

Preface:

This review is a bit experimental, a sort of communal effort by the lads and lasses of the TIS squad. As such it might feel a bit disjointed, but your fic was just too large for a single anyone to review properly by themselves. Hopefully you can still get something out of it, after all, that is the point of this whole thing. I can assure you that we only put the effort in because of a genuine desire to be altruistic.

Individual Opinions:

Blorcyn - I have only read the first three chapters and the last three chapters of the story, so I've missed a huge chunk. However, I think it's reasonable to say that the last chapters are much improved compared to the earliest.

Truthfully, I think the early chapters are so much worse than the end that I think you must lose a ton of readers who won't progress past a weak opening. Openings and endings are the most important part of any story.

In the last chapters, there are still some typos and spelling mistakes. The quality of the writing is improved, but you do still have a tendency to sentences that don't *do* anything. Though much more rarely. Remember to try and make sure that your sentence isn't just mental filler. It's fine to help you figure out what's happening, but if you can explain more by saying less, then do so. Make sure you take those fluffy sentences that 'tell' people's feelings out at the end. People will infer it still, because you wrote it first. And, when people infer things it leaves a stronger impression

Scene construction is much improved. In the first chapter, very little of worth would happen in any sentence. The most recent two chapters both have well turning scenes in them that aren't overly long, and do have good tension and good main character reactions. However, there's still some slight 'not-quite-rightness'. Particularly in 37, with the reactions to Grindelwald's working with Harry: you are good at Harry and Grindelwald and Doge, the main players in the scene, that provide most of the tension, but the bit characters feel a bit two dimensional. Look at Molly, how you make her speak and act. There's not that sense of verisimilitude, of real *people*, that made the HP books and its best fanfics stand out.

Microwave —

I read this in the middle of the night quite a while ago, but I found it to be quite a bit to drudge. My thoughts after rereading:

- The beginning is a *lot* to drudge through. Harry seems to be stuck as some sort of weird redpill fantasy which isn't really helped by the quality of the writing.
- You could cut a bit down on the detail. The fic could probably be cut down by a lot if you just left in the things with descriptive or thematic value.

- The emotion seems a bit ... overplayed? I don't have better words for it. Think Tommy Wiseau but in writing.
- It does get a lot better as the story progresses, but a few things:
 - A more clear direction would be nice. Parts of the story don't feel like they build to others

Niez —

Truth be told I only read the first two chapters and didn't have the will/time to push through the rest. Your opening is very rough, and if I hadn't gone in with the mindset of reviewing enough of the story to make some useful commentary I would have dropped it after a few paragraphs. I realise it is not helpful at all to constantly have people tell you that your first chapters are rough and not tell you why, but luckily for you I have detailed a play by play of typos, poor grammar and weird stylistic sentences that occurred in your first chapter, as well as things that simply didn't work for me. It's waiting for you after the individual opinions. I'm not presumptuous enough to tell you to rewrite the first chapters, or really any other part of the story, but to put it simply, a bad opening will turn away most readership. You have a fairly large number of reviews on ffnet (impressive these days) so I'm assuming there is a lot to enjoy once you get past the initial chapters, but I wasn't willing to do so, and I doubt I was the only one.

Anyhow, and just in case you don't want to wade through a metric ton of comments made by some asshole on the internet, I will summarise my main problems with your story (or at least the first two chapters).

Chapter one focuses far too much on pointless minutiae (Harry watching t.v, that whole three paragraphs remarking about Hedwig's disturbing human-like behaviour, etc.), it exposit like a mofo and is generally 'telly' and lacks a hook. You hit the same story beats as canon (intro - trip - Slughorn), but do it worse. Perfectly understandable, as unlike JK you are not a professional author, but if you are going to do it worse, why do it at all? I would go further; what does Chapter one add to the story you want to tell? How is what happens different enough that you must show it to us? Only you can answer these questions, mine is just one opinion, but I don't feel this Chapter justifies its existence personally. With what is revealed, you might as well start in the Hogwarts train.

Some other **general comments**. Some of these may not be valid any longer, but they are certainly valid in your writing at the beginning.

a) Avoid author comments, even if implicit, they are very jarring. Your whole bit about magic needing to mature sounds like a dig at other powerup! Or indy! Fics.

b) Your Harry is overly emotional, and you seem to have a penchant for cheap drama (it's been 16 years since Lily died - Slughorn should not be getting emotional even if she was his favourite student). I don't really need to explain how this may detract from the story.

c) Check dialogue formatting or at the very least get someone to look over these initial chapters. There are far too many mistakes that should have been easily caught by a quick readthrough, or if you don't/didn't know how to format dialogue, a quick google. Even if it wasn't the case, it just gives the impression of lack of effort. I know it's fanfiction, I know we are all amateurs and truth be told despite my comments I'm pretty sure I couldn't do it better than you. But shit like this is low-hanging fruit, it's like basic spelling. You must have those things at the very least for us to be willing to read it, and in the first few chapters, you didn't. If you aren't planning to rewrite or go through them yourselves, at least get someone to do it for you. I'm sure you can find someone on the site that would be willing to. Sorry if this is too negative, but as I said your first two chapters were very rough, and they were all I read.

Majube—

Rough start. I don't really understand how and why the whole magical theory plays into it, its exposition, it's boring (this whole thing: 'There was a reason why children were unable to start their official magical education until the age of 11, and there was a reason they took their OWLs in 5th year and their NEWTs in 7th. Magic was free flowing and a power that no witch or wizard would truly ever understand. One needed to take time to develop their magic, expand their knowledge, hone their control and skill.') Anyways, the first few chapters would be way better if they were more minimalist, I think you've fallen into the trap of using a bunch of words when quite few would do.

6Foxtrot9 —

Just read the first chapter. Chapter 1 seems to drag on a bit, you seem to have trouble focusing on what matters to the story and get lost in the details. Maybe it is partially a byproduct of it being fanfiction which makes retreading ground cumbersome, but I will try to push through in the future since I know you said the initial chapters are a bit rough.

Proofread and Errors:

Chapter 1 (a bit lengthy so I put it in the spoiler below):

[Spoiler=Readthrough]

By necessity this type of readthrough focuses on typos and perceived style errors - so it will always come across as overwhelmingly negative. I do try to offer solutions/suggestions but still. A fair warning. Also I'm an absolute asshole, but if you're wise you'll take something out of my asshole-y (and by mine I mean Niez's. Don't take it out on the Blorc-man, even if he does deserve it sometimes).

[Quote]

For many...

[/Quote]

If I understand correctly you want to do this: 'for many [things were fine], for Harry, [things were not]'. However you don't do this clearly enough; Harry appears in an entirely different paragraph, meaning that by the time we reach him we have forgotten that 'for many' thread. As it stands, it goes nowhere and looks out of place.

[Quote]

his summer hadn't been uncharacteristically hot unlike the last, but it still was much warmer than usual.

[/Quote]

I don't understand this sentence; so it was warm but not as warm as last year but still very warm? Ok (?).

[Quote]

took advantage of one of the last truly warm days

[/Quote]

AYAYAY. So it was warm, but not as warm as last year, but still warm, but now getting colder? My god what a temperature rollercoaster. I would advise removing all mentions of weather save a short sentence (maybe). As in conversation, incessant mentions of how hot or cold it is outside is a mark of mental vacuity.

[Quote]

summer was drawing to close

[/Quote]

Summer was drawing to a close.

[Quote]

younger children in the neighborhood chased each other, playing some type of childish game they must have learnt in the playground at school.

[/Quote]

Yeah no shit they learned it in a playground, where else. Also children playing childish games? Couldn't you think of a single children's game? Seriously, this image is so vague it's almost worthless.

[Quote]

raven haired

[/Quote]

Raven haired is a description you use when you have used dark haired too many times. But a) you should never use dark haired too many times b) your story hasn't even used it once. Do not do it.

[Quote]

Smiles were a rare thing for the young man whenever he spent time in this immaculately kept house, for there were few happy memories for him within these walls. As a result of recent events, any sort of smile was exceedingly rare for him.

[/Quote]

Smiles were a rare thing - and then again, smiles were a rare thing. Ok we get it fam, no need to say it twice (and no, the exceedingly doesn't warrant it).

[Quote]

After being played like a fiddle, and indirectly causing the death of his beloved godfather, Harry Potter had been made to look like a fool.

[/Quote]

Hol up. So Harry doesn't smile because 1) he's been played like a fiddle, 2) Sirius is dead because of his actions 3) he's been made to look what a fool. One of these things is not like the other. (Indeed, the emotional impact from Sirius dying seems to render the other two things utterly inconsequential, and even if that weren't the case being played like a fiddle and being made to look a fool are basically the same thing. Also when you put 'made to look like a fool' last you seem to emphasize it over the other two when, again, Sirius death is the most important thing by far.)

[Quote]

Children always brought a smile to his face. Maybe it was hearing the joy of childhood and the love of their parents, which was something that he was never able to experience. Perhaps it was their innocence from the darkness in the world, something that he himself was exposed to at such a young age.

[/Quote]

Excuse me while I go puke (seriously though, what is going on here and what type of story do you mean to write).

[Quote]

But, there was another a reason for his smile as well.

[/Quote]

How many times are you going to remark on his smile. This is becoming farcical.

[Quote]

His headmaster, the one who's office he had destroyed weeks earlier, was coming to take him away from his temporary residence.

[/Quote]

I wasn't aware Harry had more than one headmaster. Also I believe Privet Drive is his permanent residence, at least until he comes of age. Also *whose*, instead of 'who's'

[Quote]

powerful protections available and considering it was only meant as a temporary protection

[/Quote]

Two protections in one sentence is one protection too many.

[Quote]

Sirius, the name still pained Harry, was never meant to be thrown into Azkaban and the Longbottom's were never supposed to be tortured into insanity, and custody over Harry was meant to be passed over to either of them after the Ministry gained a semblance of control following the initial fall of Voldemort

[/Quote]

Run-on sentence. Substitute the second 'and' with a period.

[Quote]

Obviously, it did not go according to plan

[/Quote]

Obviously, things did not go according to plan. (There is not a single object/situation 'it' can be a reference to)

[Quote]

It's not like he could have started training immediately after he first picked up his wand and turned into some super-powered wizard weapon by the time he took his OWLs. Harry scoffed internally at the thought.

[/Quote]

This seems a completely out-of-story dig at those powerup! fics. It's jarring, and takes you out of the story, and only I can criticise other people's stories. Watch me.

[Quote]

Sure there were certain wizards, like himself, who were born with an extraordinary amount of magical power. Driving away hundreds of dementors away with one spell and summoning a broomstick from miles away could attest to that, but truly harnessing this power was a journey in itself.

[/Quote]

Can I get an 'Amen'. Also if Harry is to become powerful how about you show it later, instead of outright telling us at the beginning. In truth all this is junk exposition (including the reasons why Dumbles kept him at the Dursleys). I think there are more elegant ways to do this, and even if they weren't, they aren't important enough to show anyways.

[Quote]

Harry sighed as turned to look at a small nightstand

[/Quote]

Harry sighed as *he* turned to look at *the* small nightstand.

[Quote]

Vernon's face always turns an unhealthy shade of purple, Petunia's hands start shaking as if she's expecting the ghost of Lily Evans-Potter to pop out of nowhere, and Dudley slowly backs himself into a corner while covering the spot where he had Hagrid's tail removed.

[/Quote]

What a weird tense shift. Compare to 'Vernon's face would turn an unhealthy shade of purple [...]' or "Vernon face always turned into an unhealthy shade of purple [...]'.

[Quote]

Deciding to treat himself [...] Taking a seat on the small cot...

[/Quote]

Why tell us in excruciating detail what Harry does whilst he waits for Dumbledore? Why is this relevant? He basically watches the telly and packs his shit, so its not exactly riveting either.

[Quote]

Sirius...

[/Quote]

Again, why are we getting a full paragraph of exposition about Sirius? He a dead boi, how he was don't matter no more. What matters is how Harry feels/is impacted by his death, and again, better to show us rather to just dump it on us via exposition.

[Quote]

Harry wiped a few of the stray tears

[/Quote]

Not to be callous but its has been more than a month, some random thoughts about Sirius shouldn't really bringing tears at this point.

[Quote]

All he got in response was a cuff over the head by her wing

[/Quote]

Personal opinion, but I hate this mother hen, human intelligence! Hedwig bullshit. Hedwig might be smart for an owl (or even a magical familiar or some other malarkey) but it's still a fucking animal.

[Quote]

"there isn't a smarter owl out there. Actually... sometimes I think you might even be smarter than Ron."

He got another bark in response, but this one sounded as if she was insulted for being compared to his red headed friend.

[/Quote]

And again. Hedwig might have an uncanny ability to understand what Harry means, but Hedwig is not a human being; it cannot understand human language. Read Wittgenstein if you don't believe me. You peasant.

[Quote]

"Yeah well maybe we'll set up a chess game between the two of you when I finally get to the Burrow."

Harry instantly regretted coming up with the idea as he spotted the predatory gleam of excitement that came over Hedwig's amber eyes.

[/Quote]

Oh no she can play chess too? I'll stop with this Hedwig complaining but seriously. This whole thing is not funny or endearing. Hedwig is a fucking owl, treat it as such. (Also have you ever seen an owl, they alway have that predatory gleam, probably because they are predators to begin with)

[Quote]

Both Minerva and Severus think it is a little to...,

[/Quote]

Ellipsis or comma, choose your fighter.

[Quote]

A sad look flashed across his usually twinkling blue eyes after he spoke, but it disappeared before Harry could notice.

[/Quote]

Up until now you have been narrating from Harry's POV, so how does this sentence make any sense.

[Quote]

"But alas...

[/Quote]

One or the other; or neither.

[Quote]

I'm sure the Weasley's would appreciate it if I did not arrive at too late of an hour."

[/Quote]

'I'? Is Dumbledore planning to ditch Harry and go to the Weasleys by himself? Also possessive should not be used there (Weasleys, not 'Weasley's'). Also why not make the sentence a bit simpler while you're at it; *I'm sure the Weasleys would appreciate it we did not arrive too late*. Brevity is a virtue.

[Quote]

this evenings activities

[/Quote]

The, instead of 'this'? Regardless, now is when you use the possessive (*evening's*)

[Quote]

"Grab hold Harry, we are on a tight schedule." The moment Harry grabbed hold

[/Quote]

Grab hold and then grab hold. I would substitute the first for *take my arm Harry*.

[Quote]

In the split second it took the two of them to travel, Harry felt as if he had been pulled through a garden hose while simultaneously having an elephant trod on his stomach. It was one of the most uncomfortable experiences of his life,

[/Quote]

I think having an elephant step on your stomach would be more than uncomfortable.

[Quote]

Harry jogged to catch up with Dumbledore's long strides as the man moved rather quick for somebody who had lived for over a century.

[/Quote]

You have this tendency to overemphasize (over explain?) things. We know that Dumbledore is old, and that if Harry needs to jog to catch up to him that he is quick. We do not need for you to 'tell' us that this is surprising. Unimportant when it happens once, but I notice it again and again.

[Quote]

"Why are we here, sir?" Harry questioned, as his mind was running through different reasons why Dumbledore would bring him to a small village in the middle of the night.

[/Quote]

Brevity is indeed a virtue. If Harry doesn't know why they're there it's only natural to wonder - but it is entirely unimportant.

(Hence;) *Why are we here, sir?*

[Quote]

he responded with his trademark twinkle in his eyes.

[/Quote]

Not your fault, by I can't help but think of IP when I see the word 'trademark' and Dumbledore making mad money out of glittering contact lenses.

[Quote]

"If we're here to hire a new professor then why are we in such a rush?" Harry asked still not understanding what was going on and why there were doing this so late in the evening.

[/Quote]

Again, redundant. If Harry and asking then Harry doesn't know. Why 'say' this twice? (If I wrote this - "*Why are we here?*" *he said, not knowing why they were there* - you'd think I was touched in the head, but what you write is not too far from this.)

[Quote]

sharing it with you after such an emotional and tragic night was unforgiveable of me. I sincerely hope that you could ease an old man's heart and forgive me

[/Quote]

So, in essence; *it was unforgivable of me. I hope you can forgive me.* Either Dumbledore is an idiot or Harry is, or perhaps it's you who is the idiot (or even me). But at least one of us is one, that's for sure.

[Quote]

it would certainly give my office a new look; and sometimes a new look is all that it takes to solve our problems in life.

[/Quote]

I don't think this is something Dumbledore would say - mostly because it's retarded. Stop trying so hard. Just write him as a wise authority figure and let us fill the blanks. You readers are your greatest tools when it comes to a lot of things, never more so than for characterisation (and now it's me who's spouting bullshit wisdom - alas).

[Quote]

"There is no need to worry about your safety Harry, they would not risk approaching us [...] If I could be so humble," Dumbledore elaborated, "it would be because I am here..."

[/Quote]

This is the opposite of humble, and also over verbose. Compare with Canon:

I do not think you need worry about being attacked tonight."

"Why not, sir?"

"You are with me," said Dumbledore simply.

[Quote]

I believe this rouse

[/Quote]

rouse

[Quote]

For me, I know you too well Horace

[/Quote]

Too well.

[Quote]

... it's safe

[/Quote]

it's

[Quote]

and I have never felt urge to play dress up,

[/Quote]

the urge

[Quote]

potion's master

[/Quote]

potions master

[Quote]

he gave Harry an indistinguishable look

[/Quote]

Huh?

[Quote]

"Yes..." he started to himself

[/Quote]

Huh? (x2)

[Quote]

he continued as he looked at Harry with what appeared to be tenderness.

[/Quote]

I don't think tenderness is the right word. Pity? Nostalgia?

[Quote]

Just take a look here my boy.

[/Quote]

Slughorn uses three 'my boys' in little over a paragraph. I think you might be overdoing it my boy.

[Quote]

Slughorn continued as he pointed to boy

[/Quote]

to a boy

[Quote]

Tears stung Harry's eyes as he fought to keep them back.

[/Quote]

I don't think I like this pansy-ass Harry you have going here, crying twice in the space of a single chapter. Harry is quite the hard chap and I don't think he cries once in the whole series. Besides, if you want to show how a character feels, tears are a cop-out.

[Quote]

Tears streamed down the older man's eyes as he stared at the picture of his former student

[/Quote]

I may have misjudged you. It's not that Harry has tear incontinence, it's that you like writing over dramatic scenes.

[Quote]

I don't think my mother would want you to be burdened by your past and by her memory

[/Quote]

be burdened(?)

[Quote]

it had some interesting knitting patterns that I would like to try?

[/Quote]

No question mark necessary.

[Quote]

he answered absentmindedly, clearly not paying attention to what was going on around him.

[/Quote]

Translation: *He answered without paying attention, clearly not paying attention.* It's like you want me to be mad at you.

[Quote]

"Yes, yes, damn you. But before I return, I have some conditions that need to be met. I want my old classroom back, my usual prize for the first 6th year class, and Professor Ogden's old quarters... the big one not the smaller one," he demanded.

[/Quote]

Translation: *"I demand this of you," he demanded.*

[Quote]

It would give them at least 5 minutes to talk in private before reaching the house.

[/Quote]

Five. Also, what an utterly pointless detail.

[Quote]

Before we get onto the matter

[/Quote]

Into? Unless Dumbledore means to hump said matter.

[Quote]

I first wanted to ask you how you are feeling about the prophecy," Dumbledore asked. Before Harry could respond, Dumbledore cut in again, "an honest response, Harry.

[/Quote]

Several things wrongs with this. A) If Harry hasn't said anything then Dumbledore can't really 'cut in'. B) Even if he had cut in, this is the first time he does, meaning that he cannot cut in 'again'. Convention says interruptions should be portrayed no with commas but with dashes (-). Then again, given that Harry was never interrupted in the first place I suppose this last criticism is not actually relevant.

[Quote]

beside him, "There

[/Quote]

Use period instead of comma.

[Quote]

it made all the difference, "Thank you, sir

[/Quote]

and again. There's actually various instances of this, but I really can't be bothered to list them all (sorry)

[Quote]

You have always had an abundance of power, but now you will find that casting comes more naturally. You will forge a more intimate bond with your own magic, silent casting will come easier, and you will gain a stronger sense of control.

[/Quote]

So Harry receives a free power-up from nowhere? Sweet. Say, weren't you the guy taking potshots at those powerwank fics earlier? Also, stop expositing for Merlin's sake. It's your first fucking chapter.

[Quote]

it would not surprise me if they found themselves occupied with more personal matters this year.

[/Quote]

This is revolting. Dumbledore should not know or even care about Ron and Hermione's budding relationship. What a creepy creepy comment.

[Quote]

I still think you are much too skinny

[/Quote]

much *too* skinny.

[Quote]

before you head back off to Hogwarts

[/Quote]

back to Hogwarts.

[Quote]

have a seat and I'll give a bowl of the soup

[/Quote]

give you a bowl of soup

[Quote]

"Hi Tonks!" he greeted back enthusiastically. After greeting her,

[/Quote]

You can't 'greet back' if five minutes have passed since someone greets you. Also avoid repetition; "*Hey Tonks,*" *Harry said. After greeting her, (...)*

[Quote]

It seemed almost as if she was clinging to Harry for dear life

[/Quote]

She either clings to him or she doesn't. There is nothing seeming about that.

[Quote]

and ran her hand through the back of his messy hair

[/Quote]

Pretty intimate for people that have talked to each other about three times, and never alone. Indeed, this whole thing is out of character and out of my comfort zone.

[Quote]

Harry choked with emotion

[/Quote]

This over-emotional/over dramatic Harry shit has got to go. He's simply not like that in Canon - and it's taking me out of the story. (besides cheap drama = shit, change my mind)

[Quote]

he replied between spoonful's

[/Quote]

spoonfuls

[Quote]

he passed the twin's and Percy's open rooms, and then he passed Bill and Charlies

[/Quote]

Inconsistent, inelegant and probably grammatically incorrect. Find a better way to phrase this, or at least use the possessive correctly.

[Quote]

Not being one who usually enjoyed physical contact, Harry threw caution to the wind and engulfed his favorite auror in a hug.

[/Quote]

Yeah no. You said it yourself brother - Harry doesn't hug. He gets hugged by Hermione, bears it in good grace, and that's about it.

[/Spoiler]

Chapter 36:

[quote]Harry felt like he was back in school sitting quietly through another detention he'd earned from missing an assignment or being caught by Filch after hours.[/quote] - This isn't a strong opening sentence. It's quite unwieldy with a simile and then a call back and it's just a little awkward.

[quote] an unsettling calm Kingsley Shacklebolt[/quote] - Unsettlingly

[quote] Harry was concerned for the elves wellbeing [/quote] Concerned.

[quote] It sunk into your skin and crawled through your veins like venom[/quote] although this starts on quite a firm It, which might be done nicer, it's a nice image and I enjoyed it.

[quote] This time Harry did take the paper and light it aflame with the tip of his wand. [/quote] Lit not light.

[quote] You have never left,Mein Schatz. [/quote] Missing a space here, after the comma.

Chapter 37:

[quote] That retched Skeeter woman [/quote] wretched. A wretch is a detestable/pitiable figure. To retch is to vomit.

[quote] Harry lay the Elder Wand against the table [/quote] I think this may be better as on rather than against. Against makes you think of an umbrella leaning on something, like an oversized novelty Elder Wand.

[quote] he could cut right through you without trying," Moody barked to the rest of them. [/quote] This would be stronger without the 'to the rest of them' as it's quite clear he's not talking to Harry. You might as well, you don't need that bit.

[quote] Harry smirked at Doge who was staring at him with deep loathing. [/quote] Generally, I think it's stronger to let the reader project their read of the room onto dialogue where at moments

of high tension, they've been following and can do it well. Look at Harry's dialogue without this line present, doesn't it look stronger?