Yavapai COLLEGE

Teaching & Learning services (TLS)
website: yc.edu/tls
email: tls@yc.edu | phone: 928-771-6120

5 AI RUBRIC GENERATORS COMPARED

These online tools allow faculty to leverage artificial intelligence (AI) to create detailed grading rubrics by analyzing learning objectives, instructions, and other information about the assignment. The tools differ subtly, so here is a handy comparison chart compiled by Cheryl Colan, Instructional Designer:

Tools	**ASU Online AI Labs**	**ChatGPT**	**Kahnmigo Rubric Generator**	**Harmonize (used within Canvas)**	**Magic School**
Cost	Free	Free	Free	Free to YC Canvas users within Canvas	Free, or you may pay to upgrade
Time to complete*	Fast	Fast	Slow	Slowest	Fast
# of Criteria available	1 to 4, or enter your own	unknown	unknown	4	unknown
# of Ratings available	1 to 5, or enter your own	unknown	unknown	4	3 to 7
Share link	unavailable	Public link with option to make the chat discoverable	unavailable	unavailable	Public link (if kept private, not shareable)
History	not retained	retained for 30 days	Retained for 1 year	not applicable	You may access your last 5 outputs on a free account
Downloadable	Word (.docx) format	no, but you can copy/paste	no, but you can copy/paste	no, but saved in Canvas	no, but you can copy/paste†
Add to Canvas via	copy/paste to Canvas Rubrics	copy/paste to Canvas Rubrics	copy/paste to Canvas Rubrics	Saves to Canvas Rubrics	copy/paste to Canvas Rubrics

*This row rates the time needed to generate a rubric completely, but does not consider the time needed to (re)build the rubric in Canvas. Also, the time to complete increases if you prompt the tool to slow down and give you the best possible answer.

Cheryl's Notes on the Tools

1. ASU Online AI Labs Rubric Generator

Because this tool is dedicated to rubric generation, it's one of the fastest. It uses the GPT-4o AI model via an API (application programming interface) platform, which means the data you send is not retained or stored to train the AI. Users can specify the number of criteria, number of ratings, and total possible points, with the option to download the generated rubric as a Word document. However, it cannot save a link to the prompt results. Be mindful that prompts and generated rubrics disappear upon download or after a period of inactivity. Users can provide desired criteria, rating titles, and preferred point distribution, and the tool accurately calculates points. It's advisable to check whether the rating levels produced are clearly distinguishable and provide meaningful feedback for students. If descriptions are too vague, supplying more detailed guidance for the highest rating description can improve results. A helpful tip is to request longer descriptions to capture assignment requirements fully, then edit them for brevity as needed.

2. ChatGPT

ChatGPT, while not specifically designed for rubric creation, can be effectively used with a well-constructed prompt that instructs ChatGPT to perform the role of an expert and includes the grade level/college year, course subject, topic of study, and other specific information (see example rubric creation prompts). ChatGPT may generate rubrics as bullet points rather than tables; if so, simply request a table format. Users can specify criteria and rating titles, but the tool's math for weighting criteria can be inconsistent. Always verify and adjust point distributions manually if needed. Like ASU's tool, ChatGPT rating descriptions may sometimes lack depth. Providing clear and specific guidance can enhance the output. Although it does not offer a document download, rubrics can be copied into Word, Google Docs, or the Canvas Rubrics feature. You can also save a shareable link to your prompt and output; there is an option to make this discoverable to other ChatGPT users.

3. Kahnmigo Rubric Generator

In our December 2024 Newsletter, TeLS announced the availability of Kahnmigo Teacher Tools in Canvas at Yavapai College. One of the tools available is a Rubric Generator. The Kahnmigo Rubric Generator starts with an interactive chat to define learning objectives, criteria, and ratings. Though slower to use due to its guided approach, the tool provides rating descriptions well-aligned to the assignment requirements and learning outcomes. For a thorough overview of the steps, see Generating Rubrics Instantly with Kahn Academy on the Kahn Academy Blog. The display can be cramped, requiring horizontal scrolling to view the full rubric. Using the "three dots menu" to invoke **Chat history** opens a new browser tab outside of Canvas with more room for the rubric to display. Rubrics cannot be downloaded directly; however, copying into Word, Google Docs, or the Canvas Rubrics feature is an option. This tool generated ratings well-aligned with the assignment instructions and intended learning outcomes.

4. Harmonize

Accessible through Canvas at Yavapai College, Harmonize offers a rubric generator integrated within the learning management system. Unlike the other rubric generators, Harmonize saves rubrics you create directly within Canvas, making them easy to reuse. Like the Kahnmigo Rubric Generator, Harmonize uses a "wizard" for setup. The optional AI Student Coaching can be disabled to create rubrics faster. Harmonize generates four "focus areas" (criteria) and four rating columns in table format, with the ability to regenerate individual criteria ratings. While using the wizard, you can reverse the rating order to match other Canvas rubrics not generated with this tool. When you publish a Harmonize assignment, the rubric is saved into Rubrics for your course and remains fully editable even if you delete the assignment. You can find and apply the rubric to a Canvas Assignment, Quiz, or Graded Discussion and use it in the Speedgrader. Overall, Harmonize did the best job of capturing the assignment requirements I included in my prompts.

5. Magic School

Magic School, another tool from Khan Academy, speeds up rubric generation by eliminating the chat interface used by Khanmigo. It prompts for grade level (and includes university levels in the menu), number of ratings columns (from 3 to 7), learning objectives, and assignment instructions, producing table-formatted rubrics. While fast, it may add unrequested criteria and struggle with accurate point distribution. Users can edit or delete unwanted criteria and should verify the point calculations. Users can copy the finished rubric into Word, Google Docs, or Canvas Rubrics, but cannot download it directly[†]. You can publicly share or get a private link to your chat prompt and output.

[†]Paid Magic School subscribers can export generated rubric tables to Word (.docx) or Google Docs.

Notes on Prompts for Generating Rubrics with AI Tools

You will quickly learn how to optimize prompts for your preferred outcomes with practice. At a minimum, provide the assignment instructions. It may be helpful to include any module-level and assignment-level learning objectives. Remove anything the rubric generator doesn't need to consider (for example, instructions about how to submit a Canvas Assignment). Aim for more specificity in your instructions ("include at least 8 references from scholarly sources") rather than less ("sources can be from the YC library").

You can look at example rubric generation prompts to help you write specific prompts for generating your own rubrics. You can prompt for the specific Criteria and Ratings titles you want, including how you want the total assignment points to be distributed (otherwise, each criterion and rating are likely to be worth an equal amount of points). Review the per-tool notes to see whether each tool does this well or poorly.