

Logic gone wrong: a sourcebook of real critical-thinking lapses

Contents:

I. Introduction

II. "Get to know these errors" worksheet with solutions following

III. Miscellaneous worksheets with solutions (past mastery assignments)

IV. Appendix of old, collected student errors, many annotated

I. Introduction

What's the big idea?

To create good arguments:

A. We must recognize the three components of every argument

1. The concrete detail or **evidence** ("show")
2. The Interpretation or inference drawn from the evidence the → **claim** (or "tell")
3. The Explanation/elaboration of "how the detail shows this" (the **reason** or "Explanation of how so?")

B. We must look for and make connections:

For arguments to "work," the writer must specically connect his or her ideas in the following 3 ways:

1. The ideas themselves must logically go together, or "**Cohere**," such that they refer to the same thing, and the evidence actually shows the claim the writer makes.
2. The writer must use words and sentence structure to specify which idea is showing which and how they connect. These **connections** must be explicit, regardless of the strength or coherence of the underlying evidence.
3. Where necessary, the writer must **explain** any logical leaps of **HOW** the evidence shows what they claim.

About this document:

Each of the many little "argument chunks" or "memes" in the long list below demonstrates gaps in logic ("critical thinking errors") created when

- Any of the basic 3 elements is missing or vague
- Any of the 3 types of connections is missing or "misconnected"

As you look at the errors themselves, consider the ways these two types of missing elements or misconnected ideas can lead to observable, identifiable mistakes:

(I've included handy abbreviation codes you can use for shorthand)

First, Consider whether one or more parts is simply missing:

? → Writer makes a claim with no real evidence;

A variation on this is

↻ "circular reasoning" when the writer uses the assumption of the claim to prove itself.

→ ? Sometimes, the detail has no no real interpretation, just summarizing the detail, often with extra wordiness, which may also be marked "so...→? "

Or, the issue can simply be:

Red(undant): The writer simply **restates** a detail without really saying anything else about it.


"E": The writer fails to include an **Explanation** of how the detail shows what you say.

Next, Consider how these errors result from poor connections *between* ideas that *are* present:

Connections missing:

// Show and tell (claim and evidence) are in separate sentences, not linked grammatically

Problems of coherence (5 such gaps are common):

--//→ Show doesn't cohere with tell; this includes jumbled or switched tells().

FOCUS: SHOWS detail about person or thing **A**, but TELLS us some interpretation about (related) person or thing **B** in the same scene.

← **"Reversed show → tell":** claiming "why detail happens," not "what it shows".

AC: "affirming the consequent" (AC) errors: When you interpret a likely *assumed* cause for an action but speculate beyond the evidence given. (Just because something **could** cause what you say doesn't mean that it **is** the cause!)

(OTE) Off-Topic Explanation : Instead of explaining "how the evidence shows the claim," the writer ends up making *NEW* claims about the subject or evidence. Usually, this is some other claim about the character or the effect of the action in the quote.

II. Introductory "Get to know these errors" worksheet.

See if you can identify each of these mistakes from the list above in the memes below: each is based on the **same passage** from your Scarlet Letter Reading .

1. A distraught Dimmesdale seems ready to give up, as Hester assures him that he will "not go alone": she actually shows a lot of strength as he believes that he "has not the strength to go on alone."

2. A distraught Dimmesdale seems ready to give up, as he falls before Hester saying that he "has not the strength to go on alone, " even after she assures him that he "will not go alone." She's trying to reassure him that she can help him, but he's giving up without even noticing her offer.

3. A distraught Dimmesdale seems ready to give up, as he falls before Hester saying that he "has not the strength to go on alone, " even after she assures him that he "will not go alone."

4. A totally self-absorbed and somewhat narcissistic Dimmesdale seems ready to give up, acting like he can't go on: he falls before Hester and whines that he "has not the strength to go on alone," but she actually assures him that he will "not go alone. "

5. As a distraught Dimmesdale seems ready to give up, bemoaning that he "has not the strength to go on alone" (even after she assures him that he will "not go alone,") he is likely to end up tragically as their plan will fail.

6. A distraught Dimmesdale shows narcissism as well as weakness when he gives up on Hester before he even tries to see what she's offering him, especially when she shows her strength in trying to save and free him from his inability to cope with the challenges of escaping.

7. A distraught Dimmesdale seems to confess his weakness as he claims that he "has not the strength to go on alone," whereas Hester shows that she is willing to reassure him when she tells him that he "shall not go alone" at all.

8. Given that the distraught Dimmesdale seems ready to give up, no wonder he falls before Hester saying that he "has not the strength to go on alone;" fortunately, because of her strength and optimism, she can at least reassure him that "he will not

(have to) go alone at all since she and Pearl will be with him.

9. The fact that Dimmesdale is so upset at his weakness suggests that he's ready to give up, without "the strength to go on alone," showing that he will not consider that he can even make it if he has so little confidence. Also, If the strong, brave Hester has the ability to buoy him up, that means that when she assures him that he will not go alone, she's the one who's really carrying the load for both of them.

10. Hester seems to be strong in the face of Dimmesdale's crumbling spirit: even though she's reassuring him that he will "not have to go alone," he gives up before even trying, in effect bemoaning in defeat that he "has not the strength to make it alone."

11. Hester is not interested in Dimmesdale's excuses; this is shown when she faces Dimmesdale's weakness and assures him that he will not have "to go alone." Unfortunately, the fact that he "has not the strength to make it alone" shows that he's just as uninterested in escaping.



Compare all to these two "good" examples, which reflect two different interpretations implied by the 11 examples above:

A: (focus on D's selfishness)

Dimmesdale shows by his rejection of Hester's plan that he is self-absorbed as well as weak. After all, when he claims he "hasn't the strength to make it alone," he effectively assumes that the burden is his alone; tellingly, not only has she just reassured him that she's made the plan for him, but she's reminded him that he need not "go alone" as she will be by his side.

B: (focus on the character contrast)

Dimmesdale, unable to believe that he "has the strength to make it [out of New England] alone," highlights his defeatism, believing already that he can never escape; this contrasts dramatically with the resilient Hester who plans their escape, and even reminds him unsuccessfully that he will not have to go alone, as she and Pearl will effectively help get him through the struggle.

Key: 1) . 2) // 3) -->? 4) no E 5)OTE 6) ?--> 7) RED 8) ← 9)  10) FOCUS 11) AC

II. Introductory “Get to know these errors” worksheet. (GG)

See if you can identify each of these mistakes from the list above in the memes below: each is based on the **same passage** from your *Gatsby Reading* .

1. Tom seems desperate to show off his “stale ideas” about racism and eugenics, as he claims that “this stuff’s been proven,” like it’s “scientific”: he actually seems like he’s looking for some rationale for his privilege, as he launches into his diatribe “unexpectedly” based on Nick’s small talk about the expensive wine.
2. Tom launches into a racist diatribe at the dinner table, prompted by a mere mention of some small talk about expensive wine, then launching into “stale ideas” about the “scientific proof” of Eugenic superiority of white people like him. He’s simply jumping into his rant without any reason; he’s desperate to find any justification for his beliefs.
3. Prompted by Nick’s banter that he feels “uncivilized” in the face of an expensive wine, Tom launches into a racist diatribe about an expert in Eugenics who claims that the superiority of the white race has been “scientifically proven.”
4. Tom is as desperate to defend his privilege as he is ready to spout off about them: After Nick says he feels “uncivilized,” Tom says that he read a book in which “civilization’s going to pieces” at the expense of the white race.
5. Even as Tom rants about the precarious power of the white elite, complaining that the “white race will be completely submerged,” he is likely to make a fool of himself. This happens after everyone sees how dumb he acts after he starts spouting off just because Nick banter about feeling “uncivilized.”
6. Daisy is completely aware of her own worldliness and privilege, complaining: “God, I’m sophisticated.” Given that she seems annoyed that she’s “been everywhere and done everything,” and even complains about it, it seems that all her opportunities and privilege are actually a source of negativity for her.
7. Daisy, completely lost in her own self absorption, shows her lack of empathy in dumping her trouble on Nick, especially after she basically imposes on his attention to begin with. This is particularly stunning since she didn’t seem to consider his experiences at all and even makes her extraordinary freedom a source of complaint.

8. Seeing as Daisy is completely self-absorbed, it's not surprising that she finds a way to complain about how *bad* it was that she's "been everywhere" and "done everything" as a "sophisticated" member of the upper class. Sadly, because of her complete failure to think of what Nick has been through, she burdens him with her complaining just to get a little pity and attention.

9. If in fact Daisy is completely lost in her own self-pity, it's pretty clear that she'll end up dumping her issues on Nick, showing that she can't even think of his needs. What's worse, she's clearly out of touch with her own privilege, which suggests that she feels entitled to her luxurious but unfulfilling life of "being everywhere and doing everything," as a "sophisticated" member of the elite.

10. Nick is disgusted and clearly put-out by Daisy, who calls herself "sophisticated" and boasts of how self-pitying she can be for "being everywhere" and "doing everything." When she demands his attention and concern merely to unload on him, it's clear that he's not impressed or sympathetic to her obvious entitlement.

11. Daisy is completely unwilling to think of other people as worthy: she shows this when she brags that she's "been everywhere and done everything" and has "sophistication" that they lack. In fact, when she dumps on Nick without even thinking of his wartime horrors, it's clear that she doesn't like serious things like war and only wants to focus on her "very bad time of things."

Key to *Gatsby* “get to know these errors” worksheet

Key: 1) ✂. 2) // 3) -->? 4) no E 5)OTE 6) RED 7) ?--> 8) ← 9) ↻ 10) FOCUS 11) AC

Models:

Tom, ranting about how the precarious power of the white elite, “will be completely submerged,” seems to be making a fool of himself”: Nick not only notices that he’s “nibbling at the edge of stale ideas, but notices that Tom seems to be looking to sound off. After all, he initiates his diatribe without any pretext other than Nick’s bantering about how “uncivilized” he feels to be drinking their overpriced wine.

Unconcerned about Nick’s own traumas, Daisy drags him into her self-pity and desire for attention, a gesture he distrusts as a “trick designed to exact some contributory emotion.” What’s worse, he notices that she’s so lost in her own entitlement that she’s able to turn her “sophistication,” purchased with Tom’s enormous wealth, into a *complaint* that having “been everywhere and done everything” is actually a hardship.

THREE FLAWED MEMES (3/6/19 warmup):

Meme A

Chillingworth, who essentially disappears from the community once “there was no more devil’s work for him to do,” actually ends up giving all his money to Pearl, clearly knowing that his plan was wrong and that he owed it to her for taking her father from her.

Meme B

Chillingworth, with “no more devil’s work for him to do,” basically just disappears at the end of the story, whereas Hester returns to haunt her old home, like she can’t really leave: It’s as if Chillingworth actually shows that Hester, not him, was really the true and faithful Puritan all along.

Meme C

Hester’s epitaph seems fitting: she herself after all is a “letter A” in “Gules” (scarlet red), against the “grey background” of her drab puritan community who sucked the life out of her and left her with nothing but her tombstone and a letter in a file cabinet.

Tuesday 3/22 CT LAB

BC: pick up old DEs (table) and turn in your memes on the computer cart

GATSBY CHAPTER TWO-THREE SYMBOLISM CHALLENGE :

1. In a seemingly symbolic description, Nick notes that where they must “shrink from a desolate area of land,” the desolate “valley of ashes,” the “railroad hastily joins the motor road:” the fact that both come together to avoid the deathly sight suggests that the rich people in their cars can only barely comprehend the lack of freedom of the poor who take the train.

2. The color yellow surfaces often at the party, as “yellow cocktail music” mirrors the “pulpless halves” of lemons that leave out the back door after each party. Clearly, yellow seems to be the color of being used up and discarded, because the music is only there in the moment, similar to the fruit which gets used up by the voracious guests.

3. Even “owl-eyes,” the blind-drunk, myopic patron of Gatsby’s library, not only sees through Gatsby: he expects his host to be a liar and a fraud. This is clearly why he sarcastically praises Gatsby for purchasing “real bona-fide printed matter” yet “knowing when to stop” by “not cutting the pages” and hence failing to convince anyone who cares to look that he actually has read any of his books.

4. As a crowd notes that in fact the first driver who “wasn’t trying” was actually different from the real driver, who seems obsessed with “putting her in reverse” to try to leave, Nick is actually thematically describing Daisy and Gatsby: when she “doesn’t try” or “realize what she’s doing at all,” she causes the wreck in their relationship because she doesn’t realize that Gatsby believes that you can “repeat the past.”

5. Nick seems to empathize with the “sense of haunting loneliness” that afflicts the “young clerks” whom he observes “wasting their most precious moments” of life. He thus suggests that he must be saying so because he is projecting his own loneliness, because of his solitary lifestyle, onto other young men like himself who are not really as alienated as he thinks.

6. As Nick claims that he “thought he loved Jordan,” it’s clear that once again, he values dishonesty, because he says that “dishonesty is never something you blame deeply in a woman,” so he felt “casually sorry” for thinking ill of her, “then forgot.”

Annotated errors:

1. In a seemingly symbolic description, Nick notes that where they must “shrink from a desolate area of land,” the desolate “valley of ashes,” the “railroad hastily joins the motor road:” the fact that both come together to avoid the deathly sight suggest that the rich people in their cars can only barely comprehend the lack of freedom of the poor who take the train.

--//— The fact that they shrink from death doesn’t show in any way that they can’t understand the poor--especially if the actual detail is that they come together.

2. The color yellow surfaces often at the party, as “yellow cocktail music” mirrors the “pulpless halves” of lemons that leave out the back door after each party. Clearly, yellow seems to be the color of being used up and discarded, because the music is only there in the moment, similar to the fruit which gets used up by the voracious guests.

The quotes don’t relate to being discarded, only to being used up. Also, the voracious guests aren’t the focus, as they consume and enjoy these things. The unifying idea might be the fact that both are temporary pleasures, consumed but then gone. We’d have to note that both the music and fruit “run out”, not that they’re “thrown out.”

3. Even “owl-eyes,” the blind-drunk, myopic patron of Gatsby’s library not only sees through Gatsby: he expects his host to be a liar and a fraud. This is clearly why he sarcastically praises Gatsby for purchasing “real bona-fide printed matter” yet “knowing when to stop” by “not cutting the pages” and hence failing to convince anyone who cares to look that he actually has read any of his books. **Simply a ← (tells us why, not what it shows)**

Even “owl-eyes,” the blind-drunk, myopic patron of Gatsby’s library not only sees through Gatsby: he actually expects his host to be a liar and a fraud. This is clear as he sarcastically praises Gatsby for purchasing “real bona-fide printed matter” yet “knowing when to stop” by “not cutting the pages” and hence failing to convince anyone who cares to look that he actually has read any of his books.

4. As a crowd notes that in fact the first driver who “wasn’t trying” was actually different from the real driver, who seems obsessed with “putting her in reverse” to try to leave, Nick is actually thematically describing Daisy and Gatsby: when she “doesn’t try” or “realize what she’s doing at all,” she causes the wreck in their relationship because she doesn’t realize that Gatsby believes that you can “repeat the past.”

OTE: changes from “this shows this theme” to “this *causes* this action”, also the first detail belongs in a different meme (the issue isn’t mistaken identity, but the contrast between the two drivers)

As a crowd notes that in fact the first driver who “wasn’t trying” ~~was actually different from the real driver,~~ while the other seems obsessed with “putting her in reverse” to try to leave, Nick is seemingly thematically describing Daisy and Gatsby: just as she “doesn’t try” or “realize what she’s doing at all,” she mirrors the upathetic driver, as Gatsby, who believes that you can “repeat the past” resembles the other driver who wants to go back.

5. Nick seems to empathize with the “sense of haunting loneliness” that afflicts the “young clerks” whom he observes “wasting their most precious moments” of life. He thus suggests that he must be saying so because he is projecting his own loneliness,

because of his solitary lifestyle, onto other young men like himself who are not really as alienated as he thinks.

←, Circular reasoning

Nick seems to empathize with the “sense of haunting loneliness” that afflicts the “young clerks” whom he observes “wasting their most precious moments” of life; he thus may be projecting his own loneliness, given that his solitary lifestyle could logically make him see other young men like himself as alienated as he himself may be.

6. As Nick claims that he “thought he loved Jordan,” it’s clear that once again, he values dishonesty, because he says that “dishonesty is never something you blame deeply in a woman,” so he felt “casually sorry” for thinking ill of her, “then forgot.”
--//-- Show doesn’t match.

As Nick claims that he “thought he loved Jordan,” it’s clear that once again, he [is willing to overlook] dishonesty, because he says that “dishonesty is never something you blame deeply in a woman,” and even says that he felt “casually sorry” for thinking ill of her, “then forgot” the matter entirely.

Gatsby Chapter 5 Challenge (followed by solutions): (4/12/19)

1. In addition, Gatsby’s childishness is shown through his rapid mood change right after reuniting with Daisy, when he “literally glowed,” which shows that he isn’t emotionally stable and his mood fluctuates rapidly, like someone very young.

2. When Gatsby stares at Daisy and Nick with “unhappy eyes,” it once again shows his true feelings without ever admitting them. It is not until Gatsby tells Nick that “this is a mistake,” that he truly reveals his fear (87).

3. Also, the “faint flow of thunder” reflects the faint notion that Gatsby and Daisy have when they sit for tea: their love is doomed--just as the storm will roll in, the tumult of their relationship is coming (95).

4. Immediately after Gatsby enters Nick’s house and sees Daisy, Nick observes that “for half a minute there wasn’t a sound.” Then Daisy says, “I’m, awfully glad to see you again,” showing how Gatsby, in all his detailed preparations, forgot how he would make conversation. Neither Gatsby nor Daisy, both realizing that they still have feelings for the other, knows what to say within the first 30 seconds (86).

5. Gatsby first starts to read from *Clay's Economics*, but this is just a pose to make himself look intelligent in front of Daisy, as Fitzgerald points out that he reads with "vacant eyes" (86).

6. Gatsby illustrates his boredom with his present situation when he, at the top of the conversation says, "Let's go to Coney Island" to Nick (81). Gatsby has thus decided at this point to abandon formal niceties in favor of any distraction.

7. Making matters worse, as he tries to "recover himself" in Daisy's eyes by showing her into his closet, she gets so overwhelmed by his "beautiful shirts" that were imported from England that she cries into them, envious of and unable to emotionally handle his lifestyle of overblown luxury (92).

8. Despite Gatsby's constant efforts to come across as elite and extravagant, his bedroom is "the simplest room of all," implying that his lavish persona is only a front designed to please Daisy Buchanan (91).

9. Three hours later, Gatsby continues trying to make Nick's house mimic his extravagant mansion to the point of absurdity, sending and paying for a "greenhouse" of flowers, once again with the hope of wooing Daisy (84).

10. Throughout the scene, "increasing rain" creates a dreary atmosphere that reflects the future of Gatsby and Daisy's relationship because of its melancholy ending. The physical features of the scene show the negative prospects of their relationship (86).

Chapter 5 *possible solutions*

1. In addition, his childishness is shown through his rapid mood change right after reuniting with Daisy, when he "literally glowed," which shows that he isn't emotionally stable and his mood fluctuates rapidly, like someone very young.

Problem: glowing isn't necessarily childish, though, and nothing shows fluctuating moods at all. (it's over-interpreting too little evidence)

Gatsby is so excited about the prospect of his reunion with Daisy that he "literally glowed" when talking to Nick.

2. When Gatsby stares at Daisy and Nick with "unhappy eyes," it once again shows his true feelings without ever admitting them. It is not until Gatsby tells Nick that "this is a mistake," that he truly reveals his fear (87).

Problem: no basis for claim that these are "true feelings," or that he hasn't admitted them so far

Gatsby, seemingly uncomfortable about the meeting so far, stares at Daisy and Nick with "unhappy eyes," evidently expecting a more positive reaction (87).

3. Also, the "faint flow of thunder" reflects the faint notion that Gatsby and Daisy have when they sit for tea: their love is doomed--just as the storm will roll in, the tumult of their

relationship is coming (95).

Problem: thunder could foreshadow trouble, but there's no basis to say it's "doomed"

Also, the "faint flow of thunder" in the distance could foreshadow some turbulence ahead for their relationship (95).

4. Immediately after Gatsby enters Nick's house and sees Daisy, Nick observes that "for half a minute there wasn't a sound." Then Daisy says, "I'm, awfully glad to see you again," showing how Gatsby, in all his detailed preparations, forgot how he would make conversation. Neither Gatsby nor Daisy, both realizing that they still have feelings for the other, knows what to say within the first 30 seconds (86).

Problem: we do see that he hasn't prepared for what to say, but the second sentence, which could simply acknowledge this is detached, and the bolder claim that "he forgot how" isn't supported, only the fact that he doesn't.

Immediately after Gatsby enters Nick's house and sees Daisy, Nick observes that "for half a minute there wasn't a sound" before Daisy finally breaks the silence; apparently, despite all his detailed preparations, Gatsby did not have any workable ideas for what to say during the shock of their reunion (86).

5. Gatsby first starts to read from *Clay's Economics*, but this is just a pose to make himself look intelligent in front of Daisy, as Fitzgerald points out that he reads with "vacant eyes" (86).

Problem: reversed--assuming the consequent--there's no basis for why he's doing this, or that it's a pose at all--it just shows that he's doing something he's not all that into.

Gatsby casually picks up *Clay's Economics* off the shelf, as if trying to look nonchalant and at ease; however, his "vacant eyes" suggest that he's not even reading, his thoughts elsewhere (86).

6. Gatsby illustrates his boredom with his present situation when he, at the top of the conversation says, "Let's go to Coney Island" to Nick (81). Gatsby has thus decided at this point to abandon formal niceties in favor of any distraction.

*Problem: nothing shows that he's rude or "abandoning niceties," much less that it's **in order to** distract himself. (←)*

Agitated to the point of restlessness, Gatsby spontaneously proposes that he and Nick go to Coney Island at two in the morning (81).

7. Making matters worse, as he tries to "recover himself" in Daisy's eyes by showing her into his closet. She gets so overwhelmed by his "beautiful shirts" that were imported from England that she cries into them, envious of and unable to emotionally handle his lifestyle of overblown luxury (92).

Problem: no basis to show envy, or that it's his "lifestyle" rather than something else about the moment that he can't handle. Note also that "recovering himself" seems more like a contrast with her being "overwhelmed," not really a connection to "overblown luxury." Also, fix transition--it's not "worse," just stranger, more dramatic.

Even as he tries to "recover himself" from his overwrought excitement, however, Daisy

herself contributes to the emotional melodrama as she spontaneously starts crying into his “beautiful shirts” (92).

8. Despite Gatsby's constant efforts to come across as elite and extravagant, his bedroom is “the simplest room of all,” implying that his lavish persona is only a front designed to please Daisy Buchanan (91).

Problem: It shows that he's not interested in luxury in private, not that it's necessarily a front, or that it's to please Daisy.

Despite Gatsby's constant efforts to come across as elite and extravagant, his bedroom, “the simplest room of all,” hints at his actual modesty and humble tastes.

9. Three hours later, Gatsby continues trying to make Nick's house mimic his extravagant mansion to the point of absurdity, sending and paying for a “greenhouse” of flowers, once again with the hope of wooing Daisy (84).

Problem: ← no basis that it's done “with the hope of” anything at all, beyond filling the place with flowers.

Three hours later, Gatsby continues trying to overdecorate Nick's house to absurdity, sending and paying for a whole “greenhouse” of flowers for his small bungalow.

10. Throughout the scene, “increasing rain” creates a dreary atmosphere that reflects the future of Gatsby and Daisy's relationship because of its melancholy ending. The physical features of the scene show the negative prospects of their relationship (86).

Problem: “dreary atmosphere” is redundant, wordy; all claims and reasons are vague.

As the reunited lovers withdraw into their fantasy romance, the “increasing rain” nevertheless hints at worsening prospects for their relationship (86).

3/6/19 Annotated errors and solutions:

1. **Chillingworth, who essentially disappears from the community once “there was no more devil's work for him to do,” actually ends up giving all his money to Pearl, clearly knowing that his plan was wrong and that he owed it to her for taking her father from her.**

Problem: Affirming the negative and he has a more who knows they wrong than he really possibly doesn't necessarily make him for there's about the. It creates a ———— effect on the of them. They either have him.

Chillingworth, who essentially disappears from the community once “there was no more devil's work for him to do,” actually ends up giving all his money to Pearl, clearly making some kind of gesture of restitution to her as though he felt he owed her something or felt that she deserved her freedom.

2. **Chillingworth, with “no more devil's work for him to do,” basically just disappears at the end of the story, whereas Hester returns to haunt her old home, but she can't really leave. It's as if Chillingworth actually shows that Hester, not him, was really the true and faithful Puritan all along.**

Problem: He has a more who knows they wrong than he really possibly doesn't necessarily make him for there's about the. It creates a ———— effect on the of them. They either have him.

Chillingworth, with “no more devil's work for him to do,” basically just disappears at the end of the story, whereas Hester returns to haunt her old home, but she can't really leave. By leaving when her revenge is complete, however, Chillingworth shows that he may never have had any other reason or goal in coming to Boston, unlike the devoted, faithful Hester, who continues to haunt the place, and Dimmesdale, by remaining in the place of their shared tragedy.

3. **Hester's upright seems fitting: she herself after all is a “letter A” in “Gale” (scarlet red), against the “gray background” of her dull puritan community who sucked the life out of her and left her with nothing but her mother-in-law and a letter in a file cabinet.**

Problem: Classic OED. Instead of explaining how the colors are symbolically or metaphorically “fitting” to Hester, the writer describes the outcome of the letter and “lets” even up happening to Hester.

Hester's upright seems fitting: she herself after all is the passionate, artistic “letter A” in “Gale” (scarlet red), who chooses to stay inside the “gray background” of her dull puritan community who continue to hold fast to their conservative, narrow beliefs.

AP 11 February 2020 TAKE-HOME CHALLENGE WORKSHEET

1. Just as the car crashes into the ditch and can't go back, the crash scene seems to symbolize the mindset of the people living for the now in the 20's, a time of prosperity and excitement, not caring about the future then being “blindsided” by reality, or rather, “the ditch.”

2. Later, in the house, when a drunken man with glasses observes Gatsby's library and notices that the books are "real," "bona fide piece[s] of printed matter," he suggests that Gatsby went the extra mile to make sure that he put on a good show, but not enough to be convincing to anyone who really looked(47).

3. Gatsby had "been so full of the idea so long, dreamed it right throughout tho the end ...at an inconceivable pitch of intensity. Now in the reaction, he was running down like an overwound clock " (93).

4. Daisy seems to recognize Tom's philandering, noting that the "girl was common but pretty." This is why she tells him "genially" to "go ahead" and take her "little gold pencil," apparently knowing that he's really trying to get her number. The detail suggests that she's trying to justify her affair with Gatsby by giving Tom permission to fool around.

5. Gatsby saw, in his reverie, that "the sidewalk really formed a ladder and mounted to a secret place above the trees," where "if he climbed alone," he could indulge his fantasies, as his mind could "romp like the mind of God" (112). Because Daisy's not worth all this dreaming, however, his "unutterable vision" will never be able to be good enough for her "perishable breath."

6. When Gatsby starts to signal that he's going to tell Tom off, Daisy "guessed at his intention" and "interrupted helplessly. 'Please, let's go home'"(131): She obviously isn't ready to stand up Tom, so she begs Tom to diffuse the situation, which will end up in her, Gatsby, or both of them getting disappointed because she's not prepared to make up her mind.

7. After the accident, Tom and Daisy only want to make a plan to skip town together: after all, as Tom and Daisy gather themselves over a late-night snack, they have an "unmistakable air of natural intimacy "about them, one which Nick interprets as them "conspiring together"(146).

8. As Nick visits Gatsby's ghostly house in the wake of the accident, Nick's clumsiness seems to signify the death of Gatsby's dream-now-gone-dark: Nick literally fumbles in the dark, "tumb[ing] with a splash" upon a "ghostly piano," and feeling "innumerable feet of dark wall"

just to find the light switches, as an "inexplicable amount of dust" settles everywhere ominously.

9. Still, Gatsby didn't really know what he was doing, seeing as he "didn't cut the pages": by not going that last step to make sure that the books looked read, he thereby shows that even an almost-drunk observer can see through his act.

IV: APPENDIX OF OLD STUDENT MEMES (SOME ANNOTATED)

English H 10 examples

(skill tie-in with weak, passive, wordy: notice how wordy constructions hide the errors of logic because of the extra words that impede clarity):

A. Pi's idea is that in his "imagination he has dressed all the animals in tame costumes"; here, what is shown is that he can use his imagination to bring these animals to life as pets(52).

+Pi imagines that the animals, now pets "dressed in tame costumes in his imagination"...--> show what? (no interpretation!)

B. The clear dislike, which is shown by the men for each other, is a result of their pride, shown through their actions of putting the other religions down: they accuse Christians of "knowing nothing about religion."

errors:

Show--//→ Tell: quote shows dislike, but not "pride";

also UA based on C→E: does not show how that pride is the cause of their feelings.

c. The "unknown," observes Pi, is something that an animal "hates above everything else": In this light, it is understood that people and animals find fear in the unknown, as in their eyes, to be secure in their surroundings is what makes them safe.

1: UA re: What shows that it applies to "people?"

2: Missing E of "how hating the unknown"==safe in surroundings

Really, most of the tell is simply a restatement.

d. As he understands these rituals, the universe suddenly "makes sense to Pi," showing that the beliefs in Brahman, the world soul, give Pi clarity that can be used to navigate the world.

*Logic: how do "rituals" relate to "Brahman" ? (missing Explanation creates a --//→)
 What shows that just because HE thinks it "makes sense," he's any better at "navigating the World?" (it's an unsupported claim of C → Effect) Put another way, just because it DOES "give him clarity," doesn't mean that it can help him "navigate" anything.*

e. The animal which is weakest has "the most to gain" in following the circus trainer, which is like people who have the most to gain by having favors given to them by those in power.

errors:

If the weakest animals gain the most from the trainer, just as people get favors from those in power, how does the writer show "what about these animals is like people?"

No text or show → similarity to people

NEED: explanation of how we're even talking about people to begin with

f. Zoos capture the "essence of the animals' homes," the provision of comfort and security being the top priority of their constructed residences. People's tendency in their own domiciles is also the seeking of stability.

By disconnecting the second sentence, it makes it into a broad claim about people--needs to connect to the first, interpreting the passage. (and lose the pretentious diction!)

Zoos, says Pi, capture the "essence of the animals' homes," in their captivity, mirroring the way that all animals place their highest priority on comfort and security: from the animals' point of view, suggests Pi, freedom is overrated compared to safety and predictability.

g. Mr. K's view is that "everything is there" in science, "if we look carefully," showing that objectivity is enough in the data about the world if we observe it, thereby revealing God as pointless.

Great example of an OTE: the dangling participle "thereby revealing God as pointless" COULD be an implication of the earlier claim; however, it's not supported by the text--says we CAN find truths, IF we look, not that by looking(+) we will find God NOT to have a point (-). (+/- mismatch between evid and claim)) style: fix the pov/attribution, too!

Mr. K's view is that "everything is there" in science, "if we look carefully," showing that at least he believes that we can find objective information about the world if we observe it.

2 errors:

(caused by missing AA/POV error):

1. Tell, if it's about Mr. K, is just a repetition of the show.

2. IF it's actually an interp, it's an unsupportable claim of opinion.

English AP 11 Final exam examples:

1. Gatsby ends the conversation as he “excuses himself with a small bow that included each of them,” showing them how special he thinks they are. He is intensely focused on every gesture, trying to show respect to get others, in turn, to appreciate him back. Gatsby perhaps believes that his impressing others as likeable is a characteristic that will help him look like a respectable, rich figure who inspires others, something he does to impress Daisy.

Error: Affirming the Consequent/missing detail to show that it has anything to do with Daisy. (implied ←)

Solution: Remove the Daisy part, so that his actions simply show his efforts to look gracious and respectful, not WHY ← he’s doing it.

2. The pathetic character Miniver Cheevy believes that the romance of the past is dead, as he yearns for visions of “warrior[s] bold” and epic battles of “priam’s neighbors” from the Iliad. These scenes contrast dramatically with modest, boring, modern life, so he’s obviously pathetically idealistic and out of touch.

Error: Logical mismatches (2 possible angles):

If he revels in the romance of the past, he feels it’s ALIVE, and modern life is DEAD.

Looking at the other angle, the fact that he’s into the ancient world shows that he LOVES the past. If you want to show that he’s NOT happy with his “boring, modern life,” it would need something to show that!

3. Mrs. Sommers cherished “how good...the touch of the raw silk to her flesh,” because being middle class rather than well to do, she never go to experience nice things such as the silk stockings she so desired.

4. Jack London writes of the natural world’s hostility toward the man when the man tries to kill the dog to warm himself and he can’t grasp the dog, since he had no “bend nor feeling in the

fingers,” showing how the universe is unconcerned with human importance, eliminating all sources of the man’s survival (505).

5. The narration then claims that with Pearl, “so large were the attainments of her three years’ lifetime” that she “transgressed the expectation of any normal child.” In essence, Hawthorne shows irony in that the issue is not Pearl’s lack of familiarity with the doctrines she refuses to explain to the governor, but the fact that she doesn’t tell him because she’s too smart for that. Hawthorne actually makes her look smarter than him!

English 10 honors examples from final exams

1. “Never sure what happened in the past,” residents of Oceania serve as examples of Orwell’s idea that nobody can remember things when the papers and official history lie to them all the time.

Error: Missing evidence . This is a case of “affirming the consequent”--just because they can’t remember doesn’t mean that it has anything to do with being lied to (by the government or by the papers).

Solution:

Add a quote about the lying papers run by the ministry of truth, which can then SHOW that the resulting “never sure of the past” is a logical result of this, thereby showing Orwell’s idea.

2. The flickering, inconstant fire in Plato’s cave could represent the lure of superficial, boring, repetitive, and banal pop music, especially since most people without training simply don’t have exposure to more complex and unpredictable art music.

Error:

3. After addressing the rest of the boys, Ralph “went on in silence, borne in his triumph,” demonstrating that he thrives on power and the support of others.

Error: it doesn't "demonstrate that he thrives on" anything, only that this is a success. A little context would help clarify *what about this triumph* shows "support of others," and the interpretation begs the question of "what about the 'silence'" part?

Solution:

After bringing the boys to agreement with the Conch and his new role as leader, Ralph "went on in silence, borne in his triumph:" he's obviously looking emboldened by, if cautious about, his new role.

4. To the prisoners, who have never imagined the outside world, it is painful to see the light: Plato says that the returning man would be "ridiculous" to venture back into the cave "without his eyes" as he saw before.

Error: Simple focus error--the meme mixes two different parties, two parts of the story.

Solution:

Either focus on how the prisoners, trapped in the shadows, are overwhelmed by the light of truth that they've never experienced, making their new knowledge painful; OR Focus on how the returning prisoner, his eyes overwhelmed by the light, is unable to readjust to the darkness, making his return a "ridiculous," bad idea.

5. Piggy says "I'm scared of the beast," and "that's why I know him": essentially, because he's the smartest, most mature of the boys, he realizes that the fear is important and that they need to consider it before they make rash decisions.

WHEN Piggy says "I'm scared of the beast," and "that's why I know him," essentially, he shows that he's smart and mature, as he realizes, in effect, that the fear is important and that they need to consider it.

OTE: his fear is a consequence of knowing about the beast, not the explanation of how he's smart or mature.

WHEN Piggy says "I'm scared of the beast," and "that's why I know him," essentially, he shows that he's smart and mature realizing

, in effect, that he must understand more about the beast precisely *because* this fear could be dangerous..

Mixed 11th grade examples

1. Whitman claims to “sing” his own body, celebrating the wonder of life. The image of singing evokes the sense that the body creates music, with all its parts harmonizing to make something beautiful and fluid. This is because he believes in showing his emotions deeply. Comparing emotions to music makes them seem even more organic and alive.

Second sentence needs to be connected to first; third tells us WHY, not how 1 shows 2 (#4 does this, but all are redundant, and filled with cliches--1 shows 2 with a little 4.

As Whitman claims to “sing” his own body, he celebrates the idea that the body creates music, with all its parts harmonizing to make something beautiful and fluid, a celebration of his soul.

2. Prufrock wishes that he were a “pair of ragged claws,” like a crab with no body. Since he’s so vulnerable and weak, he doesn’t even think that he has a body at all. What’s more, by “scuttling” at the bottom of “silent seas,” he creates a sense of depth, like he’s lost far below a surface he’ll never return to. This could be why he can’t connect to others. It implies that he can’t make connections without any means to have others hear him beneath the waters.

Mismatched the claws (that grab things) with the lack of a body that can’t move

Mismatched the silence of the seas with their depth. Put all three ideas’ S-->T together: first his weakness, then his “in too deep”, followed by his forced silence:

Prufrock in wishing that he were a “pair of ragged claws,” like a crab with no body, embraces being vulnerable and weak. Unfortunately, because he is now left “scuttling” at the bottom of “silent seas,” he seems lost far below a surface he’ll never return to, where he could otherwise

connect to others who could hear him if he could only emerge.

3. Phoenix seems aptly-named as she is, like the mythical bird, reborn from her ashes again and again: each time she gets to town, she would seem to have accomplished her mission, sacrificing herself. She has to undergo many hardships to do this that could be a kind of suffering, a real sacrifice for her. Because of this, she helps her grandson, which gives her a new lease on life. This rebirth of purpose is a kind of resurrection, as she must rekindle the flame of devotion each time she makes the trip.

OK; there aren't any quotes, but there are text details. All seem mismatched to the interp: First the fact that she's "reborn" isn't directly shown by her "sacrifice"--we're referring to two totally different aspects of the Phoenix. Second sentence has no connection, sounding like a new claim, along with an OTE that simply says that it's a "kind of suffering" (idea #3) Finally, the last sentence claims (again) two different ideas--one that she's reborn, but a second idea, that she must "rekindle a flame" of devotion to do this. It's really 3 little memes, all out of order: Should be--the Phoenix lights a flame, sacrifices itself to the flames, then is reborn again--just like Phoenix.

Phoenix seems aptly-named: First, each time she gets to town, she would seem to have accomplished her mission, yet she rekindles that flame of devotion by returning to her grandson, even knowing that she'll have to do so again. Perhaps the challenge of the many hardships to do this resemble the flames that seem to consume her; still, the fact that she repeats the journey suggests a kind of resurrection, as she seems renewed in her purpose, and her devotion shines each time she makes the trip.

GREAT GATSBY EXAMPLES:

Somehow mark the **SHOW** (evidence)

The **claim** (what they "TELL")

The **explanation** (HOW it shows what they claim)

#1

The people who visited parties "got into automobiles which bore

them out to Long island, and somehow they ended up at Gatsby's door" (41). This shows that he's desperate to get people to come to his parties,

specifically so that he can impress Daisy, seeing as he wants her to see him as wealthy.

#1b The people who visited parties got rides from the train station where Gatsby sent his own car and driver "like a brisk yellow bug" to ferry people back to his parties (30). Gatsby, given his superficial vanity and apparent desire to impress, thus attempts to get as many people as possible to come to his parties, and be impressive, going so far as to send his Rolls to pick them up. This suggests that his efforts will probably not work, however, since no one who's there is there for any other reason than his mistaken judgment.

#1 (with multiple errors):

Later, in the house, when a drunken man with glasses observes Gatsby's library and notices that the books are "real," "bona fide piece[s] of printed matter," he suggests that Gatsby went the extra mile by buying real fancy books, not fake ones, to make sure that he put on a good show, but not enough to be convincing to anyone who really looked since he never cut the pages to make them look read(47).

Solution:

#3: MULTIPLE errors...

Gatsby ends the conversation as he “excuses himself with a small bow that included each of them,” respectfully showing them how special he thinks they are.

He is intensely focused on every gesture, trying to show respect to get others, in turn, to appreciate him back. Gatsby perhaps believes that his impressing others as likeable is a characteristic that will help him look like a respectable, rich figure who inspires others, something he does to impress Daisy.

list of additional examples from American Literature/Grade 11 textbook selections:

“miniver cheevy, richard cory”:

a. Unfortunately for Miniver, he “thought, and thought, and thought, about” his problems, then “went on drinking.” He clearly kept thinking and drinking because he was so bitter about what he didn’t have in his life that he obsessed over fantasy.

←

Unfortunately for Miniver, he must have been bitter about what he didn’t have in his life , despite his fantasy, seeing as he “thought, and thought, and thought, about” his problems, then only “went on drinking.” .

b. The fact that Richard Cory “glittered” when he walked perfectly captures the way people perceived him as wealthy and prosperous.

“Perfectly captures” is an opinion, not a claim

Missing POV/AA caused a weird gap--that *they* saw him this way shows that *they perceived him this way*. Now it’s clear: it’s redundant--> needs to Tell us *something*...

In seeing Richard Cory as so wealthy and prosperous that he “glittered” when he walked, the people of the town seem to have projected their own class envy of on to his higher social

status.

c. Cheevy, unsatisfied with real, present-day life, believes that the romance of the past is dead now, for he yearns for visions of “warrior[s] bold” and epic battles of “Priam’s neighbors” from the Iliad.

First participial phrase sounds like we’re assuming why (<-->) when we need to explain:

Secondly, notice the +/- error: Celebrating (+) the romantic past → romance is DEAD now(-)

Cheevy, who yearns for visions of medieval “warrior[s] bold” and epic battles of “Priam’s neighbors” from the Iliad, clearly sees this idealized past as superior to modern reality.

He is

d. When Richard is in a crowded setting, like “downtown,” people only see him “glittering” from afar, unlike when it’s a “calm summer night,” which becomes so depressing that he “put a bullet through his head.”

Cause → Effect words that can cause problems (ALWAYS):

Because since leads to causes so due to so that

e. Cheevy is called a “child of scorn,” a phrase that emphasizes that he was just made or born bitter: pessimism just seems a part of his foundation that has led him to mourn the lack of “ripe renown” available to him in the modern world.

-

“disillusionment at 10 o’clock”--Wallace Stevens

f. People don't dream of "baboons and periwinkles" as the old sailor does since they lack the imagination. This is because they are too confined by society, which is why they aren't "drunk" like he is.

g. People in the poem, unable to dream of "baboons and periwinkles" like the old sailor, have no imagination.

"The cross of snow" -Longfellow

h. "In the long sleepless watches of the night," Longfellow looks at the image of his lost love; he's clearly obsessed with her memory.

Bad explanation of error: there's no explanation

Clear explanation of error: needs to explain how looking at the picture shows obsession

i. He compares her memory to a cross of snow that, "sun defying," refuses to melt, always in the shade, the way he wears a cross "changeless since the day she died."

Bad explanation of error: the explanation is illogical

Clear explanation of error: 2 problems with explanation--if it defies the sun is it really "in the shade"; also, the "in the shade" doesn't go with "won't melt," --it's WHY it won't melt (OTE)

10th-grade examples: Socrates's "allegory of the cave," *Things Fall Apart*, & 1984

j. The prisoners in the cave, bound since birth, are unable to turn, signifying their inability to change perspective. At the same time, the fact that they're in chains is significant as a symbol of ignorance, since they've never known anything else.

hint: 1 idea or 2? think about What they're doing? When they've been doing it?

k. The fire, though far brighter than the shadows, remains flickering and inconstant: the fact that it's so appealing to the prisoner makes it a symbol for something that looks like truth, but

really isn't.

l. Learning is clearly an uphill climb, symbolized by the narrow passage through which the prisoner needs the light from outside to find his way. This makes him frustrated, since he yearns to have knowledge.

The narrow passage, lit only by a dim light from outside, could resemble the confining rules and restrictions of more sophisticated subjects of study whose passage is facilitated by looking carefully for information and ideas that help us progress.

m. The sun, though bright, is also blinding: since he can only come to view the sun after patience and care, the prisoner signifies the way that we must aggressively work to gain knowledge, no matter the cost.

n. The wise philosopher, like our happy, sun-tanned free man, would no doubt prefer to stay in the sun. He has to return however, because philosophy, the love of truth, is the most important thing the wise must sacrifice for.

If the sun is truth, he can't be sacrificing for truth since he'll be GIVING UP The truth by going back in the cave.

He'd be "sacrificing the TRUTH itself," not "sacrificing for it."

Things Fall Apart:

o. The accidental murder of Ezeudu's son at the wedding feast seems especially ironic: after a lifetime of avoiding the frivolity and partying that he associates with his father, Okonkwo is undone by a mistake he makes during the one time he doesn't want to be aggressive.

p. The murder of the first white man is a terrifying omen, which leads to the slaughter of the whole village implicated in the crime. In effect, everyone is now afraid of the white men.

q. The fact that the second missionaries set up in the evil forest may reflect Achebe's satire of his own Christian upbringing: Christians who believe in poverty would no doubt gladly take up

the land that others have rejected as untouchable.

r. The aptly-named Mr. Brown actually tries to learn Igbo language and culture; he helps to win legitimacy for the white men's laws, unlike his predecessor, who adamantly rejected their pagan religion and tried to instill only white, European values.

5. The report of Okonkwo's death, a mere footnote, barely worth a "paragraph," in which a man "kills a messenger and commits suicide is clearly anticlimactic for a reason: he represents the way European authorities trivialize the destruction of a whole culture, with no idea who or what has been sacrificed.

"Dr. P--would anyone ever *really* create a chunk of a paragraph in which they actually had a Tell and an How? And somehow forgot the evidence? What would that look like?"

"Occam's razor"--nickname in CT for the idea that an explanation of anything gets better as it gets simpler. (cutting away anything that overcomplicates the idea).

t. The Greeks must have been passionate about the notions of truth and reason, for they enshrined these in democracy, for democracy allows all to participate equally and thereby encourage the best ideas from everyone to govern all.

Rev S \leftarrow T; told us why they did it, not what the fact that they did it SHOWS...

The Greeks must have been passionate about the notions of truth and reason, enshrined in democracy, for democracy allows all to participate equally in sharing ideas.

hint: assume that it's a $S \rightarrow T$!

u. The anger of Achilles, like that of Athena, serves as the central theme of *the Iliad*: both figures, by hurting others out of jealous pride, are depicted this way to show that Greek culture feared excessive pride.

v. The difficulty of surviving in harsh, warlike political conditions clearly led to a mythology in which the Gods treat mortals unfairly for no reason.

w. Some of the people are willing to believe anything they're told: "Never sure whether anything in the papers could be true or not," even when they remember that chocolate rations used to be 15 grams, now cannot accept that they weren't actually 20grams, which shows Orwell's idea that truth itself is lost when you can't trust what the media say.

Some of the people are willing to believe anything they're told: seemingly, they were "Never sure whether anything in the papers could be true or not," yet they did remember that chocolate rations used to be 15 grams. In effect, Orwell suggests that truth itself is lost when people accept as true that contradict our own experience.

"not sure about the papers," they show that **they don't trust the media**. We need more evidence, such as "it seemed as though nothing were true," or something like it, to show that "truth itself" is lost.

y. Julia, who only seems interested in her affair with Winston as a way to "get back at the party," is clearly unstable and someone Winston should have been more careful with.

z. *Carmina Burana* have made it a favorite for soundtracks or a star of LACHSA's recent production. It fits with dramatic scenes, due to its driving rhythms that seem to curse fate itself, especially in "O Fortuna," the most famous passage in question. Ironically, the larger work is actually based on a sequence of medieval drinking songs, themselves a happy a celebration of the joys of life, rather than the curse of fate.

aa. The fact that the new version of *The Great Gatsby* had been directed by Baz Lurhman led everyone to suspect that it would be over-the-top and operatic. **great example of a missing explanation: what about Baz Lurhman = “over the top and operatic”?**

The fact that the new version of *The Great Gatsby* had been directed by Baz Lurhman led everyone to suspect that it would be over-the-top and operatic, seeing as he directed *Moulin Rouge*, an ersatz, melodramatic sendup of fantastically farfetched situations and staging.

bb. F. Scott Fitzgerald dedicated *Gatsby*, a tale of a man whose ruin comes largely from trying to please his privileged would-be lover who had grown up rich and out of his league, “once again, to Zelda.” This has led to the obvious interpretation that the woman in the novel, Daisy, is a thinly-veiled version of Zelda, who demanded a lot from him and was in and out of mental institutions.

cc. The students showed dramatic improvements in topic sentences in their writing tests, vindicating the teacher’s belief that focusing on main ideas, word clouds, and clustering had paid off.

Examples for [Plato's "Allegory of the Cave"](#)

G. As in the cave, Young Amish people, for example, aren't allowed any other lifestyle than the one they know until they are sixteen. In this way, they aren't allowed to see "anything but the shadows."

C. The prisoners in the cave, **bound since birth**, are **unable to turn**, signifying their **inability to change perspective**. At the same time, the fact that they're **in chains** is significant as a symbol of **ignorance**, since they've **never known anything else**.

harder, logical fallacy: the "appeal to ignorance": since I can't prove that they're not in the shadows, they must be in the shadows.

Then, when they are 16, they are "dragged up a steep and rugged ascent, and held fast until they are forced into the presence of the sun:" they are exposed to other ways of life, but don't have a desire to leave the Amish community.

BB. In the parable, the man "pities his fellow prisoners" enough that he goes back to try to free them. This could be like a woman who has freed herself from spousal abuse, and tries to help a similarly-abused friend, only to find that she isn't open to hear the truth.

CC. Sometimes, knowledge is limited to the one perspective one has known since childhood, so it's clear that the prisoners have been "chained since birth." This makes them unlikely to change if they're actually in chains.

DD. One specific imbalance in their marriage is the way that Lena and her husband split each other's costs: for example, when Harold spends "over a hundred dollars" in a week, Lena will "owe him about 50 dollars from her checking account," which is essentially an unfair deal for her.

EE. To the prisoners, who have never imagined the outside world, it is painful to see the light, and the returning man would be "ridiculous" to venture back into the cave "without his eyes" as he saw before.

FF. The story shows up in my music: I have personally given up trying to help people appreciate modern jazz, as they say that it just sounds like random, nonsensical notes. They insinuate that I'm ridiculous for listening to it, but they don't want to see the "higher light" that could come from learning to understand it.

GG. Without work or jobs in our society, or even without money, we would not feel an obligation to choose the paths that others with more power lay out for us. We're like those prisoners, with the shadows of the American dream flickering before us

HH. People who hold power are like those walking on the road carrying objects: CEOs of companies are able to manipulate people without power, even as they stay unseen in the dark of the shadows.

II. ...It might be difficult to turn away from something they have known their whole life. To be specific, someone who was indeed practically confined by his or her religion could likewise be given the chance to be shown the "truth" that their religion or beliefs could just be something that they created themselves, or is even utter nonsense, but it would be hard to turn away from a belief that they have valued since childhood.

*they need to explain what's "higher" about it, at least once it's understood. They assume **that** it's better without giving examples or explaining how it's like the cave story. This is especially awkward since there's otherwise a mismatch between "random, nonsensical notes," which sound like the opposite of the "steady, unchanging" qualities in the story that make the sun a "higher light" in the first place.*

GG. Without work or jobs in our society, or even without money, we would not feel an obligation to choose the paths that others with more power lay out for us. We're like those prisoners, with the shadows of the American dream flickering before us. *OTE--the first sentence, apparently an attempt at explanation, does not defend how the American dream is like a set of shadows flickering before us. Instead, it's a new assertion, a C→ E claim that's not even supported, about the EFFECT of being manipulated*

HH. People who hold power are like those walking on the road carrying objects: CEOs of companies are able to manipulate people without power, even as they stay unseen in the dark of the shadows. *OTE: the fact that they're not seen in the shadows is not related to "in what way do those in power 'manipulate' others?" (this needs to be explained so that it's clear how those in power are like people carrying puppets, not like people in the dark.)*

II. ...It might be difficult to turn away from something they have known their whole life. To be specific, someone who was indeed practically confined by his or her religion could likewise be given the chance to be shown the "truth" that their religion or beliefs could just be something that they created themselves, or is even utter nonsense, but it would be hard to turn away from a belief that they have valued since childhood.

a few answers: why would they want to? In the story, there's something new to see in the form of the fire that's worth looking at--they need an example what do these people have to see that's new. without this, it's really just a mismatch.

*ff. circular reasoning: they need to explain what's "higher" about it, at least once it's understood. They assume **that** it's better without giving examples or explaining how it's*

like the cave story. This is especially awkward since there's otherwise a mismatch between "random, nonsensical notes," which sound like the opposite of the "steady, unchanging" qualities in the story that make the sun a "higher light" in the first place.

GG. OTE--the first sentence, apparently an attempt at explanation, does not defend how the American dream is like a set of shadows flickering before us. Instead, it's a new assertion, a C→ E claim that's not even supported, about the EFFECT of being manipulated.

HH. OTE: the fact that they're not seen in the shadows is not related to "in what way do those in power 'manipulate' others?" (this needs to be explained so that it's clear how those in power are like people carrying puppets, not like people in the dark.)

II. why would they want to? In the story, there's something new to see in the form of the fire that's worth looking at--they need an example what do these people have to see that's new. without this, it's really just a mismatch.

*ff. circular reasoning: they need to explain what's "higher" about it, at least once it's understood. They assume **that** it's better without giving examples or explaining how.*

gg. OTE--the first sentence, apparently an attempt at explanation, does not defend how the American dream is like a set of shadows flickering before us. Instead, it's a new assertion, a C→ E claim that's not even supported, about the EFFECT of being manipulated

hh. OTE: the fact that they're not seen in the shadows is not related to "in what way do those in power 'manipulate' others?" (this needs to be explained so that it's clear how it's like the cave story.

ii. mismatch (hard one) the "they have valued" conflicts with the symbol of chains put on them by others.

JJ. Their desires to continue watching the shadows before them keeps them looking away, for they are happy and comfortable, ultimately making them oblivious to their surroundings. This occurs when people continue bad health habits, out of sheer habit, justifying that they like it, even though those habits (like poor diet, smoking, drugs, etc.) are actually harmful.

KK. This refusal to face the truth is found in today's politics, where people choose not to be informed or vote because they believe that their vote doesn't matter, and can't be heard, so they don't turn their heads at all.

LL. People struggle to look at the shocking brightness of the “truth,” like the sun in the tale, by pursuing scientific inquiry, say, so that they can find out the secrets of the universe. Of course, we’ll never probably know these secrets, but that won’t stop us from seeking our way out of the cave of limited understanding.

MM.

The flickering, inconstant fire could represent the lure of superficial, boring, repetitive, and banal pop music, especially since most people without training simply can’t understand sophisticated styles of any art music.

NN. *The Awakening*

The sound of her children’s voices specifically resembles a song, showing that her children are not important to Edna: “by the time Edna went home, the song no longer echoed in her soul.”

A Few *Scarlet Letter* Examples

Still more

1. Chillingworth, however, has no desire to actually heal Dimmesdale. He, instead, is bent solely on tearing Dimmesdale in half by forcing him to admit to his affair with Hester Prynne.
2. By showing that Dimmesdale is willing to argue on Hester’s behalf but unwilling to confess, Hawthorne illustrates that Dimmesdale feels guilty *because Hester suffers alone, yet is too cowardly to confess effectively foreshadowing the inner turmoil that ultimately tears Dimmesdale apart.*
3. Beyond mere leadership, Bellingham, hardly a superman, accordingly seems to be *overextending himself*, at the expense of his duties, in all his ventures. “Bred a lawyer”, he has *been transformed* by the New World into “a soldier, as well as a statesman and ruler”.
4. The narration then claims that “Pearl, therefore, so large were the attainments of her three years’ lifetime” could exemplify the way a Puritan should live by the rules “although unacquainted” with any way of showing it. // In essence, Hawthorne shows irony in that the issue is not Pearl’s infamiliarity with proper behavior, but her conscious decision to act nothing like a Puritan, despite the many influences surrounding her that should convince her to examine a Puritan lifestyle.

5. When “With unshaken hope,” they believe that their dearest minister “would unquestionably” conquer Chillingworth, the supposed Devil for, they show their belief that according to their Puritan faith, the predestined (like their saintly minister) are forever assured God’s protection (118).

Says why he does it, not how we know it. (<--)

6.

7. To start, Chillingworth is described as a thief trying to “steal the very apple of his eye,” which metaphorically characterized himself as the thief while Dimmesdale’s secret is the “apple of his eye” that he is attempting to “steal” (121).

8. Cosmic irony is the idea that the universe is so large and man is so small and, therefore, the universe does not care about the plight of man. In “To Build A Fire” cosmic irony occurs at every moment, but especially when the intelligent and nature-knowledgeable dog arrives to safety as the human dies, **proving** that the *universe is a “survival-of-the-fittest” system, uninterested in which creature “makes the cut”*.

. Through Mrs. Sommers’s *impulsive acts*, the author shows human’s reaction to wealth and inability to control themselves.

9.1 While Zeena tells Mattie and Ethan, in “vivid descriptions,” of her “intestinal disturbances,” she “look[s] straight at Mattie,” with a sinister, “faint smile.” // Zeena is almost glad to have stomach problems because she can use them as an excuse to get Mattie out of the house to fetch medicine for her.

2 errors

// separated S T “because”= ← quote only shows that she likes it, not why

10. 2 Pearl, using her childish innocence to see past Chillingworth’s act, realizes that Chillingworth “got hold” of her father, worsening his illness in an attempt to exact revenge; however, “little Pearl” also recognizes that “[Chillingworth] cannot catch” her since, unlike her parents, she has not committed any crimes, thus leaving her invulnerable to suffering any of the consequences (125).

11.1 The young man ended up falling through the ice and getting wet, which would end up delaying him at least “an hour”: (502) in effect, he was still hindered by this act of nature.

// —//—> Explain?OTE (some other claim) ← —> ? doesn't interpret

12.3 Dimmesdale's quiet agreement to Chillingworth's degrading connotations of Pearl suggests that he ultimately thinks that Pearl, "dancing" carelessly, embodies the same "freedom of a broken law" **that could lead to them feeling guilty that she has no morals.**

13. 2Naturalism is a school of literature where characters behave according to "forces beyond [their] power." Arpin describes the pessimistic naturalists as wanting to "dissect" human nature with the same "objectivity" that a scientist might use to "dissect... a cadaver." (421)

14. In the last section of the story, Bierce creates an atmosphere of surrealistic and dream like actions, a foretaste of the fact that it is not real, and Farquhar is truly about to die. // Bierce writes that "his tongue was swollen with thirst," and "he could no longer feel the road beneath his feet," which actually is him hanging by his neck from a bridge.

15. When the man with "keen eyes" looks at her, he observed something that he cannot "decipher" denouncing her to "nothing." This shows that although she has adorned herself with make-up of the upper class, this man barely noticed her. (437)

16. Mrs. Sommers cherished "how good...the touch of the raw silk to her flesh," because being middle class rather than well to do, she never go to experience nice things such as the silk stockings she so desired.

17. London observes that this young man traveling through the Yukon fails to realize "his frailty as a creature of temperature" and thus could only survive within "certain limits narrow limits of hor and cold," (pg. 498) for *regardless of any which way the traveler feels inclined to think, he is out of his ideal environment and the frigid Alaskan wilderness wil far from accommodate him in his needs* (498).

18. Jack London writes of the natural world's hostility toward the man when he tries to kill the dog to warm himself and he can't grasp the dog, since he had no "bend nor feeling in the fingers," showing how the universe is unconcerned with human importance, eliminating all sources of the man's survival (505).

Still more...

1.

When the boys first land on the island, in *Lord of the Flies*, the conch is their most valuable possession because it is what ties everyone together. The boys respect it and allow it to do its job of ensuring an organized environment. The conch's influence was so "powerful" that it was the prominent reason for Ralph becoming chief.

2. When "signs of life were visible now on the beach" and "more and more of them came" after Ralph blew into the shell continuously, the shell serves the role as the founder of a community in its ability to unite the survivors on the island. --/--

3. Ralph says "there's no village smoke, and no boats," while Jack says "We'll get food. Hunt. Catch things until they fetch us," implying that Jack wants to assert his power over animals while Ralph cares more about the well-being of the boys, in that he wants to find out if the island is inhabited.

4. The boys talk about the "beast" as a big, dark, harmful thing. When Ralph first hears it, he goes in denial to the existence of the beast so he says "there is no beast!" showing fear.

5. The sound of the shell that could be "hear(d) for miles" helped Ralph to be chosen as the leader, as he was addressed as "him with the shell," and was appointed "to be chief with the trumpet-thing."

c--> E (just tells us why, but doesn't actually "tell" us how this is important or matters) (-->?)

6. When Jack further states to the crowd, “We’re English, and the English are the best that there is!” he again demonstrates his superior and egotistical mind, which dictators possess. (--/-->)

7. Piggy suggests a “small fire,” rather than a bonfire, proving that he’s similar to an advisor in that he has realistic concerns towards the group. (-->E? explain how it shows what you say)

8. Ralph, shaken up from the crash, seems not to acknowledge Piggy with the utmost regard since he usually appears “faintly interested, later he defends Piggy when the children call him “Fatty” in the group of children. G, IQ, (-->E? explain how)

9. When the presidential Ralph is “compelled to make [his] point, loudly “ for all to hear, it shows that he wants to make people listen to him. --/-->

10. After addressing the rest of the boys, Ralph “went on in silence, borne in his triumph,” demonstrating that he thrives on power and the support of others.

11. Even as Ralph tries to gain the boys’ interest with his confidence that his father “in the navy” “will rescue them,” Piggy serves as a good advisor by challenging him with a note of reality, because he really wonders “how” Ralph’s father would even “know that they’re there.”

12. When Piggy is trying to speak, the boys “looked at him with eyes that lacked interest in what they saw,” showing that Piggy does not have good speaking skills like Ralph or Jack, making the boys not respect him as much.

13. Furthermore, Jack cannot accept defeat, as seen when he first fails to kill the piglet and reassures himself that “next time there would be no mercy,” since he tries to prove to himself that he is not too much of a coward to kill.

Still more, from periods 2, 3. (notice that many of these also need more supporting quotes!)

14. (q. 3) Ralph sets a meeting to discuss what to do going forward on the island, he asks for all the boys’ names, he stands up for Piggy when the other kids are bullying him. “He’s not Fatty,” cried Ralph, his real name’s Piggy!” displays how rude Jack is, “Choir! Stand still!” proves that Jack is very controlling over what other people do (18).

14. When someone from Jack’s group says “I saw a thing bulge on the mountain, and Ralph says “you only imagined it, because nothing would bulge. not any sort of creature.” This suggests that there is a sort of immature innocence to the boys’ talking about the beast, **as**

though it never occurred to them that they might not know enough about various creatures to make such a claim.

15. Ralph, shaken up from the crash, seems not to acknowledge Piggy with the utmost regard since he usually appears “faintly interested”; later he defends Piggy when the children call him “Fatty” in the group of children.

16. Ralph realizes that they must “have all the names,” so that they can communicate well. They must have rules so that they don’t become “savages,” and everybody must “have a job for everything to stay in order.” He understands as a good leader what they need.

17. Inviting Jack and his crew to “join the meeting” is the first thing Ralph does that shows leadership, through making decisions.

18. The boys regard the beastie as a “nightmare” because they are at first trying to clear up the fear within the group, but in the end everyone had doubt over the existence of the monster. It shows that they are fearful of things that are “ungraspable” no matter the rationality of the situation. (some UAs, ? → , //)

appendix: class notes on “Affirming the Consequent”

*(Just because $P \rightarrow Q$,
doesn't mean that because we see Q , P happened)*

examples of this fallacy:

Hawthorne, in noting that after the “darksome” influence of the Puritans, we have “lost forever the full art of gaiety,” suggests a problem with American culture: Americans really never wanted to have fun or be free after all.

There must have been a tornado, since my shoes are scattered.

When “no head bobs on Gatsby’s shoulder,” and he stands alone amid his guests, his lonely isolation shows that he’s saving himself for Daisy.

The way that the policeman defers to Gatsby and lets him off without even a warning suggests that Nick, clearly impressed at Gatsby’s influence, recognizes how far he himself is from the power of the rich.

If in fact there was a “doubt as to the quality of [Gatsby’s] present happiness,” when Daisy is finally right beside him, Gatsby must be realizing that he still hasn’t fully been welcomed into wealthy 1920s society.

When Alex didn't finish the homework, this failure clearly showed that his computer had a problem.

As you think about “what’s illogical” in each, try to think in terms of
 “because it says ___ this could mean ___, but it might not NECESSARILY mean that
 ..._____”

Note: by itself, “Affirming the consequent” (because of q , P) leads to a causal fallacy, a simple reversal of $C \rightarrow E$, $S \rightarrow T$.

(“causal fallacy”: confusion between coincidence of P and Q and Causation of Q by P !)

In REAL life with people, it leads to another equally important fallacy, in which we assume a malign intention where none is evident:

consider:

.If my parents were trolls and fascist dictators who wanted to ruin my life, they would not let me do what I want.

.. My parents will not let me do what I want

∴ My parents are fascists and trolls.

Let’s hope not! We hope that they love and want to protect us!

.If my friend was a crabby, manipulative ___, she wouldn’t tell me what was going on.

.. My friend didn’t tell me what was going on.

∴ My friend is, in fact, thus a crabby, manipulative...

(or she really respects people’s privacy and can be entrusted with their confidences:)

this is called “The intentional fallacy”: confusing a specific act with the PRESUMED intentions behind that act.