material Design with Polymer**
- **Google Material design**
- **Windows 8 Design Handbook**
- **Designing for iOS**
- **Don't make me think revisited**, **Krug**
- **iOS7 User-Experience Appraisal** **"Flat design hides calls to action" - Neilsen Norman Group**

- **[Design choice is more than just about taste its an accessibility-issue](#)** - Neil Milliken
- **[Why hollow icons are more work for your users and ultimately create cognitive fatigue](#)** - Aubrey Johnson
- **[Smartphone UX shootout includes info on cognitive Load & UX Friction](#)** - Pfeiffer Report
- **[Flat Design: Its Origins, Its Problems, and Why Flat 2.0 Is Better for Users](#)** - Neilsen Norman group
- **[Long-Term Exposure to Flat Design: How the Trend Slowly Decreases User Efficiency](#)** - Neilsen Norman Group

Definition of critical:

We could use the value at https://www.w3.org/TR/personalization-semantics-content-1.0/

For anything with a narrow scope (e.g. only buttons to proceed in a process) it needs to be at least somewhat effective from a user point of view.

Agreed. A narrow scope is incredibly useful. It is not everything, but having a scope of links and/or buttons would solve the worst offenders - Making many more sites useable.
Clearly more is better, but we should not let the perfect be the enemy of the good
(Also it will make designers aware of the issue)

Suggestions

Option 1 and 2
Limit scope to critical control for a multi step process /
Or buttons and links that **are necessary** to complete a   multi step process
  1. Add option of it critical controls for a multi step process programmatically determined as critical
  2. also option 2 seems good : COGA suggestion from April 9th

Interactive elements do not rely solely on spacing or a single visually identifiable characteristic to differentiate them from static elements, except for the following:

- An underline is sufficient to indicate a link is interactive
- A color difference is sufficient to indicate an element is disabled

- The control is part of a group of controls that has a visual indicator for the group

3. OPTION 3 Merge option 1 and 2

Interactive elements **needed to progress or complete a process** do not rely solely on spacing or a single visually identifiable characteristic to differentiate them from static elements, except for the following:

- A border with sufficient contrast
- An underline is sufficient to indicate a link is interactive
- A color difference is sufficient to indicate an element is disabled
- The control is part of a group of controls that has a visual indicator for the group

===============

David's edit of option 3 to remove the confusing "spacing or…" and make spacing part of the list of characteristics:

4. OPTION 4

Interactive elements needed to progress or complete a process rely on at least 3 of the following to differentiate them from static elements:

- Color
- Spacing
- Text effect - outline/underline, bold, italic
- Font size
- Font style
- Fill color
- border/outline (including shadow, glow)
- Icon associated with text

except for the following:

- An underline is sufficient to indicate a link is interactive
- A color difference is sufficient to indicate an element is disabled
- The control i5s part of a group of controls that has a visual indicator for the group
- The control can be programmatically determined as critical

================

Example Sites with Discussion of How the SC would Apply

DAVID ADDS

> a single visually identifiable characteristic

Here is a proposed list types of characteristics so controls to progress would need 2 of these to be different from static text on the page:

- Color
- Text effect - outline/underline, bold, italic
- Font size
- Font style
- Fill color
- Shadow, glow, border
- Icon associated with text
- (anything else?)

Examples:

Google

1: search results are shown in a large font with spacing above and below - pass
2: links to related search terms - fail as rely only on colour