

Set: Reweaving Gossiel

Team Members: Sunset, ThatDamnPipsqueak, morgan (FLAREdirector), EpicToast

Score: 1.67

Feedback:

Pitch: Decent summary here, and I like the mix and match of tricolors. Let's see if your team delivered mechanically.

Acrid Crossroads - According to the pitch, this is a tricolor set with arcs (Esper, Jund, Naya) and wedges (Jeskai, Sultai). This combination gives us the following two-color pairs I expect to be supported in Limited: WU, UB, BG, RW, GR. Those are the overlaps that make sense for the given tricolors, facilitating a smoother Draft experience so players aren't railroaded into one tricolor too early. It's clear that your team had color balance in mind when choosing the tricolors, but there is so much more to expect from what goes into the architecture of a tricolor set that doesn't seem evident in your team's submission. With that in mind, presenting a WB land in the dual slot is an odd choice. Maybe the uncommon cycle has all ten two-color pairs represented, fine. But other cards in this entry (I'll elaborate further as I get to them) lead me to believe that there was no conscious effort that went into determining which pairs should be present in the set to make Limited work. The individual design on this land I like, at least.

Akhalni Orphan // Imperial Vessel - This being base W with a UB ability is another miss for me. Jeskai should be the W-centered faction given the combination of tricolors present in this set (WR lets you pivot to Naya; WU lets you go Esper). I suppose this could be meant as the tricolor common cycle, so locking you in to one faction comes with the goal of the slot, but I'm not a fan of it even in that context; I like those to be as simple as possible, and this design feels a bit convoluted for that. At least Reimagine is serviceable as a mechanic, and it does look like it delivers on what the pitch promised. Imperial Vessel should have the artifact frame, though.

Fearless Warrior // Fearsome Monstrosity - Fine demonstration of the reimagine mechanic, definitely a better use of it than the card that came before it, but not much to say other than that. Menace -> Menace+ is an upgrade that isn't anything new, but it works.

Refracting Portal - I can see this dropping the mana value restriction, but this card's a decent delirium plant that reimagine requires.

Horrific Observations - I wasn't a fan of enlighten at first since I tend to dislike mechanics that explicitly require you to multispell, but at least it only asks it of you once,

and I realized this wanting you to have both spell types plays into reimagine. Neat removal spell that looks like every Bx deck will want a few of in Limited.

Dreamscape Channeler - Solid fixer in a tricolor set makes this very appealing, and added utility to mess up opponent's reimagines is gravy. I think the second ability might want to be sorcery speed just to avoid questions about priority, but overall I think this card is fine.

Restless Mournwolf - Showcasing more ways to get card types in this graveyard seems to be the goal of this slot, but it does so in a way that feels clunky. I suspect there's a better way to word this (maybe a reflexive?) as right now I believe it always makes you target, which is weird. But honestly I'm not a fan of land sac as a kicker, and if you wanted black to get lands in the graveyard it has plenty of tools to do it (self-discard, mill) that's more organic.

Figment Spinner - Commons that make statements about the set are what I'm looking for in this challenge, and this definitely does the job. I like the custom reminder text here, though I think it could be workshopped a bit. This is for the Jeskai faction, but I can see it working in Naya as well to flicker ETBs Evoke creatures may have.

Manifested Wisdom - Speaking of Evoke, I like this card a lot. Evoke as a way to get creatures in your graveyard early for reimagine is also nice. This milling also furthers hitting delirium, so points for that as well.

Beltanic Visionary - This just has a bit too much going on for me. I think it didn't have to stop at reducing only the first instant or sorcery you cast each turn. The body is also pretty underwhelming for the enlightened reward to be exciting. I can see this slot wanting to be a looter that drops the discard when enlightened, or maybe a curiosity creature with more stats.

Dreamstriped Anhinga - I go by WotC practice and think flying can go 5C *if set themes do enough to justify it*. This entry so far has not done enough in that regard that I can overlook a common, well-costed, 3-power flyer in red. Flavoring this differently with another red keyword would have made me like it way more, but this is another miss for me.

Relinquish Preconceptions - Using surveil for the set is a good call. This card looks neat and exciting in Constructed. No issues here other than the flavor text dragging a bit, but that's minor to me.

Nature Amidst the Unnatural - I think this is the weakest link of the entry. Isn't Jeskai supposed to be the enchantment faction? If you wanted to showcase cross-faction synergy I would have at least made this WR . . . which circles back to my initial macro-level issue about this set. The art feels out of place (if you really wanted this to make an Elk I'm sure there's a bunch of other deer art out there) but that's the least concerning of this card's issues. The actual effects on the Saga I'm fine with, at least.

Nightmare Bearer - Tricolor uncommon showing us that Jund is all about lands. Does its job well enough even if I'm not super wowed by the design.

Tahaz, Ardent Overlord // Dream of Dominion - One each turn, not per; this isn't YGO. Tahaz seems cracked but I like it anyway. What's baffling is that it reimagines into an enchantment, instead of an artifact. There's nothing about Dream of Dominion that makes me think it had to be an enchantment, so that just seems like an oversight.

Revel as Reality Dies - I have no idea what decisions lead to this taking your foil slot -- an opportunity to perhaps show a flashy card at any rarity -- and your team chose to put a rehash of a canon common in it, and one that's significantly worse than its counterpart. At least the token has a color appropriate keyword now.

Overall I like the vision here with tying card types to the factions, but the lack of foresight about color combinations with respect to Limited, as well as some questionable individual designs makes me think this set will be rough to draft.

This world seems interesting at first glance! Taking a factional approach to the dreamworld concept is something I haven't seen before, and I really like the choice for each faction to care about specific card types as opposed to them each having their own mechanic. Let's look at the cards.

Acrid Crossroads - Definitely an interesting design, and I like the support for reimagine here. It does feel janky to have the tapland and the fetch on the same card instead of using, like, a Rocky Tar Pit-alike, but that's not a major issue and I like the idea that you have a tapland to fix you in the early game, and then either if necessary or to turn on your reimagines, you just crack it to grab a potential 3rd color.

Akhalni Orphan // Imperial Vessel - This is an interesting design. I like the idea to go from an evasive creature that lets you fuel your reimagine to a larger creature that you can attack with in the lategame. The thing that puts me off of this though, is the fact that there's no continuity between the front or backside? It goes from white to UB instead of esper (despite the fact that it would be like, functionally the same) and the back has no

reference to either flying or surveil. It just feels like a bit of an odd choice to have the two halves not really match in terms of flavor at all.

Fearless Warrior // Fearsome Monstrosity - Yeah, this is a super killer common! For the exact same reasons as I said I didn't like the last card as much, I like this card a lot. Flavor is there, it feels congruous, and the backside is a clear upside to the ability on the front.

Refracting Portal - Neat! Fuels Reimagine well, and it seems solid as an early-game tempo sort of tool.

Horrific Observations - I like enlighten a fair bit, as it's a cool way to justify running a lot of spells in a non "Whenever you cast a noncreature spell" way. The design itself is a solid removal spell, and I would definitely love to play it.

Dreamscape Channeler - Seems really solid as a mana dork and as a way to block Reimagines from popping off later. I'm a big fan of cheaper green dorks like this for Limited, and this does it nicely.

Relentless Mournwolf - Seems solid - I would be disinclined from sacrificing a land here unless it's pretty late in the game, but I think that's fine, especially if there are incentives to do so.

Figment Spinner - This is a super nice common! I like the ability to pick up an ETB, which is super relevant in a format with Evoke and Sagas, and the body seems fine enough to support the ability.

Manifested Wisdom - Love this, just feels like a solid call for an Evoke creature in a graveyard-leaning set.

Beltanic Visionary - This feels wack at common - getting to draw a card every turn on top of that reduction leans too complex IMO.

Dreamstriped Anhinga - I like this on the creature end, but it feels a little awkward to evoke as 1R discard two draw two just doesn't feel like a great rate.

Relinquish Preconceptions - Solid uncommon, I like the ability here to Divination at 2U if you meet the condition without feeling too powerful because of that restriction.

Nature Amidst the Unnatural - This is such a weird card here, as GW isn't in any of your color pairs, and this clearly isn't an arcun considering none of the modes point to any particular deck or theme, it's just a toolbox of weird effects. Doesn't feel like it fits or is congruous with any of your themes other than "sagas = enchantments in yard".

Nightmare Bearer - Solid, neat little tricolor payoff that lets you synergize with lands.

Tahaz - Same issue as Orphan/Vessel, there's just no congruence between these modes. The frontside asks you to build up a board of a bunch of artifact cards, the backside is a graveyard-matters engine that lets you freecast the spells you should have already played. Doesn't work at all for me.

Revel as Reality Dies - If you're gonna include a foil, make it do more than a worse rehash of Experimental Synthesizer. Costing 1 more to cast and 2 more to activate, only

for the sole benefit of replacing vigilance with haste, just is not nearly enough to make this playable or, more importantly, interesting.

I've seen some attempts of "factions with card type focuses", and I think the concept plays better the more colours per faction, so that players aren't punished as hard when you design cards in a colour that aren't that card type.

- Acrid Crossroads confuses me. The life payment seems like it makes more sense on the mana ability, because I don't imagine I'd want to trade my dual land for a basic land very often in a 3c faction set.

- Akhalni Orphan having no mechanical resemblance to Imperial Vessel makes the two faces feel too disconnected for me. Reimagine is on the wordy end, and by including the reimagine cost in the reminder text rather than saying "for its reimagine cost", you cut yourself off from designs with non-mana reimagine costs. The mechanic seems workable, and I would expect some kind of Delirium-like in a set with card type-matters, but one faction being inherently more clued in to it (with Beltan caring about two types), makes me a bit wary of how the Limited environment would play out with this as your 5c mechanic.

- Fearless Warrior is a solid common. I appreciate the simplicity and the parallel here, with the back face featuring "menace+".

- Refracting Portal takes a standard uncommon, puts it on an artifact and gives it a sac ability to get it into the yard to fuel Reimagine. Cool. With blue also having the faction that cares about instants and sorceries, the fact that this slot takes prevents an unsummon effect appearing on an instant or sorcery among blue commons feels like it hurts the Sultai faction a decent amount, though.

- Horrific Observations is a fine removal spell, though I recommend dropping the "instead" on effects like these so they aren't foiled by indestructible creatures/combat tricks. Having a mechanic for the Sultai mechanic, and kind of the Naya mechanic in Evoke, but no other factions feels like a mistake to me.

- Dreamscape Channeler is probably good enough just by nature of its mana ability in a 3c set. The second ability feels off to me on a common - sacrificing your mana dork for this feels like it will so rarely be worthwhile, but I do appreciate that this is a creature you want utility out of early that you can sacrifice later to help fuel Reimagine (and remove opponents' Reimagine cards).

- Restless Mournwolf feels like it's meant to be for the Lands Matter faction, but it recurring a Creature muddies that signalling. Including a card that helps you pitch lands is a good call, though the failcase of hitting for 2 feels a bit sad.

- Figment Spinner being an Aetherborn tells me it's intended for the Enchantment-matters deck, but letting you hit creatures feels like it goes against that development. I understand that it might be correct to include cross-faction effects like these caring about multiple card types, but it feels like it lessens the meaning of said

factions. I think that would be less the case if you hadn't specified that some factions were centred around a specific creature type like Aetherborn. As a card it seems solid, but while I understand why you included the reminder text, it feels a bit jarring on a common.

- Manifested Wisdom, the classic 6 drop with "landcycling". This will play solidly, although the 6-drop half feels a bit overtuned. I will say, I dislike Evoke in a set that also has Instants and Sorceries matter - Evoke facilitates using Creatures in Instant and Sorcery slots, so the two fight for space, especially with being in the same colours.

- Beltanic Visionary is a spicy common. While I think power-wise you could get away with this at common, it feels like it eats away at some of the splashier design space for Enlighten cards that you'd want to save for uncommon.

- Dreamstriped Anhinga is a card I think is probably always wrong to Evoke, with it putting you down a card. The resolution of it also feels kind of unsatisfying, with you being unable to shortcut it to "discard two, then draw two".

- Relinquish Preconceptions features the swingy "mill effect, then effect conditional on what's in your graveyard". I dislike this combination of effects, because it isn't truly rewarding you for hitting Delirium - it can reward you for doing as little as having 2 card types in your yard (or fewer if you have multi-typed cards). Besides that this card seems fine. Flavour text slaps.

- Naure Amidst the Unnatural immediately sticks out to me as not really fitting the consistent art aesthetic you'd maintained for the rest of the submission. I think the power level of this card is defensible, but it misses on a number of axes for me, including: ch3 Naturalize discouraging your opponent from casting artifacts or enchantments into it, being a GW card when only one of your five factions includes that colour pair, and not being particularly good with the Enchantment-flicker card earlier in the pack.

- Nightmare Bearer's land recursion ability initially had me worried that you'd missed its antisynergy with Reimagine, but that's been covered by the second ability. That said, this second ability does not feel okay, particularly when combined with the first meaning you're not truly giving anything up. This is a huge "remove me or die" threat that feels too swingy in Limited.

- Tahaz makes sense as a big artifact lord for your artifact faction. "Once each turn" is the wording used in canon. I'm not sure why the back face is an enchantment rather than an artifact in the artifact faction, or why it doesn't mention artifacts anywhere on it despite that being the whole deal of the front face.

- Revel as Reality Dies being so similar to Experimental Synthesizer feels like not the best way of showcasing your design talent. Showing us ways of putting enchantments in the bin to enable Reimagine is good, but there was a lot more that could have been done here.

Overall I think you had some good setup with your set idea, and you took the prompt in a direction that showed promise. Unfortunately, a lot of the cards on an individual level stumbled on their execution, and the set's structure through its mechanical choices felt like not the best way to execute the stated set goal.

I'm interested in this off-shard/off-wedge three-colour combination. Having five different interpretations of "dreamworld" based on five different factions works for me as a selling point. Each one being based on a card type tribal I think is a little less appealing, though? Faction sets are already linear, and so heightening the differences with linear tribal-esque strategies feel like it's doubling down on the same conceit. It also makes it harder for there to be cross-faction cards, since, like, only one deck/one faction is ever going to care about becoming Enlightened, for example--and Evoke using creature slots to do instant/sorcery effects actually fights that, since it makes for a narrower band of applicable ways to become Enlightened. That kind of permanent state change feels weird being limited to a single faction when it takes enough deckbuilding heft and hoop-jumping to centrepiece the whole set, and the fact that it's a faction mechanic when not all factions have one also feels a bit weird. Reimagine lands well as a hybrid Delirium-Disturb; while I'm a bit odded by having a faction set based around card types where the main mechanic wants you to collect all the card types, even the ones outside of your faction, the actual mechanic itself does a clean job combining the two mechanics together and has a lot of functionality in terms of deckbuilding and gameplay (it's great you can self-mill to enable it and get them to cast the back faces, for example!).

Looking across the pack, I am provoked by in turn some cool things and some weird questions. When do I want to sacrifice my dual land to get a basic in a three-colour deck? Doesn't the dual already get me better fixing? Why does the Imperial Vessel have nothing to do with the Orphan on its front side? Why does the Figment Spinner need that reminder text? What is the Nature Among the Unnatural? Are houses particularly out-there? Isn't the whole plane "unnatural"? Why doesn't Tahaz's backside care about artifacts at all? Why is the foil just Experimental Synthesizer but sad? On the other hand, though, there's some winners; I like the Refracting Portal adding meaningful novelty to the classic Unsummon slot while also being an artifact that puts itself in the graveyard for cross-synergies, I like "upgrading" from Fearless Warrior to Fearsome Monstrosity that shows a strong progression and good flavourful re-imagining, I like the Restless Mournwolf having that late-game sac-a-land modality to let you curate yourself into Delirium. It's unfortunate I feel like I have to have this splintered up like this, because the cards I like I do really like, but the cards that fumble often feel like big fumbles, or just... general weirdness that I'm not really sure about.

I feel like the premise of "different lenses of reality" done through this graveyard-matters jumble-of-all-the-things actually lands well as a premise. I think what's actually making

this struggle is the three-colour factions, and that's where I'd put the major pain point conceptually; having them be such strict deck identities means when you have this many total pieces floating, it makes them hard to map out properly. I feel like if this didn't have the factions and was just open-ended "delirium world", it'd clean up some of these oddities and streamline the set, while still hitting the "we all have our own interpretations of Phantasy" flavour beat.

The blurb here has me generally intrigued, though I'm not sure why the Naya and Jund faction descriptions don't include an idea of their mechanical identity while the other three do.

- Acrid Crossroads is neat. It's difficult to create meaningfully new land cycles without getting into the weeds, and this feels like it succeeds at staying simple and effective. Self-sacring lands also make sense in a format with reimagine.

Speaking of reimagine, I want to take a moment to do a quick aside to talk about the mechanics suite. I like mechanics that have specific deckbuilding incentives/are adjacent riffs to existing well-liked ones, so in theory reimagine ticks a lot of boxes for me. I'm not sure how to feel about Reimagine itself potentially removing a type from your grave for your other Reimagine cards, though. I'm really not a fan of enlighten. It feels moderately trivial to enable, especially since it itself is placed on i/s cards. Just strangely placed when you have a pseudo-delirium mechanic already, which is a bigger ask/deckbuilding hoop that almost subsumes the deckbuilding ask here. It also feels like it has limited ability to pull weight as the "spells mechanic" slot that its currently filling. Evoke is fine, a good choice given the grave themes here, but I wish there was a mechanic that was a little more aggressive to balance the scales here.

- Dreamscape Channeler: Not a fan of set-mechanic hosing ability being present on a common that's highly pickable anyways.

- I'm a fan of Refracting Portal; feels like an effect that's been pushed down the curve in an exciting way/just generally plays nice with lots of set themes while also being faster than them if that's where you want to be.

- Manifested Wisdom feels redundant with Restless Mournwolf.

- Dreamstriped Anhiga is definitely a bigger flier than red usually gets at lower rarities, though I'm willing to be more amicable towards that/handwave it as an environmental choice for the most part.

- Revel as Reality Dies just being Worse Experimental Synthesizer TM isn't a good look, especially since Experimental Synthesizer just came out.

- The ordering of modes on Nature Admist the Unnatural seems bizarre - telegraphing your removal is generally not a good play, the creature being delayed is maybe a powerlevel choice but just exacerbates the awkwardness.

After looking through your pack, it felt like while you had an ambitious concept, there were definitely cracks here. A lot of slot space was devoted to grave support and your Esper (and to a lesser extent, Jund) archetypes, but that ended up leaving question marks as to what your other archetypes are doing; while I got some answers wrt to Jund, at least, I still know nothing about Naya. Overall, this feels like an entry that I wanted to like more than I ended up actually did.

Acrid Crossroads: I guess this is the land slot. I don't really like this design, it doesn't seem like a particularly interesting progression on ye olde tapped land slot, since it already adds two different colors of mana. Sacrificing this to get a third color of mana is almost always not going to be worth it.

Akhalni Orphan: The front half is fine; the back half is fine, though feels more like an uncommon. Reimagine is fine, though "other cards" might be unintuitive. My problem with this slot is that the front half and the back half have absolutely no connection whatsoever. They don't even look like they belong in the same deck. I also think it's interesting to make your Esper centered around white, which this hints at; not a problem, but a choice.

Fearless Warrior: Super dull name. Easy place to put something more colorful. The card itself seems fine. I do wish the back faces had the "if this would leave the battlefield, exile it instead" so you don't have to tie the weird token-making into the reimagine text.

Refracting Portal: Sure. Cool way to get artifacts into the yard for reimagine.

Horrific Observations: I don't think enlighten wants to have instants/sorceries with enlighten at common; makes it too easy a benchmark to hit IMO. This design is a bit of a miss for me, as well. The floor is already very playable, and "destroy it instead" doesn't line up with a -X/-X effect in a way I'm keen on.

Dreamscape Channeler: The numbers here don't look like they were really thought-out. A two-mana dork is fine, 0/2 is pretty weak for that effect. I don't mind having a common that counteracts some of the set themes, but why does it cost {3}? That number looks like it was pulled out of a hat. I'd also suggest making this effect tuck, just because shuffling gets very fiddly.

Restless Mournwolf: This card screams "how do we put the land type in the graveyard" and doesn't look like it was really developed much beyond that. Both sides of the effect

are fine, but not interesting, and not connected in a discernible way. Side note: you have a stray "another" in the text.

Figment Spinner: I guess I'm about to find a Saga here! ETB aetherize is interesting.

These go infinite with two copies. It reads weird to have the Saga RT and not something preventing the card from hitting copies of itself.

Manifested Wisdom: Yeah, sure. Big fatty with competitively costed evoke is a tale as old as time. Not a big fan of seeing two cards in this pack that recur creatures from the graveyard, especially since you want creatures in the yard for reimagine.

Beltanic Visionary: Not a fan of commons with two line breaks. This could easily just be a 3/2 without the middle line of text, and I think there it's a much more interesting card.

Decks that want to enlighten will be playing cheap I/S's anyways, so I doubt you're getting big wins out of a single mana reduction.

Dreamstriped Anhinga: Really not a fan of red getting a 3/3 flier at common. Really not a fan of "ETB or dies" at common. Evoking this is a huge mistake because it's negative card advantage. This card is a clean miss for me.

Relinquish Preconceptions: Sure. Seems like fun to cast, good glue piece for multiple archetypes.

Nature Amidst the Unnatural: Here's my Saga. This card... the balance is super wrong. Putting removal on a late mode of a Saga is annoying to play into, I'd much rather see those modes on I. I don't mind a Watchwolf, but this is a delayed Watchwolf that also 2-for-1's against some decks and I really don't think it'll play well at all.

Nightmare Bearer: Another really uninteresting name. Pretty neat design, but it feels like it doesn't take up enough board space on its own for a three-color three-mana play. I'd rather this be a 3/3. Just a nitpick.

Tahaz, Ardent Overlord: Are artifacts a theme in this set? I've seen one and it wasn't particularly memorable. None of your reimagines are artifacts, either. The back face once again feels like it has nothing to do with the front face. I guess it's like an extension of the front face's ability, but it doesn't feel natural.

Revel as Reality Dies: This is just a worse version of an existing card from NEO. It takes up a ton of the same space as Anhinga.

Overall: The flavor hits pretty well, but I'm not much of a flavor judge; the mechanics I find lackluster. I didn't see anything used in novel ways, there seemed to be basically no support for anything (no mill for reimagine, no cheap instants/sorceries for enlighten). I don't really know what the archetypes are. The cards all feel like they belong together, but as game pieces I'm not really enthusiastic.

Set: Lost Empire of Xeri'aq

Team Members: Splashcat, Dodger, MBTree, Badknight13

Score: 2.17

Feedback:

Map Out the Future: Disturb on instants/sorceries is ffffffine, though it doesn't feel overly novel. I don't love disturb costs that are less than the main cost of the spell, at least at common. I do think these two pieces at least belong in the same deck.

Cavern Collapse: What is this doing here? There has never been a "choose two" at common outside of an unset. This adds a ton of complexity and doesn't really feel like it actually does anything in practice.

Disciple of the Ruins: Okay, sure, we're doing tons of artifact themes here. This is a good riff on Disciple of the Vault.

Eave Leaper: This is just Renown, right? I get that it's a *little* different, but really, this is just Renown. I doubt the AA will play well, especially because you can activate it multiple times per turn.

Erase from History: Wild that you've already shown me two artifact removal spells in this set where seemingly every card cares about artifacts. The cost reduction on this card doesn't feel like it really matches up with the slot (expensive white hard removal).

Grand Construction: Sure. Seems fine. Did you not chop the text? The top line on the front half looks reaaaally close to the typeline.

Harsh Sentence: Really boring name; in fact, a lot of these names are pretty dull. This card doesn't make much sense. The sides don't feel like they belong on the same card.

Methodical Professor: Seems cool, but seems red. I like Clues in artifact environments.

Ravenous Puzzler: You can activate this multiple times per turn? This card's floor is super low and the ceiling is CRAZY high (we're talking +8/+0 at a minimum late-game). Not what I want to see out of a common.

Runed Beetle: Sure. Wait, this is a Clue? Feels like there's a typo here, one way or another.

Black Sun Temple: I like the flavor of Digs. Level 2 doesn't really fit with levels 1 and 3. I do always like Rack effects, and they're more fun when they're stapled to discard.

Soul Repository: Cool signpost. I actually think this would be a more fun signpost as "noncreature permanent" because it leans really heavily into artifact sac, but that's a nitpick. I like the card.

Translated Text: Hate that you gave me two uncommons that investigate. This card seems fine but it's not doing anything interesting or new in this booster.

Fractured Core: Weird to see this and Professor in the same pack. None of the effects here feel like they really tie into one another. I see the mana plus free spell combo of 2 and 3, but once you're paying 4RR to get to mode three, you don't need the mana. I also hate that this fuels itself to level 3.

Lia, Ruin Runner: Whaa? A mana dork you're incentivized to attack with is already tense, and the number here don't make sense. If my 2-drop is a 3/4, I'm probably just clocking with it. Lia getting two counters but only granting one is weird. Overall: I don't really feel anything about this plane beyond "artifacts." I don't really feel anything about this limited environment beyond "artifacts." The mechanics feel derivative; I like Digs, but I don't think you're doing enough interesting with them to keep my attention.

The "Lost Ruins" prompt has an uphill battle to distinguish the set from Zendikar (and soon, Ixalan--though I can't speak to the future), and so I'm hoping to see some stuff that's really neat here to scrub the idea of skyclaves from my brain, especially since they share the core premise of "colossal ancient ruins suddenly re-appear". The mechanical suite is giving me some concerns about that, though. Clues and Disturb are fine mechanics, but they're very generic and open-ended, which doesn't put a ton of strong identity in that part of the pitch, although I can see you took work to tighten Disturb by having them all flip into artifacts. Enlighten seems like it's just a reskin of renown, which I don't understand why conceptually, but Renown is better at putting some differentiation in the sell. It does end up meaning that Excavate is doing a lot of the heavy lifting for making this set feel unique and having solid identity, and it'd be fine as one of several but a Class variant can't hold it alone.

The first handful of these commons aren't particularly novel. I like the modality in Cave Collapse, and while it's no Abrade, it's good to have this kind of flexible artifact removal in a set that's heavy on artifacts. Eave Leaper immediately stands out as using a new twist on Renown, which makes it leap ahead in terms of appeal when I'm looking at it as a judge, even if the card itself is kind of mediocre (very reliant on getting that first hit in, hopefully from being on the play). Grand Construction's self-feeding nature is a good kind of one-two linearity, and that sells it to me as a reason for Disturb to be here than the other two Disturb commons, which don't have as clean a throughline. Ravenous Puzzler is reinforcing the twist that Eave Leaper suggested, and that's also good for giving us a new look at how this is different from just returning Renown. Confused why the Runed Beetle is a Clue that doesn't do Clues. There's no Clue-matters here, so it seems like a filler slot with a weird typeline. The two Excavations have to carry a lot on their shoulders still, and Black Sun Temple generally lands with me (it's a cohesive package that grows up well), I'm not really sure where Fractured Core is supposed to go. It's a very expensive mana rock, or a very very expensive extra card per turn. Having written this all out, I'm actually thinking that the thing that did the best work here is Enlighten, and that's despite it being just a renown reskin. Shifting its emphasis to activated abilities and using it as a "gate" rather than just a power boost is novelty and feels like the most unique thing going on in this pack. However, holistically, I'm not convinced this setting is different enough from Zendikar Rising for me to be hype over,

and I feel like the mechanics went a bit too far in the "safe" side, so there's not enough exciting me when they're on very basic cards. It just overall felt like it ended up falling a bit short.

Not sure why the blurb says "plane of [Name]" - the name of the set has what appears to be a plane name, so this just seems sloppy. In general, the blurb here doesn't excite me/really demonstrate anything unique to me either flavorfully or mechanically. Using returning mechanics or riffs on them isn't itself an issue, but when 3/4 of your mechanics are workhorse returning mechanics, (Enlighten basically just being renown) it leaves your suite feeling very flat, especially when the one new mechanic, Digs, only provide a small amount of splash factor. (Classes being released recently takes the "wow" out of repurposing the Saga frame.) There's definitely an attempt to repurpose Disturb by putting it on nonpermanents, which I can appreciate to some degree/would be satisfied with in a set that had other unique mechanical explorations. Unfortunately, it doesn't feel like enough to break the mold here.

I think the individual designs themselves, however, leverage their simplicity in a good way, forming effective riffs on existing commons and/or having good attention to the play patterns and points on the curve your respective archetypes would likely want to play on. I like how you've taken care to ensure a strong focus on artifacts in your set, calling them out in different ways on several cards that makes you realize there's something up before you even see the density of them in general. I think there is an issue here where as you get further into the pack, your cards are getting diminishing returns on the new information they're providing. They also expose that your mechanics aren't being used in unique ways to support new archetypes - that is, when we have information on what archetypes to exist beyond lots of UB clues support.

Some notes on specific cards:

-I'm not sure I understand why Erase from History has the reduction condition that it does - feels like a sort of "oh man we need to make it clear artifacts are important here" when the removal condition itself already does that. Because of how artifact-dense the set is, it feels like the condition will be trivial/won't have meaningful deckbuilding considerations to enable.

- Methodical Professor feels very swingy/feels like it'll either be a trap or be obscene.

-Ravenous Puzzler scales up obscenely well once it becomes enlightened, probably moreso than a common should.

-Runed Beetle has the Clue typing but no ability referencing it, which is a miss to me especially since it could lead to scenarios where people don't realize its a Clue and therefore don't leverage that/make the wrong play.

-More flexibility is never bad, but I think the reward for Lia's tap ability is somewhat lukewarm/less attractive than just continuing to punch in with a 3/4 for 2.

I think in general the flavor text being somewhat generic contributes to the feeling I got from the pitch of this being a very by-the-numbers take on the prompt given, but I'd like to particularly note Erase from History and Grand Construction as effective expositional FTs.

I imagine the plane is called Xeri'aq and not [Name]! The mechanical suite you've chosen is fitting for this kind of plane prompt, though they are on the more simplistic end with two returning mechanics and two riff mechanics, so I hope the individual cards speak for themselves.

- Map Out the Future is a fine enough card. I appreciate that the mill can work both for yourself to fuel Disturb, but can also be used as a win con if the format ends up grindy enough. The parallel of 2s on both sides is also nice. Exile clause is missing "from anywhere" so that countering it also exiles it. Missing artist credit on the back!

- Cavern Collapse reminds me of Smash To Dust, though I can imagine artifacts being more prevalent as something needing to be removed in this set. I think the card would perform better if its alternate modes helped it to be more maindeckable rather than being small add-ons to the Shatter as the main mode.

- Disciple of the Ruins' cardname could do a lot more work to storytell than it's currently doing. Card seems fine, but from what you've shown me in the rest of the pack, artifacts look to be on the more high-individual-impact and higher-cost end of the range, which this doesn't work all that well with.

- Eave Leaper shows us Enlighten, which seems like a good way of allowing aggro decks to keep the more greedpile decks modest and needing to focus on the board. I think these kinds of cards with additional upside if they've managed to connect (i.e. the "grant another creature flying" part) are better suited at uncommon, because they're quite play/draw dependent, with your opponent being much less likely to have a blocker when on the draw.

- Erase From History seems solid and is reasonable but splashy at common. The flavour text as a Story Spotlight card probably wants to be a bit more specific - it's quite vague as to what it's referencing.

- Grand Construction seems like it could be an all star performer in Limited, allowing for players to slow games down. Love the flavour.

- Harsh Sentence is playable by nature of being removal, and I appreciate this kind of lategame mana sink on early interaction. Though, if you'd manage to incorporate a surveil on the front face so that there was some parallel between the two faces, it would feel tighter for me.
 - Methodical Professor is neat, especially with being able to discard Disturb cards. Am a fan.
 - Ravenous Puzzler does mostly the same for this submission as Eave Leaper, but a less good job. I doubt this is connecting with your opponent very often, but the ceiling of +2/+0 for R that can be used multiple times a turn makes the highs and lows of this card feel too disparate.
 - Runed Beetle having the Clue type but not Clue text is a is for me. This design doesn't really add anything to the submission.
 - Black Sun Temple shows us Excavate, and being Classes as an artifact that adds exiling cards from your yard to the level up cost isn't compelling enough for me to have this be a new type. I'm not a fan of chapter 2 being on-board removal, and as a sac it's either "they have a crap creature that insulates their other stuff" or "they're heavily discouraged from casting relevant creature spells". The final mode tying into the first but being unrelated to the second makes it feel like this is just a grouping of standard black effects, making it feel less tight than it otherwise would.
 - Soul Repository is cool. Could imagine it wanting to make the tokens tapped.
 - Translated Text seems fine. I partly wish it worked with Disturb, but working with Digs and Clues and the activated abilities on your Enlighten cards is likely enough.
 - Fractured Core feels misplaced to me. The costs on this feel prohibitive enough that it wouldn't dent Constructed, and also isn't an insane bomb in Limited, making it read like an uncommon to me. I think the card is fine, but similar to Temple it feels like just an assortment of standard red effects that don't really come together for a super tight package.
 - Lia is an interesting concept, but one that with these numbers I don't think plays super well. In Constructed against control, if you're swinging with this t3 instead of ramping something bigger out, your opponent is probably very happy and can kill this without setback. Against other decks, I don't imagine you're ever getting Enlighten off. This makes it seem like the best way to enable the counter part of the mana ability is to put a counter on this through other means, which defeats the point of Enlighten.
- Overall I think you had some solid individual cards, but you didn't take your mechanics as far as I would have liked. Definitely higher on the commons of this entry compared to the other rarities.

Pitch: Plane of [Name] isn't the most evocative choice, but I like your mechanic suite here. Let's see if the cards do it justice.

Map Out the Future // Chronicle of Mistakes - This sure isn't a mistake, as I like the design. Weave Fate with upside, and either allowing a mill side-strategy or just more disturb/excavate fuel. Neat common.

Cavern Collapse - This looks like a flavor include to capitalize on tropes associated with your set prompt, but I quite like the mechanics here also. There needs to be a space before the long dash after "Choose two", though. Gotta pick up the slack on templating at this point, folks.

Disciple of the Ruins - Well-designed common, and I like the flavor. Not much to say past that but this is very solid include.

Eave Leaper - Ah, fixed Renown, good to see you again. Notably I like this a bit less than previous attempts at fixing the mechanic just because it drops the intervening-if clause, because now this triggers every time it connects even if later triggers don't do anything. That's a minor thing, but stuff like that shows awareness of good design practices. Speaking of which, I believe Eave Leaper's activated ability makes you target another thing always, and I don't like that about it.

Erase from History - Decent removal for Limited. This should say "This spell" instead of the cardname (WotC might make you slap Affinity for artifacts instead, but I don't fault this for not doing that). I like the flavortext exposition here giving us the broad strokes of the story's context (slight grammar issues with it, though).

Grand Construction // Stubborn Remnant - 3 mana Ramp with upside! Ramp coming with its own threat attached is exciting, so I look forward to picking this up for Gx decks in this format.

Harsh Sentence // Disrepaired Throne - I'm sensing a pattern here . . . the Disturb cards have so far been solid and well-costed, but I do think putting in three of them gets repetitive. Harsh Sentence isn't bringing anything new to the entry, so I'd have either cut this or the first one. An excellent submission has each slot in the pack communicate something about the set, and I don't feel like this card does that in a way the others haven't already. I suppose there's a flavor beat here, so there's that at least.

Methodical Professor - I would have thought this card was a trap but Disciple of the Ruins makes me higher on it. I like the design when I think about it less as a roundabout Tormenting Voice and more as a way to get artifact counts up for cheap.

Ravenous Puzzler - This is a bit mathy for my liking, I think. Getting this enlightened also looks swingy. I do love the attitude of the flavor, but so far that's two for two on the fixed renown designs being misses.

Runed Bettle - A Clue creature! WotC has demonstrated that they're definitely willing to give pre-defined artifact token subtypes to cards that don't have the token's actual ability printed on them, but this doesn't do it for me. I really wish it at least drew a card in some way.

Black Sun Temple - I'm programmed to think the level costs here are activated abilities, even if the reminder text on excavate could mean that they're not, so I really think they should have colons to signify that they are. I like Classes a lot, so it's hard for me to dislike Digs, although I will say they're not the most compelling evolution of the mechanic. This particular Dig is cool. I like grindy black engines.

Soul Repository - This confirms that UB's archetype is artifact centric, or at least focusing on sacrificing Clues. I dig it, pun not intended.

Translated Text - Another Clue enabler . . . I wish this submission showcased more of what the other Limited archetypes are like, but I do think this is a fun design regardless.

Fractured Core - Awesome. Level 3 looks like it'd be reserved for a wacky high cost do nothing enchantment but getting to build to it from a cheap cost makes this card cool.

Lia, Ruin Runner - How's this getting in combat damage with those stats? Honored Hierarch suffered from the same issues, so this is a disappointing to me. I guess it can't be too significantly beefier statwise given it's a mana dork at this cost, but I think that just means the numbers here need more tweaking.

Mountain - I respect the decision to showcase a Basic, and a Mountain feels fitting.

Overall I think this entry was fine, but wish more things stood out; Digs didn't feel like they're as splashy as they could be, and the enlighten designs generally didn't work for me.

This world feels pretty fun. I like the idea of a “race for treasure” in terms of the lore, and it feels matching with your mechanics. However, in terms of your mechanics, I can't say I'm particularly excited by any of these? Investigate and disturb are both returning, enlighten is functionally renown, and Digs are functionally Classes with exile tacked into

the cost, meaning that nothing mechanically here feels really innovative at all, even if I do like these mechanics in a vacuum. Let's look at the cards, though.

Map Out The Future - Seems solid enough, a draw spell into a mill engine that both lets you pick up more disturbs or try to hit your opponent with it feels solid, and I like the 3U -> 1U+2U curve there.

Cavern Collapse - Neat! Seems a bit weak, but the modality should come in clutch, especially with the ability to hit artifacts as what's probably the "main" mode.

Disciple of the Ruins - I like this a lot, feels well balanced as an aggressive body that can generate a lot of value on the side.

Eave Leaper - Sick! Flying on the AA to get in and trigger your enlighten paired with the ability to grant that flying elsewhere feels really natural, and the card definitely feels powerful but in a way that takes a lot of mana to get going.

Erase from History - Clean, simple, solid.

Grand Construction - Seems very fun, would love to just have a super nice late-game payoff for that ramp spell I'd be happy playing either way.

Harsh Sentence - An upkeep library trigger that's pretty easy to forget I don't super love at common, especially because you could very easily hit multiples of these, but the concept of removal spell that gives you card selection later into the game is one I'm fine with.

Methodical Professor - Cool! I like how this gives you advantage but you need to sink a lot of mana into the card to pick up that advantage, meaning that discarding a card here is a real choice. You also have artifact triggers that this is also very useful for.

Ravenous Puzzler - Eh? Not sure I love a Firebreathing effect this efficient at common, mostly because that's a ton of power you can generate out of nowhere once the creature becomes Enlightened. I think I would have preferred to see this at +1/+0 with a more on-curve body to compensate.

Runed Beetle - Feels like a pretty notable mistake to not have the Clue ability on your Clue creature. Feels like an oversight. Card's fine though.

Black Sun Temple - Seems fine, and I like this as a more value type of spell that can punish your opponent for going too low on cards.

Soul Repository - Very fun arcun! Big fan of the idea of getting those clues via pitching actual spells as opposed to lands, making the ability a notable cost while still letting you loop for a lot of value.

Translated Text - Sure, doesn't really do much for me since we already have a Clues uncommon, but this is a pretty cool idea.

Fractured Core - Nice! I like this as a cheap artifact that lets you generate a lot of value later into the game, especially with that final mode being a really fun payoff towards investing mana into this when you have the chance.

Lia - Feels pretty swingy, right? Having your $1/2$ suddenly become a $3/4$ if you can luck into getting a free attack vs. having it stay as a $1/2$ seems like a really wide delta that I don't love. Concept is there, I just don't think it needs to enlighten so much and also be as much of a weak body as it is.

Set: Vastyn: Battlefield of Immortals

Team Members: AmbroseWinters, Fleur, 1ogic, TheCatsEighthLife

Score: 3

Feedback:

In terms of the blurb, I'm definitely a fan. I like the idea of "favor" and devotion reflected through an energy-like mechanic, and having a different way to spend it depending on the god you choose is really fun. The call to make one of the modes for favor getting access to basics is really solid, just in terms of getting cheap fixing for one of your ally colors. Chosen is also pretty interesting as a way to try and make Auras a little less 2-for-1'y. Embody is also fun as a coalesce-alike that's less powerful but still manages to push aggro really nicely.

Horgruk's Favors - Neat! I like the choice of generating two aggressive bodies for one of the favor options here, as it lets you make a more aggressive Favor that can't save you from losing in combat but still generate board presence.

Righteous Fire - Solid Favor card for common, with a weak removal spell that also lets you save up for a larger favor or just tutor for a land.

Albrai's Edge - Love the idea of using abilities on Chosen cards to prevent your creature from getting 2-for-1'd in combat. The design itself seems pretty fun!

Doubt - Seems solid as a counterspell in a format with a graveyard mechanic.

Invoker of Lanseth - Good choice to include Invokers in this set with the flavor of Gods, I like that a lot. The design itself is cool, and I like it having first strike on attacks paired with that buff, feels relevant.

Seer of Winds - Sure! Pairs with the graveyard mechanic, and the flying definitely seems nice in a set with Chosen where you can buff up your creatures pretty easily.

Death Holds No Sway - Solid use of Embody, seems pretty fun in terms of letting you do a little bit of GY looping while still managing to be aggressive.

Defy - Very cool Chosen answer, think this design rules.

Bloodsoaked Faithful - This feels like a very nice design to take advantage of getting multiple favor triggers, I especially like it in conjunction with Horgruk's where you can generate and then sacrifice creatures with it.

The Illusion of Safety Burns - Love this as an aggressive tool, although the combat math might be a little much for this coming out of nowhere in a graveyard at common, just in terms of your opponent constantly having to keep track of how much they can afford to attack with.

Towering Stature - I do wish this just sacrificed itself instead of another Aura, since it makes this very sticky at common, but the concept is pretty cool.

Scintillating Stones - Fun Manalith variant, especially with how if you get lucky in Limited you can use it to pull out a heavy hitter God card.

Will of the Deceiver - Maybe a little too powerful just paired with the Chosen mechanic, since this can do a ton of damage in one hit, but the concept is very cool.

Voice of Putrefaction - UGH I love this. Augmented as an archetype for one of your "factionless" color pairs is really fun as it lets you just pull all of the multicolored faction cards into a single deck, and if you're able to consistently generate WUBRG, this is fun as a spell that rewards you for playing big spells.

Karega - Seems very fun as a way to generate a lot of advantage for favors, and also generate a lot of power to use to buff your entire board. Feels like a very fun game-ender that can generate mana using Favor and close out the game with a big swing.

I appreciate that the crux of your set is represented in each of your mechanics but in different ways. Having each of the Gods' first favours be the same is a good way in my opinion of supplementing the parts of the mechanic not explained on the card. My instinct is that favours should be locked to sorcery-speed given their lack of a mana cost. With the one favour we see here, being able to create two tokens for no mana cost at instant speed can make Impact Tremors-like triggers feel a bit too trick-y.

- Righteous Fire's baseline of 2 mana deal 2 and tutor a basic feels on the strong end, and instinctively I'd want to push the cards with this mechanic less so they're more likely to be pickable by players going hard on Pledges. I appreciate that you've mentioned the two red gods in this flavour text without making it seem like the character depicted is a disciple of both.

- Albrai's Edge shows us Chosen, which immediately gives me flashbacks to Amonkhet Limited. With this mechanic and with Embody, it reads to me like this Limited environment will play out where it's very unprofitable to block, so I hope to see ways of supplementing that further on in this pack. I do think Chosen is a cool way of making Auras more viable by reducing their vulnerability to 2-for-1s, and this in turn allows you to keep instant speed removal at a powerful level without it ruining the Auras-matter focus.

- Doubt is fine as a Dissipate-like. Including some graveyard hate in a pack with Embody makes sense, though I think there was room to go further with this design. Flavour is fantastic.

- Invoker of Lanseth is a nice flavour nod, though mechanically this card accentuates the "blocking is unprofitable" issue from earlier.

- Seer of Winds lets you pitch Embody cards if you don't want the value and prefer to focus on the beatdown, but another awful blocker with a combat-related "your turn only" bonus has me worried.

- Death Holds No Sway seems solid. The length of the reminder text is a bit unfortunate, and not saying "for its embody cost" limits you from using costs other than mana. I suppose the lack of evasion on these big hasty beaters makes chump blocking more of a

thing. Having a mechanic that only works in 3 colours with the faction-y set structure you've set up feels like a mistake to me.

- Defy is neat, and helps with my blocking issue. Could imagine this kind of effect wanting to be uncommon so people don't have to play around it as much. Fantastic flavour.

- Bloodsoaked Faithful seems fine, if a bit on the weak end. Don't think this needs a second black mana symbol. I appreciate showing us different ways colours have of gaining... favor counters? Just realising you haven't given them a name, which I think they really want.

- The Illusion of Safety Burns seems weak given how tough it already seems to block. The inclusion of this card doesn't really tell me anything that Death Holds No Sway didn't already.

- Towering Stature shows us another way that Chosen auras can protect their creatures, which is good, but doing so in a way that's so similar to how Albrai's Edge does it feels on the too overlap-y end for me.

- Scintillating Stones is neat, though the format does not seem hospitable to this kind of fiddling around with your mana.

- Will of the Deceiver seems like it's meant to synergise with Embody, but both its cost and Embody costs so far being so expensive makes that seem very unlikely to work out. I appreciate that you put your unblockable creature at uncommon so it's less often immediately game-ending with Chosen auras.

- Voice of Putrefaction I imagine is a reference to Lustrebloom Diviner, but in case it isn't I'll judge as a convergent design. This card feels a bit out of place here. I get that's the point, with it showing us what those who aren't devoted to a God are doing, but I think it would hit harder if there were clearer setup for it earlier in the pack, or in your blurb. Mechanically in a set that doesn't seem to lend itself super easily to playing more than two colours, I would want a pretty big incentive to go 5c, and I don't think this lives up to that.

- Karega, Mortals' End using your rare slot to show us something that isn't one of the gods is not what I would expect. The pledge ability is cool, although overall this card feels kinda lowbally in terms of power level. Really depends on what the green gods' ultimate favour ability is.

Overall I think you did a solid job of sticking to the prompt and also making it yours. Very consistent in that regard. I think the submission could have performed better if more was done to supplement blocking - Defy being the only way of impacting the board at instant speed is a lot of weight for one card to carry. The flavour across the board was excellent.

I wish your blurb had some more information of the flavor conceit of Vastyn, but It does a great job explaining your mechanics and their purposes. Fealty in particular is gutsy, splashy but definitely polarizing - though I think I'm ending up in its favor.

Kind of wish you'd used your land slot for something more - even if you still landed on a basic, give it some flavor text! You only have limited space in your pack, so every card needs to contribute something, and "random skull art Swamp" isn't contributing jack.

Big fan of pledges being color-locked, feels like a heads-up solution to the concerns people had about dungeons' potential for color pie fuckery.

Albrai's Edge feels like a solid example of chosen, though I would've liked some example of what their unique qualities enables differently from Auras; perhaps at higher rarities.

Big fan of Doubt. Simple Cancel riffs are always great, and I think the ability to stymie grave value (Embody in this case) is super important for limited control decks' ability to actually function and not just get outvalued by other people playing the game.

Invokers feels like a slam-dunk concept to return here flavorfully, thorough frankly I'm not sure what they're bringing to the table mechanically. I also think Invoker of Lanseth's ability is likely too strong, even for its expensive cost.

The Illusion of Safety Burns and Towering Stature are parts of the pack that feel like they overlap with what we've already seen from the pack, especially since neither of them have room for flavor text.

Scintillating Stones feels super weak; at uncommon this honestly should just be a Manalith.

Will of the Deciever alongside Bloodsoaked Faithful implies that UB is a sac archetype, but we have little idea of what you would sac to these payoffs; wonder if the common one could've been something you'd want to sac instead.

Voice of Putrefaction takes a hard left turn into "hey, there's a 5c archetype," which only makes me want Scintillating Stones to be a Manalith more/feels like it needs to be signalled/supported elsewhere. This is where redundant common slots come back to bite.

Karega's second ability feels kind of tacked on; I would've preferred an alternate way to spend favor or something to that effect. Also, big missed opportunity to show off one of the gods, especially with Scintillating Stones hinting at their existence.

Overall, while I think you had an exciting premise and a good number of cards that felt attractive and fun to play with, there were also a number of choices made here that hurt your entry's ability to live up to its full potential.

I respect the Swamp.

This mechanical suite is cool. Creating alternate resources is a good source of splash, and this specific execution of Favours allowing you to cash in early or use it late if you save up is great smoothing and solid decision-making; plus it's super open-ended with all the different Favours you can pick. Well, okay, there's only five, but there is meaningful diversity in that, even. Stuff like a RG deck taking the RB Favor is good emergent choice-making. I assume the inspiration here came from Stasisbot's [Clique pledging](#)? Within the judge chat, we had some divided opinions on whether we liked the pack only showing us one set of favours, but I think I like that. It makes it more interesting, and makes me want to ask more questions, which is a big win for this kind of challenge. Chosen also lands well; It's... not super different from an Equipment in practice, but those are good, and this gets all the flavour wins of actually getting blessed by a god and using their boosts well. I'm a bit nervous of how offense-heavy it is, since it's a one-off payment to suit up your best attacker every turn and that makes blocking hard while being immune to sorc-speed removal, especially when cards like the Invoker suggest this format is supposed to be slower (well, the set description says its fast, so maybe I'm getting mixed signals). . Embody is a solid Revelation variant, though candidly I'm getting a bit tired of them all, hah; the one-off nature of it makes it less of an insane value proposition compared to normal Revelations, since you're only getting two-and-a-half cards of value instead of the full three+. I think it's the weakest part of this mechanical suite, but it's a good way to go over the top in the lategame all the same and out-card your opponents with more forceful stallbreaking.

Across the pack, I am seeing some very cool individual cards, but not a ton of things that alleviate my worries about Chosen. Defy being the only way to really deal with them (because in addition to the innate flexibility of Chosen, both Chosen cards here also have added anti-blocker/anti-trading tools) while also being a blowout trick makes me worried about counterplaying being speed wars, especially with how many of these cards are additionally offensive-only effects (like the two blue creatures) or attack triggers like the Faithful, and none of them being good at blocking. That amount of aggressive linearity may also shut down some of the decision-making of Favours that I liked, since it makes it difficult to build up to five where the choice really matters of which God you support. I am interested in the other things going on in this pack, like the Voice

of Putrefaction suggesting a theistic approach and not aligning with a specific God as well as being a five-colour thing, I assume based off of grabbing off-colour lands with off-color Favor, but I'm worried that kind of thing is just overshadowed by "s1mple go kill". The emphasis on stallbreakers and ways to go over-the-top also feel odd when there's not really anything defensive to go over the top of, both in terms of the unblockable uncommon, the rare hydra's anthem, or the red Embody piece. I really like Favor as a central mechanic here, and it's a great sell to this brutal world of bloody Godly violence and murderkilling, with dark rituals and spooky monsters and stuff. From the beginning skull-Swamp, the core aesthetic/appeal had me hooked. I feel like, however, it was marred somewhat by being so one-sided offensively, and by having a lot of cards that feel structurally similar, like the two blue cards being "evasive offensive creatures that put stuff in the yard". It's one of the sets that I'd love to see further development on if you all would be up to doing it, as once you even out the offense I think there's a lot here to like.

Horgruk's Favors: Wait did you really not give us all of the God's favors? How am I supposed to evaluate non-Rakdos pledges?

Righteous Fire: This is difficult. I don't really know what the cards do. On its face, this will always be a 2-damage removal spell that tutors for a Jund basic of your choice, which I think is a little too good. I wish I knew what the other red God's namesake favor was.

Albrai's Edge: I like chosen in theory. Really interesting way to do Auras for limited. I don't love this card very much because I think it would make on-board combat frustrating; I'd rather this not have a toughness boost.

Doubt: Sure. I expect I'll see why the graveyard matters mechanically soon.

Invoker of Lanseth: I love invokers. This one is very good. I again don't like this big a toughness boost because in a lot of limited environments this just reads as "{8}: Win combat and probably the game," but I don't mind a big board boost on an invocation.

Seer of Winds: ... weird. Are AAs part of the mechanical theme? If not, I don't think this really does much beyond the ETB looting.

Death Holds No Sway: Yeah, here's the GY stuff. I personally think embody is just a much worse coalesce. These two-for-one's (or in this case, three-for-one) at common are already stressful on complexity. Granting haste makes this really frustrating to play around because there's always a 5-damage attacker lurking in the yard.

Defy: Huh, sure. This is pretty weak (fight is really a one-mana effect these days), but it's not a bad ambush. I don't like how much it can hose a specific limited strategy of yours though.

Bloodsoaked Faithful: Seems like a fine pledge card. I wish I knew what the other black favor was.

The Illusion of Safety Burns: This is a nonsense common. I would be sus of this at uncommon. Playing around this as a known quantity in the graveyard would be horrible.

Towering Stature: Again, this doesn't really feel like a common. A five-mana enchantment that makes something a 6/6 every turn seems game-winning. I'd like to see a chosen card that doesn't save the creature!

Scintillating Stones: Sure. This seems fine.

Will of the Deceiver: Have I really seen anything worth sacrificing? Yeah, not really. I don't think I understand what this card is doing here. It's pretty powerful, but doesn't seem to line up with any of your set mechanics.

Voice of Putrefaction: Is 5c an archetype? This is the first I've seen of it. It looks like there are a lot of big-mana payoffs here but nothing is really supporting them. I don't mind this as a standalone but I don't see how it makes sense in this pack.

Karega, Mortal's End: This spot feels like it really wants to have a God. I don't know what pledging to green does, so I can't really evaluate this. Everything else is so expensive and so under-rate that I suspect the best use of this will be "X: pledge X to green."

Overall: The mechanics make sense with the flavor, but for me, I can't get past not knowing what the cards do. For some, that intrigue might lead them to like this pack more; for me, considerably less.

Pitch: I like the ambition here. Wish we knew what the counter name was (favor counters?). Noting that each pack contains one of the five Pledge reminders mitigates my hesitations toward the concept a bit. I might have gone so far as to make them double sided, just to maximize getting the information to players quick.

Swamp - With all the flash around Basics these days it's easy to overlook a good normal one, and I appreciate the restraint here. Basics are always a good window into the setting and this one's cool enough. Maybe the giant skull is actually a god.

Horgruk's Favors - I like the decision to have each Pledge do basic landcycling a lot. The big reward for this one specifically I'm not sure I like, but it's appealing enough in Limited. I have to comment about the look of the counters not working for me; I'm pretty sure that symbol comes with MSE and that "favor" is a harder concept to symbolize than, say, energy, but I'd have liked something that read better at this size.

Righteous Fire - This looks too efficient with it fetching a basic at base, and the powerlevel of the rest of the pack doesn't indicate that this card is fine for its cost. I like it enough still, and I like the mention of the two gods in the flavor text. There's some weirdness about the reminder text and God being a creature subtype, but what's written here works for me.

Albrai's Chosen - Chosen tries to represent more of the prompt's flavor beats, and it does that well enough, but I can't get over it feeling and looking awkward. I'm sure it'll play fine as far as Equipment go, at least. This specific card looks neat.

Doubt - Cancel with upside that fights back against a set mechanic. I'm into it. And the flavor text is a banger.

Invoker of Lanseth - Slotting an invoker design to capitalize more on the set prompt was a great choice.

Seer of Winds - Neat. This seems great at getting Embody cards in the graveyard, and the AA makes it respectable.

Death Holds No Sway - There's a certain degree of tiredness I associate with Coalesce variants, but Embody is awesome. In fact, I think I like it more than the original mechanic! This card is really cool too, a fun way to do a Gravedigger at common without the usual issues that type of card has. This design combined with the Invoker also leads me to think this is a grindy set, which is a bit contrary to what your pitch mentioned about this being a faster-paced environment. Faster perhaps than it otherwise would be if these were just using Coalesce, sure, but the individual designs here don't reflect the alleged format speed at all.

Defy - Your team really likes one word spells that hose set mechanics, huh? This is a fine fight spell. What a diss on that flavor text.

Bloodsoaked Faithful - I'm realizing it's going to be difficult to judge these pledge cards without knowing what the other gods give you, but I'm willing to believe they're all about the same power level as the provided example. This card looks all right.

The Illusion of Safety Burns - Panic effects are often mediocre but slapping Embody on it definitely makes it more appealing. I think the power here is a point off but that's a minor thing.

Towering Stature - Eugh, I'm not a fan of unkeyworded totem armor. I also think this is a bit more complicated than what it wants to be with it letting you sacrifice other Auras to save the creature.

Scintillating Stones - This fetches Gods but we don't see any in the pack. That feels like a misstep to me. I also think this could just be a manalith straight up. Not big on this at

all, even if it seems like it's also meant to fetch Revelations (which I assume are all sorceries).

Will of the Deceiver - PSA to everyone in this competition: If you're still using cardnames in place of "This spell" in cases where you shouldn't, this is your wake up call to brush up on templating changes introduced in DOM. With that said, I like this card enough.

Voice of Putrefaction - I suppose with all the basic fetching a 5c archetype makes sense. This design is cool and I hope to enable it in Limited.

Karega, Mortals' End - Just about what I'd expect from a hydra that wants to use pledge. The AA is a bit funny with it affecting itself, but overall this is a serviceable rare.

All this considered I think Embody is the high point of the set. I wish more things stood out, though.

Set: Voyages of the ARK-7

Team Members: Crashington, elmikkino, cdnewlon, Grapple

Score: 2

Feedback:

Pitch: I like this summary a lot, and the concept of the Fade is eerie and awesome. But will the mechanics pull through?

Swiftwater Cliffs - Gainlands are always a welcome addition to a Limited format, though part of me wishes an attempt was made at your own take on a new common dual. Those are always challenging to get right so I understand the "don't fix what's not broken" mentality here, at least. My biggest issue is with the art choice. It seems that to make up for this being a reprint, effort was put into amping up the aesthetics, but the actual piece here evokes neither "Swiftwater" or "Cliffs"; I'm usually for recontextualizing cards in a new setting, lands especially, but this doesn't work. I looked up the piece just to be sure of what I was looking at, and the full picture does make a bit more sense, but the cropping here loses it scale.

Ferrophage - Neat common. I like that it implies a lot about the set while remaining simple. Also . . . please . . . no spaces after the long dash in flavor text attributions . . . I don't want to have to write that reminder in future challenges, so survivors be warned.

Sparrow-Class Exosuit - It's an upgrade to Dragonfly Suit. Not much to say past that. I do like that exosuits are the Vehicle theming of choice for this set. Textbox is in dire need of better chopping.

World of Waves - This is the mechanic I was wishing your team would get right just from reading the pitch. Unfortunately I don't think it nails it. Planet as a spell type feels dissonant and the casting restriction is so-so. I can see what this was going for, but it just feels like watered down MDFCs.

Not As We Know It - Cool commune spell, showcasing an archetype. I like the rider, especially if Vehicles are at common.

Investigate Formations - Artifact emerge! I'm into it and it's my favorite mechanic here. Not the first time I've seen it, but that doesn't take away from it at all. This card in particular seems like a fun Tormenting Voice riff.

Migratory Thurrock - Gotta have rep for alien life in here, I suppose. More of that non-Human, nonartifact theme. Bruckst better get themselves moving. Space those ellipses . . .

Stasis Capsule - This is great. Cheap fodder for Refine and captures a trope I'd expect from the set concept.

Shadow of Fear - Y'all should have proofread each others cards, why does this drop the ball hyphenating nonartifact? It's about what I'd expect of the premier black removal at common, and I do like the flavor text introducing the Fade.

Mite-Class Rover - And we have regular colored artifact creatures too, cool. The second mode is a bit "just there", though. Think it could do a bit more.

Planetfall - Discover doesn't work for me, sorry. I think there's an awareness here of why this mechanic isn't the best since the first card you show me with it lets you scry, getting you some degree of control over the randomness this mechanic relies on. But the keyword being "conditional cantrip" and stopping at that is underwhelming. It always getting you a land if you reveal one is something, at least, and Planets do help with that, but whiffing from this isn't going to feel good.

Interstellar Cartographer - If this is supposed to be a signpost I feel like it's not doing a good job at it. UG Planets maybe? Something that repeatedly discovered and/or keyed off of discovering would have been a better fit for this, I think.

Seal-Class Bathyscape - Capital V for Vehicle. Crew should go below the curiosity anthem. This signals a Vehicle theme in a Ux pair. With the only other Vehicle in the pack being white I'd assume it was WU, which is kinda disappointing since that's the same colors Vehicles were last time they were an archetype in canon.

World of Rot and Rebirth - Off-color Planets do seem more interesting, but my feelings toward it don't change much.

Kiil, ARK-7 Captain - I don't want to think of what happens when you somehow have two of these out, and past that, I'm not sure I like that tap ability. Combat math looks super annoying with this but at least it bites it to spot removal. For what seems to be a crucial character this card feels a bit underwhelming designwise.

H-9K Prototype - Oh I like this. Might be my favorite card in the whole entry. Exciting use of the foil slot, at least.

Overall I have to say that there's enough mechanical misses here that lower my excitement for this hypothetical set, but some individual designs are cool.

Solid blurb - clues me in to the premise, story, and tone of the set, while also hinting at what the mechanics of the set and their play patterns are.

Swiftwater Cliffs is not a great note to start on. While reprinting the gainland cycle is not an inherently bad choice for a set, here it's essentially a waste of a slot since it doesn't take the opportunity to tell us anything about your set. No flavor text, and the art itself feels ill-cropped and inappropriate for a land. Also feels like an unfortunate choice coming off of the blurb emphasizing the importance of land themes.

Not a fan of Planets - while their "differently named lands" theme at first seems to imply some sort of buildaround, the threshold of 3 is super low/trivial. There also isn't any indication of what a planet deck would look like beyond "I drafted a bunch of Planets I guess-" the uncommon Planet slot could've been used for this, in my opinion. Showcasing offcolor planet spells is neat, but less imperative than this in my opinion. The sorcery type being Planet as opposed to a land type also feels unintuitive, in my opinion.

Not As We Know It is a cool riff on a staple common slot that also serves to establish tone and mechanical theme. It's a shame Migratory Thurrock and to a lesser extent Shadow of Fear hit similar notes, though at least Shadow of Fear has neat FT.

Refine is cool, and Investigate Formations is a solid example of how it would show up on cards. Emerge was used more for haymakers that justified the sacrifice, though, so I wonder if just "slightly increased value" is enough for a draw. Minor thing, but I wish Stasis Capsule had been placed right after Investigate Formations here to answer the questions of "okay, so what am I sacrificing for Refine?"

Not a fan of Discover. Really needed a whiff protection clause like Explore, or some other adjustment to prevent it from being as swingy as it is. I think there's some lip service paid to how it could be built around/enabled in the pack here, but generally just saying "play all cheap spells" doesn't feel like a meaningful condition - it's difficult and unwieldy in limited, and potentially trivial and very powerful in constructed. Low point for the entry for me.

Mite-Class Rover feels like a plant for Refine sacking, but given it scale off of MV, feels sort unimpressive for that purpose/you'd take things like Stasis Capsule over this for that purpose every time.

How are lands getting into grave for Interstellar Cartographer?

The vehicles in this pack Exist, but I'm gonna be honest, neither one has hooked me mechanically or flavorfully, and haven't really felt like they've added to what the pack is showing. It's one of the repetition factors that made me get to the end of the pack and go "wait, that's it?"

Kiil is Okay, but feels like it was a flavor-based design made in a vacuum that doesn't really contribute to set themes when this slot desperately needed to do so.

H-9K Prototype - Wish this was more attractive to cast unrefined, a solid constructed plant otherwise.

Overall, I think your mechanic suite set you up for failure, and distribution and choice of individual designs severely hampered your ability to effectively overcome that hurdle.

I am intensely upset there is an improperly formatted em-dash on the Ferrophage flavour text. Instant negative twelve million points.

Scuffing past that, I think the pitch of this set as "humanity's last adventure", going across the stars, lands. Being able to showcase all sorts of sci-fi, alien worlds is an appealing conceit and I like that as a baseline, getting to bounce around like a space opera. The emphasis on artifacts and non-Human creatures hits that beat to me. I'm not super sold on these keywords, though. Discover is just, like, draw a card. It's got a condition to it, but the entire mechanic is just "play land and draw card". It doesn't really feel like it's encouraging any specific play pattern or novel strategy, even in deckbuilding--you either play big things with big lands, or cheap things with few lands, but that's just like... what already happens. And in the latter deck, whiffing with an early discover seems rough. Planets also just don't feel like it's doing a lot, three lands is just "your default 2c deck basics and one Planet", which is a really soft cost in deckbuilding or in play, and the modal reward means you have no reason to not be trying for it. Planets as sorceries are also awkward flavour-wise in my mind. Refine, however, is solid; it's a fine enough riff on Emerge and it has more costs and more opportunities using artifacts instead of creatures, which I think is enough to sell it to me and make me interested in it (Ichor Wellspring MVP). The keywords do have one big advantage in that they all flow together and can comfortably share deck space with each other, and reinforce similar themes.

Across the commons, they all seem pretty fine to me. I am noticing a trend here--and other judges have marked it too--that across the board this round, there have been a lot of "safe" designs that function well, but just being simple riffs on staple commons or creatures with set mechanics attached, don't do a good job of showing off what y'all can do as designers. They fit realistically as what might appear in a pack, but aren't doing anything worth writing much about. In this pack, cards like Not As We Know It or Migratory Thurrock are doing that, and while it's not a bad thing to have some staples, it's the cards like Investigate Formations that hype me up, and the balance is tilted away from the novelties. Showing off the two different "models" of Planets is a high point I will note here; the off-colour Planet is cool and suggests broader set trends that emphasize more colours at higher rarities, which I like a lot, especially contrasted to the regular archetype uncommon you've got.

I think there are very solid pieces here for a good ecosystem, and I'm a big fan of this kind of high-flying across-the-galaxy flavour, which I think is landing well, but I don't feel like the mechanics are doing enough to sell the whole thing alone, and the individual cards are a lot of stuff I can find in any old set. It's a hard prompt to work with, so I don't envy the task y'all had to do. And some of the stuff wouldn't be huge changes to get workable (Planets going to four lands and being renamed, like "Landings" or something, for example). But it's just ended up to me a bit shy of a dozen.

Swiftwater Cliffs: Always a good land-slot card, but boy does this art not have water or cliffs in it.

Ferrophage: I like this as a common support for an artifact sac deck. I'll be evaluating it as a support card throughout this pack based on what artifact sac I'm shown.

Sparrow-Class Exosuit: Weird to see the token as a Dies trigger, but I guess it makes sense. Generally I'd imagine that when your mech suit blows up you die with it, but maybe not always. Card seems fine.

World of Waves: Not big on this mechanic. Planet is not a good name for a sorcery subtype. I like spell lands, but I like them as lands that have effects attached to them on the battlefield. Having to choose between the two seems like a nuisance since mana is so important in Magic.

Not As We Know It: It'll be interesting to see what artifact creatures show up here. This is a fine version of this effect. It really should have a line or two of FT. Where you have space in this competition, use it.

Investigate Formations: Yep, this is a natural progression of emerge. The card seems fine. I don't think the refine cost needs to be double-pipped.

Migratory Thurrock: I appreciate that this all feels very alien so far. This card seems like a fine common. Mechanically it's showing off similar space to Not As We Know It, so I do wish I was getting more of an idea of the limited environment.

Stasis Capsule: Huh. Okay. I don't mind this card. I like it as a piece for the artifact sac deck. I wonder if it needs to cost {2}.

Shadow of Fear: Your big removal spell in black should hit all creatures. I get the flavor here, but you're doing yourself a mechanical disservice for the small flavor beat, which you should really never do.

Mite-Class Rover: Hey, an artifact creature! Totally fine card.

Planetfall: I like that discover gets better the more you discover, but right now it's very roulette-heavy. It'll always pick up a land if you find it, but the fact that it has a weak fail-case is frustrating. I'd rather this be like explore, where if you don't hit, you at least get something out of the deal. (I realize this card can stack the deck so you aren't missing, but I really doubt every card that discovers will do so.)

Interstellar Cartographer: Nah. Putting the "choose one" makes this card much less interesting to me. I'd like an aggressive body to rebuy your planets; I'd like a card that discovers with some payoff for discovering. This is just a swiss army knife that doesn't feel like it really belongs in any archetype.

Seal-Class Bathyscaphe: Okay, I'm going to guess there's a white/blue Vehicles archetype. I like this card, though I think the text could just say "whenever a Vehicle ...". I also think it's a mite overcosted.

World of Rot and Rebirth: Still not vibing with this mechanic. I guess this gives me an idea of what the archetype is, but black/green sac isn't novel.

Kiil, ARK-7 Captain: I guess they go on rescue missions? This card has neat flavor, but feels very fiddly. I also don't love that you can use the AA as a combat trick to pump your board, since it's already a combat trick to save a creature.

H-9K Prototype: Really strong card. Good at two, good when refined.

Overall: The flavor is strong. I think your mechanics are hit-or-miss. I'd have liked to see a few more cards indicating limited themes.

In terms of the lore here, I'm interested. I like the idea of a set exploring lots of different worlds with those themes of both exploration and running from the Fade. The mechanics are interesting - I like Refine in terms of flavor and think using an artifact-specific mechanic to reduce your costs is pretty cool as well. Discover is a very fun card advantage tool and feels simple and neat. Not a fan of Planet, however - the condition feels pretty trivial in Limited, since all you need is two basics and one other land that's either a nonbasic one your drafted or a third basic, and "Planet" as a sorcery subtype as opposed to the name of a land mechanic just feels awkward.

Swiftwater Cliffs - That is neither swiftwater nor cliffs. I like gainlands here but rename the land if you don't want to find art that works for it.

Ferrophage - Neat! Works nicely with Refine and other artifact-matters themes, and the flavor is cute.

Sparrow-Class Exosuit - Kind of a feelsbad that this makes a token that could crew it, but can't because the ability only triggers when the Suit dies, but the design as a whole is fine.

World of Waves - Not a fan of Planets on the whole, this design feels fine though.

Not as We Know It - Sure, I like the idea of making a "batching" that addresses the class of aliens. Seems solid.

Investigate Formations - I like that it draws more as you sacrifice an artifact, letting it work in pie, while still feeling simple and not clunky. Seems very fun.

Migratory Thurrock - Seems fine, no real feelings either way.

Stasis Capsule - Seems fun as a cheap cantrip artifact that works as fodder for refine, solid.

Shadow of Fear - Neat! Love the representation of "the Fade" here, and the design feels solid as common removal.

Mite-Class Rover - Again, solid as an option for something to sac with refine, overall I fuck with it.

Planetfall - I like this a lot as a cool Preordain riff that feels balanced, since you have restrictions on what you're allowed to pick up with it.

Interstellar Cartographer - Doesn't really land as a signpost, but the design on the whole seems fine as either a cantrip creature or a way to turn on your Planets.

World of Rot and Rebirth - Don't really like the call to go for off-color Planet spells, just feels like an odd choice when you have the space to make mono and multicolored lands with the same color of Planet. I also feel like the design would be cuter if it could also sacrifice lands and was more expensive, considering that it's a very land-centric design.

Kiil - Sure, feels like a fun leader for a Human/artifact creatures deck. Don't really love how this would work with combat tricks or other anthems, just in terms of getting a ton of boosts out of nowhere (maybe if it keyed to the number of +1/+1 counters instead of raw power?) but the concept is definitely there.

H-9K Prototype - I feel like this is a waste of the foil slot - this is just a really simple design that doesn't tell me much new. On base, it's just a vanilla, and on refine, all it is is a Chupacabra. Doesn't do much for me.

The premise of your set taking place on many different planes that we haven't seen before faces the dilemma of "showing too diverse a range of planes can make the set's aesthetic feel incohesive" and "showing too same-y a range of planes means the set isn't delivering on its goal". Interested to see where you land on this.

- Ferrophage seems like a fine filler common, though with Refine involving individual sacrifices for bigger effects, this card's suggestion that players should be sacrificing a lot of stuff feels a bit lost to me.

- Sparrow-Class Exosuit being Dragonfly Suit that dies into a 1/1 feels both like not the best include in a submission, and not the best way of making the card more playable.

- World of Waves shows us Planets, and while I love the flavour of using planets as your nonbasic lands (which I drop a bit on with your inclusion of Swiftwater Cliffs), I don't think the restriction of needing 3+ different lands is really worth its own mechanic beyond MDFC lands. The size of the text box you're left with when using the Adventure frame seems incredibly limiting as well.
- Not As We Know It seems like a fine enough filtering spell. Putting a tribal/card type restriction on a classic card archetype isn't the best way to showcase your designs, but it could do a lot worse.
- Investigate Formations mechanically is solid. I'm glad you opted to have the mechanic be reduced by mana value rather than mana cost, so that it doesn't get fiddly with coloured artifacts.
- Migratory Thurrock seems fine, but it doesn't really tell me anything about the set that Not As We Know It hadn't already.
- Stasis Capsule feels like a bit of a missed opportunity where you could have given us something with a death trigger to better fuel Refine. I'm not a fan of cutting stun counter reminder text here.
- Shadow of Fear has fantastic flavour, but this is another mostly reprint of an existing card archetype with your set's tribal tag attached, and doesn't show me anything new.
- Mite-Class Rover gives us another artifact to sacrifice to Refine, but it isn't super compelling for that goal. Unless the majority of your Refine cards come with additional value rather than just cost reductions for sacrificing something (which is the case for Refine cards in this submission, but I imagine the design space of just that area isn't deep enough for a full set), the second mode of this isn't enough of a failcase for me to really be grabbed by this card in Limited.
- Planetfall has great flavour. Mechanically, I think the ballsiness of riffing on Ponder at common and the synergy between scry and Discover is enough that it doesn't fall into the same trap as things like Shadow of Fear, if barely. Discover is a difficult one to judge without seeing it in action - I like that it technically promotes two different decks (only cheap spells vs ramp), but it seems like it would suck to have it whiff, and with Refine encouraging you to run more expensive things that you want to sacrifice there is a bit of tension here. It's hard for me to imagine there being a ton of design space for this mechanic at cheaper costs where you need something like Scry in order to not wipe out player agency for the mechanic, but then it also becomes trivial on more expensive cards.
- Interstellar Cartographer recurring lands is cool for Planets, but it being a 3-drop is not the best place on the curve for supporting that interaction. I can appreciate Discover being a modal choice to give players some more agency with it, but the other option being as restrictive as needing a land in your yard lessens that slightly. If this is intended to be a signpost uncommon, it doesn't tell me enough about what deck it's trying to support to do a great job of that for me.

- Seal-Class Bathyscaphe being the most expensive artifact in the set but not being something you'd ever want to sacrifice to Refine hurts the mechanic for me. The card on its own with no other vehicles seems very weak, and while including a vehicle with evasion in the pack helps make this card read better, it still feels kind of out of place here.

- World of Rot and Rebirth is a cool individual card, and it indicates to me that you're wanting to facilitate some extra multicolour-matters, which is something it tells me about the set that World Of Waves does not. However, its inclusion means that World Of Waves isn't telling me anything about the set that isn't covered by this card.

- Kiil feels vastly undersupported by what you've shown me about the set so far. There are no ways in this pack of supplementing Human creatures' power, 0 power is bad for crewing Vehicles, and there aren't any creatures I'm interested in bouncing with this. Those make me low on it in Limited, and in Constructed it seems largely too slow except in situations where enabling the first ability is trivial, in which case this card seems very swingy.

- H-9K Prototype is sweet. Gives me a nice balance between a solid floor for an aggressively-slanted aristocrats shell and one with later game value built in. I don't love that the Refine cost here is literally a kicker given that the cheapest the Refine cost can be is the same as the card's regular casting cost, though.

Overall I think this entry played it on the too safe end. Many of the cards in this pack riffed too closely on existing cards or card archetypes to showcase much of your design talents, or they overlapped too much with other cards in the pack which put a limit on how much depth you could actually show about the set.

Set: Pursuit of Perfection

Team Members: Orion Rings, Admirallvy, Lordpat, Queen Emily

Score: 2.5

Feedback:

Talandris Archivist: Interesting way to start. Card is fine; I'll be interested to see what you do with either artifacts, colored mana, or both.

Academy Exiles: ... I sure hope if I scroll down I find the Philosopher's Stone. Okay, there it is; interesting. The fact that it's just a card-draw effect doesn't really enthuse me. I'll be interested to see what else you do with it. Side note: weird to have study tied to an "ETB or dies" at common since the token it makes is legendary.

Amphibification: This card basically exists already.

Elira's Hex: Not a terrible way to do this "add ingredients" effect; I'll look forward to seeing what this looks like at higher rarities.

Encased Experiment: Funny to have a mechanic that untaps artifacts and then a common artifact that taps ... and also sacrifices to activate its only effect. Card seems fine. Not sure why it's an artifact yet.

Fool's Gold: Missing a period here. Don't like milling cards attached to the final ability because it starts to get very lottery-like. Overall I'm not really sure what this card is doing for this entry.

Speed Read: I think you can probably get away with this at two mana. I don't think I'd ever play it at three.

Ingredient Eater: What a cutie. Love the flavor here. Do you have a mechanic that puts counters on creatures? Why is this Mouse a 3/3? (Edit: Right, Adapt is in here. I don't think the +1/+1 bonus is huge, but it's a fine signpost common.)

Blood Brewer: Sure. Seems neat.

Senior Apothecary: I suspect this card is better than you're giving it credit for. The 2/2 lifelink for two is already quite good.

Botany: Fun naming scheme. The card seems okay. I doubt you're ever picking Gardening since Gathering is only one mana more and infinitely more valuable.

Wily Transmuter: Explains the Experiment to some degree. I think this would be a very fun signpost to play with. Oh, also explains the treasure to some degree!

Novice Firemaker: I'd rather this only let you play this turn if you're going to make the payoff a Treasure token. I like the thought though.

Practical Professor: I don't mind this effect. Getting artifacts/enchantments into the graveyard is difficult. Weird that this isn't in the same color(s) as the artifact-sac theme. I don't think the brew effect is particularly exciting compared to the base case since it's basically just "draw a card."

Garden of Sorrows: Surveil is significantly more powerful than scry, so these might prove to be more powerful than the environment can reasonably handle. I don't mind the idea of at least testing them, though.

Overall: The idea is there, and it's cool. I wish the Philosopher's Stone did something more exciting, and I wish your multicolored permanent support was more diverse (hybrid, anyone?). There are a few cards that don't really feel like they belong in this entry, but it does feel cohesive at the end of the day.

Pitch: The plot seems vaguely close to Strixhaven from the little I know of Extus but that's all whatever, this blurb has me sold.

Talandris Archivist - This looks like a cut above what I expect ratewise for a colorless card, but if the rest of the pack carries on this power level I'm into it. Nice worldbuilding flavortext to start, even if once again I'm reminded of Strixhaven's Biblioplex.

Academy Exiles - This quickly had me scrolling down for what might the Philosopher's Stone be, and I'm not disappointed. Keying off of multicolor with it is very cool! The failcase for study I'm not as high on, though. I get it's supposed to untap the Stone but you still have to have tapped it and paid (2), and then pay (2) again to get value. At least putting Talandris Archivist upfront does signal there's artifact creatures to use it on, too, so it's not a total dealbreaker for me. One thing I feel strongly about is the naming choice for the artifact. It's definitely alchemy-in-your-face but I wish it had a more Magic: the Gathering(TM) spin to it. I don't know, call it a Philosopher's Mox or something (that's not perfect either, as I'd expect it to add mana then, but I hope what I'm intending here comes across. You probably get the idea.) As for the actual card here, I know the dies trigger is what makes this feel black but needing to hold up (2) for the Stone is a chore.

Amphibification - This is just hybrid Frogify, but I'm willing to overlook that aspect of it and commend what this tells me about the set. Multicolor is important for enabling the Philosopher's Stone, and putting hybrid at common makes sense.

Elira's Hex - I don't like Brew. I'm fully aware it will play fine but the formatting choice here is so jarring. I think you could have gotten away with just saying "Brew a creature card" here and so on. I also wish at least one card in this entry did things with cards that have been brewed, which would be a nice distinction to separate it from being "just kicker". With that said, this actual card is a nice removal spell, no other complaints.

Encased Experiment - This is neat! Funky typelines for tokens does make a set more memorable, and Homunculus Drake feels apt for an alchemy-themed set.

Fool's Gold - Missing a period after Surveil 1. Seems like a fun artifact and I appreciate this being a study target.

Speed Read - Another showcase of what can be done with study, this time as a rider on a spell effect. Flavor's fun, not much to say past that.

Ingredient Eater - And the set has common gold cards too, cool. Big chunker of a mouse this is, but I respect the statline. I like that this also tells me that GW is about +1/+1 counters, too. Adapt time.

Blood Brewer - See this would read so much better if it just said "Brew two cards". Serviceable common. ". . . if it was brewed" reads weirder on permanents than on spells, but I respect the decision to be consistent with the wording.

Senior Apothecary - Adapt is probably one of my favorite mechanics of all time, and I'm glad you chose to expand it to other colors. I do think the potential of this being a 4/4 lifelinker is pretty scary, and I can see this needing to be 2/1 at base, but I like it enough despite that.

Botany - We've seen so many variations of Sagas, Classes, and this type of ". . . added effects"-style cards that there's part of me that's no longer wowed by them. Disciplines are another story. I like these a lot, and Botany is well designed. There's a bit of a nonbo with Gardening and Adapt creatures, though.

Wily Transmuter - This elevates the inclusion of the earlier Encased Experiment for sure. Neat signpost!

Novice Firemaker - I'd have let this brew instants too (I know there's associations with red and sorceries but that's become less relevant in modern design), but it's a feel good card overall.

Practical Professor - This doesn't feel like a Druid but I like it enough, Tutoring for what was brewed is definitely a sensible rare slot for this mechanic.

Garden of Sorrows - I personally wouldn't print these at common just because canon has designated Temples at rare, and I think there's value in figuring out what new common duals look like without just resorting to shifting down existing ones. But I'm putting all that aside as I do also believe these could be common, so I have no issues here. The flavor is fun, too.

Philosopher's Stone - I already said what I wanted to about this in my review of Academy Exiles, but I want to repeat that I like this a lot. Making it legendary was a neat choice and obviously including the token in the pack was a must.

Overall I'm pretty happy with your team's work, some quibbles with templating aside. Good job.

Excellent blurb; sets up the setting, story, and stakes, and then goes on to concisely explain your mechanical suite and their intended play patterns/flavor resonance. Well done.

We're running into my biggest issue with this entry early, which is the study mechanic itself. First of all, I think the name is more than a little underwhelming given its splashy nature, and has potential to be confused with learn. Mechanically, I want to like it. There's something really compelling about having an entire limited revolve around a single Macguffin, and racing towards a goal. Unfortunately, it feels hitched to the wrong horse here; immediately being able to create the Stone feels underwhelming flavorfully, and mechanically there isn't a tangible accumulation of resources or working towards a threshold that makes each untap feel like it's stacking up to something more significant - hell, with the looting, I'd almost have supported Literal Threshold here. You could argue that the looting helps you find a multicolored permanent faster, which is true, but it presupposes that that isn't already trivial, which given there are hybrid and multicolored permanents at common, sure feels like it is. It feels like some sort of Dungeon-esque or adjacent tracker that leads into creating the Philosopher's Stone at the end would've been both more evocative, splashy, and effective. Just something that actually represented more of a gradual buildup of resources overtime.

On Academy Exiles, if it dies thanks to a removal spell or having to block, you're less likely to have mana up to re-sue your Philosopher's Stone.

Amphibification is neat, feels like an entirely appropriate shift into hybrid.

Elira's Hex is a simple execution of the Brew mechanic; I do wonder if it's too simple/justifies a slot, especially when to really sell Brew, you have to show more complex or focused uses of it elsewhere anyways. Overall, I kind of don't feel like the entry ever succeeds in showing off what differen brew decks would look like/how drafters would be incentivized to make it more than trivial/incidental, which is awkward given how many slots are dedicated to it.

Big fan of Encased Experiment. Simple, effective Wind Drake variant that plays into set themes and flavor.

There's a section in the middle devoted to the +1/+1 counter archetype in GW, and I kind of wish it was more directly aggressively oriented. Brew and Study are already very focused on accumulating and spending value over time, it would've been neat to see a more aggressive take on Adapt to punish those/play at a different speed instead of the whole format being semi-durdly. (Which honestly feels like it'll turn into "whoever sticks a multicolored permanent first wins.")

Botany is a neat showcase of disciplines, playing into a set theme we've already seen, but honestly I think it drops the ball in making both modes equally attractive; at their current costs, you pick Gathering every time in most scenarios.

Garden of Sorrows has no period at the end of "surveil 1."

Overall, I think you had an ambitious concept, with some effective individual designs, but Study just didn't effectively carry the weight you put on it, and the execution of Brew failed to sell it.

The set-up here is solid. Alchemy is cool, and a variant on Strixhaven wizard college lands as a good basis to set this up. Mechanically, feels like this is leaning very heavily on the Philosopher's Stone for appeal, since as you admit, Brew is just a kicker with a good name, and Adapt is a well-functioning workhorse, same as the Disciplines. But I honestly am not super sold on it? I don't really feel like I'm actually... doing anything with the Stone. All of the questions it asks are in deckbuilding, between the number of Study-ers (considering diminishing returns after you create the Stone, one the first use) and the number of gold cards, and even then I kind of just... always run it anyway? Because it's a mana sink card draw engine? I don't feel like it actually is influencing my gameplay or my strategy in interesting ways. That's a bit unfortunate for the heart of the set. Ironically, even though Brew is a much less splashy mechanic, I feel like it does a better job being the "heart", since there are a lot of different ways to deckbuild for different Brew results, including the same "foci" study does with artifacts or gold cards, and how you enable it in-play and with what lines does offer a lot more choice. Looking at individual cards, most of these are very solid staple effects, but there isn't much that's special happening here, so I'm a bitwhelmed. It feels like this entry played it very safe, with cards like Academy Exiles just being a Hill Giant with an ETB/LTB set mechanic, or Blood Brewer and Senior Apothecary being curve fillers with topdeck upgrades. The most exciting stuff here were the artifacts, Fool's Gold and Encased Experiment in particular, but I'm not actually seeing the stuff in this pack that makes

their oddities worth it; since only the Transmuter does anything there. The highlight of these cards is definitely Botany, the Discipline. This is good modality and offers a "modular" buildaround that you can change in play--compared to the other three mechanics here being much more linear and deckbuilding-based, this one does the best job of changing how I play and offering me more choices.

Holistically, I think there's solid pieces here, but it's not coming together in a way that satisfies me. Selling Study as the heart of the set didn't land with me, and I think you played it too safe with a lot of the cards when you needed to show off what made these mechanics cool, especially when the environment is asking for so many different things. The setting seems solid; I think you did a good job distinguishing it from Strixhaven and putting alchemy as the "important thing", and the Discipline was a standout concept both flavourfully and mechanically. I just wanted more than I think this pack could give.

In terms of the lore, not sure how much I get out of this that I don't already get from Strixhaven? Sure, there's the bent of potions instead of magic, but for the most part it just feels very "multicolored school, but there's an evil person with a plot afoot."

Mechanically, I think this is pretty interesting, with Disciplines being a cool take on the school theme, Brew being a graveyard kicker variant which pairs nicely with Study, and Adapt serving as a more creature-based mechanic. Study as your central mechanic is interesting - I don't think that I love that all the condition needs is multicolor, especially in a format with hybrid, but I like the idea a lot and think that the ability to untap your other artifacts if you already have it is cool.

Talandris Archivist - Seems fun as a larger creature that seems like it might be able to more reliably attack without dying and generate Treasure to either ramp or play a more multi-color focused deck.

Academy Exiles - I like study triggering twice here, since it lets you play this and get your token down, then when it dies, you'll have the mana to be able to trigger it twice in a turn.

Amphibification - omg... frog... Cool design! I like that this is a multicolored card for Study, giving this otherwise basic design some interesting context in the format.

Elira's Hex - Seems like a fine removal spell for common.

Encased Experiment - Seems neat as a creature body that comes down with an artifact in your graveyard, effectively, letting it be valuable for brew and other potential artifact themes.

Fool's Gold - Neat as a cheaper artifact you can untap instead of untapping your Philosopher's Stone, but I wish that the AA operated on a different axis other than CA so it felt meaningfully different from the Stone. In a vacuum, fine card. Add the period after surveil.

Speed Read - I like the mirroring of the discard/draw into the token that lets you draw/discard, design feels solid.

Ingredient Eater - I like this as a tool for a more aggressive GW deck that works really nicely with Adapt, feels fun.

Blood Brewer - I like the numbers here, as a 4/3 feels like a reasonable reward for the pretty low cost of 2 cards into your graveyard, and the 3/2 mode is also just fine.

Senior Apothecary - Cool! Adapt 2 feels relevant here for more lifegain, and the starting body is also solidly fine.

Botany - I like this mechanic a lot, both in terms of the general concept and the formatting. This is a solid example of it and feels very natural.

Wily Transmuter - Given that your pack had two artifacts with sac triggers, as well as brew, this is a good call on an archetype, and the design of the signpost works well.

Novice Firemaker - Love this! The Treasure feels like a fair reward for having cast a sorcery earlier, and it definitely feels relevant when you want to play the card you exiled as well as another spell from your hand, potentially. Fun design.

Practical Professor - Also a big fan here, as it feels like a fitting reward for brewing an artifact and an enchantment to get the card you tutor into your hand as opposed to topdeck, and the card tutoring for the brew condition makes it feel like a full package.

Garden of Sorrows - I like this at common to allow you easy ways to start getting things into your graveyard for Brew, needs a period after Surveil.

I'm all for school sets, but your blurb treads a lot of the same ground as Strixhaven, beyond just the school setup itself.

- Talandris Archivist seems fine, though decks running colourless cards often find themselves on the less aggressive/proactive end.

- Academy Exiles show us Study, and I'm not sure where I land on this mechanic.

Having a mechanic revolve around a legendary artifact is quite splashy, but having the keyword that makes it not have any hoops and be thrown around like this (multiple times on one common) dulls that splashiness by a significant amount for me.

"Multicolour matters" being the gimmick of the Stone feels like selling such a powerful artifact short.

- Kassantra's Amphibification, meet Kasmina's Transmutation. Sure I can buy this in hybrid WU, but including a reprint and just changing the colour is rarely going to do anything to showcase your design talent in this competition, regardless of how good of an idea including it in a set might be.

- Elira's Hex shows us Brew. I suppose this mechanic is intended to work with the discard mode of the Philosopher's Stone? Representing Alchemy in Magic is something I've seen a lot of people attempt, given how exciting of a concept combining reagents is, but just being an on/off switch of "Kicker - exile stuff from yard" doesn't feel like the most

compelling way of representing it, and cards like this exiling only a single card hardly feel like anything is being brewed.

- Encased Experiment I imagine is meant to incorporate part of the "artifact focus" you mentioned in your blurb, but besides Wily Transmuter (which isn't the most exciting payoff), I don't get the vibe from this pack that the set actually cares about artifacts.

- Fool's Gold seems fine, though with three set mechanics as mana sinks (Study, Disciplines, and Adapt), this doesn't feel like something I'd want to be doing in Limited.

- Speed Read is Tormenting Voice with Study glued on. This design doesn't show me anything that Academy Exiles didn't already - utilise your limited design real estate to show us what unique things cards can do with your mechanics!

- Ingredient Eater seems like a solid beater. The synergy with Adapt is a lil awkward timing-wise, since a tempoary +1/+1 buff is hardly helpful in the stage of the game where players have mana to adapt stuff rather than wanting to cast spells, but its synergies elsewhere are fine.

- Blood Brewer shows us that Brew can care about card quantities rather than just card qualities, which is a good reason for this card to exist in your submission. The flavour text feels rough.

- Senior Apothecary has the same issue as Speed Read. We already know what Adapt does, and putting on an otherwise- French Vanilla creature (even if it's in a different colour to its original appearance) doesn't show us anything about your design talents. The card individually also seems kinda cracked at common - lifelink bears are already first-pickable cards in a lot of Limited environments.

- Botany shows us Disciplines, which I'm high on! I think the kind of modality this mechanic offers is great, especially on a buildaround engine, where most of your other mechanics play out on the more linear end. I think the Gathering specialty wants to be more expensive, since I don't imagine people are often picking Gardening as-is. It's a bit odd that picking Gathering also means the lifegain only occurs once a turn, but I don't mind that as a sacrifice the player needs to make.

- Wily Transmuter seems fine, though I'm not sure what this card mechanically has to do with transmuting, given Amphibification seems to represent transmuting, and doesn't work with this.

- Novice Firemaker and Practical Professor fill the same role for me, as well as filling the same role as your other Brew cards, being "brew as kicker". With the inclusion of this many Brew cards in your pack, I hoped you would show a wider variety of things the mechanic could do, such as a card caring about the qualities of what has been exiled to make a brew ("If it brewed a multicolor card" for example). The wording of "If this creature was brewed" reads awkwardly.

Overall your entry seemed to make an ambitious start with trying to capture very splashy concepts with your mechanics, but their mechanical representation didn't reach the high bar you set for me, and there was a good deal of overlap between what your

cards showcased which prevented you from showing us much depth of design expertise.

Set: Zetvia

Team Members: Garduu, Cool Beens, Jallaba, Pacifist Westwoman

Score: 3.83

Feedback:

This might be my favorite plane pitch this round, which is impressive given that you had a prompt that did not have the intrigue and details to latch onto that would normally spur this level of worldbuilding. I like the explicit articulation of the speed and expected play patterns of the format, how you want players to feel, and how your mechanics contribute to that.

Harvest Scythe feels too similar in slot to Giant's Skewer, in my opinion.

I like that Grovalen Sharecropper allows you to exert it upon becoming tapped for non-attacking reasons - feels like that's to its flavorful and mechanical benefit, representing the work being done directly and allowing it to be used in more ways than it was initially in Amonkhet. However, you saying that Exert is in RW and then the only noncombat mode of exertion being in U feels awkward to me.

Not a fan of Put Out to Pasture, given the timings and costs that are likely going to be associated with having an artifact ETB relative to how this would likely be ideally used. It being the only example of Industry in the pack also feels awkward - like, on one hand it's not a tough mechanic to envision uses for, but we wanted to know how *you* envision its use in this set, and Put Out to Pasture doesn't tell us a lot in this regard.

Satiate is an interesting mechanic, sort of mixing the state-based tracking of a Renown with the sacrifice synergies of an Exploit. Feels like a neat variant on existing mechanic play patterns that justifies itself in how the pieces it's picked and chosen interact in new ways. I like that it gives you a way to cash in Food to proactively advance the gamestate.

Gore Boar feels redundant when we already have a midsized Satiate exemplar in Carnivorous Crop.

I think Thresher Thopter sort of helps me articulate my worries around Cultivate, in that it's really hard to justify using keyword counters over +1/+1 counters given how insanely effective it can be to give a whole board a strong keyword, and even +1/+1 counters start to stack up pretty quickly. I think you've appropriately considered the rate here, but I think it presents a strong developmental concern.

I think Satiates and Cultivates got a lot of space in the pack, while Exerts and especially Industry were left out to dry/needed more representation. Overall, though, I think you effectively created an environment with strong synergy points between its mechanics, with flexible and attractive commons and cards in general. Also, the art direction and flavor of this set are simply a cut above. Really excellent work in that regard.

I was not expecting "evil Farmville" as a set concept. I think this is immediately engaging and interesting; it reminds me a lot of the indie tabletop games where "no framing device is too out there". There's a lot of ideological imagery here, too, with the heavy emphasis on co-ops and unions, almost collectivization. Your mechanical suite makes me a bit nervous, though. I love the idea of using actual bodies as a currency here, and Satiates making me "feed" people to the monsters has that kind of greater-good feel of a lot of RTSes, as well as Cultivate being a novel build-'em-up that pulls from the same vein as, say, what Zangy did in [Alkabah](#), but has more uniqueness to fit the plane. But tying the core essence here to Food feels a bit weird; Food is a bit low-hanging-fruit that abstracts a lot of the imagery from the world into this clean little token, and it's also got concerning play patterns with how much easy Food access clogs and slogs up a game state. When the set is pitched as being slow and resource-intensive, Food certainly slows down the game... but I don't see the kind of stallbreakers that can manage that unless you're using the high-value Cultivate keywords with a good, developed Plant board.

The art and aesthetic here lands really well. I like this sort of clockwork-agraria, and it's a good use for the Jakub Rozalski art that I often wish I could find a use for. The interplay between your different mechanics here lands very well, especially the more subtle ones, like how you can pitch excess Cultivate Plants to Satiates creatures if you're not in a Cultivate-heavy deck, or how Food tokens enable Industry (though that's a bit low hanging fruit once again, hah!), with the highlight here being the Grovalen Sharecropper connection's to Vehicles, and crew costs letting you exert it safely for extra tokens. I do feel like a lot of these cards are a bit safe, design-wise, that are solid staples but aren't telling me too much about your design skills, like Indentured Shepherd being just a funcprint, or your two Satiates commons playing the same way. Ravenous Reaper did a good job of doing something more than just "when satiate, bigger", and that's showing the mechanic's depth better even if it's less true-to-life about all the cards that'd have it as a real set average. Beacon of Good Harvest looked at first glance like a bomb mythic, but in truth, it's a pretty intensive buildaround to go bomb-y, and I appreciate that restraint. Also I see the male angel art.

I'm not convinced this entry gave me enough to not worry about Food-spam and the effects of that on a Limited format, but I feel like there's enough happening here beyond that that I like that I'd want to see this set actually go through some iteration and further development. The core here lands for me well, and I really like the grindy, attritive

build-'em-up wide gameplay that it's selling me with. It would have benefitted you for some more novelty in your designs, since this doesn't need to be a "realistic" pack, but I can make peace with that when they are solid role-players that get some new identity, like the Shepherd is.

I love the twist you put on this farming world rather than just going for the theme at surface value. The aesthetic is sweet. I appreciate that you went into the depth of outlining all your archetypes (even if most of them are standard)

- Abandoned Homestead being a land cycle that asks for a mana payment on etb is a bit of a rough sell, but ultimately not worse than Rupture Spire or the like. I kind of wish you'd strayed away from Food, as it tends to be the obvious go-to that ends up warping a set around utilising the tokens, and isn't associated with the most enjoyable play patterns.

- Blessing of the Harvest Moon certainly pulls some weight as a trick. Putting a lifelink counter on anything can do a lot at common, and the condition doesn't seem all that tough with Vehicles in the set. That said, I do like this condition and how it enables multiple deck styles (go-wide aggro and Vehicles-matter).

- Harvest Scythe is different enough from Giant's Skewer, but still feels a bit derivative. The play patterns on this feel a bit awkward - it can gain you life, but to do so you need to give up a blocker.

- Indentured Shepherd has fun flavour, but just being a colourshifted reprint of Doomed Dissenter doesn't really tell me anything about you as designers.

- Grovalen Sharecropper shows us Exert, and utilises a new way of using the mechanic. This is great! Showing us the different ways a mechanic can be operated (especially for returning mechanics) is a fantastic use of your pack real estate. I could imagine a 3/2 being too high of a floor for getting a token every second turn when you have a Vehicle out, but I don't think it's a damning balance point.

- Overgrow seems like the bread and butter Cultivate card for the set. I misread at first that this actually creates two Plants, though that might just be a skill issue. I'm into it.

- Put Out to Pasture shows us Industry, which incorporates the flavour you hinted at earlier with Indentured Shepherd in a fun way. I think there were more interesting things you could have done with your sole representation of this mechanic in the entire pack, though balance-wise it seems fine.

- Scarecrow's Stare has me a bit confused. Judging by the rest of the pack, I'm not sure why this has a reflexive trigger (to avoid fizzling to a sac outlet I guess?), or why it isn't just a creature with an etb. It would support Industry and Satiating exactly the same if it were a creature. Being an artifact Man-O-War for an extra mana doesn't add a lot to your submission.

- Carnivorous Crop shows us Satiating, which is a bit odd to me as a special action rather than an activated ability (though it isn't a big deal). This set seems to be doing the same

thing as Eldraine with Food in encouraging you to sacrifice them to outlets rather than their own ability, and while that can help make the games drag on less by cutting out the lifegain, it makes the Food feel pretty irrelevant as mostly textless artifact scraps. The floor of a 4 mana 4/4 reach seems too high to justify the ceiling of a 4 mana 6/6 reach that sacs a Food.

- Tillerwalker shows us that Vehicles are in the set as a way of helping trigger Exert and enable the WU archetype. I appreciate that it also contributes to its own crewing to help ease the higher crew cost.
- Gore Boar seems quite sad up against Carnivorous Crop, and doesn't really tell me anything about the mechanic or set (or flavour) that Crop didn't already.
- Voracious Plowbear is pretty much what I would expect from a Food signpost uncommon. Not the most interesting or exciting design, but I do appreciate the inclusion of "Whenever you sacrifice a Food" abilities to help the sac abilities of Food actually feel relevant.
- Grain Sorters is a neat individual card, but it doesn't really tell me anything about the mechanic or set that Grovalen Sharecropper didn't already.
- Thresher Thopter shows us that cultivate can utilise keyword counters. While this doesn't show me much about the mechanic or set that Overgrow and Tillerwalker didn't already, it's at least something. I think this would be a fun uncommon buildaround and payoff.
- Ravenous Reaper combining sacrifice payoffs with Satisfy payoffs is a fun extension of the mechanic's triggers. I appreciate that this feels playable in Constructed while not necessarily being an unbeatable bomb in Limited.
- Beacon of Good Harvest is a mythic I would expect to utilise Cultivate in this set. However, while I dig the flavour, it doesn't tell me anything about the mechanic that Thresher Thopter didn't already.

Overall I think you did a solid job of making the prompt your own, with this not at all feeling like Stock Standard Farm Plane. The synergy between your mechanics felt well thought-out. The main area I think you could improve is to try and make sure each card in your submission brings something new to the table, whether that be by not including close-to-reprints, or by having your Mechanic features show us different ways the mechanic operates or can be utilised.

Pitch: Sounds like your team got the short end of the prompt-stick, but from the blurb I was definitely at least curious to see if you pulled off what you had to work with. I like that you included the full archetype list. The mechanic suite I'm not too impressed by, so let's see if the individual designs get there . . .

Abandoned Homestead - My first question after reading the prompt was why satisfy was given to red, given it can't be generating Food. Of course it could just sacrifice

creatures to make it work still, and be tertiary, but it's weird to make it only work with one half of the mechanic. I appreciate that the first card in the pack addresses that immediately, with what I assume is a full cycle of Food duals. I hesitate with these a bit given the stall potential Food has, but the rate is actually so abysmal that I suppose it's fine.

Blessing of the Harvest Moon - Moment of Heroism with upside, not much to say past that other than the bonus reading a little clunky. Flavortext introduces us to The Crows, which is neat.

Harvest Scythe - Satiating enabler. Seems all right to mediocre.

Indentured Shepherd - Give this thing reach, look at those robo-tilts! Another synergy piece for satiate, it seems. Again not much to say here. Wish there was some more spice to these commons.

Grovalen Sharecropper - Repeatable token generation is often inadvisable at common, but this card makes it work. Curious how keying off of being tapped instead of attacking changes the equation when you have Vehicles about, though. I have to say that exert and satiate in the same set feel like they play into similar styles, but I'd have to play with the actual cards to know for sure.

Overgrow - I think cultivate is the lowlight of the mechanic suite. It just doesn't feel compelling as a keyword to me, and 0/1s make for terrible board states. I like the flavor exposition here, at least. "Agrimancer" is a neat word.

Put Out to Pasture - I guess there's giants in Zetvia. Industry is a workhorse mechanic but one that I like a lot, and it's hard to go wrong with solid common creature removal. Cardname's fun and makes sense for the set.

Scarecrow's Stare - Is there a reason this is a sorcery? I suppose I do like the idea of the 2/2 token in this set being Scarecrows, so I don't mind that it is. Finally more exposition on the Crows.

Carnivorous Crop - Our first satiate card and it's definitely potent. Flyers aren't getting past this after you feed it. I suspect the numbers here are off slightly but I like it regardless. I do like the choice to have actual Plant cards in the set so Cultivate has more going for it.

Tillerwalker - This would be a weird include if you didn't list down the Limited archetypes. I'm still not convinced cultivate was worth it, though.

Gore Boar - Decent common. Will definitely want to satiate this ASAP.

Voracious Plowbear - The art's a little silly and doesn't fully sell 'Voracious'; as a signpost it's fine if a bit simplistic.

Grain Sorters - Pretty exciting exert uncommon. The mechs in the background sell this a lot.

Thresher Thopter - The more I see of Cultive the less I like it, but this is a sensible blue uncommon slot with it.

Ravenous Reaper - I like how you went about giving this a general sac trigger and making the satiate a bonus rider. Fine rare.

Beacon of Good Harvest - Cultivating double strike I have to admit is pretty splashy, but less so when you're putting the counters on 0/1s . . . at least this puts one on itself.

Overall I feel like this entry is lacking splash factor, which isn't usually a problem for me when I have the full set context, but is something that definitely helps within Survivor.

Abandoned Homestead: Assuming this set cares about Food in multiple ways, I'm cautiously optimistic about these. Food does stall limited quite a bit though, so I'll be looking at how your cards incorporate Food into winning the game.

Blessing of the Harvest Moon: Banger name, banger art. Caring about tapped creatures right off the bat is interesting. I'll be looking for ways to tap outside of combat. I like keyword counters, so this is another cautious optimism point for me.

Harvest Scythe: Sure. Again, I'll be looking for how you turn these Foods into ways to end the game, not just prolong it.

Indentured Shepherd: Not really sold on the flavor here. I like leaning into Scythe art for this booster. Red better have an evident sac theme in this set. (Edit: Just remembered you spelled out the archetypes for me. So it does.)

Grovalen Sharecropper: I can't wait to see what taps creatures outside of combat. Card seems fine. I like that you can't use the Peasant as a blocker if you tap it on your opponent's turn.

Overgrow: Cultivate is pretty cool. I don't really like ""cultivate +1/+1"" but I'm assuming I'll see like ""cultivate trample"" later in this entry. Seems like it has potential to get really overwhelming.

Put Out to Pasture: Interesting way to care about Food. Card seems fine.

Scarecrow's Stare: Sure. Neat enabler for industry.

Carnivorous Crop: Ah, here's a good Food payoff. This card is bonkers, but the idea is cool. Given how easy it is to get Food in this set, this is pretty reliably a four-mana 6/6, which seems wack.

Tillerwalker: Finally, a Vehicle. The numbers look like they were pulled from random.org but I like the idea of a Vehicle that makes plants grow.

Gore Boar: That name, lol. I'd rather these cards be simpler at common; 5/4 that satiates for menace would be fine.

Voracious Plowbear: Nice art find. This card is great.

Grain Sorters: Sure. I think this could be a 2/2 without much hassle.

Thresher Thopter: Yeah, this is basically what I was expecting. The flavor doesn't really make sense, and I think if you cultivate twice and then hit this you basically always win the game. Neat idea, but the power level is rare for sure.

Ravenous Reaper: Cool card. Toplevel doesn't really match up with the effect, but I think it'd be fun to play.

Beacon of Good Harvest: This card doesn't make a lot of sense. I like double strike on the cultivate trigger as a top-end, but the 3/6 flying trample body also looks randomly generated.

Overall: The mechanics work. The flavor works. I come away from this pack interested in firing up a draft of the set, and that's good enough for me.

I feel like y'all did a killer job of taking what you were given and making it feel really interesting. Mechanically, I think some of these are solid. Exert and Satisfy both feel like cool choices just on the lens of looking at a world where resources are scarce and you need to scrap what you can together to survive. Food makes a lot of sense in the farming world. Cultivate is also a cool choice in terms of a farming mechanic, although unless a lot of the Cultivate options are +1/+1, I'm not sure how effective making an army of 0/1's with a bunch of keywords and no way to use them really is. Finally, Industry is functional if not a little boring (although the synergy with Food is nice.)

Abandoned Homestead - Food-lands are a fun idea here, and I think they make a lot of sense to pair with the Industry-artifacts theme as well as the general flavor of the set.

Blessing of the Harvest Moon - I like this as an archetype to complement Cultivate generating you tokens and Exert tapping down your creatures, and it feels solid as a combat trick.

Harvest Scythe - Dope, menace and a combat damage ability is definitely solid, and this being an artifact that generates lots of Food tokens makes it great for Industry.

Indentured Shepherd - Doomed Dissenter but a Shepherd, and again it makes a lot of sense to have a death-trigger card with Satisfy.

Grovalen Sharecropper - Kind of surprised we never got a design like this in Amonkhet - feels simple, clean, and fits in nicely.

Overgrow - Seems fun as a way to generate two plants, and it definitely feels solid to pair with a lot of the other Cultivate effects.

Put Out To Pasture - Works fine as common removal, and as an Industry spell.

Scarecrow's Stare - Seems solid! Not really sure why this is a spell and not a creature, but this FT is really fun worldbuilding paired with the flavor of the card.

Carnivorous Crop - I think this is definitely overtuned, as with a single Food it becomes a 4 mana 6/6 that can dominate combat. Design-wise, I like it though - just probably wants to be like, one counter, or 3GG or something similar.

Tillerwalker - This is giving me the implication that most of the common Cultivate effects are +1/+1, which if true is a choice I like a lot. The commons creating the power and the uncommon's giving your Plants cool abilities is a fun idea. I also like the design since if you're already playing a lot of Cultivate effects, you can get your Plant to crew the Tiller, which is neat.

Gore Boar - Seems like a solid enough Satisfy creature.

Voracious Plowbear - Seems pretty solid, especially because you can pair it with Satisfy creatures and sacrificing Food to them also triggers the Plowbear.

Grain Sorters - Love this design as a small creature that you can swing in with to get a decent amount of card selection once or twice before it goes down. FT is very fun.

Thresher Thopter - Seems like a solid flyer that lets you get a ton of value if you're all in on Cultivate.

Ravenous Reaper - Satisfy as a rider to a general sacrifice ability is really cute, and the design feels solid for a rare, letting you grow a huge creature and sacrificing to deal damage somewhere along the way.

Beacon of Good Harvest - Love this. Cultivating double strike is super splashy and fun for a mythic, especially when it gets to also turn itself on. Definitely exciting for a heavy cultivate deck.