

# 2nd DLI Symposium

# Translanguaging

# Articles Table

Spring 2024



TEACHER EDUCATION FOUNDATIONS DEPARTMENT

**Spanish Bilingual Authorization**

Table: Translanguaging Literature Review.

Authors & Year	Bilingual Education Perspective	Country /State	Language/s (studied)	School Settings: Elementary (E)Secondary (S) Higher Education (HE)	Research Design: Exploratory (EX) Quantitative (QT) vs Qualitative (QL) or Mixed Methods (MM)	Translanguaging model	Main concepts mentioned	Translanguaging Practices/Strategies mentioned
García, O., & Lin, A. M. (2017).	Dynamic Bilingualism Dual Language Education	USA	English Welsh Spanish Tex-Mex Arabic-Hebrew Basque Sign Language	Elementary	EX	Unitarian Dynamic Bilingualism	Linguistic minorities Heteroglossic linguistic behavior. Translanguaging as multiple discursive practices beyond code switching. Named languages as national/state languages Language Isolation Code Switching Translingual practice Translanguaging is different from code switching. Post additive bilingualism. Translanguaging is a political act to	Code switching Bilingual label quests Relation and translation across languages Simultaneous literacies Code Meshing

							empower language minoritized children. Push against the “two solitudes” approach in DLI	
Palmer, D. K., Martínez, R. A., Mateus, S. G., & Henderson, K. (2014).	Dual Language Bilingual Education	USA/ Texas	English Spanish	Pre-Kinder garten 1st Grade	QL Ethnography and discourse analysis	Additive Bilingualis m Dynamic Bilingualis m	Strict Language separation in DLI Two solitudes assumption Dual-monolingualis m Paradigm Language as practice (action in social and cultural contexts) Identity Theory Linguistic repertoires Crossing Language Sharing Hybrid language practices.	Translanguaging practices Students as Translators or interpreters. Codeswitching (between languages or language dialects) Metalinguistic Commentary (Cognates/false friends) Cognate Cops
Somerville , J., & Faltis, C. (2019). Dual languaging as strategy and translangu aging as	Dynamic Bilingualis m Dual Language Education	Midwes tern City  USA	Spanish English	fourth grade math and social studies	<b>Qualitative (QL)</b>	Unitarian  Strong version, the other is a Weak version, call for combining	They argue students’ translanguaging can be understood as a language <i>tactic</i> that challenges traditional TWDL policy of language separation. The traditional TWDL	Code switching Translanguaging Dynamic Bilingualism Purpose that new TWDL models include: a. designated time and effort to developing students’

tactic in two-way dual language programs. Theory Into Practice, 58(2), 164-175.

(Chapter 3) Solorza, C., Aponte, G., Leverenz, T., Becker, T., & Frias, B. (2019). Translanguaging in dual language bilingual education: A blueprint for

					both.  Bilinguals speakers are not usually allowed to deploy speaker full linguistic repertoire in traditional TWDL	uses <i>strategies</i> that align with institutional policies	linguaging practices in academic contexts, which include the use of multiple varieties of both languages  b. designated time and effort for encouraging and facilitating students' translanguaging practices
Integrated Languages are still considered separate entities, but can be used at the same time to learn and teach  Acknowledges all	Queens , New York  USA	Spanish English	4th grade	<b>Qualitative (QL)</b>	Unitarian Dynamic Bilingualism	This chapter discusses: translanguage classroom community development and translanguaging spaces	Use designated colors to identify named languages  establish translanguaging spaces  value linguistic diversity  develop mindfulness of culturally-bound words  use comparative analysis and self-reflection to

planning units of study.	student's repertoire s.							develop metalinguistic awareness through: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. comparative language study</li> <li>2. create cognate/false charts</li> <li>3. language self-reflection</li> </ol>
Delavan, M. G., Valdez, V. E., & Freire, J. A. (2017).	Dual Language Education	USA/Utah	Chinese French German Portuguese Spanish	Kindergarten to Sixth Grade	(QL) Critical Discourse Analysis	Languages are still considered separate entities, but can be used at the same time to learn and teach.	Discursive erasure/pattern discourse of highly relevant information became close inspection. Disorienting discursive speech/pattern distracts the audience from other speech. Equity/Heritage Framework World Languages Constituency Preserve local linguistic diversity Create access for marginalized language communities	Three theories of DL: Maintenance, Heritage, World Language Prepare linguistically and culturally responsive teaching. Students compete in complex global economic and industrial sectors. (Business of Language) Promotional materials made: discursive erasure, misdirection

							Maintenance of a local language Proactive approach in promotional materials	
Tian, Z. (2022).	Multilingual Spaces in Dual Language Bilingual Education	USA/Texas	English Mandarin Spanish	Elementary	QL (Participatory Action Research)	Additive Bilingualism Dynamic Bilingualism	Create balanced and translingual societies. Creating social change/educational justice. Establish curricular objectives/demands for each content area. Interlinguistic Connections Pedagogical Translanguaging Synchronous Translanguaging Translanguaging establishes deliberation by alternating input and output languages. Process information in familiar language to promote a deeper understanding of the topic.	Translanguaging Transformation, access to opportunities for bilingual students to use linguistic resources to process challenges. Bi/Multicultural Identities Multilingual Dynamic Bi/Multilingualism Three main steps: reading discussion, teacher model, students making a connection to their own language/culture portraits.

							<p>Cognitive skills to internalize new skills, to understand the concept simultaneously/ immediately.</p> <p>Pedagogical strategy to improve student understanding in access (prior knowledge/ understanding of complex concepts)</p>	
Caldas B. (2019)	Bilingual preservice teachers and translanguaging in teaching and learning	USA	Spanish English Spanglish Tex-Mex Pocho	HE	QL	<p>Dynamic Bilingualism</p> <p>Spanglish is Translanguaging</p> <p>Softening boundaries between separated languages</p>	<p>Linguistic minorities</p> <p>Language Ideology</p> <p>Effects on culture</p> <p>Educational Approach</p> <p>Bilingual stances</p> <p>Language Isolation</p> <p>Code Switching</p> <p>Translingual practices</p> <p>Raciolinguistics</p> <p>discrimination</p>	<p>Academic Code switching</p> <p>Language Separation</p> <p>Multiple Language Practices</p>

							<p>Translanguaging is different from code switching.</p> <p>Post additive bilingualism.</p> <p>Translanguaging is a political act to empower language minoritized children.</p> <p>Push against the “two solitudes” approach in DLI</p>	
Solorza, C., Aponte G., Leverenz, T., Becker, T., & Frias, B. (2019).	DLBE Teachers translanguaging in teaching and learning	USA	Spanish English Spanglish	E	MM	<p>Additive Bilingualism</p> <p>Acknowledges all student’s repertoires</p> <p>Contextual translation is encouraged to learn, languages can feed each other (cognates, connections, etc.)</p>	<p>Translanguaging assessments honor student’s diverse linguistic practices</p> <p>Complex language/learning profiles</p> <p>Freedom to use their entire linguistic repertoire to better gauge their understanding of the content</p>	<p>Translanguaging pre-assessments formative &amp; culminating assessments</p> <p>Linguistic repertoire</p>



Guerrero, M. (2023).	Dynamic Bilingualism Dual Language Education	USA	English Spanish	Elementary	MM	Unitarian Dynamic Bilingualism	Is there evidence to reframe language allocation in two-way immersion programs? Dynamic bilingual practices: code switching and translation Conceptualizing bilingualism as a unitary linguistic system Translanguaging rings Advocates and opposed perspective of language separation in the classroom Translanguaging vs. Language separation How translanguaging affects emergent bilingual latino children in TWI programs	Translating Interpreting Code-switching Differentiation Scaffolding
Garza, E., & Arreguín-A	Dynamic Bilingualism	USA	English Spanish	Elementary	QL	Dynamic Bilingualism	Translanguaging pedagogy Code switching	Code switching Code-mixing

Anderson, M. G. (2018).	Dual Language Education						<p>Translanguaging as a framework to engage in discursive practices</p> <p>Translanguaging pedagogy to engage in receptive and expressive language use</p> <p>Dynamic bilingualism</p> <p>Multimodal learning approach</p> <p>Translanguaging to enhance science learning</p> <p>Use translanguaging to make connections /prior knowledge</p> <p>Defying language separation/compart mentalization in bilingual classrooms</p>	Use of multimodal communication and various resources
Hamman, L. (2018)	Translanguaging in	USA	English Spanish	Elementary	Mixed Methods	Dynamic bilingualism	Translanguaging discredits the	Claiming the “right to speak”

	Dual Language Education (Two -Way)					Language flexibility	<p>assumption of 2 solitudes</p> <p>Language &amp; its speakers evolve in a socio-ideological context</p> <p>Dynamic use of language in real-life contexts</p> <p>Language is heteroglossic</p> <p>Power dynamics influence students academically</p> <p>Flexible language strategy can benefit and hinder dual immersion programs</p> <p>Sociolinguistic environment affects the needs of DLI in a region</p> <p>For it to be successful students</p>	<p>Scaffold language &amp; learning</p> <p>Authentic communication</p> <p>Flexible language practices</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	-------------------------	--	---

							need to be included in conversations about the nature of bilingualism	
Valdes, G. (2018)	Two-Way Bilingual Immersion	USA	English Spanish French (mentioned)	Elementary	Exploratory	Additive bilingualism	<p>TWI made for monolingual students in societal language and those in minority language</p> <p>Aimed to help minority language speakers learn English &amp; give up home language</p> <p>Promote linguistic &amp; ethnic equity</p> <p>Curriculum language</p> <p>Theoretical and ideological mechanisms</p> <p>IN TWI, translanguageing might not be</p>	<p>Interacting mechanisms</p> <p>Translanguageing should be discouraged in TWI so that all students reach maximal opportunities to develop additional language</p>

							appropriate or as beneficial Use of 2 languages must be strategic	
Esther Garza & María Guadalupe Arreguín-Anderson (2018)	One way dual language classroom	USA	Spanish English	Elementary	QL	Flexible Approach	Science being taught in Spanish. Content-based centers Flexibility in Spanish and English Prior knowledge	Code switching Relation and translation across languages Discussing in one language and reading/writing in another Linguistic Repertoire Multimodal formats Simultaneous literacies Code Meshing
Ester J. de Jong (2016)	Two Way Immersion	USA	English Spanish	Elementary Secondary	EX	90:10 model  50:50 model	Strict Language separation in DLI Duality of TWI population Linguistic diversity Student identities Non-linguistic student diversity Issues in translating content Dynamic bilingualism Dual-monolingualism Paradigm Language as practice Achievement Gap Teaching pedagogy	Balanced number of speakers Recognizing multilingualism Awareness of bilingualism Importance of language separation double monolingualism Flexible bilingualism Knowledge transfers Codeswitching Metalinguistic Commentary (Cognates)

García-Mateus, S., & Palmer, D. (2017)	Two-Way Dual Language Bilingual Education	[South western ] USA	English Spanish	(E)/1st Grade	(QL)	Integrated Two-Way Dual Language	Identity construction; Strictly separating language of instruction prevents emergent bilinguals from developing positive identities. EB's are less inclined to take linguistic risks and engage in critical discussions that explore social issues pertaining to equity; translanguageing offers more equitable educational and language opportunities to minoritized bilingual students	Translanguageing; use of critical multicultural children's literature; full linguistic repertoire to construct meaning around critical bilingual literature; bilingual pairs where each student serves as an "expert" in his/her native language; no separation of language; strategies that support positive identity development and promote critical metalinguistic awareness in two-way dual language bilingual education; linguistic interaction; developing bilingual identities
Cummins, J. (2021)	Bilingual and Second language immersion programs	Belgium /Flanders; Italy;	English Spanish Welsh Dutch	(E) (S)	(EX)	Unitarian; Integrated Additive bilingualism	Lack of empirical evidence or analytic discussion of the combination of additive bilingualism with monoglossic ideologies;	Codeswitching; Pedagogical translanguageing; Engaging students' multilingual repertoires; decolonizing curriculum;

							Minimal differences between instructional strategies promoted by Unitary Translanguaging Theory (UTT) and Crosslinguistic Translanguaging Theory (CTT); Theoretical framing of these strategies (UTT) fail to address relevant empirical evidence, have logically inconsistent propositions, and give unclear and confusing messages to educators committed to equitable and effective teaching of minoritized students; transforming the educational achievement of minoritized students requires more than critical translanguaging or	affirming student identities; translation; cross-linguistic study and metalinguistic awareness of their own bilingual practices
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

							critical multilingual awareness	
Solorza, C., Aponte, G., Leverenz, T., Becker, T., & Frias, B. (2019)	Dynamic Bilingualism Dual Language Education	USA, New York	Mentioned: English, Spanish, Mandarin, LOTE	E	EX	Dynamic Bilingualism	Traditional bilingualism (two autonomous linguistic systems - code switching), Cummins's Linguistic Interdependence theory (two distinct autonomous linguistic spaces; equivalent proficiencies in both languages), Dynamic bilingualism (translanguaging; one linguistic system with features from both languages); dialects, informal, and social language; students naturally translanguaging; languages as social-political constructs, linguistic/cultural identity; strict language allocation	Codeswitching; utilizing full linguistic repertoire/resources by using features from two or more languages; dialects, informal, or social language; assess, observe, and listen to students to understand how they use their linguistic knowledge; every student has their own translanguaging, not one universal; Language is part of identity, and therefore we should not limit students use of it because it is part of how they express themselves



							policies and how they limit students and create a deficit mindset; linguistic/cultural identity; utilizing full linguistic repertoire; balanced bilingual	
Yilmaz, T. (2021)	Dynamic Bilingualism Dual Language Education	USA	English, Spanish Arabic Chinese Swahili Russian Haitian Creole	E, HE	EX	Dynamic Bilingualism	pedagogy related to true bilingualism and translanguaging recognizes there is a singular linguistic system that can aid in teaching/learning content and language development; pedagogy should “mirror” the students’ language practices; historically language minoritized-students’ have not had their linguistic funds of knowledge and resources valued in mainstream classrooms; Cen Williams coined the	Teachers should set high expectations, encourage students to share their resources, and help students engage in academic rigor using their full linguistic resources. This also allows students to access more resources and knowledge that may not be available in one language classrooms. This also encourages students to be critical, creative thinkers who can find and use different ways of thinking, closing educational gaps and the perceived hierarchy created by strict

							<p>term 'translanguaging' as a pedagogical practice to help promote student bilingualism and academic achievement, and to give them a voice; Bilingualism is defined differently depending on your view (i.e. monoglossic: mastering two separate, distinct languages, heteroglossic: bilingualism is a singular system incorporating multiple languages); Dynamic Model of Multilingualism: development of fluid language practices in order to communicate and make meaning between languages, dialects, etc.;</p>	<p>language guidelines in a traditional monolingual classroom.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

							Translanguaging is “the flexible use of linguistic resources by bilinguals in order to make sense of their worlds,’ different from code-switching, as it is a pedagogy that allows linguistic flexibility as one system of multiple languages, and more equitable learning environments that recognize students’ funds of knowledge and affirms their identity	
Laura Alamillo, Cathy Yun & Lisa H. Bennett (2016)	DynamicBilingualism Dual Language Immersion Education	CA, USA	English Spanish	E	QL	Integrated Dynamic Bilingualism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Project-based curriculum</li> <li>-Reggio-Emilia Approach (adapted)</li> <li>-Student choice (in language use and curriculum)</li> <li>-(bi)literacies (including non-linguistic literacies)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Code switching</li> <li>-Multimodalities</li> <li>-Children not pressed to use one language or the other</li> <li>-Maintenance, pluralism, and enrichment</li> <li>-bi/multi literacies</li> </ul>

							<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-child directed speech (particularly in non-native language)</li> <li>-Scaffolding</li> <li>-Hybridity</li> <li>-Break away from 90/10</li> <li>Spanish/English split in early childhood</li> <li>DLI</li> <li>-Changing Teacher Perspectives</li> <li>-progettazione (flexible planning and documentation)</li> </ul>	
Cristian R. Aquino-Sterling & Fernando Rodríguez-Valls (2016)	Additive Bilingualism in Dual Language Immersion Teacher Preparation Programs	USA	Spanish English	HE	EX	Integrated Additive Bilingualism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Spanish Language Competencies</li> <li>-Teaching-specific language competencies</li> <li>-Pedagogical Spanish</li> <li>-Full Professional Proficiency</li> <li>-“we space”</li> <li>-scaffolding</li> <li>-not teaching skills in isolation</li> <li>-real world application</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Hybrid language</li> <li>-Additive approach</li> <li>-critical language awareness</li> <li>-embracing all languages, language variances, and cultures</li> <li>-Language for a Specific Purpose</li> <li>-Discipline Specific Vocabulary</li> <li>-Syntax/Pragmatics</li> <li>-Integrated and Designated Spanish Language Development</li> </ul>

							-cultural responsiveness	
Lima Becker, M., Chang-Bacon, C. K., & Oliveira, G. (2022)	Unilateral translanguage teacher practices TWI	USA	Portuguese English	K-1	MM	TWI programs	Monoglossic language ideologies Dynamic bilingual education Identity formation Linguistic inclusivity Linguistic repertoire Portuguese and English Critical pedagogy Bilingual Biliteracy development English Language Learners Linguistic benefits of translanguage Translanguage equity and social justice	translanguage dynamics in the classroom instructional time 80% portuguese and 20% english in kinder 70/30 in first grade literacy and Math in portuguese ELD and ESL teachers teach science and social studies in English English literacy taught after first grade
Zheng, B. (2019). Zheng, B. (2019).	CI Bilingual education	USA	Chinese English	K-12	MM	Chinese Immersion Bilingual education	Linguistic Repertoire Linguistic inclusivity Named languages English-Other languages Critical pedagogy Code Switching Bilingual	Code Switching Multimodal Dynamic Student Centered Collaborative Project Based Learning Code meshing

							<p>Sociocultural competence</p> <p>High academic achievement</p> <p>Language proficiency</p> <p>Cultural appropriation</p> <p>Biliteracy</p> <p>Emergent bilinguals</p> <p>Linguistic, Social, Cognitive and cultural benefits of Translanguaging</p> <p>Translanguaging teaching practices/strategies</p>	<p>Comprehension</p> <p>translanguaging</p>
YILMAZ, T. & JONG, E. (2020)	<p>Culturally and Linguistically Diverse (CDL) students</p> <p>Mainstream education and Cagdas Turkish</p>	USA/Turkey	<p>English Turkish</p> <p>Spanish</p> <p>Cantonese</p>	<p>Elementary- 1st grade</p>	Quantitative (QT)	<p>Bilingual</p> <p>Monolingual</p> <p>Translanguaging</p>	<p>Students Linguistic patterns: at home, mainstream school and Cagdas Turkey School.</p> <p>How CLD students navigate their linguistic repertoire as they move across home, school and heritage language school. Role of translanguaging in</p>	<p>Code switching between languages to communicate,</p> <p>Boundary crossing</p>

	School (CTS)						the CDL's student boundary crossing experience.	
de Jong, E. J., Coulter, Z., & Tsai, M. C. (2023)	bi/multilingualism two-way immersion two-way bilingual education	USA	English Spanish	Middle school (grade 6–8)	Expository Study	multilingual Bilingualism	Functions of translanguaging in the classroom, Translanguaging plays a role in making a sense of belonging and student identities	flexible use of both English and Spanish, inclusion,

References:

- Alamillo, L., Yun, C., & Bennett, L. H. (2017). Translanguaging in a Reggio-inspired Spanish dual-language immersion programme. *Early Child Development and Care*, 187(3-4), 469-486.
- Aquino-Sterling, C. R., & Rodríguez-Valls, F. (2016). Developing teaching-specific Spanish competencies in bilingual teacher education/Toward a culturally, linguistically, and professionally relevant approach. *Multicultural Perspectives*, 18(2), 73-81
- Caldas, B. (2019). To switch or not to switch/ Bilingual preservice teachers and translanguaging in teaching and learning. *TESOL Journal*, 10(4), 485
- Catalano, T., & Hamann, E. T. (2016). Multilingual pedagogies and pre-service teachers/ Implementing “language as a resource” orientations in teacher education programs. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 39(3-4), 263-278.
- Cummins, J. (2021). *Translanguaging\_A critical analysis of theoretical claims. Pedagogical translanguaging/Theoretical, methodological and empirical perspectives*, 7-36
- de Jong, E. J. (2016). Two-way immersion for the next generation/ Models, policies, and principles. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 10(1), 6-16
- de Jong, E. J., Coulter, Z., & Tsai, M. C. (2023). Two-way bilingual education programs and sense of belonging/ Perspectives from middle school students. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* 26, 84-96
- Delavan, M. G., Valdez, V. E., & Freire, J. A. (2017). Language as whose resource?/ When global economics usurp the local equity potentials of dual language education. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 11(2), 86-100.
- Fortune, T. W., & Tedick, D. J. (2019). Context matters/ Translanguaging and language immersion education in the US and Canada. In *Perspectives on language as action* (pp. 27-44). Channel View Publications.
- García-Mateus, S., & Palmer, D. (2017). Translanguaging pedagogies for positive identities in two-way dual language bilingual education. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, 16(4), 245-255.
- García, O., & Wei, L. (2014). *Language, bilingualism and education* (pp. 46-62). Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- García, O., & Lin, A. M. (2017). Translanguaging in bilingual education. *Bilingual and multilingual education*, 117-130.
- Garza, E., & Arreguín-Anderson, M. G. (2018). Translanguaging/ Developing scientific inquiry in a dual language classroom. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 41(2), 101-116.
- Guerrero, M. (2023). Gauging the adequacy of translanguaging allocation policy in Two-Way immersion programs in the US. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 22(4), 1427-1441.
- Hamman, L. (2018). Translanguaging and positioning in two-way dual language classrooms/ A case for criticality. *Language and Education*, 32(1), 21-42.



- Lima Becker, M., Chang-Bacon, C. K., & Oliveira, G. (2022). Unilateral translanguaging/teachers language use, perceptions, and experience in a Portuguese-English two-way immersion program.IJdBB.25(8)3068-3083
- Palmer et al (2014) Reframing the Debate on Language Separation- Toward a Vision for Translanguaging Pedagogies in the Dual Language Classroom
- Palmer, D. K., Martínez, R. A., Mateus, S. G., & Henderson, K. (2014). Reframing the debate on language separation: Toward a vision for translanguaging pedagogies in the dual language classroom. *The Modern Language Journal*, 98(3), 757-772.
- Scherzinger, L., & Brahm, T. (2023). A systematic review of bilingual education teachers' competences. *Educational Research Review*, 100531.
- Solorza, C., Aponte, G., Leverenz, T., Becker, T., & Frias, B. (2019). Translanguaging in dual language bilingual education/ A blueprint for planning units of study.
- Somerville, J., & Faltis, C. (2019). Dual languaging as strategy and translanguaging as tactic in two-way dual language programs.*Theory Into Practice*,58(2),164-175
- Tian, Z. (2022). Challenging the 'Dual'/ Designing translanguaging spaces in a Mandarin-English dual language bilingual education program. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*,43(6)534-553
- Valdés, G. (2018). Analyzing the curricularization of language in two-way immersion education/ Restating two cautionary notes.*Bilingual research journal*,41(4),388-412
- Yilmaz, T. (2021). Translanguaging as a pedagogy for equity of language minoritized students. *International Journal of Multilingualism*,18(3),435-454
- Yilmaz, T., & de Jong, E. (2020). Translanguaging as a Boundary Crossing Mechanism/ A Turkish-American Youngster and Her Linguistic Negotiation of Three Discursive Spaces. *Australian Journal of Applied Linguistics*,311-25
- Zheng, B. (2019). Translanguaging in a Chinese immersion classroom/ An ecological examination of instructional discourses. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*.