

Manager/FS autonomy track (fast track)

21 Feb 2024: At the management meeting we noted we should be extra-cautious with COI along this track. The 'assessor' (i.e., the person giving the second opinion) would consider this carefully.

15 Dec 2023 update:

- We now have a much larger 'field specialist team' and a slightly more involved process for prioritizing/selecting work for evaluation
- The 'manager autonomy track' still applies, at least for now.
- DR: I propose we extend it to allow advisory board members who have been with the UJ for 3+ months to move forward with this for 1-2 papers as well (being wary of COIs)
- DR: I propose we extend it to field specialists who have had extensive involvement with the UJ processes (e.g., if they served as evaluation managers)

Background:

We have budget and a plan to evaluate ~70 more papers in 18 months (roughly 1 per week)
8 (active) management committee members (plan to expand to ~15)

Proposed 'manager autonomy' track, for now.

1. Each manager can identify/choose up to 3 papers/projects for evaluation
 - Limiting this to save room for expanded team and more systematic and coordinated approaches (and potential trial)
2. Add these to Airtable (or PubPub system if this replaces it in time)
3. Prepare a brief on 'why relevant for Unjournal' (and, optionally 'what aspects to evaluate')

Other rules apply:

- Unless it's NBER, we need the authors' consent (update: expanded somewhat) See: UJ: Direct evaluation track; expansion and rules
- The paper must be publicly hosted/accessible [NBER is on the border here] ... todo: have a public note on how to access, and/or require authors to also post it elsewhere
- Get a 'second' from at least one other member of the Management Committee (also make sure David Reinstein is aware, at least until we have others on this)
 - Update Dec.: this is called the 'assessor' role
- The default expectation is that the proposer will be the Evaluation Manager (but you can suggest someone else)

→ Up to ~24 papers through this stream

I suggest we reconsider and assess balance after 10-15 papers