

Findings Data Challenge Feedback Form

Date:	Title:
Reviewer First Name:	Author(s):

Directions:

1. Read the full Data Challenge.
2. Read it again, focusing on the Question section.
3. Look at criteria for Level 1.
4. Look for evidence of Level 1 in the Nature Note you are reviewing.
 - If you find it: mark that level 1 had been reached
 - If you do NOT find the information needed to meet Level 1, circle what is missing and jump straight to step 6. Do NOT continue to the next level.
5. Repeat step 4 for Levels 2, 3, and 4 until you cannot find evidence of a level, or level 4 is reached.
6. Repeat this process for the other sections: Data Visualization and Claim.
7. Determine whether the submission is ready for publication. If the submission scores a level 3 or higher in all categories, you can accept it for publication! If there are some scores of 1 or 2, you should encourage revisions. Mark your decision at the end of this form.

The Question: What is being investigated

The data scientist...

	<i>and...</i>	<i>and...</i>	<i>and...</i>
poses at least one question that they are investigating with the data.	includes information, that is <u>cited accurately</u> , about where this data comes from and how the data was produced	uses background information to explain how the data are relevant for answering the question(s) they are posing	describes gaps in the data and/or suggests next steps to continue investigating the question(s) and why investigating this question matters
Level 1	Level 2	Level 3	Level 4

Strengths	Opportunities for improvement
<i>You do a great job explaining how the data will help answer the question...</i>	<i>You could add information about the data like...</i>

➤ Highest level achieved (circle): 1 2 3 4

Data Visualization: Looking at the data

The data scientist...

includes at least one table, graph, or other visualization	<i>and...</i> includes a title and properly labeled axes, colors, or shapes in the visualizations	<i>and...</i> represents relevant attributes of the data that relate to and help investigate the question(s) posed	<i>and...</i> annotates the visualizations to show patterns, trends, or interesting aspects of the data
Level 1	Level 2	Level 3	Level 4

Strengths	Opportunities for improvement
<i>You do a great job with your visualization by...</i>	<i>Something you could add to your visualization is...</i>

➤ Highest level achieved (circle): 1 2 3 4

The Interpretation of the Data: What the data says

The data scientist...

makes a claim or observation about the data	<i>and...</i> explains how the data leads to the claim or observation, referring to specific data points, clusters of data, patterns, or trends	<i>and...</i> connects the claim or observation to the original question, and to describe how existing knowledge might add to or conflict with what is known. Relevant background information is cited	<i>and...</i> explains potential weaknesses and or limitations in the interpretation(s) based on the data and proposes next steps
Level 1	Level 2	Level 3	Level 4

Strengths	Opportunities for improvement
<i>You do a great job interpreting the data by...</i>	<i>Something you could add to your interpretation is...</i>

➤ Highest level achieved (circle): 1 2 3 4

➤ ➤ ➤ Recommendation: Does this Data Challenge achieve a Level 3 in every category? (Choose one)

NO - some level 1 or 2 = Encourage revisions

YES - all level 3 or higher = Accept with minor (or no) revisions