

Moving from an Initial Claim to a More Nuanced Claim

Tropical Fish as Pets

Modified from [National Writing Project Argument Writing Course: Crafting Claims](#)

INITIAL CLAIM

Write a Claim

Make an initial claim about tropical fish as pets. Write your claim below.

Be sure your claim is:

1. Debatable — other people might disagree
2. Defensible — you can defend the claim with evidence: facts, data, personal experiences, etc.

Reflect

What did you base your claim on? (prior knowledge, experience, etc.)

REVISING YOUR CLAIM

Read and Revise

Now that you have made an initial claim, study the issue more closely.

- Read each excerpt in the first column.
- As you read, your initial claim might change.
- If your claim changes, write your new claim in the middle column, and then write what changed your thinking in the third column.
- You may wish to use these [sentence frames](#) to help you craft your evolving claim.

Read each excerpt. . . (Links to full texts are included)	Did your claim change at all? If so, write your new claim here. Use the claim frames to help you revise your claim.	What changed your thinking?
<p><i>Collectors douse the coral reefs with cyanide, which is ingested by the fish who live there, and as reported in Scientific American, "The resulting asphyxiation stuns some fish and sends others into spasms, making them easy to grab by hand or net." Half the affected fish die on the reef, and 40 percent of those who survive the initial poisoning die before they reach an aquarium. Cyanide also kills the coral reefs themselves, and marine biologists rank it as one of the biggest dangers in Southeast Asian waters.</i></p> <p>https://www.peta.org/teachkind/humane-classroom/fish-classroom-pets</p>		
<p>Catching fish from tropical coral reefs around the globe 6,10,11,12, small-scale fishers have been the primary procurers of marine aquarium, or ornamental, species 6,13, this is especially true in the Indo-Western Pacific 4,13,14. These individuals who participate in the sourcing side of the trade, are an oft-overlooked part of a larger global population working in small-scale fisheries, which employ over 100 million people 15—more than the other largest ocean sectors combined. 16,17,18.</p> <p>https://www.nature.com/articles/s44183-023-00033-7</p>		
<p>Freshwater species tend to be easier to maintain in captivity, generally have lower mortality rates and, since most are captive bred, don't pose as great a risk to wild fish stocks. Nevertheless, they too suffer in captivity and the conservation</p>		

<p>implications of their trade are not benign. The International Union for Conservation of Nature issued a report in 2003 indicating that a large number of freshwater fish are collected from the wild, particularly in Brazil, Colombia, Indonesia, Peru, and East African countries. For these species, overcollection can result in localized depletions and extinctions, capture-to-tank mortality can be high, and they also can become invasive species if released.</p> <p>https://awionline.org/awi-quarterly/2015-fall/ethical-and-ecological-implications-keeping-fish-captivity</p>		
<p>A local fisheries advisory council — made up of environmentalists, divers, fish collectors, tourism industry officials and others — recently moved to strengthen the regulations. Their new rules limit species that collectors may capture to a list of 40.</p> <p>Arielle Levine, a San Diego State University marine conservation expert who recently co-authored a paper on the success of the no-collection zones, said they're doing "an impressive job" of protecting and increasing fish populations.</p> <p>Other factors harming the area's coral reefs haven't been as well managed, she said.</p> <p>Reefs are being smothered when sediment and nutrients like fertilizer wash into the ocean from coastal housing and hotel developments. Algae-eating fish that would prevent excessive plant growth from choking the reefs are heavily fished for food.</p> <p>https://www.oregonlive.com/environment/2014/06/hawaiian_tropical_fish_at_cent.html</p>		