N3216 DIS 9899 Final disposition of comments

Date:2023-12-07	Document:	Project:

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
paus** -001					*Subclause and clause cross-references*	When referring to a whole clause, please use the word "clause" i.e. "Clause 8". When referring to a subclause, please use the number only i.e. "8.1".	Accepted	✅
** -002					*Footnote 28 "the standard"*	Please use the standard identifier number i.e. ISO/IEC 60559 to be clear.	Accepted	✅
** -003					*Grammar*	**General comment:** remove the comma after i.e. and e.g. See "e.g., i.e. and etc." in the ISO house style.	Accepted	✅
** -004					*Footnotes*	footnotes 23 and 24 can easily be turned into NOTES below the text where the footnote numbers appear. The only change needed would be changing "might" to "can".	Accepted	✅
** -005					*Footnote 20*	Footnote 20 can easily be changed to a cross-reference in parentheses i.e. (See 6.2.5) after the text where the footnote number appears. This makes the document more user friendly.	Accepted	✅
**-006					*Footnote 12*	Footnote 12: Please refer to **ISO/IEC 60559** and not "The IEC 60559 standard for binary floating-point arithmetic". The reference is	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						clear without repeating the title of the standard		
**-007				Ed	*Subheadings*	subclauses 5.1.2.2 and 5.1.2.3 have the same title. Please consider modifying one title so that they are clearly distinguished.	Accepted	✅
**-008				Ge	*Hanging paragraphs*	5.1.2.2 is a hanging paragraph. **As per ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 22.3.3:** "Hanging paragraphs" shall be avoided since reference to them is ambiguous. A new subclause "5.1.2.2.1 General" must be inserted to correct this, and cross-references amended throughout the text. Otherwise the subclauses can all be moved onto the same level i.e. 5.1.2.2 Hosted environment 5.1.2.3 Program startup 5.1.2.4 Program execution etc.	Accepted	✅
**-009	Whole document			Ge		Please do not use "Need not" as the meaning is unclear and not aligned with the verbal expressions defined in HYPERLINK "https://www.iso.org/sites/directives/current/	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						part2/index.xhtml#_idTextAnchor069"ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 2021, Clause 7. Please clearly use a verbal form as per Clause 7 of DP2 i.e. "it is not necessary/required". Amend accordingly throughout the document.		
**-010	Whole document			Ge	all text in bold i.e. Semantics", "Constraints" , "recommended practice" which are not subclause headings.	Bold is not permitted in the main text unless it is as a subclause or clause heading. For example, "Recommended practice" can be made a subclause heading 5.2.4.2.3 and then remain in bold. These "headings" in bold can also be the introductory sentences of lists, so that they stand out from the other text, without using bold. Please amend document accordingly throughout the document	Rejected. We don't want to change the normative content of the standard.	✅
**-011	Whole document			Ge		Only the terms defined in this document can be italicized in Clause 3 for cross-reference purposes and but not other content throughout the rest of the text. Please correct.	Rejected. We don't want to change the normative content of the standard.	✅
**-012	Whole document			Ge		In accordance with the **ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 9.1:** 'The decimal sign shall be a	Rejected: See **ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 9.2**	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						comma on the line in all language versions.' Please amend throughout.		
**-013				Ed	This document has been edited by an ISO/CS Editor.	Please use the file named "Word with trackchanges", from ISO CS available on ISO Projects as a basis for any further drafting. Please contact the Editor nelson@iso.org for any questions. I can also provide a PDF file with detailed comments.	Rejected: Documented is maintained in LaTeX	✅
**-014		1		Ed	*Second sentence of scope*	Colon : missing. Please add here and in the second paragraph too.	Accepted	✅
**-015		2		Ed	ISO 80000–2	The correct title of "ISO 80000–2" is "Quantities and units — Part 2: Mathematics". Please correct.	Accepted	✅
**-016		2		Ed	ISO/IEC 60559:2020	The correct title of ISO/IEC 60559:2020 is Information technology — Microprocessor Systems — Floating-Point arithmetic Please correct.	Accepted	✅
**-017		2		Ed	*ISO 4217,* *ISO 8601,* *ISO 80000–3,* *ISO/IEC ITTF,* *The Unicode Consortium. Unicode Standard Annex, UAX #44,*	There is no explicit requirement to use these documents. Please move the references to the Bibliography. **In accordance with the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 15.5.3:** "Only references cited in the text in such a way that some or all of their content constitutes requirements of the	Accepted. The following documents are all normatively referenced: ISO 4217, ISO 8601, The Unicode Consortium. Unicode Standard Annex, UAX #44, The Unicode Consortium. The Unicode Standard, Derived Core Properties The following references have been moved to the bibliography:	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
					The Unicode Consortium. Unicode Standard Annex, UAX #31, *The Unicode Consortium. The Unicode Standard, Derived Core Properties*	document shall be listed in the Normative references clause." This means that to be considered normative, these documents must be cited using a requirement i.e. "xxxx shall be in accordance with ISO 4217". This reference must be moved to the Bibliography at the end of the document. **NB: Keep in mind these comments must be addressed. Failure to do so can result in rejection of the document at the next stage.**	The Unicode Consortium. Unicode Standard Annex UAX #31 ISO 80000–3	
**-018		2		Ed	*ISO/IEC ITTF*	Where is ITTF website cited in the document? It does not appear to be cited normatively so please move to the bibliography	Accepted: ITTF Website is not referenced, so it has been removed instead of being moved to the bibliography.	✅
**-019		2		Ed	*ISO 8601*	ISO 8601 is a multi-part series - please include a reference to a specific part i.e. ISO 8601-1, or if the whole series applies, specify "the ISO 8601 series" in the text below. Furthermore, please correct the title of ISO 8601 depending on which part(s) are cited.	Accepted	✅
**-020		2		Ed	*Incorrect title for ISO 4217*	Please correct title to "Codes for the representation of currencies"	Accepted	✅
**-021		2		Ed	*URL in clause 2 not needed for ISO/IEC documents*	Remove " Available from the ISO online browsing	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						platform at http://www.iso.org/obp." and all other URL links for ISO/IEC documents listed in clause 2. Only the document title and number can be included here.		
**-022	3.18	3		Ed	*Definition*	Please revise wording of the definition to improve grammar: "specification that is strongly recommended as being **kept** in **alignment** with the intent of the standard, but that **can** be impractical for some implementations"	Rejected. Changes normative meaning of text.	✅
**-023	3.6	3		Ed	*Need not*	Please consider rephrasing this sentence to make the meaning clearer i.e. "**It is not necessary to** express the address of each individual bit of an object."	Rejected. Changes normative meaning of text.	✅
**-024	3.4, 3.9	3		Ed	*Term not used in the document*	As per the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 16.5.4: "Only terms which are used in the document (outside of clause 3) shall be listed in the Terms and definitions clause."	Accepted: adding missing use of term 3.4. Term 3.9 "Constraint" already referenced such as Clause 4, paragraph 2.	✅
**-025	3	3		Ed	*Terms and definitions are only allowed in Clause 3.*	1) Please change the second line to " ISO and IEC maintain **terminology** databases for use in standardization at the following addresses:". This is the fixed text. 2) Please delete paragraph 3 as Clause 3 cannot include anything other than term entries and the template text (introductory paragraphs 1 and 2). The only	Accepted: Changed terminological to terminology. Contextual definitions are necessary because of the size and the structure of the document.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						place to define a term in the document is in Clause 3, please add the term entries as necessary instead of having them in other places in the document.		
**-026	General	3	Cross references	Ed	*Cross references*	Please insert cross references and modify the existing cross references so the term is italicized and it is accompanied by the term entry number in parentheses (see example below). requirement that objects of a particular type be located on storage boundaries with addresses that are particular multiples of a *byte* (3.7) address	Accepted	✅
**-027	3.4	3	Ge	Ed	*Cross references to other parts of the document*	Please remove cross-reference to "floating-point number" subclause "5.2.4.2.2). Only cross-references to terms within clause 3 should be included. This is because definitions and terms can appear out of context of this document (on the HYPERLINK "https://www.iso.org/obp/ui" online browsing platform), therefore these terms and definitions should function as stand-alone entries. Please remove other cross-references to other parts of the document in clause 3.	Rejected. In some cases, these references are important to clarify the definition. We recommend that these cross-references be stripped when used in the vocabulary standard.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
**-028	General	3	Note to entry	Ed	*Incorrect format for notes to entry.*	Notes to entry should not be in bold font.. Please correct throughout Clause 3.	Accepted	✅
**-029	3	3.1		Ed	*Definition*	Please remove "to" at the beginning of this definition. In accordance with **the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 16.5.6**: 'The definition shall be written in such a form that it can replace the term in its context." This does not work if it begins with "to".	Accepted	✅
**-030	3.3	3.3		Ed	*Deprecated term*	The deprecated term should be on the line below the admitted term i.e. **argument**. actual argument DEPRECATED: actual parameter. See ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 16.6 for an example.	Accepted	✅
**-031	3.7	3.7		Ed	*Italics*	remove italics here as italics are reserved for cross-references to other terms within clause 3 only.	Accepted. We extracted high-order bit and low-order bit into their own definitions.	✅
**-032	3.9	3.9		Ed	*Requirements not permitted in definitions*	"is to be" suggests a requirement, which is not permitted in a definition. Please change the text to "which is intended to be	Accepted. "is to be" replaced by "is".	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						interpreted" so that it does not appear as a requirement.		
**-033		3.10		Ed	*Note 1 to entry*	The meaning of this note to entry is unclear. What is the intended usage exactly? It seems contradictory to state that "correctly rounded" should not be followed by "result".	Accepted. Change **Note 1 to entry**: In this document, the words "correctly rounded" may apply to an operation that produces a correctly rounded result, or to input for such an operation.	✅
**-034		3.12			*Grammar*	Please consider revising definition to improve readability i.e. "reference to a **subsequent** subclause of this document that contains additional information relevant to **that** subclause"	Accepted: Change to "reference to a subsequent subclause of this document that contains additional information relevant to the referring subclause"	✅
AT-035		3.21 3.22	side index	ed	The symbols for floor and ceiling are lost in the side index (side bar, navigation bar) of the pdf. The sole x is not helpful.	Generate the index in a way the symbols for floor and ceiling are not lost. Alternatively spell out ceiling and floor.	Accepted	✅
**-036		4				This footnote 3 could be an Example as per the ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, clause 25. Please consider changing	Accepted	✅
GB03-037		4	8	ed	There should not be a space before footnote number 5.	Remove the space.	Accepted	✅
**-038		7.6, 7.6.4, 7.6.5, 7.6.6, 7.8, 7.12, 7.13, 7.12.14 7.12.16, 7.12.17, 7.13, 7.14, 7.16, 7.17.2, 7.17.3,		Ge	*Hanging paragraphs* (listed in "Clause" column)	This is a hanging paragraph. **As per ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 22.3.3:** "Hanging paragraphs" shall be avoided since reference to them is ambiguous. A new subclause "5.1.2.1 General" must be inserted to correct this, and cross-references amended throughout the text.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
		7.17.4, 7.17.5, 7.17.6, 7.17.7, 7.17.8, 7.20, 7.21, 7.22, 7.22.1, 7.22.2, 7.22.3, 7.22.4, 7.23.6, 7.24.1, 7.24.3, 7.24.5, 7.24.7, 7.24.8, 7.28.4, 7.29.3, 7.30, 7.30.1, 7.31.2, 7.31.4, 7.31.4.4, 7.31.6, 7.31.6.3, 7.31.6.4, 7.32.2, 7.32.2.1, 7.32.2.2, 7.32.3, 7.32.3.2, 7.33, 5.1, 5.2.1, 5.2.4, 5.2.4.2, 6.4.4, 6.5.2, 6.5, 6.5.1, 6.5.16,				**NB: Keep in mind these comments must be addressed. Failure to do so can result in rejection of the document at the next stage.**		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
		6.5.3, 6.7, 6.7.2, 6.7.3, 6.7.6, 6.7.12, 6.7.12.7, 6.8, 6.8.4, 6.8.5, 6.8.6, 6.9, 6.10, 6.10.4, 6.10.9, 7.2, 7.4, B.6, D.2, F.2.1, F.8, F.9, F.10.12, F.10.13, F.10.14, G.5, G.6, H.2, H.4, H.11.3, H.11.3.1, H.11.3.2, H.12, H.12.3, H.12.4, J.3, J.5, J.6, K.3.5.3, K.3.6.3, K.3.6.4, K.3.6.5, K.3.7, K.3.8, K.3.8.2, K.3.9, K.3.9.3.1, K.3.9.3.2						

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
CA1-039		5.1.1.2	1	te	The removal of trigraphs makes it impossible for processing of C source code in code pages with variant code points for characters in the basic character set in a guaranteed deterministic way for all programs.	Add to the end of 5.1.1.2#1: Trigraph sequences are replaced by corresponding single-character internal representations. Add in a new section, 5.2.1.1 Trigraph sequences with the following body: Before any other processing takes place, each occurrence of one of the following sequences of three characters (called *trigraph sequences*)[17] is replaced with the corresponding single character. **??= # ??([??/ ** **??)] ??' ^ ??< {** **??! | ??> } ??- ~** No other trigraph sequences exist. Each **?** that does not begin one of the trigraphs listed above is not changed.	Reject	✅
GB04-040		5.1.2.1	1	ed	The change from "type" to "return type" made in commit 3a5f0b027d4e501aa86fbb43c1b9721439ad2c33 was incorrect here; "type" was genuinely being used to mean type, not return type.	Change "return type" to "type".	Accepted	✅
GB05-041		5.1.2.2.1	1	ed	Footnote number 10 should appear after not before the semicolon.	Move the footnote number after the semicolon.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB06-042		5.1.2.3	2	ed	Footnote number 12 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
**-043		5.1.2.4, Note 18			*Grammar*	Grammatical correction in Note 18: "In fact, most single-threaded program transformations continue to be allowed, since any program that behaves differently as a result **of xxxxx** necessarily has undefined behavior even before such a...". Please make it clear what it is "a result of".	Accepted. Change "as a result necessarily" to "as a result of such transformations necessarily"	✅
GB08-044		5.2.4.1	1	ed	In the sixth bullet point, there is a missing space before '('.	Change "name(each" to "name (each".	Accepted	✅
GB07-045		5.2.4.1	1	ed	Footnote number 17 should appear after not before the colon.	Move the footnote number after the colon.	Accepted	✅
**-046		**5.2.4.2.2**			*Cross references to other documents*	When referring to content or elements from other documents, please make the cross-reference clear, using the following construction i.e. "xxxxx as specified in ISO/IEC 60559". or "ISO/IEC 60559:2020, Annex x".	Accepted. Change to "An implementation that defines __STDC_IEC_60559_BFP__ or __STDC_IEC_559__ shall implement floating types and arithmetic conforming to IEC 60559 as specified in Annex F of this document. An implementation that defines __STDC_IEC_60559_COMPLEX__ or __STDC_IEC_559_COMPLEX__ shall implement complex types and arithmetic conforming to IEC 60559	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
							as specified in Annex G of this document."	
GB09-047		5.2.4.2.2	8	ed	Footnote number 22 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB12-048		5.2.4.2.3	10	ed	In the preferred quantum exponents table, the unary minus entry has extra space between '-' and '('.	Change "- (x)" to "-(x)" (remove that space).	Accepted	✅
GB11-049		5.2.4.2.3	10	ed	This table should be numbered (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.3). References to the table should be by number rather than position as per the ISO/IEC Directives.	Give the "Preferred quantum exponents" table a number following ISO rules (probably sequential numbering within the clause, so Table 5.2). Change "The table below" in paragraph 9, and "The following table" and "the table above" in paragraph 10, to refer to the table by number.	Accepted	✅
GB10-050		5.2.4.2.3	8	ed	This table should be numbered (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.3).	Give the "Quantum exponent ranges" table a number following ISO rules (probably sequential numbering within the clause, so Table 5.1).	Accepted	✅
GB13-051		6.1	3	ed	The cross-reference to "8" should be to "Annex A".	Change "8" to "Annex A" (keeping it as a link to the same place as at present).	Accepted	✅
GB14-052		6.2.2	4	ed	Footnote number 33 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB15-053		6.2.4	2	ed	Footnote number 35 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB16-054		6.2.5	12	ed	There should not be a space before footnote number 46.	Remove the space.	Accepted	✅
GB17-055		6.2.5	13	ed	Footnote number 47 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB18-056		6.2.5	31	ed	Footnote number 51 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
**-057		**6.2.6.2**			*Note 2*	NOTE 2 correction: "Previous **editions** of this document." To be more specific, consider adding the year of each edition i.e. ISO/IEC 9899:2018 etc.	Accepted	✅
GB19-058		6.2.7	3	ed	"At least one" in the last bullet point is redundant, given that the previous bullet point covers the case where both types are enumerated types and the last bullet point now (after commit 2dbb1c091d265887a79a312a903c7c4c276ae25e) explicitly says "other than an enumerated type" for the second type.	Change "At least one" to "One" in the last bullet point.	Accepted	✅
GB20-059		6.2.7	5	ed	Footnote number 60 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB21-060		6.3.1.1	2	ed	Footnote number 62 should appear after not before the semicolon.	Move the footnote number after the semicolon.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
** -061		**6.3.1.8, H.13, K.3.7.1.4, K.3.7.2.2, K.3.9.2.1.2, K.3.9.2.2.2 And all throughout the document**			*Example 1*	Correction: please remove the "1" from this example. If there is only one example in the subclause, then it does not need to be numbered. See ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 25.3 Please correct accordingly throughout the document	Accepted	✅
GB22-062		6.3.2.1	4	ed	Footnote number 69 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
** -063		**6.4.2.1**				Please indicate where the "translation phase 4" is cited in the text to make it clear for the user.	Accepted	✅
** -064		**6.4.2.2 and all examples beginning with "consider"**			*Examples - no imperatives permitted*	"Consider" is an imperative verbal form which can be considered to be a requirement. Please change this to "The following code fragment can be used as an example", so that it is clearly not a requirement.	Accepted	
GB23-065		6.4.3	2	ed	Footnote number 80 should appear after not before the '.'.	Move the footnote number after the '.'.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
** -066		**6.4.4.1**			*Examples – numbered when more than one within a subclause*	This should be Example 1	Accepted	✅
GB24-067		6.4.4.2	5	ed	This table should be numbered (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.3). References to the table should be by number rather than position as per the ISO/IEC Directives.	Give the table a number following ISO rules. Change “the following table” to refer to the table by number.	Accepted	✅
** -068		**6.4.4.2, 6.9.1, 6.10.1, 6.10.9, 7.3.9.3, 7.12.9.11, 7.12.12.3, 7.17.1, 7.24.9.1, 7.27, 7.28.4, F.2.1, F.10.12, F.10.13, H.2.4, H.5.2**	**Note 1**		*Note*	Correction: This note must be NOTE, not NOTE 1	Accepted	✅
** -069		**6.4.4.2, Note**			*No requirements in notes*	As stated above, notes cannot contain permissions "may" or requirements "require". Please remove these (i.e. change to "can") or make this note normal text.	Accepted: replace “may” with “can”. Replace “Annex F requires this behavior” with “implementations conforming to Annex F have this behavior”. Replace “Conversions yielding exact results require no rounding, so are not affected by the order of negating and rounding.” with “Conversions yielding exact results	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
							are not affected by the order of negating and rounding.”	
GB26-070		6.5.15	3	ed	Footnote number 122 should appear after not before the colon.	Move the footnote number after the colon.	Accepted	✅
GB27-071		6.5.16.1	1	ed	Footnote number 125 should appear after not before the colon.	Move the footnote number after the colon.	Accepted	✅
**-072		**6.5.2.2**		ed		remove "have to be" as this is an implicit requirement which is not permitted in an EXAMPLE.	Accepted: Replace “All side effects have to be completed before the function pointed to by pf[f1()] is called.” With “All side effects are completed before the function pointed to by pf[f1()] is called.”	✅
GB25-073		6.5.2.5	4	ed	Footnote number 110 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB28-074		6.6	11	ed	Footnote number 131 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB29-075		6.6	17	ed	Footnote number 134 should appear after not before the ‘.’.	Move the footnote number after the ‘.’.	Accepted	✅
GB30-076		6.7	6	ed	Footnote number 135 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB31-077		6.7.1	2	ed	Footnote number 137 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB33-078		6.7.1	22	ed	In this code example, there is a “~” in “IEC~60559” that should be a space (presumably intended as a non-breaking space in LaTeX, but shows up literally in a code example).	Change “IEC~60559” to “IEC 60559”.	Accepted	✅
GB32-079		6.7.1	6	ed	Footnote number 140 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB39-080		6.7.10	11	ed	Footnote number 178 should appear after not before the semicolon.	Move the footnote number after the semicolon.	Accepted	✅
**-081		**6.7.10**	**Example 1**	ed	*Font*	should the "d" here also be in bold? i.e. **#included ?**	Accepted. Change “#included” to “included” all without bold.	✅
GB40-082		6.7.12	5	ed	The reference to “Annex M (??)” should have an actual table number (or similar), not “??”. (“??” is a link to the correct destination, however.)	Change “??” to “Table M.1” (keeping it as a link to the same destination as at present).	Accepted	✅
GB34-083		6.7.2.1	11	ed	Footnote number 145 should appear after not before the semicolon.	Move the footnote number after the semicolon.	Accepted	✅
GB35-084		6.7.2.2	13	ed	Footnote number 151 should appear after not before the comma and the stray “.” before it should be removed.	Change “.151),” to “,151)” (superscript “151)”).	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
** -085		**6.7.2.2, 6.10, 6.10.1, 6.10.3.3, 6.10.3.4, 7.12.9.10,**		ed	*Examples must be numbered within the same subclause. If there is only 1, then this is only EXAMPLE without a number.*	These examples must be numbered EXAMPLE 1, EXAMPLE 2 etc.	Accepted	✅
GB3 6-08 6		6.7.2.3	10	ed	Footnote number 156 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
** -087		**6.7.22, 6.7.3, 6.10.3**			*Must in examples*	"must" is used in several EXAMPLES, which appear to be expressing requirement rather than external constraints (see **ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 7.6**). **Please remove all requirements from EXAMPLES or make them normal text.**	Accepted.	✅
** -088	**Last paragraph**	**6.7.6**		ed	*Note that…*	Instead of including this text in parentheses, please consider making it a Note.	Accepted. Remove parenthesis and remove "note that".	✅
GB3 7-08 9		6.7.6.2	4	ed	Footnote number 173 should appear after not before the semicolon.	Move the footnote number after the semicolon.	Accepted	✅
GB3 8-09 0		6.7.6.3	8	ed	There should not be a space before footnote number 174.	Remove the space.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB42-091		6.8.5	4	ed	Footnote number 200 should appear after not before the colon.	Move the footnote number after the colon.	Accepted	✅
GB41-092		6.8.5	4	ed	Footnote number 199 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
**-093		**6.8.6.1 (EXAMPLE 2), 7.24.3.4 (NOTE 2) And the whole document**	**Example 2**		*Negative permissions*	Negative permissions are ambiguous and should not be used. Rather than using negative permissions, either rewrite the sentence to state what is permitted, or rewrite as a requirement/recommendation not to do something. Furthermore, "is permitted" is a permission which is not permitted in an example. See ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 2021, 7.4 and Clause 25 **Please check the whole document and remove all negative permissions.**	Accepted. Change “is permitted” to “is valid”. Negative permissions will be rewritten as a requirement/recommendation where it improves readability.	✅
GB43-094		6.8.6.2	2	ed	Footnote number 202 should appear after not before the ‘.’.	Move the footnote number after the ‘.’.	Accepted	✅
GB44-095		6.9.1	10	ed	Footnote number 206 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB45-096		6.10	2	ed	There should not be a space before footnote number 208.	Remove the space.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

N3216 DIS 9899 Final disposition of comments

Date:2023-12-07	Document:	Project:

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB46-097		6.10.1	13	ed	Footnote number 212 should appear after not before the '.'.	Move the footnote number after the '.'.	Accepted	✅
GB47-098		6.10.4.5	5	ed	There is a mistake in the conversion of this example to LaTeX for C17 that previously went unnoticed. The definition of h should just have "~" instead of "\~{ }", and likewise where it is expanded in the expected results.	Change "\~{ }" to "~", twice (once in the definition of h, once in the expected expansion), thereby restoring the definition to the state it had in C11.	Accepted	✅
GB48-099		6.10.4.5	9	ed	"and", in the argument to showlist, should not be in bold, since it's not being used in any way as a standard macro. This was CD1 comment GB-140; subsequently CD2 comment GB-086 raised "and" being in the wrong colour (the latter comment rejected because of colour not being part of the final standard).	Arrange for "and" to be shown in the same font as the rest of that argument.	Accepted	✅
GB49-100		7.1.4	1	ed	There should not be a space before footnote number 237.	Remove the space.	Accepted	✅
GB50-101		7.1.4	4	ed	There should not be a space before footnote number 238.	Remove the space.	Accepted	✅
GB51-102		7.3.1	6	ed	Footnote number 244 should appear after not before the semicolon.	Move the footnote number after the semicolon.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

N3216 DIS 9899 Final disposition of comments

Date:2023-12-07	Document:	Project:

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB52-103		7.6	1	ed	There should not be a space before footnote number 254.	Remove the space.	Accepted	✅
GB53-104		7.6.2	4	ed	This table should be numbered (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.3). References to the table should be by number rather than position as per the ISO/IEC Directives.	Give the table a number following ISO rules. Change “the table below” and “the table above” to refer to the table by number.	Accepted	✅
GB54-105		7.6.3	2	ed	This table should be numbered (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.3). References to the table should be by number rather than position as per the ISO/IEC Directives.	Give the table a number following ISO rules. Change “the table below” and “the table above” to refer to the table by number.	Accepted	✅
GB55-106		7.17.2	1	ed	Footnote number 313 has ‘.’ both before and after it; the latter should not be present.	Remove the second ‘.’.	Accepted	✅
AT-107		7.18.3 7.18.4 7.18.5 7.18.6	p1 p1 p1 p1	te	While the headings use common, widely used terminology the actual function names do not. _count is missing in the function names. This is also not in line with 17.18.11 and 7.18.12. 7.18.11 and 7.18.12 have _count in the names as expected.	In 7.18.3 p1, 7.18.4 p1, 7.18.5 p1 and 7.18.6 p1 substitute the prefix stdc_ with stdc_count_ for all functions. This shall also apply to the generic variants.	Rejected	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB56-108		7.21.2	3	ed	Footnote number 318 should appear after not before the '.'.	Move the footnote number after the '.'.	Accepted	✅
GB57-109		7.22.1.5	1	ed	Footnote number 322 should appear after not before the colon.	Move the footnote number after the colon.	Accepted	✅
GB58-110		7.23.1	4	ed	Footnote number 325 should appear after not before the semicolon, and there should be no space before the semicolon.	Move the footnote number after the semicolon, and remove the space.	Accepted	✅
GB59-111		7.23.6.2	24	ed	"\\0" should be "\0" here; this is a LaTeX conversion issue introduced in C17.	Change "\\0" to "\0".	Accepted	✅
GB60-112		7.23.7.10	5	ed	Footnote number 353 should appear after not before the '.'.	Move the footnote number after the '.'.	Accepted	✅
GB62-113		7.24.3.1	2	ed	Footnote 360 should end with '.'.	Add '.' at the end of the footnote.	Accepted	✅
GB61-114		7.24.3.1	2	ed	Footnote number 360 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB63-115		7.24.5.1	5	ed	Footnote number 369 should appear after not before the comma and the stray "." before it should be removed.	Change ".369)," to ",369)" (superscript "369)").	Accepted	✅
GB64-116		7.26.4.1	2	ed	Footnote number 378 should appear after not before the '.'.	Move the footnote number after the '.'.	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB65-117		7.26.5.1	1	ed	Footnote number 379 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB66-118		7.29.1	2	ed	Footnote number 387 should appear after not before the semicolon.	Move the footnote number after the semicolon.	Accepted	✅
GB67-119		7.29.3.1	4	ed	Footnote number 396 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB69-120		7.31.4.1.1		ed	Footnote number 419 should appear after not before the '.'.	Move the footnote number after the '.'.	Accepted	✅
GB68-121		7.31.4.1.1		ed	The paragraph in this subclause should be numbered.	Give this paragraph number 1.	Accepted	✅
**-122		**7.31.4.5**			**Subclause numbering wrong**	this clause numbering is wrong. 7.31.4.5 is empty. Change 7.31.4.6 to "7.31.4.5.1 Introduction" and renumber subsequent subclauses.	Accepted	✅
GB70-123		7.31.4.6	1	ed	Footnote number 427 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
GB71-124		7.31.6.4.1	2	ed	There should be a space after footnote number 431, before the next sentence.	Insert a space between "431)" and "Each".	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
**-125		All examples in the text.		Ed	*Examples*	Please remember that EXAMPLES as per the ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, clause 25.This means: 1) they cannot contain requirements (shall), permissions (may) or recommendations (should). Requirements also include "have to be/has to be", "are to be/is to be", "is/are required to be", "is/are to be", and of course "shall". Please remove these requirements OR change these from EXAMPLES to normal text. 2) Examples appear in smaller font than normal text. Please amend accordingly. 3) "might" should be replaced with "can", as "might" is not a defined verbal form in the ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, and therefore the meaning can be unclear for the user. **Please review all examples in this document to ensure they comply with the above three points.**	Accepted. Imperatives will be rewritten when they express a new requirement.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						NB: Keep in mind these comments must be addressed. Failure to do so can result in rejection of the document at the next stage.		
** -126		**Annex A**				**ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 20.5: "**Each annex shall be explicitly referred to within the text." Please add a reference to this annex in the main body of the text.	Accepted	✅
** -127		**Annex A**			**Note in annex A**	Notes cannot appear under annex title, but they can appear under A.1. Please move the NOTE and make it "NOTE" not "NOTE 1".	Accepted. Add new subclause A.1 titled "Notation" and add text from note to this section but eliminate the note.	✅
** -128		**Annex f**			**Self reference**	within Annex F, use "this Annex" to refer to Annex F, not "Annex F"	Accepted	✅
** -129		**Annex J**			This annex collects some information about portability that appears in this document.	This sentence must be moved to J.1. A new "General" subclause can be created if necessary.	Accepted. Deleting sentence "This annex collects some information about portability that appears in this document" that must be moved.	✅ - kept sentence and used general clause to prevent hanging paragraph or deleting the note (since it makes it clear it may not collect ALL portability issues, just some)
** -130		**Annex L**			Normative annex	Annex L is normative, so please add an explicitly normative reference to this annex in accordance with **ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 20.2**.	Accepted. Add "shall" for the analyzability normative annex reference in §6.10.9.3 Conditional macros.	✅
** -131		**Annexes I and J**			**Reference in footnote only**	**ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 20.5: "**Each annex shall be explicitly referred to within the text." Please add a reference to this annex in the main body of the text. Currently Annex I and J	Accepted. Make the following footnote a Recommended Practice in the main text. 9)An implementation is encouraged to identify the nature of, and where possible localize, each violation. Of	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						are only cited in a footnotes 1 and 9. Please move these footnotes and citations of Annex I and J to the main text.	course, an implementation is free to produce any number of diagnostic messages, often referred to as warnings, as long as a valid program is still correctly translated. It can also successfully translate an invalid program. Annex I lists a few of the more common warnings. Move footnote "This document is designed to promote the portability of C programs among a variety of data-processing systems. It is intended for use by implementers and programmers. Annex J gives an overview of portability issues that a C program might encounter" To main body of text where footnote appears.	
GB7 3-132		F.10.6.6	3	ed	Footnote number 458 should appear after not before the colon.	Move the footnote number after the colon.	Accepted	✅
GB7 4-133		F.10.9.2	3	ed	Footnote number 460 should appear after not before the colon.	Move the footnote number after the colon.	Accepted	✅
GB7 2-134		F.3	1	ed	This table should be numbered (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.3). References to the table should be by number rather than position as per the ISO/IEC Directives.	Give the table a number following ISO rules. Change "the following table" to refer to the table by number.	Accepted	✅
**-135		Foreword		Ed	*Updating Foreword*	Please contact the editor to obtain the latest version of the Foreword, headers and footers (and other template texts) **before** submitting the document for FDIS ballot.	Accepted.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						For example, the current foreword is missing the last line and the third paragraph has been changed. The current headers and footers in this document are not correct - the footers should only have page number and the copyright. The page headers should have ISO/IEC DIS 9899:2023(E).		
GB75-136		G.4.2	1	ed	Footnote number 463 should appear after not before the comma.	Move the footnote number after the comma.	Accepted	✅
**-137	Whole document	General		Ed	*Examples*	EXAMPLES are not in bold text and should be the same size font as notes to entry.	Accepted	✅
**-138		General		Ed	*Italics*	Italics text is reserved for specific uses in ISO documents i.e. variables in mathematical formulae and cross-references in clause 3. Please change italics to normal font throughout the document.	Rejected. We are using italics for definitions which are also found outside of Clause 3 (see 011).	✅
**-139		General		Ed	*Paragraph numbering*	Please remove the paragraph numbering.	Rejected. SC22 Document N5861 passed resolution 23-05 requesting JTC1 for paragraph numbering at all stages.	✅
**-140		General		Ed	The font for the document shall be Cambria, use Courier New only for code. No other font shall be used.	Please change the font to Cambria before submitting the document for FDIS ballot.	Rejected. We do not own a license for the Cambria font and its use, and ISO has not provided one for use outside of e.g. Word.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB78-141		H.11.3.1.1, H.11.3.1.2, H.11.3.2.1, H.11.3.2.2, H.12.3.1, H.12.3.2, H.12.4.1, H.12.4.2, H.12.4.3, H.12.4.4		ed	The PDF bookmarks for these subclauses (not the visible text on the page) say “darkmagenta” in the function names.	Remove “darkmagenta” from the text of all PDF bookmarks.	Accepted	✅
GB79-142		H.12.3.1	heading	ed	As noted in CD1 comment US-289: There is a space before the “N” in the function name.	Remove the space between “strfromencf” and “N”.	Accepted	✅
GB76-143		H.2.1	1	ed	These tables should be numbered (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.3). References to the tables should be by number rather than position as per the ISO/IEC Directives.	Give the tables numbers following ISO rules. Change “The two tables below” to refer to the tables by number.	Accepted	✅
GB77-144		H.2.3	1	ed	This table should be numbered (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.3). References to the table should be by number rather than position as per the ISO/IEC Directives.	Give the table a number following ISO rules. Change “The table below” to refer to the table by number.	Accepted	✅
GB80-145		I.1	1	ed	The second sentence “None of such situations specified as part of this document.” is ungrammatical, and also misleading (some situations for warnings **are** specified in the main body of the document, albeit non-normatively, as part of Recommended Practice, and	Change that sentence to “Most such situations are not specified as part of this document.”.	Accepted. Remove sentence “None of such situations specified as part of this document.”	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
					the #warning directive is defined in normative text).			
GB108-146		Index		ed	There are bogus index entries for frompfp and frompfpx functions (note the first “p”; no such functions exist). This was part of CD1 comment GB-306.	Remove those index entries.	Accepted	✅
GB107-147		Index		ed	There are bogus index etnries for decodebin, decodebind, decodedec, decodedecd, decodef, encbind, encdecd, encf, encodebin, encodebind, encodedec, encodedecd, encodef, described as functions (there are also entries describing those a function families, which are OK).	Remove the index entries describing them as functions.	Accepted	✅
GB106-148		Index		ed	There are bogus index entries for macro name fragments for speed properties of fma and narrowing functions, such as FP_FAST_D, FP_FAST_F, ADDD, ADDF, XADDD, XADDF. (FP_FAST_FMAF is a valid macro name, but should not be indexed for page 562 because it’s used there as a name fragment. FP_FAST_FMAD is a fragment, not a valid macro name.) This was part of CD1 comment GB-306.	Remvoe the index entries for those name fragments, and instead add entries for the macro families as listed in H.11.1 paragraphs 3 through 8.	Accepted	✅
GB105-149		Index		ed	There are bogus index entries for the macro name fragments HUGE_VAL_D and HUGE_VAL_F.	Remove the index entries for those name fragments, and instead add entries for the macro families HUGE_VAL_FN, HUGE_VAL_DN, HUGE_VAL_FNX, HUGE_VAL_DNX (N in italics).	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB104-150		Index		ed	There are bogus index entries for math.h narrowing function name fragments such as addd, addf, xaddd, xaddf.	Remove the index entries for all those name fragments for math.h narrowing functions, and instead add entries for the function families such as fMaddfN (M and N in italics; see the H.11.2 list of families corresponding to 7.12.14 for the full list of 48 families).	Accepted	✅
GB103-151		Index		ed	There are bogus index entries for stdlib.h and wchar.h functions ending with “d” where the page in question is actually using those sequences of characters not as a function name for double, but as a fragment of a function name for _DecimalN or _DecimalNx, such as wcstod on page 576 as part of the names wcstodN and wcstodNx.	Remove the index entries for all those name fragments on pages where they are used as name fragments, and instead add entries for the function families such as wcstodN and wcstodNx.	Accepted	✅
GB102-152		Index		ed	There are bogus index entries for math.h, complex.h, stdlib.h and wchar.h functions ending with “f” where the page in question is actually using those sequences of characters not as a function name for float, but as a fragment of a function name for _FloatN or _FloatNx, such as acosf on page 564 as part of the names acosfN and acosfNx.	Remove the index entries for all those name fragments on pages where they are used as name fragments, and instead add entries for the function families such as acosfN and acosfNx (N in italics).	Accepted	✅
GB101-153		Index		ed	There are bogus index entries for math.h functions ending just “d”, which are name fragments of actual functions for decimal floating types, such as for acosd where the actual functions are acosdN and acosdNx.	Remove the index entries for all those name fragments for math.h decimal floating functions, and instead add entries for the function families such as acosdN and acosdNx (N in italics).	Accepted	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

N3216 DIS 9899 Final disposition of comments

Date:2023-12-07	Document:	Project:

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB100-154		Index		ed	There are no index entries for the type families _FloatN, _DecimalN, _FloatN_t, _DecimalN_t.	Add such index entries (N in italics).	Accepted	✅
GB99-155		Index		ed	There are no index entries for the types _Decimal32, _Decimal64, _Decimal128, _Decimal64x, _Decimal128x, _Float32x, _Float64x, _Float128x.	Add such index entries.	Accepted	✅
**-156		*Introduction*		Ed	*Introduction*	Please add a reference to the bibliography callout number [15]. See "Cross-references to an unnumbered document" in the ISO house style for further information: https://www.iso.org/ISO-house-style.html	Accepted. Add a reference to [15] in the Introduction paragraph 6: The library clause (Clause 7) is based on the 1984 /usr/group Standard. Add a reference to [14] on paragraph 5.	✅
**-157		*Introduction*			*Working group*	Please remove content regarding the Working group. As per the ISO house style: "Remove extra details that do not help the user to implement the document and make the document longer than it needs to be. For example, details about the development of the document (e.g. N documents, meetings, individual contributors, decisions taken) are of interest to the members of the Working Group but not the document user." See "Tone" ISO - ISO House Style.	Accepted. Remove paragraph 7.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
						If necessary, please include this reference in the bibliography, but please remove this text from the introduction.		
**-158	Introduction	Introduction		Ed	*Introduction*	Please consider making it clearer that this is referring to this updated edition of the document i.e. "With the introduction of new devices and extended character sets, new features could be added to **the new edition of** this document"	Accepted. Use the wording from p2 in p1: "With the introduction of new devices and extended character sets, new features could be added to <ins>future revisions of</ins> this document"	✅
GB83-159		J.2	1	ed	In item 141, "The type parameter" should have the word "type" in italics (similar to item 146, for example).	Change that instance of the word "type" into italics (leave the other instance in that item unchanged).	Accepted. Match the font from (7.16.1.1). Be consistent with J.2 items 146 and 149.	✅
GB82-160		J.2	1	ed	In item 80, the second entry in the list should have "nor" before it like the third.	Change "an empty initializer" to "nor an empty initializer".	Accepted.	✅
GB81-161		J.2	1	ed	In item 52, "a an integer" should be "an integer".	Change "a an integer" to "an integer".	Accepted.	✅
GB84-162		J.3.2	1	ed	The change from "type" to "return type" made to item 2 in commit 3a5f0b027d4e501aa86fbb43c1b9721439ad2c33 was incorrect here; "type" was genuinely being used to mean type, not return type.	In item 2, change "return type" to "type".	Accepted.	✅
GB86-163		J.6.1	2	ed	__alignas_is_defined and __alignof_is_defined were removed so should not appear in this list. This was CD1	Remove __alignas_is_defined and __alignof_is_defined from this list.	Accepted.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
					comment GB-320.			
GB85-164		J.6.1	2	ed	The following are fragments of identifiers or keywords (of no significance by themselves) and should not appear in this list: FP_FAST_D, FP_FAST_F, FP_FAST_FMAD, PRIB, strfromencbind, strfromencdecd, strfromencf, strtoencbind, strtoencdecd, strtoencf, wcstoencbind, wcstoencdecd, wcstoencf, X_DECIMAL_DIG, X_DIG, X_EPSILON, X_MANT_DIG, X_MAX, X_MAX_10_EXP, X_MAX_EXP, X_MIN, X_MIN_10_EXP, X_MIN_EXP, X_SNAN, X_TRUE_MIN, _Decimal, _DECIMAL_DIG, _EPSILON, _Float, _MANT_DIG, _MAX_10_EXP, _MAX_EXP, _MIN_10_EXP, _MIN_EXP, _SNAN, _TRUE_MIN. Some of these were previously listed in CD1 comment GB-319.	Remove those entries from this list.	Accepted.	✅
GB89-165		J.6.2	1	ed	acosd, acoshd, acospid, addd, addf, asind, asinhd, asinpid, atan2d, atan2pid, atand, atanhd, atanpid, canonicalized, cbrtd, ceild, compoundnd, copysignd, cosd, coshd, cospid, DEC, DECN_, DECN, decodebin, decodebind, decodedec, decodededecd, decodef, divd, divf, encbind, encdecd, encf, encodebin, encodebind, encodedec, encodededecd, encodef, erfcd, erfd, exp10d, exp10m1d, exp2d, exp2m1d,	Remove those entries from the list (without affecting their formatting elsewhere in the document).	Accepted.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
					expd, expm1d, fabsd, fdimd, Float, floord, FLT, FLTN_, FLTN, fmad, fmaxd, fmaximumd, fmaximum_magd, fmaximum_mag_numd, fmaximum_numd, fmind, fminimumd, fminimum_magd, fminimum_mag_numd, fminimum_numd, fmodd, frexpd, fromfpd, fromfpxd, getpayloadd, HUGE_VAL_D, HUGE_VAL_F, hypotd, ilogbd, ldexpd, lgammad, llogbd, llquantexpd, llrintd, llroundd, log10d, log10p1d, log2d, log2p1d, logbd, logd, log1pd, lrintd, lroundd, modfd, muld, mulf, N, nand, nearbyintd, nextafterd, nextdownd, nextupd, powd, pownd, powrd, quantized, quantumd, remainderd, rintd, rootnd, roundd, roundevend, rsqrtd, samequantumd, scalblnd, scalbnd, sind, sinhd, sinpid, sqrtd, subd, subf, tand, tanhd, tgammad, truncd, ufromfpd, ufromfpxd, xaddd, xaddf, xdivd, xdivf, xfmad, xfmaf, xmuld, xmulf, xsqrtd, xsqrtf, xsubd, xsubf are fragments of identifiers (of no significance by themselves) and should not appear in this list. This was CD1 comment GB-325 (which also included an identifier X_ that has been removed from the list).			
GB88-166		J.6.2	1	ed	The eight entries starting “frompfp” (note the first ‘p’) are entirely spurious; there are no	Remove those entries from the list.	Accepted.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
					such standard identifiers. This was CD1 comment GB-324.			
GB87-167		J.6.2	1	ed	The names reserved for complex.h by 7.33.1 are only listed in their “double” forms, not the corresponding float and long double identifiers. This was CD1 comment GB-322.	Add the corresponding “float” and “long double” identifiers to the list.	Accepted.	✅
GB90-168		K.3.6.3.1	7	ed	Footnote number 500 should appear after not before the comma and the stray “.” before it should be removed.	Change “.500),” to “,500)” (superscript “500)”).	Accepted.	✅
GB98-169		M.2	1	ed	The list of changes should mention qualifier-preserving library macros.	Add “added qualifier preserving macros for bsearch, memchr, strchr, strpbrk, strrchr, strstr, wcschr, wcspbrk, wcsrchr, wmemchr, and wcsstr” (function names in a fixed-width font) bullet point after the “changed the type qualifiers of the …” bullet point.	Accepted.	✅
GB97-170		M.2	1	ed	The list of changes should mention the memalignment function.	Add “added memalignment function to query the alignment of a pointer” (function name in a fixed-width font) bullet point after the memset_explicit bullet point.	Accepted.	✅
GB96-171		M.2	1	ed	The list of changes should mention sized deallocation support.	Add “added free_sized and free_aligned_sized functions” bullet point (function names in a fixed-width font) after the “zero-sized reallocations” bullet point.	Accepted.	✅
GB95-172		M.2	1	ed	The list of changes should mention the printf/scanf %wN, %wfN support.	Add “added printf and scanf length modifiers for intN_t, int_fastN_t, uintN_t, and uint_fastN_t” as the last bullet point (N in italics, the two function names and the four type names in a fixed-width font).	Accepted.	✅
GB94-173		M.2	1	ed	The list of changes should mention initialization with empty braces.	Add “added support for initialization of objects with empty braces;” after the constexpr bullet point.	Accepted.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

N3216 DIS 9899 Final disposition of comments

Date:2023-12-07	Document:	Project:

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB93-174		M.2	1	ed	The list of changes should mention support for omitting parameter names in function definitions.	Add a bullet point “parameter names may be omitted in function definitions;”, before the “ellipses on functions may appear…” bullet point.	Accepted.	✅
GB92-175		M.2	1	ed	The list of changes should mention the new minimum/maximum math.h functions (which didn’t come from TS 18661).	In the “harmonization with floating-point standard IEC 60559” bullet point, add a new sub-bullet point at the end: “new maximum and minimum functions for operations recommended in ISO/IEC 60559:2020”.	Accepted.	✅
GB91-176		M.2	1	ed	The list of changes should mention the integration of TS 18661-3.	In the “harmonization with floating-point standard IEC 60559” bullet point, add a new sub-bullet point between the second and third such points: “integration of floating-point types technical specification TS 18661-3”.	Accepted.	✅
**-177	3.19	Note 1 to entry		Ed	*Note to entry*	Please revise note 1 to entry to improve clarity: "Despite the similar terms, a runtime-constraint is not a kind of *constraint* (3.9), and **it is not necessary for it to be** diagnosed at translation time".	Accepted.	✅
**-178	3.20.2	Notes		Ed	*Definition sublevel*	why is "indeterminate representation" on the same level as "value" 3.20? Should it be 3.21, as it does not appear to come under the "umbrella" of the term "value"?	Accepted. Raise 3.20.2, 3.20.4, 3.20.5 to the top level of Clause 3	✅
GB02-179		page headings		ed	The page headings in the DIS say “© ISO/IEC 2023”, which is not the correct year for the final standard.	Change “2023” to “2024” before publication.	Accepted.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

N3216 DIS 9899 Final disposition of comments

Date:2023-12-07	Document:	Project:

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
GB01-180		page headings		ed	The page headings in the DIS say “ISO/IEC 9899:2023 (E)”, which is not the correct year for the final standard.	Change “2023” to “2024” before publication.	Accepted.	✅
**-181		**the whole document**		Ed	*Must*	**ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 7.6:** Do not use “must” as an alternative for “shall”. This avoids confusion between the requirements of a document and external constraints (see 7.2).	Accepted.	✅
**-182	3.5	Throughout the document		Ed	*Behaviour spelling*	Please use Oxford English spelling "behaviour"), as per the ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 8.2. Please correct throughout this document.	Rejected. Consistency with WG21 spelling of same term and existing usage. We are using the spelling from the Webster dictionary.	✅
**-183		**Whole document**		Ed	*Grammar*	Should lvalue be “l-value”?	Rejected. “lvalue” is an established term.	✅
**-184		**Whole document**		Ge	*All tables in the document must be cited, given a title and a number*	This is a table which must be given a table and title i.e. Table 1 - xxxxxxxx. It must also be cited in the text i.e. "See Table 1" instead of "the following Table". See **ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 29.4** **This comment applies to all tables in this document.**	Accepted.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
**-185		Whole document			*Notes cannot contain requirements, permissions or recommendations.*	As per the ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 24.5: 'Notes shall not contain requirements (e.g. use of "shall", see Table 3) or any information considered indispensable for the use of the document, for example instructions (imperative mood), recommendations (e.g. use of "should", see Table 4) or permission (e.g. use of "may", see Table 5).' "it is necessary" is a requirement. We suggest changing this to normal text or change to a descriptive statement i.e. "but it is expected that data races are ensured". **Please review all notes in this document to ensure they comply with the directives.** **NB: Keep in mind these comments must be addressed. Failure to do so can result in rejection of the document at the next stage.**	Accepted.	✅
**-186		Whole document			*Imprecise references*	Footnote 14: ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 2021, 10.1: 'Imprecise references such as "the following clause" or "as described below" shall not be used. Please replace imprecise references with precise element numbers, e.g. "Clause 5", "Figure 3".	Accepted.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
**-187		Whole document			*Might and can*	Avoid using verbal forms that are not defined in the HYPERLINK "https://www.iso.org/sites/directives/current/part2/index.xhtml#_idTextAnchor069"ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 2021, Clause 7. To ensure that a document is understood and applied correctly, use “may” to express a permission and “can” to express a possibility or capability. Avoid substituting either of these terms with “might” or “could”, even if this seems logical in English. See heading "Might and could" in HYPERLINK "https://www.iso.org/ISO-house-style.html" ISO house style. Keeping in mind that this is a NOTE, please change "could" to "can".	Accepted.	✅
**-188		Whole document			*Thousand separator*	**ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 9.1:** ‘Each group of three digits shall be separated by a small space from the preceding digits, counting from the decimal sign.’ Kindly amend throughout.	Rejected: See **ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 9.2**	✅
**-189		Whole document		Ed	*ISO/IEC 60599*	This document is "**ISO/IEC 60599".** Please correct throughout the document	Accepted. Change to ISO/IEC 60559. (Note the double ‘5’ and not the double ‘9’.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Disposition	Actually Merged
**-190		Whole document		Ed	*Footnotes*	**General comment:** instead of using footnotes throughout the document, please consider using Notes instead, in accordance with **the ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, Clause 24** Some of these footnotes which are short could also be incorporated into the text in parentheses. Please consider making this change to improve the readability of the document, so that the user does not need to search for footnotes to access the information.	Rejected. This change might affect normative text as there are currently over 500 footnotes. We'll improve this in future revisions.	✅

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

ISO_IEC DIS 9899 (Ed 5)_ASI.docx: Collation successful

ISO_IEC DIS 9899 (Ed 5)_BSI.doc: Collation successful

ISO_IEC DIS 9899 (Ed 5)_ISO.docx: Collation successful

ISO_IEC DIS 9899 (Ed 5)_SCC.doc: Collation successful

Collation of files was successful. Number of collated files: 4

SELECTED (number of files): 4

PASSED TEST (number of files conformed to CCT table model): 4

FAILED TEST (number of files conformed to CCT table model): 0

CCT - Version 2020.1