Department of Educational Technology, New Jersey City University

Doctorate in Educational Technology Leadership

EDTC 807 Implementation and Evaluation of Curriculum

Assignment (Conservative v. Progressive View of Education)

E.D. Hirsch is an advocate for a "core knowledge base" to be taught in American schools and argues that Progressives such as Dewey are one reason American students are not achieving as well as they should be.

Read about Hirsch and his philosophy about schooling. Compare his thoughts and ideas to one of his critics. You can present the information in table or diagram form. Be as specific as possible.

Sedar Fred Pougaza

Keywords: Conservative view of Education, Progressive view of Education, E.D. Hirsch, Dewey, American Schools, Core Knowledge Base, Experiential Learning, Achievement Gap, Pedagogy.

Idea:	Hirsch	Critic (Dewey)
Achievement Gap	Hirsch's argument as to why it exists	Critic's argument
Critical thinking	• "Core knowledge base" • Core content can and will be retained. It is also useful as a building block for further depth of knowledge (Tully, 2005, p. 399). • Emphasis on "Content-based learning" in schools in *The Schools We Need and Why We Don't Have Them* • Hirsch's mantra is "content knowledge." • The decline in school performance nationwide, such as in the United States, can be attributed to the introduction of European Romantic-era ideologies during the 19th century (Tully, 2005, p. 396). • A necessity for shared information in upholding a	• Experiential learning. • According to Dewey, our optimal learning occurs through active involvement with the material, as opposed to merely listening to lectures or rote memorization of facts (Main, 2023). • Utilizing progressive techniques of impactful questioning and fostering dialogue can facilitate deeper and more meaningful interactions within classroom settings (Main, 2023). • The human experience should

	democratic society (Tully, 2005, p. 397). • Hirsch attributes the decline in classroom performance to the absence of a common reservoir of knowledge or "shared bank of knowledge" (Tully, 2005, p. 397). • According to Hirsch, for effective classroom learning to occur, it is essential for all class members to possess sufficient shared reference points, facilitating consistent learning for every student (Tully, 2005, p. 397). • Particularly at younger ages and lower grades, students must establish a base of knowledge that serves as a reference point as they continue to expand their understanding over time. For instance, it is important for	serve as a guiding light in both education and efforts toward social reform (Main, 2023). • Dewey argues that knowledge must be firmly rooted in practical, real-life experiences, and true exploration and learning can only occur when students actively engage with their material through firsthand experiences or experimentation (Main, 2023). • For Dewey, education goes beyond acquiring theoretical knowledge; it also involves gaining

	students to learn about the Tigris and Euphrates Rivers in the fourth grade, rather than simply visiting a river. This knowledge will later enable students to identify these rivers within discussions about the origins of civilization (Tully, 2005, p. 397). • Hirsch takes great pains to demonstrate that, despite being in the minority, the educational sphere lacks substantial evidence to support the notion that critical thinking and project-based curricula yield benefits for students. Inquiry-based learning often results in reduced whole-class instruction, leading to decreased student engagement and a slower rate of learning. Additionally, integrated	practical experience (Main, 2023). • Dewey takes a holistic view of education, seeing it as an ongoing process that merges academic knowledge with life experiences. He encourages students to blend critical thinking skills with real-world applications, fostering a seamless integration of theory and practice (Main, 2023). • Dewey advocates for a holistic approach to pedagogy, emphasizing the integration of experiential learning

	curriculum approaches frequently result in a lack of coherence in the presentation of information (Tully, 2005, p. 397). • Delaying the implementation of a developmentally appropriate curriculum means allowing valuable time before imparting crucial knowledge to students, knowledge that is often introduced at earlier stages in other countries (Tully, 2005, p. 398). • Hirsch highlights France and the ecoles maternelles as a prime example of successful early education, demonstrating the effectiveness of a content-based curriculum for young students at very early ages (Tully, 2005, p. 398).	into the educational process. He suggests that students should merge theoretical knowledge with practical experience, fostering a deeper understanding of concepts through hands-on engagement (Main, 2023). • Dewey asserts that meaningful experiences play a vital role in shaping a well-rounded student who possess the ability to think critically and apply tangible skills in the real world (Main, 2023).

	• Hirsch describes content curriculum as the most effective method available for imparting fundamental, foundational knowledge (Tully, 2005, p. 398). • Hirsch also advocates for standardized tests, often criticized, as a valuable means of measuring learning and bolstering content-based education. Despite being scapegoated for poor outcomes and labeled as unfair to minorities, these tests can provide valuable insights and prevent students from being pigeonholed (Tully, 2005, p. 398). • According to Hirsch, “Tests are also effective in determining the adequacy of a teacher’s or a school’s performance, in	• Child-centered teaching. • For years, educational terms such as "classrooms without walls," "lifelong learning," and "project-based education" have been prevalent in the educational landscape (Tully, 2005, p. 397). • Rote learning is frequently boring and fails to establish meaningful connections for recall. Memorization tends to be impractical and results in fragmented understanding. Verbal-based education overlooks

	gaining students' attention, and in creating an opportunity for further learning while students are reviewing for the test and while they are taking it" (Tully, 2005, p. 398). • Hirsch challenges the assertions that multiple-choice tests prompt teachers to focus solely on test preparation, fail to foster higher-order thinking skills, promote rote memorization, and are susceptible to cheating (Tully, 2005, p. 398). • Tests, though often viewed negatively, are a necessary tool that should be utilized to demonstrate year-by-year content-based learning, ensuring the establishment of a solid foundation for ongoing education (Tully, 2005, p. 398).	other senses, learning styles, and individual abilities (Tully, 2005, p. 397). • Rote learning, in the case of Catholic schools (the Baltimore Catechism that was one example of compulsory core content), is effective in convening knowledge but falls short in facilitating true understanding (Tully, 2005, p. 399). • There are any number of invalid and unreliable tests and formats (Tully, 2005, p. 398). • Core content requires further processing to

	• Hirsch presents comprehensive and persuasive arguments regarding education, addressing potential counterarguments and identifying gaps in suggested strategies. His assertions are supported by substantial research. In conclusion, he advocates for the implementation of specific, content-based, grade-level standards on a national scale (Tully, 2005, p. 399).	be understood (Tully, 2005, p. 399). • After Hirsch's book was published in 1996 and many states in the United States (Chicago's public schools, for instance) have written standards, many of which are content specific, and others which are not, issues such as widespread cheating, inaccuracies in test items, and rapidly changing standards became prevalent (Tully, 2005, p. 399). Following Tully, teachers, tasked with aligning content to

		teaching methods, often resorted to simply creating lesson plans and then selecting standards that closely matched their plans (Tully, 2005, p. 399). Similar to many other authors on education, Hirsch offers limited practical solutions for implementing core content principles in the real world (Tully, 2005, p. 399). • According to Tully, even though Hirsch sounds conservative and focused, in the end, a rote, memorized world of knowledge is not

		desirable (Tully, 2005, p. 399). Tully mentions that "Instead, a combination of showing and telling yields the fastest and securest results in both writing and teaching" (Tully, 2005, p. 399).

References

Main, P (2023, February 14). John Dewey's Theory. Retrieved from https://www.structural-learning.com/post/john-deweys-theory

Tully, D. (2005). The Schools We Need and Why We Don't Have Them, by E.D. Hirsch, Jr.. Journal of Catholic Education, 8 (3). http://dx.doi.org/10.15365/joce.0803092013