

Secondary ELA Instructional Materials Review Rubric

August 2025

Compliance with State Law (Required)				
Items		Adequate	Inadequate	
Sensitive Materials and Prohibited Submission 53G-10-103 , R277-628		Does Not Violate Law	May Violate Law	
Prohibited discriminatory practices 53G-2-103-5 , 53B-1-118 and 67-27-107		Does Not Violate Law	May Violate Law	
Maintaining constitutional freedom in the public schools. 53G-10-202		Does Not Violate Law	May Violate Law	
Free from advertising, e-commerce, or political interest		Contains none of the listed items.	Contains one or more of the listed items.	

Content [Total Points: Double point value]				
Items	Extensive (3 points)	Adequate (2 points)	Inadequate (1 point)	None
Alignment	The materials align extensively with	The materials align with most grade-level Utah core	The materials align with a few grade-level Utah core	The materials do not align with any of

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

	grade-level Utah core standards. It is current, well-researched, and referenced from reliable sources. These materials require no supplementary content to cover all standards.	standards but will need supplementary materials to ensure coverage of all the Utah core standards.	standards.	Utah's core standards.
Curates a Variety of Challenging Texts	The materials contain a wide variety of complex, grade-level texts (including print, audio, and visual media) and a variety of lengths, including short stories and novels. The text selection spans various time periods, cultures, social contexts, historical perspectives, and genres, providing students with access to complex syntax and vocabulary. These texts provide sufficient challenge and opportunities for deep analysis, critical thinking, and intellectual growth.	The materials include some variety of complex texts, but the selection lacks consistent variety in genres, time periods, cultures, and perspectives, and a variety of lengths. The texts may not consistently provide sufficient challenge or opportunities for deep analysis.	The materials rarely contain a wide variety of complex texts, and the selection lacks a variety of time periods, cultures, and genres. The materials do not include a variety of lengths. The materials rely on texts that are below grade level or lack complexity, offering limited opportunities for analysis or critical thinking.	The materials contain no variety of complex texts and no variety of lengths. They offer no opportunities for analysis or critical thinking.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

Ethnic Studies (Ethnic studies in core standards and curriculum should be a <u>narrowly tailored</u> incorporation of age-appropriate opportunities that <u>naturally arise</u> through education <u>without pretextual effort</u> in courses, programs, or activities where ethnic studies is not a primary focus. The material should incorporate a curriculum of people and cultures that reflect the state's various demographics <u>without commentary that seeks to violate the neutrality</u> standard	In addition to the content outlined in "Adequate," this material offers multiple evidence-based supplemental resources and opportunities for learning about various forms of cultural philosophies and epistemologies from Utah, the United States, and worldwide. The materials provide cultural backgrounds, contemporary real-life experiences, and contexts that are relevant to local students. Some examples may include people with disabilities, various body types, and ages.	This material demonstrates respect for diverse socio-cultural identities. The material provides opportunities to acknowledge and integrate the histories, cultures, contributions, and perspectives of people from the United States and worldwide. The material accurately represents the cultures, languages, traditions, beliefs, values, and customs of people from diverse backgrounds through a variety of texts, examples, scenarios, imagery, and applications.	The material has limited themes of social and cultural histories within the United States and globally. The material provides limited examples of inclusive or cultural real-life experiences and does not include diverse characters.	The material does not meet the requirements within the ethnic studies core standards and curriculum requirements. (53E-4-204.1).
--	---	--	---	---

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

established in codes: 53B-1-118 , 53G-2-103 , 53G-2-104 , 53G-2-105 , 67-27-107 ,				
Shared Values and Character Traits	The material extends beyond the content outlined in "Adequate", it includes elements that connect Utahns to the world. The material offers multiple evidence-based supplemental resources and opportunities for cultivating character traits in students. Some examples may include characters with a variety of personalities, education, income, occupation, or behaviors that illustrate character traits.	The material focuses on the shared values of diverse people and communities, the common elements that unite Utahns, and displays some character traits in its imagery and content. It aims to cultivate character traits in students, such as courage, leadership, intelligence, integrity, honesty, respect, morality, civility, duty, honor, and service, along with principles found in the Constitution.	The material lacks a sense of shared values or common elements that unite Utahns. Furthermore, the material has limited resources addressing civic and character education.	The material does not meet the requirements within the ethnic studies core standards and curriculum requirements (53E-4-204.1) and civic and character education. (53G-10-204)

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

Builds Knowledge & Includes Authentic Tasks	The materials include effective pre-reading activities that consistently activate prior knowledge and bridge knowledge gaps for all students. They also include reading, writing, speaking, and listening tasks that are authentic and purposeful, enabling students to build knowledge about the world. Reading tasks culminate in authentic writing that requires deep textual analysis and argumentation.	The materials provide pre-reading activities, but their effectiveness in activating prior knowledge may vary. The materials also include some reading, writing, speaking, and listening tasks that are authentic, but they may not consistently enable students to build knowledge. Reading tasks may culminate in writing, but the depth of analysis or argumentation varies.	The materials rarely include pre-reading activities or meaningful tasks. The tasks are often limited, repetitive, and lack authenticity, rarely enabling students to build knowledge. Reading or listening tasks do not culminate in authentic writing or lack deep textual analysis and argumentation.	The materials contain no pre-reading activities or purposeful tasks that enable students to build knowledge.
Teaches Comprehension Strategies	The materials consistently provide explicit and repeated opportunities for students to learn and apply a full range of comprehension strategies, such as questioning, visualizing, making inferences, summarizing, determining importance, and	The materials teach some comprehension strategies, but students may not consistently apply them. Similarly, students show some metacognitive awareness but might still struggle to consistently apply strategies for deeper comprehension.	The materials inconsistently teach comprehension strategies. Consequently, students show little to no metacognitive awareness of their comprehension.	The materials do not teach comprehension strategies or metacognition.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

	monitoring comprehension. This occurs before, during, and after reading. The materials also lead students to clearly demonstrate metacognitive awareness of their comprehension, moving beyond simple decoding to effectively self-monitor and apply strategies for deeper understanding.			
Builds Word Knowledge & Vocabulary	The materials provide consistent opportunities for students to build and practice word knowledge through analyzing word choice and authentically using acquired vocabulary across various tasks. These opportunities are designed to also support English language development. Students get repeated exposure to concepts and vocabulary	The materials provide some opportunities for building word knowledge and using vocabulary, but they may not consistently involve analyzing word choice or fully support English language development. Students have some exposure to new vocabulary, but their opportunities for varied use may be limited.	The materials provide rare or isolated opportunities for word knowledge or vocabulary use. Students have limited exposure to new vocabulary and few chances to use it.	The materials provide no opportunities for building word knowledge or vocabulary use.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

	in different contexts and have ample opportunities to use new vocabulary in their own work.			
Fosters Oral Language Development	The materials provide explicit instruction and ample opportunities for students to develop and practice oral language skills, including vocabulary, syntax, and discourse conventions. This instruction is integrated into speaking and listening tasks to promote clear and effective communication for all learners.	The materials provide some opportunities for oral language practice, but explicit instruction in vocabulary, syntax, or discourse conventions may be limited or inconsistent. Support for oral language development is present but may not be systematically integrated into all speaking and listening tasks.	The materials provide minimal or no focus on explicit oral language development. Students have limited opportunities to practice and refine their spoken language skills, and there is a lack of targeted support for developing oral language.	The materials provide no focus on explicit oral language development and offers no opportunities for practice.
Facilitates Text-Aligned and Sustained Collaborative Discussions	The materials provide for text-aligned and sustained collaborative discussions where students actively participate. They engage in the analysis and synthesis of information, make connections across topics, and support their	The materials include discussions that are generally aligned to texts but may sometimes lack depth or consistent evidence-based support. Students participate in collaborative discussions, but their engagement in analysis, synthesis, or	The materials' included discussions are superficial, loosely aligned to texts, or dominated by the educator. Students participate minimally in collaborative discussions, with little engagement in	The materials do not include text-aligned or collaborative discussions.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

	interpretations with evidence from sources.	evidence-based support might be inconsistent.	analysis, synthesis, or evidence-based support.	
Develops ELA Disciplinary Literacy Skills	The materials explicitly address and develop disciplinary literacy skills relevant to ELA, enabling students to evaluate rhetorical choices, interpret literary devices, and evaluate author's craft to understand the historical and cultural context of literature.	The materials introduce disciplinary literacy skills in ELA, but they may not be explicitly or repeatedly developed. Students may be able to interpret literary devices but struggle to evaluate rhetorical choices or an author's craft.	The materials inconsistently design content that addresses disciplinary literacy skills in ELA, and students are not taught to evaluate rhetorical choices, interpret literary devices, or evaluate author's craft.	The materials do not address or develop disciplinary literacy skills in ELA.
Provides Visible & Strategic Scaffolds	The materials ensure all students have access to visible scaffolds for speaking, listening, reading, and writing with grade-level texts and content. These scaffolds, which include the strategic use of technology, are intentionally temporary and are gradually released as students develop independence.	The materials provide some scaffolds, but they may not always be visible, comprehensive, or strategically used for all learners. The gradual release of these scaffolds may not be consistently planned for, which can hinder students' development of independence.	The materials provide minimal or no scaffolds, hindering student access to grade-level texts. The concept of scaffold release is not evident in the instruction.	The materials provide no scaffolds.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

Teaches Writing Instruction and Skills	The materials provide explicit instruction on the writing process and offer multiple opportunities for students to write for different purposes and audiences. It includes guidance on effective feedback and revision strategies.	The materials include some writing tasks but provide limited explicit instruction on the writing process or opportunities for revision. Writing is often treated as a final product rather than a process.	The materials offer rare or isolated writing assignments with no instruction on the writing process or revision.	The materials contain no writing assignments or instruction.
Supports Research, Inquiry, and Information Literacy	The materials provide explicit instruction on a scaffolded research process. Students are taught to formulate meaningful research questions, locate and ethically use a variety of credible sources (print, digital, and media), and synthesize information effectively. They are also taught to identify bias, determine the credibility of sources, and cite evidence using a standard format.	The materials include some research projects and opportunities for students to find and use information, but with limited instruction on how to evaluate the credibility of sources or formal citation practices.	The materials include some mention of research but provide no explicit instruction on the research process or information literacy skills.	The materials do not include any opportunities for research, or instruction on research and information literacy skills.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

Embeds Grammar, Conventions, and Sentence Structure Instruction	The materials provide a systematic and contextualized approach to teaching grammar, usage, and mechanics. This instruction is embedded within and connected to reading, writing, speaking, and listening activities, allowing students to analyze how conventions impact meaning and apply them to improve their own communication.	The materials include some grammar exercises, but the instruction is often isolated and not consistently embedded within reading, writing, speaking, and listening. There is a lack of connection between grammar instruction and students' own work.	The materials provide minimal and inconsistent instruction on grammar, usage, or mechanics.	The materials provide no explicit instruction or practice opportunities for grammar, usage, or mechanics.
Supports Digital and Media Literacy	The materials provide explicit instruction and opportunities for students to analyze, evaluate, and create various forms of media. It teaches students to recognize bias and rhetorical strategies in digital contexts.	The materials incorporate some digital tools but offer limited instruction on media literacy or critical analysis of digital information.	The materials may use digital texts but provide no explicit instruction on media literacy.	The materials do not include any digital or media literacy instruction.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

Technology Integration	Technology is seamlessly and purposefully integrated to support content delivery, student collaboration, and creative expression. The materials leverage digital tools for differentiated instruction and assessment.	The materials use technology for basic tasks (e.g., online readings or quizzes) but do not fully leverage its potential to enhance learning.	The materials mention technology but provide few or no examples of how to integrate it.	The materials do not integrate technology in any meaningful way.
Navigation	Educators and students can navigate the materials independently. Instructions are clear and understandable. The materials are well organized.	The materials contain instructions that are understandable and easy to navigate. Students may need educator support to navigate the materials.	The materials are only usable with direct educator support due to a lack of clear instructions. Students will need educator support to navigate the materials.	The instructions in the materials are unclear, and navigation is difficult. The materials are disorganized.
Assessments	The materials contain a variety of formative and summative assessments aligned with Utah Core Standards. It provides appropriate intervention strategies that lead to observable performance and real-world experiences for students.	The materials contain summative assessments aligned with Utah Core Standards with few interventions.	The materials contain a limited number of assessments without intervention strategies.	The materials do not provide assessment materials.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

Material Characteristics [Total Points: 9]				
Physical Characteristics	This material goes beyond the content outlined in "Adequate" by incorporating modern, up-to-date, and relatable visuals.	In physical terms, the material is interactive and provides high-quality audio-visual and tactile experiences for all users.	The material offers limited or low-quality audio-visual and tactile experiences for students, but it is reusable.	The content either has low audio-visual quality or is not intended for reuse.
Technical Standards	This material surpasses the content outlined in "Adequate" by ensuring the safeguarding of student data privacy and easy installation or access without technical assistance. Furthermore, any licensing information is clearly stated in the description.	The materials meet all the requirements of federal and state laws, as well as accepted technical standards such as ISTE Standards and VPAT Compliance. Additional technical specifications and limitations, including hardware requirements, bandwidth demands, and software/web access restrictions, are clearly outlined in the description. The design of the materials allows for error-free installation	The material is constrained by specifications that require additional materials, technical assistance, hardware, software, or infrastructure. Access to resources within the material expires after a trial period.	Student data privacy is at risk.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.

Material Characteristics [Total Points: 9]				
		or access without the need to purchase additional components.		
Adaptability	The material is currently relevant and adaptable for educators and students. The material can be customized for the needs of diverse learners.	Educators or students can utilize the material, but it may not be customizable for the needs of diverse learners.	The material has limited options to address adaptability for the needs of diverse learners.	The material is not suitable for different educational settings with diverse learners.

Contact Person and Email: Amber Wright amber.wright@schools.utah.gov

This document was shared with the Standards and Committee Meeting held on August 2, 2024. Edited November 19, 2024. This version of the document was passed in full Board on January 9, 2025.