Research: Feedback on Scoring Criteria Samples

Note about samples: Excerpts of sample scoring criteria come from the following sources: "VT" - Vermont Transferable Skills; "NH" - New Haven, CT; "GSP" - Great Schools Partnership; "HC" - Henry County, GA

Feedback Questions:

1. How well does the sample criteria **align** with the Performance Indicator?
2. Does the **level of thinking** expressed in the "meets" match that of the Performance Indicator?
3. Based on your "What Can I Do / What Do I Need to Know" chart, which samples **include essential elements** of the Performance Indicator? What elements of the Performance Indicator are **missing**?
4. Is the language **clear**? Is the language **friendly** to students, teachers and the community?

Performance Indicators (Click or scroll down to see sample Scoring Criteria.)

1. Analyze the relevance, bias, and usefulness of information.
2. Use and adapt appropriate research tools, including but not limited to technology and digital media, to access information.
3. Organize information from multiple sources.
4. Compare and synthesize information from multiple sources and/or disciplines to draw conclusions or make claims.
5. Develop questions that can guide further learning.
6. Select and use strong evidence and reasoning to justify claims or conclusions.

Add your name here after giving feedback, so we know you've had a chance to weigh in:

#1 Analyze the relevance, bias, and usefulness of information.

Does Not Meet	Partially Meets	Meets *This column should match the cognitive demand of the Performance Indicator.*	Exceeds
Student can.. NH: **-use** predetermined questions to **identify** perspective in sources. GSP: **-identify** information from multiple sources to **address** questions or challenges.	Student can… NH: **-Identify** main ideas in multiple sources, **-identify** prominent perspectives and assumptions in sources. **-Categorize** sources based on analysis and determine which are useful.	Student can.. NH: -**Compare and contrast** multiple sources to **identify** similarities and differences -**identify and assess** the influence of perspectives and assumptions in multiple sources on interpretation of events **-apply** analysis of sources to **determine** usefulness and validity. GSP: **-evaluate** the bias and accuracy of multiple and varied sources such as primary sources, articles, observations, interviews, images, or visual data displays;	Student can.. NH: **-synthesize** multiple sources to identify significant similarities and differences. **-analyze** the intentional or unintentional influence of perspectives and assumptions in sources **-apply** analysis of sources to identify most useful and valid information. GSP: **-identify** areas where your analysis would benefit from additional information; -**seek out** additional academic sources and/or hard-to-find primary sources; **-analyze** the interrelationships among or between concepts in a clear and concise way to **frame** original questions or draw thoughtful conclusions
"Does Not Meet" Feedback or Suggestions:	**"Partially Meets" Feedback or Suggestions:**	**"Meets" Feedback or Suggestions:**	**"Exceeds" Feedback or Suggestions:** I'm confused about the way the term synthesize is used here. You are not creating/producing but rather analyzing or reviewing right? - synthesis in this context is to look at multiple sources and pull out the common themes- doesn't have to be written or a new product, but can be evident in a written portion of a product- it is a term to indicate a deeper iteration of compare/contrast to find similarities.

General WARM feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #1:

The progression across the continuum seems like a nice flow

General COOL feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #1:

#2 Use and adapt appropriate research tools, including but not limited to technology and digital media, to access information.

Does Not Meet	Partially Meets	Meets *This column should match the cognitive demand of the Performance Indicator.*	Exceeds
Student can… NH: **-use** predetermined questions to identify key information/main idea, VT: **identify** digital or physical tools that could be used to… GSP: **-identify** information from multiple sources to address questions or challenges.	Student can… GSP: -**take notes** from my sources, prioritizing relevant information; **-summarize** information from multiple and varied sources. VT: **identify** a range of appropriate tools to…	Student can… NH: **select** relevant evidence from multiple and varied sources. VT: **-evaluate** multiple tools to...; -use the selected tool to ...; -**articulate and/or explain** why the tool was or was not the best choice.	Student can… NH: **synthesize** and **select** most relevant and reliable evidence from multiple and varied sources. VT: **be** creative and innovative in my selection and use of tool VT: **seek out and learn** about new tools that are very well-suited to the problem, or adapt a tool to fit my needs. VT: **Use** technology, including digital technology, to **organize**, **analyze**, and **synthesize** information.
"Does Not Meet" Feedback:	**"Partially Meets" Feedback:**	**"Meets" Feedback::** I really like the "articulate and explain" part of the VT sample!!	**"Exceeds" Feedback:**

General WARM feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #2:
I think the meets category for NH does go along with use appropriate research tools.

General COOL feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #2:

#3 Organize information from multiple sources.

Does Not Meet	Partially Meets	Meets *This column should match the cognitive demand of the Performance Indicator.*	Exceeds
Student can…	Student can… GSP: -t**ake notes** from my sources, prioritizing relevant information;	Student can… NH: **summarize** information from multiple sources. HC: **using data** from a variety of sources to reason abstractly and quantitatively, to identify patterns, trends, and relationships, to accomplish goals	Student can… NH: **identify** related information from multiple sources. VT: **Use** technology, including digital technology, to **organize, analyze, and synthesize** information.
"Does Not Meet" Feedback:	**"Partially Meets" Feedback:**	**"Meets" Feedback::** NH indicator here is not rigorous enough.	**"Exceeds" Feedback:**
General WARM feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #3: **General COOL feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #3:**			

#4 Compare and synthesize information from multiple sources and/or disciplines to draw conclusions or make claims.

Does Not Meet	Partially Meets	Meets *This column should match the cognitive demand of the Performance Indicator.*	Exceeds
Student can…	Student can…	Student can…	Student can…
		NH: **summarize** information from multiple sources.	NH: **identify** related information from multiple sources.
HC: The student's idea **represents** a basic concept	HC: The student's ideas **represent** concepts from the same or similar contexts or disciplines.	HC: The student's ideas **compare** concepts from different contexts or disciplines. HC: **observe**,evaluate, and synthesize situations to define problems, using data from a variety of sources to reason abstractly and quantitatively, to identify patterns, trends, and relationships, to accomplish goals	HC: The student's ideas **connect** a variety of concepts from different contexts or disciplines. HC: **analyze** situations, data, and patterns to create unique responses and applications in established and new contexts.
GSP: **identify** information from multiple sources to address questions or challenges.	GSP: **identify** connections between what I learn in different disciplines and real-life situations. GSP: **take notes** from my sources, prioritizing relevant information; - **summarize** information from multiple and varied sources.	GSP: **apply** knowledge from other disciplines and experiences to; • **analyze** real-life situations, data, patterns, texts, artifacts, or other products. GSP: **-evaluate** the bias and accuracy of multiple and varied sources such as primary sources, articles, observations, interviews, images, or visual data displays; **-analyze** the interrelationships among or between concepts and **synthesize** information in a clear and concise way.	GSP: **apply** knowledge from a range of disciplines and experiences to; • **synthesize** information about real-life situations, data, patterns, texts, artifacts, or other products; • **predict** outcomes in complex real-life systems. GSP: **identify** areas where your analysis would benefit from additional information; • **seek out** additional academic sources and/or hard-to-find primary sources; • **analyze** the interrelationships among or between concepts in a clear and concise way to **frame** original questions or draw thoughtful conclusions.
VT: **Extract** information from multiple and varied sources.	VT: **Describe** and **summarize** information from multiple and varied sources.		VT: · **Draw conclusions** based on information from multiple sources; Or

		VT: **Evaluate** the credibility of multiple and varied sources to analyze the interrelationships among concepts.	**Create** alternative evidence that expands upon proficient. VT: **Use** technology, including digital technology, to organize, analyze, and synthesize information.
“Does Not Meet” Feedback:	**“Partially Meets” Feedback:**	**“Meets” Feedback::** The last sample from VT is repetitive of our indicator #1	**“Exceeds” Feedback:**
General WARM feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #4: **General COOL feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #4:**			

#5 Develop questions that can guide further learning.

Does Not Meet	Partially Meets	Meets *This column should match the cognitive demand of the Performance Indicator.*	Exceeds
Student can…	Student can…	Student can…	Student can… VT: **identify** areas where your analysis would benefit from additional information; • **seek out** additional academic sources and/or hard-to-find primary sources; • **analyze** the interrelationships among or between concepts in a clear and concise way to frame original questions GSP: **identify** areas where your analysis would benefit from additional information; **• seek out** additional academic sources and/or hard-to-find primary sources; **• analyze** the interrelationships among or between concepts in a clear and concise way to frame original questions or draw thoughtful conclusions.
"Does Not Meet" Feedback: (ask questions and find answers within one or more texts)	**"Partially Meets" Feedback:** (ask questions and infer answers from one or more texts)	**"Meets" Feedback::** (ask open ended/rigorous questions and synthesize information from multiple sources to infer the answers Use answers from questions to ask follow up questions)	**"Exceeds" Feedback:**
General WARM feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #5:			

General COOL feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #5:

#6 Select and use strong evidence and reasoning to justify claims or conclusions.

Does Not Meet	Partially Meets	Meets *This column should match the cognitive demand of the Performance Indicator.*	Exceeds
Student can… VT: **Use** information from several sources to **generate** a claim.	Student can… VT: **Include** information from several sources to **support** a claim with reasoning.	Student can… Vt: **Use** valid and reliable evidence to **support** a claim and **develop** a well-reasoned argument.	Student can… VT: **Critique** the reasoning and the supporting evidence for an argument to **determine** its credibility; Or **Create** alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.
"Does Not Meet" Feedback:	**"Partially Meets" Feedback:**	**"Meets" Feedback::** Should identifying and critiquing evidence for the contrary argument be here or under exceeds?	**"Exceeds" Feedback:**
General warm feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #6: **General cool feedback on sample scoring criteria for indicator #6:**			

Overall feedback on sample scoring criteria: