

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman - Student Panel Transcription**  
*John Michael Autobiographical Lecture Series - 2013*

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** I'd like to thank all of you for coming this morning. This is the student panel that is always convened subsequent to the lecture of the autobiographical lecturer, who has been honored for 2013, and in this case, it's Dr. Enid Zimmerman, professor emeritus from the Indiana University. And we have with us our Department Chair, Peg Faimon, Enid's spouse, Gilbert Clark, and we have students—Michael Anne Higgins, Doris Ray, Elizabeth Herald, and Amy Walt—Abby Walt. Do we need to do that again and cut that out?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** No, it's alright.

\*Laughter\*

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** We'll cut that part out!

And I'm Julie Lindsey.

So the students attended the lecture last night and have some questions and some observations that they would like additional reflection from Dr. Zimmerman, and we're going to have our own reflection, should we have the opportunity. But the focus here and the intent of John Michael was to have an interaction between students and the lecturer, because he was always very student-centered. So with that in mind, I would like to turn it over to the students and to see... um... who would like to ask the first question?

\*Laughter\*

Thank you, Doris.

**Doris Ray:** First, I would like to start off by saying 'thank you' to Dr. Lindsey, because... I know at the end of one of your classes, we put together a binder, and I'm able to go back to that and reference some of the articles that we read, actually, so....

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** Thank you.

**Doris:** My question for you today is: Education is always changing, and with each change comes another way to assess, not only the students, but the teachers. In our educational classes at Miami, we hear the words 'validity' and 'reliability' as a way to show educational growth in the classroom.

So in your article, 'Reconceptualizing the Role of Creativity in Art Education,' you state that conceptual and operational definitions of creativity need to be reconsidered to help discover art students who may not be identified as having high creativity abilities through current procedures. So could you expand more?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Okay, well, I mentioned—That's a good question!—I mentioned yesterday about creativity not being popular in... If you read the literature, you see that there was a huge expanse of time, especially from the 80's through the early part of this century, to the 21st century, when people were not speaking about creativity. Now, because there were conceptions that creativity was sought, that what creativity was is everybody doing their own thing, without any kinds of boundaries, or guidelines, or means of assessment.

And there are creativity tests. There are ways of assessing creativity that are much more what we call 'authentic assessment,' so that we can look at the student's whole body of work—The kind of ways they do problem finding, problem solving... the way they use their own experiences, and also always the skills that are involved when you are doing work, because if you don't have the skills—both the skills of physically doing something and also the skills of language and understanding—then you really don't have the whole package.

So creativity, for me, means that you needed to develop both of those things, both the skills and then the creative problem solving. Without the skills, you may have it in your mind and you can't produce it. Also, the ability to write about what you do. And that's another thing. Most artists— but not all—can talk their work and students need to use that, whether they are going to be artists, and they definitely need to write about what they do. But then also students who are not going to be artists but will be able to be appreciators of art... They also need to be able to express, not only that they like it, but why they like it.

So I think that we've now embraced creativity. My big fear is that we're gonna go back to "Express yourself-- Here's a bunch of materials. Make something." But that we're gonna really use those kinds of... and I didn't get into it in the lecture, but in the article... you read in the article... that we need to look at kinds of ways people process... solve problems, even finding a problem is important. What processes you go to to create something-- How do you assess whether you've reached the stage where that's finished, and why is it finished? For all those things, I think that we need to rethink and reconsider.

And I wrote a chapter for this handbook about creativity recently. The one thing I said is that we need theory, we need assessments, we need curriculum, so we appear to be *for* art education. Right now, we appear to be *of* art education, where we take notions about creativity but from other subjects, because we haven't done a lot of research. So even in the book -- 6:20 --- that I wrote about and then the creativity issues that we wrote, a lot of people are using other theories

to create curriculum and do things for art education. I think if we keep doing this, we may eventually come up with what's the best *for* art education directly, and I think that's where we need to go. So does that answer your question?

**Doris Ray:** Yes.

**Zimmerman:** Good question... Dolores, right?

**Doris Ray:** Doris.

**Dr. Zimmerman:** Doris! Okay, that's it-- Thank you, Doris! Doris Ray, right? I'm trying to remember everybody's name. Okay, does anybody else want to say anything about... ? Now you people's turn to respond, or... ?

\*Laughter\*

**Peg Faimon:** We still have forty more minutes. I mean, I agree completely, and I think there's a lot of— I think it's interesting that there's a certain new interest—light that's shining on creativity in our nation. I think that 'innovation' is also sort of a hot word. And I think that business has sort of driven that a lot—rediscovered a lot of that, the value of that—and that's helped drive the conversation.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** And Florida writes a lot about... He writes about the idea that a new generation of artists... We need creative artists. We need people who are creative, because that's driving industry, but I think we also—and I think it's good that it is—but I said in my talk that we need to develop each student's creativity. And when you do it working in fine arts, when you're working with students who have high ability, I think we have an obligation for them to develop those things, but I think you'd agree that skills are so important, because that's the big thing. You don't want to lose that.

But everybody has a right to that. And if people are interested in it for other reasons, that's fine, and economically they are, but we can use that leverage so that we can get funds and write grants, so that all students can profit, not just economically. And what's strange to me is that standardization is taking place with the core subjects at the same time as we're interested in creativity. And you're gonna have to, when you go out and you teach, you're gonna have to show you meet the course standards, which is really the lowest common denominator.

It's easy to do. Everybody's happy, and then you can really expand that, and the way you meet that and you can, you know, develop students' ability and their own interests in their community and what's important to them. Because you need to work against standardization, because what

happens is students aren't interested, and they're alienated, and they go to the art class. If you're in elementary school particularly... and, you know, then they're not... They're "Oh, we don't want to do this," and, you know, nobody's interested. But if you can tie it to integration with other subjects and other things that are going on in the community, and make it a part of a whole, not just your room. You're isolated, and the boundaries aren't permeable, but if you're working with others, and you're working...

We did a lot of work. Gil and I went in different communities. And, you know, we even worked on the Indian, you know, Native American... the pueblo where we worked we, you know, we ummm... had an opportunity. That's a whole different way of accessing, having people involved. You know, there you can't do certain artwork, because it goes against their religion and their beliefs. So you have to know that in your own community.

You know, nudes in a college town... Nobody really thinks twice if there's an art book and there's a nude in it, but in some of our rural areas where we went... This is interesting—I don't know if it's true in Ohio—but when you're teaching, you get... there's a lot of students who come from pretty fundamental backgrounds. They can't do anything from their imagination. Teachers—I don't know if any of you are working like that—Teachers get a whole list in rural Indiana, where we are, of things that they cannot teach to certain children. So you're developing another curriculum.

And when we had our Summer Institute, there was one parents who wanted us not to... We went to the art museum—which we did with these highly abled kids that we wrote this book about—we made sure they didn't see any nudes. And they didn't want them to walk in front of the fountain. I don't know whether they wanted me to put bras on the... Cause there was this big fountain, and there were all these kind of mermaids with, you know, their boobs sticking out. Uhhh... \*murmuring\*

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** I think everybody knows already...

\*Group laughter\*

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** And, you know, the parents, you know, we said, "We can't guarantee that your son won't see these things. We'll try to make sure." So when we went to the museum, we told the kids not to go into this room, cause there was kind of a... show that was inappropriate. Some things... this is middle school, early high school. So who was trying to sneak in? This kid!

\*Group laughter\*

There goes to say maybe you can't have some people anymore... Maybe I should shut up!

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** The only comment I ever have about creativity is that it's a way of life and a way we actually live our lives in a very creative way. I think the last time I heard Howard Gardner speak, he spoke about, umm... the ethics of creativity, and he felt that that was quite important, because if you... Just because you can do it or make it, doesn't mean you have to. And I think that, while we embrace creativity, and I certainly... and I certainly do... then there's that important thing.

The other thing that he said that I thought was very significant was that anyone who was not working creatively, as we enter the 21st century, would be replaced by a computer. So that's the kind of value that he put on that, and those two things in particular really stuck with me from that lecture that he did. And I just wanted to add that...

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Yeah, that's important. And he had said in his writings that everyone can live a creative life, that all of us always have choices, and that we can think outside the box, and always... umm... especially people that have skills in the arts. You know, I mean, I can't understand in a culture why people want to nick the arts and not support them. As I said, can you imagine a life without arts?

Well, we are very fortunate on campus. We have... you know... I use cinemas—one of the ten best cinemas now on campus in the United States—and they bring in directors, there's a ballet, there's the opera, there's music every... You know, we're out almost every night now that we're retired, but even when I was teaching—and this is really interesting, I think, just think about this—you get so caught up in your own kind of mundane, not creative, life by just trying to get by. Some people have families, some people have partners—whoever you like. It turns out you're so busy that you often don't have time... just... you feel like you're in this grind, and you're just doing things just to get ahead.

So I—everybody—has a religion... I have a religion, too, but I have another religion. My other religion is that once a week, twice a week, no matter what was happening in my life, I went to something outside of where I was, in the School of Education—to a lecture, to a concert, to a talk that had nothing to do with other things I was studying to keep my mind alive. You know, like you heard Howard Gardner... you hear people around the university campus. So few people take advantage of that. And that's where creativity comes from, putting a lot of ideas together from different places and keeping your mind alive, and not letting...

Even doing your artwork... like I still do artwork, but I'm not showing it... But that can be let go, because it often doesn't become a priority. Then when you're teaching, it becomes a grind, even though you love the students, I think you have to keep that part of you going no matter

what. And I did some of my greatest artwork when I had my first child, and I was doing my MFA and I did these great... kind of... paintings and art. Anyway, I think that it's important to do that and not to forget that. So we each have that capacity, but we often become so overburdened with other things that we don't leave time for outside things to influence us.

**Elizabeth Herald:** So I might ask my question now, just because it's on this topic. I dunno, I don't mean to barge in.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Oh, no! Okay wait, now, don't ever apologize.

**Elizabeth Herald:** Okay.

\*Group laughter\*

**Zimmerman:** You know, I used to have my apologizing stick in my class, and when someone would apologize, I don't "Don't apologize!" Women often do, like, apologize. You know that. So you're a smart, lovely women. And so start over and say, "I have a question, and it's really pertinent."

**Elizabeth Herald:** Okay. \*Laughter\*

I have a question, and it's so important.

**Zimmerman:** Good!

**Elizabeth Herald:** Um, so it's also about creativity and assessment... so those two things kinda together. And I agree with everything you were saying about creativity and how important it is, and students learning through self-direction and initiative. But because of all the standards and assessments being implemented right now, do you have any, sort of... suggestions for how to combine the two and have them coexist?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Yes. You gotta give people what they want, so you don't have to argue about it. So you have to make the rubrics, and you know, you learn... We have to teach it—I did, and I'm sure you did—teach about rubrics and filling in the cells, and you know... from this to this... or how many points and all that. And you say, "You know, we gotta get this done." And then where do you go from there? You know, you've done the project. Then you bring them to where they can even assess their own artwork and follow standards. Okay, then you look at... umm... I shouldn't... I can't used the blackboard, can I?

**Peg Faimon:** Yeah, sure.

**Zimmerman:** Okay, then I'll...

**Peg Faimon:** There's this one over here. May you should use...

**Videographer:** Do you want to...

**Peg Faimon:** There's a marker right there.

**Videographer:** Should we just bring it over?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Okay, this is something that when you're teaching students skills-- I hope this [marker] will work. It'll have to work --

**Peg Faimon:** Here's these over here. Do you wanna move it over more?

**Videographer:** No, we got it.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** When you wanna teach skills, this will work. Umm, you wanna teach skills. So you know exactly what you're teaching, and you know exactly what your assessment's gonna be. I dunno, if you're building a pinch pot, say... So you know the different things that are all gonna look alike, these little pinchy things. Kay, then the next step would be to add the pinch pot to other things that you... You can open it up, you can do different things, you show a lot of different ways of doing it.

So you're the teacher here. You know exactly what this is gonna be. You know what A, B, and C [are], and even D, the students, have choices. That's where people stop, cause this would all be something you could assess, because you as a teacher know what this is gonna be. Then, when you've gotten to that stage, this is where the stages... Students have developed all this, okay...

Then you tell the students, "What are you gonna do? Here's a project. It's gonna be something the you think about, that you learn from all these things. And then you're gonna be able to do your own work, whatever, you own research. You're gonna write a project, and it's gonna be your own. And you're gonna decide how you're gonna assess it, whatever." So you've met all your standards here. But the creativity is when the teacher brings the students with skills and abilities, and then *here's* when you say, "Surprise me! I don't know what it's gonna be. I wanna know, with all the things you learned, how you are gonna put this together in your own way."

And, you know, it might be “What kind of problem is it?” You’re gonna find the problem. You’re gonna shape the problem. You’re gonna go through the process of doing it, and then you’re gonna come out of it. So this process is as important or more important than the product, because it’s what you learn.

How you’re gonna assess this is pretty open-ended. So you’re giving people what they want, but that’s not your goal. Your goal is to come here. I mean, you can’t do it with every project, but... And then the students would keep their notebooks of all their work, and then—and I work with this—and then... umm... and then they would have articles, and do research, and come up with their own product, but it’s something that you didn’t think of, and that’s when you’re doing the creativity.

So, I dunno, does that answer your... does that answer your...

**Elizabeth Herald:** Yeah, it does.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Good! That was a good question. Thank you!

**Michael Anne Higgins:** Mine kind of goes along with that.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Good.

**Michael Anne Higgins:** I’m gonna start you off with a little example. So, in terms of creativity, we teach Saturday Art, which is just from kindergarten through high school. I had, I think it was a first grader, who... You would give them free time to draw, whatever they want, and he would often draw, like, aliens killing people with laser beams and dead people with blood and all kinds of stuff. And I would be like, “Uhhh... may this is not like...” And I would kinda.

But then I brought it to my partner, who I was with, and she was like, “It’s not a big deal. He just watches video games.” So, I guess... And then this reminds me of the parents being concerned about them seeing things. What is appropriate to let...? When is there a line to be drawn? And last night, when you showed that one print... or whatever it was... where a lot of the time, people said, “Oh, maybe don’t show that.” Is there a time when you had a line to be drawn when they’re expressing themselves completely freely in the classroom?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Yes. It has to do with community values. Cause what you don’t wanna do is be, umm... In rural Indiana, a teacher said to a student, “Don’t you put your butt on that chair again. I want you at the door.” She was dismissed, because she used the word ‘butt’ in the classroom. I mean, it’s an extreme... But you’re gonna be in a community when you’re



teaching. Certain communities, you react in different ways. You know, so, think... A lot of it depends on what the community values are.

Then, you have all this violence... And my son, who I've written about... umm... who has a, well... I guess... He went to the University of Pennsylvania, Penn, where he... umm... had an undergraduate degree in Women's Studies as a minor, but he was a Fine Arts major. And... umm... he... and I studied him from when he was a young child to through college. And I interviewed him. I've written about it. And he did a lot of these things, and he—The reason I mention this is he was a Women's Studies minor—He's very... don't you kinda... in the book... Gil has also been very... all so quiet... and he kinda... supports women, as well.

Now, umm... the things was that he drew a lot of these things with... years ago, now... he's in his early forties... But when he was in middle school and high school... people... holding up a woman's head... a man... you know, with blood dripping out. And I said, "Eric, how could you have done this?" And he said, "Boys' culture."

So what you're seeing is boys' culture... boys are showing their... you know. Then, somehow, you've got to say, this is... you know... not overreact to it, I think. But say, "Okay, this is part of what you, you know, you're doing, but I'm giving you this assignment now. I let you do this. You do it at home. Bring it in and show it to me. But we've got another assignment. This is what you need to do in the class. You've done this already. I've seen it. You've gotten it out of your system. You can do it at home. Keep a notebook. Do it there. But we've got this assignment where we're working on... I don't know... going out and photographing the fall and looking at textures... whatever you're doing. And that this is going to be what I'm expecting you to turn in. I'm interested in what you're doing. I know where it comes from. You can bring it to me, but we're moving on."

Now, of course, also, you may not want... Kids do manga, and there are all kinds of things that they do on their own, and they often do it in secret, and they don't want to show you, especially kids of high ability. They often... you don't even know they're in your classes. I encourage them to show you, to share with you... When appropriate, you can have a bulletin board where they can put up their work from home. But if it's very bloody and gory, you can say, "You know, some parents don't approve of this, but I'm willing to see what you're doing." Don't overreact to it, but also don't let him make a fetish of it, where he or she can't... umm... It's just as dangerous as girls continuously making models with, you know, the way... and wedding gowns and all... I mean, it's all sort of fantasy... you know, this kind of a life, and there's a lot more they could look at and see and appreciate that's going on. But I don't think we should act as condoning or condemning, but we wanna, you know, make sure that they do, also, other things. I dunno, does anybody else want to add to that, or... Does that answer...?

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** Can any of you from your experience... Can you... Do you have anything that you'd want to add to that?

**Doris Ray:** I can relate to when you said that they should be working on that project at a certain time and then move onto the next one, because in high school, we... taught the same in high school. And we had a lot of that, "Well, this is art class. I should be able to make what I want."

And you know, gearing them toward a certain activity, meeting those standards that we need to meet... that throughout the course they need to meet for the class... umm... That was a little difficult, you know, when they put me on the spot... You know, "Well why do I have to do this? Why can't I make my own?" And it kinda relates back to the first question where you said, "I hope art doesn't turn into this thing where you give them paper, 'Here's all the supplies. You make your own.'"

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** But don't condemn what they're doing. Have them keep a notebook, and say, "Show it to me-- I'm interested. But we have certain things we have to meet in the class, too." Once you start, "Oh, we can't do this! It's horrible! I don't want to see it!" Then you make them want to do it more.

By not... I remember-- This may be shocking, I don't care... I remember when I was teaching in an elementary school in a very economically deprived neighborhood in the Bronx, and where they... the people who rode the motorcycles... What are they called? You know, it's a club...

**Peg Faimon:** Oh, Harley Davidson?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** No, there's... there's a group of them...

**Abby Walt:** Hell's Angels?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Yeah! Hell's Angels! Thank you!

\*Group laughter\*

**Abby Walt:** I'm full of surprises!

**Zimmerman:** Abby, right? Thank you!

So, Hell's... Now I forgot what I was saying!

\*Group laughter\*

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** You were in the Bronx, teaching, and...

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Yes, wait, I'll get it! 'Hell's?' Why 'hell's?' I talk too fast! Think about it, gimme one second...

Oh, I remember! So, anyway. So here we were in this school, and they had had art exhibits before I came to the school. And it was a K through sixth school. And, umm... I mean... I looked as young as the sixth graders, because I was always littler than everybody, even my sixth graders. And I said... I got people to donate all this paper to mount their artwork on, and I was gonna put it around the school on the first floor, so everybody could see it, and we could have an art show.

I did art shows where the parents and the community came in during my lunch hour.. those who were available. But I said to them, "Look, I'm gonna put this up, but I know in the past when I've put it up, people have written 'shit' and 'fuck' and everything all around..." And I said, "I don't want it on the artwork. You wanna do it, we'll have a place in my room where you can write whatever you want. But I don't want to see any writing on..."

Everybody said, "It won't work!" Nobody ever wrote on any of the artwork! Cause I said it... these words... and that it wasn't gonna shock me. It's the same thing. And it extinguished the behavior. So... umm... so I think you gotta find a, you know, place where...

But, I mean, this is what's on their minds. And it's a very frightening world for young people out there. I mean, with the guns, and there was just another teacher that was shot. You know... and you should say, "I know, because I'm scared, too. I'm teaching you. Teachers are shot. Students are shot." We live in a world, and they know it's disturbing. You know, and sometimes, we need to get away from that and do something... that we can think of something in a more positive way. But I'm not, you know, telling them not to do it. So that goes on... I could go on and talk to you a lot, but that's not...

\*Group Laughter\*

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Anybody else wanna ask a question? Now, who asked the question? Michael did? Was this yours, or...?

**Michael Anne Higgins:** Yeah, I was the start of all...

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Is... is that...?

**Michael Anne Higgins:** Yeah! Oh, yeah, absolutely!

**Abby Walt:** Well, my question kinda goes with student experiences, but I'm gonna go away from, like, the United States. So you talked last night about.. umm... I mean, you've been in more than 40 countries to do lectures and to work with kids, right? And... umm... how do... when students put their own experiences in their artwork, how does it differ from the other countries compared to the United States?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** First of all, I know Gil and I have worked mostly in the Far East, in those countries, but we've been in other countries... or in South America, or... We haven't... I haven't done that much work in Europe, or... So, in talking from cultures where... I said yesterday, a respect for the teacher, and also they have a very, very high level of art training and education for the students.

I remember... do you remember?... we were in Singapore. We went into this classroom. There were all sixth graders. The teacher took out the --31:15-- which is like a big radish, put it in front of everyone. The teacher stood up there and did a beautiful watercolor of this fruit. And every child made a beautiful watercolor of the fruit. And so... of this... radish... a radish isn't a fruit... It's a vegetable... Well, it's an --30:32-- right? Is it -- 31:35 --?

Yeah, so the skill development... You can see those portraits, and the skill of kids, especially those in high abilities classes, and the high school, so superseded everything I saw, in terms of skills, at the university. When it became... They kept asking me about how do we develop creativity? You know, and I thought, well, we're trying to get more skill in and... so that they can be creative. They wanted their students to be able to not be as... umm... to be skillful, but then to be more creative.

And they... I know when we were in Korea, South Korea, they're working toward that. And they said that we've abandoned all of these standardizations in the arts, because it didn't work. People develop skill, and I think we don't develop enough skill with our students in the United States, personally. And students at a certain level, where they can be artists or art teachers, they wanna have the tools to be able to do something that looks adult-like and not childlike.

But then where do we go from there? And how do we do it? And I think that the free-wheeling kind of... kind of make and take projects, or "Here's a bunch of things. Make some art out of it" is a wrong way to go, but it's also the... When we think about it, the chart I drew... They're probably maybe at the second level, but they don't go to that third level. But in order to go to the third level, we have to have our students have more skill. So that's one thing that I think that... umm...

And also I said the way teachers are treated by the community. Art people are in high regard. The arts are part of culture. They teachers are paid well, and they... umm... I guess, except for Taiwan, where they built too many schools, and they want to... you know... cause their child level, 1.7 or so... It's one of the lowest in the world... You know, per couple with children, they have less than one... not less than two children to replace... So, you know, they had too many schools, but otherwise... umm... I think that support for the arts is not there the way it is in other countries. Do you want to say anything about that, Gil? The difference when we went to other countries?

**Gilbert Clark:** Well, I think, obviously, Enid, the skill development in the Far East is so much above ours. 34:15-34:23 And so you see skill development, but you don't see the creative extension of that in the Far East.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** But we did see in South Korea, they were beginning to do it, and then every child that came to the school for really highly-abled kids in the arts... They all had to do self-portraits. I didn't show that year, but some of them... a few of them, really were able to go beyond that concepts of simple self-portrait and really push the limit. But most of them just did something expected.

So when they came up with the last thing, the teachers were really shocked by the ways the students expressed themselves, but they had the skill and the ability to do it. Also there, students do have to... In the countries that we're talking about in the Far East, where I worked a lot... umm... students had to take art, and it's part of the culture where we always... My whole career was fighting for the arts. We all know that, and I think if we could really support at the elementary level, then we would see the arts at a high level in our high schools for all the students.

I mean, I think also the students should be doing all the arts. They should all do some theater. Some even movement and dance. And learn a musical instrument, or do singing, or, you know, participate, because they're gonna be the ones who are gonna shape the future, not only as artists but appreciators, so...

I mean, art is so ingrained in the culture like in Japan and, you know, where we visited and taught and did workshops and we... In Australia, went to an interesting... When I was in Australia, people also... if you go to a dance performance, they not only have the young, beautiful dancers. They had people who are older, like my age, dancing! They still could move! And they also... I used to dance when I was young. I did a lot of modern dancing, but now I don't think I... But if they were still able to... People with handicaps dancing. They included everybody in the performances.

**Gilbert Clark:** And they also included children.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** And children... Oh, and then the Native Americans... When they did the dance... We went on the Santa Domingo Pueblo. They don't dance for themselves, so we were working with them, and there were tourists, and we were able to watch the dancing. And they also had people who were handicapped... who had, like, cerebral palsy or all kinds... dancing. And the little children, dancing with their parents. And they learned it as part of the culture. And they also did artwork and made things with their parents, so it was...

But I see the different cultures we work with. Like in South Carolina, the Gullah people, who spoke in another language.... really a very conservative kind of... umm... kind of environment, where grandparents came from the West Coast of Africa, first generation... We were working with that—or second—that didn't come over as slaves. And how they also incorporated arts and culture...

I think, mainstream, kind of... where people are so interested in getting ahead and the academic grades and those who maybe don't see the arts as... So it's up to us... you, not me anymore... to try to... you know... when you have a mission, I think, to do this. If you see yourselves as missionaries of the arts, and you're bringing the arts to kids and people to express themselves and make it part of the culture.

And what kind of culture do we have? A visual culture. Never in history, except maybe during the Renaissance, was there so much art and visualization, and, you know, if you look on the computer... everybody... and you know, when we used to speak, we'd stand and read our paper. Now, I can do, seventy-five... seventy-seven slides that I make, and, you know, it's all visual.

Are millennium kids gonna get jobs? Parents, "Oh, they'll never get a job if they study art." It's what I told... we told our son, "Don't go into the arts," because he wouldn't make money!" And that's more money than I have now! Well, you know, he wound up being a professor, but there are so many jobs... He had a company, one of the second largest ink companies in New York City. Unfortunately, it went under, right before the, you know, the stock market crash and the recession. And they were gonna sell the business and make millions of dollars, and the people who were gonna buy it didn't have enough money, so the bottom fell out... So he always talked to me about how there weren't enough people in the United States who really knew what they were doing... again, skill. You go to these... umm... countries that we went to, like Taiwan, and there were all these skills that they had with computers. They all could do these phenomenal... really phenomenal things.

**Gilbert Clark:** This addresses your question. I think the fact that Eric had such a bad time getting American students... You go to the Far East, and you get students who have highly developed representation skills.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** And they work for these... and he said they couldn't find them, and they still can't. There were so many jobs. For many parents who said that you can't get jobs... If you have a visual art background and a strong technology, too... and you probably know that from --40:25-- there are jobs out there. There really are a lot of jobs still around.

And it's a visual culture now. So if you take advantage of this, but all of you have to be out by new technology. You all have to learn different... all the different things that you need to know, so that... And if you don't know them, your students are gonna know them, so let your students teach you. It's okay. You can't know everything. And the younger the students are, the more their brains are... their brains are physically being changed, and think differently. You think differently than I do. My grandson: "Grandma, you're supposed to be smart! What's wrong with you?"

\*Group laughter\*

My grandson: "Why can't you use your cell phone map? What is wrong with you?" [My daughter] said, "It's so obvious!"

I said, "I keep calling... I don't know what to do!"

She said, "Mom, I don't believe it!"

But it's different, and you're gonna use those skills, because people are gonna need them. And people can create all kinds of things now that they couldn't before. And some of the skills are different that we need now than we needed before, so how are you gonna do that and work with your students? And students who don't have phenomenal drawing ability, who aren't gonna be artists but want to create things, there's so many ways on the computer of doing things that it's really a whole different world. And it's going to be exciting!

And parents tell you, "My kid... I don't want them... I want them to be in business," and business is out now. Maybe it's medical things... doctors or what... who knows? Lawyers or whatever. But they can have jobs and have income, and I think it's one of the first times that you can say that with some assurance.

So... umm... who asked...? you asked...? No, Abby asked... Abby asked...

So... umm... I dunno... do either of you want to say anything? I talk... I was born with blab... blabber... blabber ability!

\*Group laughter\*

And I have a captive audience-- You can't leave! Like a few students last night left after I chastised them, but that's okay, they'll remember it!

No, that's another thing. Don't ever be afraid to go... if you don't like what the students are doing... if it's not respectful, let them know immediately. Otherwise, you'll never be able to extinguish it. So even... And you don't want people to like you as much as respect you as a teacher, cause later on...

One woman came up to be last night... umm... her name was 'Polarski,' and she was my student, and we were talking about the student here who doesn't have arms, who teaches art, and I was so excited, and she... This was such a coincidence... we were talking about coincidences...

She came up and said to me, "Do you know who I teach?" And she said... This is what she said to me... She said, "You were my teacher twenty years ago..." You [Gil] were a teacher too. She said, "Whatever I'm doing, I think, 'What would Enid tell me to do?'" So it's a marvelous... you know, that legacy of yours to a student, and you're able to really do something. It made me so happy!

And then she said, "You know, I teach in this school with this..." And I said, "I know about the man," and it was such a coincidence, but she's such a supportive person, and I had remembered her after... She talked about when she was a student, because I have thousands of students, you know, over what... forty-five years of teaching. And here she was, and here she was working with this young man who was... And... you know... and I think because she's probably supportive also of him, and what he's doing, and she... you know... I influence her.

So, ya know, the things you're gonna do now when you're a student and the people you influence... I was speaking in Wyoming to the teachers there, ya know, and there I am, speaking at a museum, and then I went on to a talk to their students, a big group of students. And one came up and said, "I went to your Summer Arts Institute."

Remember, I showed the kids who came in the summer, and they studied with Gil? She had been one of those students, and she said, "If I hadn't gone to your summer camp, if I hadn't been there on campus, I never would have studied art." And now she's an art teacher out in Wyoming! So you never know your influence, if you have so much legacy and so much you can



offer to your students. You know, there's nothing like it. You're really lucky to have a career as art teachers. So just feel good about it, and don't let anybody take it away from you.

Any more... are there more questions? You sure... Do you have any practical questions?

**Gilbert Clark:** [Second Video 2:17](#)

**Michael Anne Higgins:** These are just my notes from last night. I wrote a lot of stuff down.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Do you have any questions that you're concerned about, going to be art teachers?

**Michael Anne Higgins:** Well, what about... I kinda had a question about... When you were talking about how you traveled to all these different places, and you mentioned you started teaching... that you started teaching at, like, poverty line... When you ran into issues of, like, supplies, what did you do?

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** You're creative. And that's when you go out into the community, and you find people who will donate all kinds of things. Um, you go to a framing store... they throw out so much paper and I collect... still collect... we in the arts, we're collectors, right? I mean, to make things, you need stuff.

So parents even in the poorest neighborhood... you need certain kinds of cans or plastic bottles or... The parents will want to be helpful, too. If they don't have money they can just bring things that you need that don't require a lot of money, or people can volunteer their time if they're able to.

But also... umm... I know that when I worked with low income students from... where they lived... where their families were... and I had new boxes of crayons and they would go crazy... just crayons... because they never had a new box of crayons. Or now, with the computers, in most schools, you don't need sometimes as many supplies... umm... But you can get paint stores, you can go out in the community and get people to donate things. They can take it off their income tax.

We have in our community, but I don't know if it exists here... Many communities have a recycling center. They also have like a place where they can put things aside for schoolteachers in our community. Most people are starting that, so you can go there and get all kinds of supplies.

Like we even have a very well known weaving, kind of-- **Second Video 4:27--** or the people do handmade weaving, it's shown all over the world. But I went to New York City, and a friend of mine had one of the weavings in her house, and it had torn, and I went back and asked if she could have it replaced. And they always have the end of bulbs, and the newspapers... we still have newspapers, and they use the newsprint. When they get to a certain point, they can't use all the paper that's on this roll and how they discard it. But if they give it to you as a teacher, then they can take it off their income tax, and you have all this newsprint...

*\*Video lapse\**

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Thank you for donating this kiln that was worth, if I had to buy it, over \$2500, and thank you very much... And then they can take that off as a donation from their income tax. So that if you don't even have a big budget, you can just... have to go out and scrounge.

And then, when you all graduate, get your emails and keep one another informed, because maybe Abby has... umm... an excess of this, but she needs that, and then Michael has more of this, but she needs something else. If you keep in touch with the people you went to school with... and even go to your state meetings where you can... I think it's important... I'm sure you... keep up with your Ohio state... it's a very good state organization. And they give out all kinds of free things at the conference, and load up! You know... and then... and also meet other teachers and get online and exchange, and if you see a teacher who's been around a long time and doing a presentation you really like, introduce yourself and say, "I really wanna learn more from what you're doing."

And do they all get a free day off... umm... each semester? In our state you can go and see...

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** Professional day.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Take your professional day, and visit teachers who have been teaching for many years that you see at a conference... something you wanna see how they teach, and spend the day with them. You'll learn so much more than from books and your art education people... which I was one! Really, but there's... You can only go there and learn cause you're prepared to. So that's where we come in.

But I think you really need to take advantage of that. Keep in touch with one another, because if you're in an elementary school, and you're the only art teacher, and you're isolated, and you don't have outside contacts, you feel like you're doing this drudging job again. But if you say, Well, I'm gonna... Oh, so-and-so is doing this, and we can all keep in touch with one another,

like all the people in your class... Now, with the email... Remember, we used to... how people...

Today, four of you are friends and you keep in touch. Then, there's a state meeting. When you all get a little more mature and you're teaching a while, do a presentation... you're together... how you all taught around a certain topic, or whatever, and do it together at the state meeting. And volunteer to do it. Get out of your classroom. Tell people what you're doing or what's working. And then your principal or your community will love you and support you.

And then they want to cut art classes or cut down, and you've got those parents whose kids' artwork is shown, and you have exhibits... You gotta get those parents in back of you. Kids who are really doing well with art and then parents... You cultivate those parents groups, and you make sure your program stays in there and not cut or anything happens, and you can make it happen.

The first year is your hardest year, and it's gonna... I used to come home and go to sleep every... and then I wound up teaching and having a child and also doing my MFA. But... you know... and I had to work up to that... I was finishing my fifth year after I was teaching. The first year, everything is new. You have to make your first mistakes each time, and, you know, it's just a tough time. But don't give up, because it's... After that, everything's from your own experience. And I know I think that. From my own experience, that's how it was. I don't know... You taught a while... What do you think, Gil?

**Gilbert Clark:** I was just thinking, I used to teach at San Diego, California, and one year, another friend of mine and I... four of us decided we weren't gonna do anything in the summer except go to companies and see what we could get that might help us teaching. And we spent a whole summer doing that, and I filled a double garage with free materials that we got that summer! It was amazing! I taught with those materials for the next five years!

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** You know what I used to do? I used to say to my students, "You have ten dollars. Go around to the garage sales this weekend, and bring back as many art things as you can. We'll have a contest to see who can get the most with their ten dollars!" They brought back books, they brought back a painting, they talked people into... "I'm in this contest..." and they would come in with boxes full of things! You know, and it's always like my 'big contest.' I used to be a big garage person... garage sale person. Now, I'm... umm... giving it away. "You like it? You want it? I'll give it to you!" I'm purging myself.

My daughter said, "Mom, when you're not here any longer..." She said, "What am I gonna do with all this stuff!"

\*Group laughter\*

I mean, she's pretty honest, so... so we're starting to: "You like it? You can have it!" So... but when I was starting out... Then there are teachers who retired, and a lot of my former students... They want something, I've got-- Shelves and stuff... I give to them. So you can... that's also a way to benefit. Garage sales? Do they eat up a lot of garage sales?

**Peg Faimon:** Yep, oh yeah.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** So that's fun to just go around. You can have a contest with a friend, like the two of you can go around... four of you, really... "Who's gonna get with...?" That's what I...

**Peg Faimon:** Good stuff!

\*Group laughter\*

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Best stuff! **-Third Video 5:38-** I don't know if you could do that in certain communities... You could do it with your students in high school and see what they could do. But then, you know, they have to have the ten dollars, and, you know, you have to think about it. But you could certainly do that. It's all out there, you just gotta find it.

**Peg Faimon:** The thing I like about that, too, is that it teaches them about sustainability and recycling, all those things...

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Right! Exactly!

**Peg Faimon:** It teaches them other values at the same time, so you're getting great materials, but you're also reusing things that were just gonna get trashed.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** And that's great! Of course, of course.

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** And you mentioned the recycle centers and cities. There is one in Dayton, if you're in the Dayton area. There's... uhhh... I think it's in the spring... my husband always works there, because he's the super recycler in our house, so he's had the schooling for it. He went to the Organic Montgomery County Parks District, so...

But all these things are brought in all year, and they're in this one facility, and then, you just find... You can just call the recycle center. And I just wanted to tell you how Dayton works.

You call the recycle center, and they will tell you what day it is. And the cars are just lined up. It's only for teachers, and you can take whatever you need. And there are just all kinds of things! Strange things!

I said... He came come and when he was taking the course, he had one of those white binders. It was like... And I said, "Well!" I said, "Hmmm.... Now, if we're talking about sustainability, those things cost about fifteen or twenty dollars." He said, "Well, they came out... somebody brought them to recycle today." And so those things that we don't think about in your community, as you said... The other thing that is very important, and I don't know how... I run across these in other parks, major cities... I think Chicago has one... but Cincinnati has a facility called 'Crayons to Computers,' and... Have you ever been there?

**Abby Walt:** No, my cooperating teacher got stuff there. Sorry, I have a little... a little allergy right now. But, yeah, Willis Pearson (name?) gets her stuff there.

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** Can you say a little more about it so people know, and then I'll talk about how it works.

**Abby Walt:** Well, I dunno much about it, but, like, for the fall, we got... umm... like leaf cutouts that prisoners actually cut out and packaged to give them something to do, and resold them at a really low price... or donated them... or whatever... So teachers could use them, and we had, kids, you know, help decorate the school with the things that we got for nearly free.

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** Didn't she have some little, like, animals or some sort of little reward box, or am I mixing that up with something else?

**Abby Walt:** We, yeah, we had, like, 'Art Stars,' which is like you get candy... I guess she could get something from down there, but...

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** I think somebody found some little... like little animal...

**Peg Faimon:** Those little plastic animals?

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** Well, no, these were furry! And these were things for teachers. And, so, if you got so many... I don't remember how it worked out... But the way 'Crayons to Computers' works... If you are in... teaching in a school district that's at-risk, you can go there at any time, take a grocery cart, and go around and get what you need, and take it back and use it. And they have all... they have crayons to computers!

*\*Video lapse\**

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** Not in... umm... a school district that we're in that has at-risk children. Uhh... you can still go there if you're, like, from Mason, but what they want is four hours of your time once a month to stock shelves and do that kind of thing. So it's virtually open to everyone, but it's absolutely free with no commitment... I think sometimes people give that commitment anyway just to... you know, for the greater good. So those kind of facilities are around, too, and if you're networking, you know about them. Because somebody said, "Oh, you can get that down at..." And often, as I've been... and I'm running on here now, and you're supposed to be talking...

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Oh, no, that's okay. I've done a lot of talking!

**Dr. Julie Lindsey:** I hear teachers in a district say, "Oh, the art teachers never get together anymore! We aren't given time for meetings anymore."

Well, it's true, but I can say, "Well, you know, but pizza night once a month works really well!" And you can just determine your own fate, and just kinda, you know, blow it off and just kinda go in that way. But plant the thought But you're not powerless. You have spent a lot of time and energy in your life commitment and your heart to become this art teacher.

And you've heard me say this: When I look at you, I see thirty thousand children behind you, because if you teach thirty years, and if you are... umm... have about... well, I taught elementary... so about a thousand kids a week, that's thirty thousand children that you have an opportunity to have an impact on.

And, so, when I look at each of you, and I see them behind you, you know, I... I have a commitment. There's... there's... I'm just not apologetic about anything, and thank you so much for saying that, because it does help me. It provides a means for me to do what I need to do. And so... umm... you are their advocate. Children have no voice, and so you *have* to do this. And I know, from working with all of you, that you're gonna be doing it. So... uhh... you know, in a sense, I'm preaching to the choir, but you're extraordinary, all of you.

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** Cream of the crop, even though I'm not supposed to say it.

\*Group laughter\*

**Dr. Enid Zimmerman:** But in every situation, to be honest, there are people who have more skills, more interest, more ability than others, and everybody's needs has to be accommodated. And there may be some of your students who are studying with you who don't care, or they won't even be an art teacher, and there are some of you who are really passionate about it. And

that makes people who are really passionate committed. Find those people, and don't glove on with the people who don't get it, because it brings you down.

And there are so many wonderful people the I know my community. I belong to 'The Old Art Teachers Society,' the 'OATS,' and all those people—well, not all—are retired now. I was their teacher, and they were... one of them had a doctorate with me, and, you know, the others all studied with me, and they worked as teachers, but we were all together now. Do ya know what I mean? We stopped meeting, but we met many years after we retired, and exchanged stories, and I have gone in... and Gil... to schools where I am still there to help the design, doing like--**Fourth Video 3:58**—and I'm doing paper mache. I'm not gonna do it alone. You know, I'm doing this... I need an extra hand. And I haven't done it in a few years. They probably think that I'm on my way out, but I have to renew that I go out and, you know... and still love being in the classroom where the kids are, and they're making things. We were just talking about that...

*\*End of all video recording\**