

III CAP Project

MODULE 5: VIDEO 4 OUTLINE

SLIDE 1: LEVERAGING CAPCAT 1.2 PLUS FOR REPORTING AND PRESENTATION OF RESULTS

Fiona Hollands, Ph.D.

Senior Researcher

Department of Education Policy and Social Analysis (EPSA)

Teachers College, Columbia University

SLIDE 2: PLANNED REPORTING FOR RR vs FFW STUDY

For each program (RR and FFW):

- Summary metrics
 - Total costs to district
 - Avg costs per school
 - Avg costs per student
- Cost Breakdowns
 - Costs per resource category
 - Costs per component
 - Cost per site

Comparative costs of RR vs FFW:

- Summary metrics
 - Incremental costs per school
 - Incremental costs per student
 - Cost – effectiveness ratio

SLIDE 3: CAPCAT 1.2 Plus

- Screenshot of CAPCAT Project Cost Analysis Template 1.2 Plus (CAPCAT 1.2 Plus)

SLIDE 4: SUMMARY TAB

- Screenshot of Cost analysis results spreadsheet
- Arrow pointing to Summary tab

SLIDE 5: TOTAL COSTS OF RR AND OF FFW IN CAPCAT 1.2 Plus

- Screenshot of Cost Analysis results spreadsheet
- Arrow pointing to Summary by condition table

SLIDE 6: TOTAL COSTS OF RR AND OF FFW IN CAPCAT 1.2 Plus

- Summary by condition table
- Arrow pointing to the condition column which lists:
 - Treatment
 - Control
 - Total

SLIDE 7: TOTAL COSTS OF RR AND OF FFW IN CAPCAT 1.2 Plus

Summary by condition table:

- Row 1:
 - Condition: Treatment
 - Costs using local prices: \$1,469,891
 - Costs using national average prices: \$1,501,869
- Row 2:
 - Condition: Control
 - Costs using local prices: \$177,345
 - Costs using national average prices: \$186,011

SLIDE 8: TOTAL COSTS USING LOCAL PRICES

Total Costs Using Local Prices chart:

- Reading Recovery: \$1,469,891
- Fast ForWord Reading: \$177,345

SLIDE 9: TOTAL COSTS USING NATIONAL AVERAGE PRICES

Total Costs Using National Average Prices chart:

- Reading Recovery: \$1,501,869

- Fast ForWord Reading: \$186,011

SLIDE 10: SUMMARY TAB: SUMMARY METRICS

Summary metrics table:

- Row 1:
 - Metric: Cost per Schools in T (average)
 - Local prices: \$97,993
 - National average prices: \$100,125
 - Local prices adjusted by geographical index: \$109,489
- Row 2:
 - Metric: Cost per Schools in C (average)
 - Local prices: \$11,823
 - National average prices: \$12,401
 - Local prices adjusted by geographical index: \$13,210

SLIDE 11: SUMMARY TAB: SUMMARY METRICS

Summary metrics table

- Row 1:
 - Metric: Cost per Schools in T (average)
 - Local prices: \$97,993
 - National average prices: \$100,125
 - Local prices adjusted by geographical index: \$109,489
- Row 2:
 - Metric: Cost per Schools in C (average)
 - Local prices: \$11,823
 - National average prices: \$12,401
 - Local prices adjusted by geographical index: \$13,210

SLIDE 12: SUMMARY TAB: SUMMARY METRICS

Summary metrics table

- Row 3:
 - Metric: Cost per Student in RR (avg)
 - Local prices: \$7,538
 - National average prices: \$7,702
- Row 4:
 - Metric: Cost per Student in FFW (avg)
 - Local prices: \$909
 - National average prices: \$954

SLIDE 13: GRAPHICS TAB

- Screenshot of the Graphics tab with charts:
 - Ave. Cost Per Site in Local Prices USD
 - Treatment: \$97,993
 - Control: \$11,823
 - Ave. Cost Per Participant in Local Prices USD
 - Treatment: \$7,538
 - Control: \$909
 - Treatment – Costs in Local Prices USD
 - Personnel: 94%
 - Materials: 1%
 - Facilities: 2%
 - Other inputs: 3%
 - Control – Costs in Local Prices USD
 - Personnel: 29%
 - Materials: 1%
 - Facilities: 2%
 - Other inputs: 69%

SLIDE 14: COST BREAKDOWNS: COSTS PER RESOURCE CATEGORY

- Summary by resource category table
- Arrows pointing to the Resource category row headings: Personnel, Materials, Facilities, and Other inputs

SLIDE 15: COST BREAKDOWNS: COSTS PER RESOURCE CATEGORY

- Summary by resource category table. Data for Treatment (Reading Recovery) is highlighted:
 - Personnel for Treatment:
 - **Costs using local prices: \$1,381,679**
 - Costs using national average prices: \$1,418,924
 - Local expenditures: \$ -
 - **% of local costs for this resource category: 94%**
 - Personnel for Control (Fast ForWord Reading):
 - Costs using local prices: \$50,713
 - Costs using national average prices: \$59,379
 - Local expenditures: \$ -
 - % of local costs for this resource category: 29%
 - Materials for Treatment:
 - **Costs using local prices: \$17,412**
 - Costs using national average prices: \$17,412
 - Local expenditures: \$52,150
 - **% of local costs for this resource category: 1%**
 - Materials for Control:
 - Costs using local prices: \$1,549
 - Local expenditures: \$1,549
 - Local expenditures: \$1,948
 - % of local costs for this resource category: 1%
 - Facilities for Treatment
 - **Costs using local prices: \$32,590**
 - Costs using national average prices: \$32,590
 - Local expenditures: \$8,000
 - **% of local costs for this resource category: 2%**
 - Facilities for Control:

- Costs using local prices: \$1,917
- Costs using national average prices: \$1,917
- Local expenditures: \$ -
- % of local costs for this resource category: 1%

- Other inputs for Treatment:
 - **Costs using local prices: \$38,209**
 - Costs using national average prices: \$32,942
 - Local expenditures: \$65,779
 - **% of local costs for this resource category: 3%**

- Other inputs for Control:
 - Costs using local prices: \$123,165
 - Costs using national average prices: \$123,165
 - Local expenditures: \$123,067
 - % of local costs for this resource category: 69%

- Total – Treatment:
 - **Costs using local prices: \$1,469,891**
 - Costs using national average prices: \$1,501,869
 - Local expenditures: \$125,929
 - % of local costs for this resource category: 100%

- Total – Control:
 - Costs using local prices: \$177,345
 - Costs using national average prices: \$186,011
 - Local expenditures: \$125,015
 - % of local costs for this resource category: 100%

SLIDE 16: COST BREAKDOWNS: COSTS PER RESOURCE CATEGORY

- Summary by resource category table. Data for Fast ForWord Reading is highlighted
 - Personnel:
 - Costs using local prices: \$50,713
 - Costs using national average prices: \$59,379

- Local expenditures: \$ -
- **% of local costs for this resource category: 29%**
- Other inputs
 - Costs using local prices: \$123,165
 - Costs using national average prices: \$123,165
 - Local expenditures: \$123,067
 - **% of local costs for this resource category: 69%**

SLIDE 17: GRAPHICS TAB

- Screenshot of Graphics tab with pie charts highlighted
 - Treatment – Costs in Local Prices USD
 - Personnel: 94%
 - Materials: 1%
 - Facilities: 2%
 - Other inputs: 3%
 - Control – Costs in Local Prices USD
 - Personnel: 29%
 - Materials: 1%
 - Facilities: 2%
 - Other inputs: 69%

SLIDE 18: COST BREAKDOWNS: COSTS PER RESOURCE CATEGORY

- Summary by resource category table
- Data highlighted in the Local expenditures column:
 - Personnel:
 - **Reading Recovery: Local expenditures: \$ -**
 - **Fast ForWord Reading: Local expenditures: \$ -**
 - Materials:
 - **Reading Recovery: Local expenditures: \$52,150**
 - Other inputs
 - **Fast ForWord Reading: Local expenditures: \$123,067**

SLIDE 19: ILLUSTRATING COSTS VS EXPENDITURES FOR FFW

Costs vs. Expenditures of FFW by Resource Category chart

- Costs using local prices:

- Personnel: \$50,713
- Materials: \$1,549
- Facilities: \$1,917
- Other inputs: \$123,165
- Total Costs: \$177,345
- Local expenditures:
 - Personnel: -
 - Materials: - \$1,948
 - Facilities: -
 - Other inputs: \$123,067
 - Total Expenditures: \$125,015

SLIDE 20: SUMMARY BY RESOURCE CATEGORY TAB FOR MORE GRANULAR RESULTS

- Screenshot of the Cost analysis results by resource category table
- Arrows pointing to the Start-up and Ongoing phases, and Summary by resource category tab

SLIDE 21: SUMMARY BY COMPONENT/ACTIVITY

- Summary by component/ activity table
- Arrows pointing to the Resource category row headings: Supervision, Training, Program delivery, and Evaluation

SLIDE 22: PIE CHARTS OF COSTS BY COMPONENT FOR RR AND FOR FFW

- RR costs by component and FFW costs by component pie charts
 - RR Costs by Component (Local Prices)
 - Supervision: \$31,656
 - Training: \$50,847
 - Program delivery: \$1,385,913
 - Evaluation: \$1,475
 - FFW Costs by Component (Local Prices)
 - Supervision: \$7,493
 - Training: \$129
 - Program delivery: \$169,723
 - Evaluation: -

SLIDE 23: COSTS BY SITES T TAB FOR SITE LEVEL ANALYSIS OF TREATMENT SITES

- Screenshot of Costs by site – Treatment sites table
- Arrow pointing to Costs by sites T tab

SLIDE 24: COSTS BY SITES C TAB FOR SITE LEVEL ANALYSIS OF CONTROL SITES

- Screenshot of Costs by site – Control sites table
- Boxes highlighting:
 - Costs using local prices
 - Costs using national prices
- Arrow pointing to Cost by sites C tab

SLIDE 25: COSTS BY SITES C TAB FOR SITE LEVEL ANALYSIS OF CONTROL SITES

- Screenshot of Costs by site – Control sites table
- Arrows pointing to columns:
 - Costs Using Local Prices
 - Total
 - Sum, Local
 - Avg, Per participant Local
 - By Resource Type
 - Personnel
 - Materials
 - Facilities
 - Other
 - By Stage
 - Start-up
 - Ongoing
 - Costs Using National Prices
 - Total
 - Sum, National
 - Avg, Per participant National
 - By Resource Type
 - PersonnelN
 - MaterialsN
 - FacilitiesN
 - OtherN

- By Stage
 - Start-upN
 - OngoingN

SLIDE 26: COSTS BY SITE CHART FROM CAPCAT

- Screenshot of Costs Per Treatment Site By Ingredient Category (Local Prices USD) chart

SLIDE 27: TOTAL COSTS BY SITE

- Screenshot of the Site Level RR Costs Per Student (Local Prices) chart
- Data highlighted:
 - Site 6: \$5,233 per student
 - Site 12: \$10,849 per student

SLIDE 28: TOTAL COSTS BY SITE

- Screenshot of the site level FFW Costs Per Student (Local Prices) chart
- Data highlighted:
 - Site 1: \$1,069
 - Site 2: \$1,069
 - Site 15: \$782

SLIDE 29: COMPARING SITE LEVEL COSTS IF T AND C ARE IMPLEMENTED IN THE SAME SCHOOLS

- Screenshot of the RR vs FFW Costs Per Student (Assuming T and C sites are the same) chart

SLIDE 30: SUMMARY TAB: INCREMENTAL COSTS

- Summary metrics table
- Metric: Cost per Schools in T (average)
 - Local prices: \$97,993
- Metric: Cost per Schools in C (average)
 - Local prices: \$11,823
- Metric: Incremental cost per Schools
 - Local prices: \$86,170

SLIDE 31: SUMMARY TAB

- Summary metrics table
- Metric: Incremental cost per Students
 - Local prices: \$6,628

SLIDE 32: COST-EFFECTIVENESS RATIO

- CE Ratio equals Incremental Costs per Student divided by Incremental Effects per Student
- Equals \$6,628 divided by 0.2
- Equals \$33,140 per s.d. increase in reading comprehension

SLIDE 33: COST-EFFECTIVENESS PLANE: AVERAGE COSTS AND EFFECTS

- Screenshot of Excel scatterplot showing average incremental costs and effects of Reading Recovery vs Fast ForWord Reading across the district.

SLIDE 34: COST-EFFECTIVENESS PLANE: COMPARING SITES

- Screenshot of Excel scatterplot showing site level effect sizes as well as site level costs for the 15 sites
- Schools 1 and 2 show negative effects and costs are over \$5,000 per student

SLIDE 35: COST-EFFECTIVENESS PLANE: COMPARING PROGRAMS

- Screenshot of scatterplot comparing average cost and effect size of several reading programs

SLIDE 36: MODEL PUBLICATIONS FOR REPORTING ECONOMIC EVALUATIONS

- Screenshot of the Model Publications of Cost Analysis And Cost-Effectiveness Analysis Results section in Module 5