

## Short Story Comparison/Contrast Essay

To assess your ability to compare and contrast the structure of two short stories as well as analyze the transition from text to film, you will be making original claims about the stories you read and the film you watched in a five-paragraph essay.

The instructions for the essay and what to include in each paragraph are below, and the rubric with which you will be assessing yourself and be assessed by a peer and your teacher is on the back of this document.

### Formatting

- ★ 12 Point, Times New Roman font (This is the accepted font and size for printed documents)
- ★ Double spacing
- ★ Your name, the course's name, your teacher's last name, and the date in the upper-lefthand corner
- ★ An original title, centered
- ★ Five-space (tabbed) indents to signify the start of each of your 5 paragraphs

### Content

- ★ An intro paragraph that includes
  - An attention getting sentence
  - A topic sentence that explicitly states the authors and director names, titles of your short stories and film, and the year in which they were released
  - 2-3 sentences of background information on the two stories and one film
  - A thesis statement which is a claim about an overall theme present throughout the three stories
- ★ Three body paragraphs that analyze, compare, and contrast the structure, characterization, and conflict from the stories to support your thesis
  - Whenever evidence from the stories or direct quotations are used, The author's or director's name should be used in introduction, and the page number on which they appear should be included (at the end of the sentence, before the punctuation) in parentheses
  - Each body paragraph should include specific examples from the stories and film, so there should be a minimum of one page number in parenthesis per body paragraph
- ★ A conclusion paragraph that includes
  - A restatement of your thesis
  - A summary of your analysis
  - A thoughtful concluding sentence

### Vocabulary

- ★ Your essay should include a minimum of five of the vocabulary words from the [Table of Important Unit Terms](#) used, with appropriate context, correctly.



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

### Essay Rubric

	Outstanding	Exceeds Expectations	Meets Expectations	Approaching Expectations	Unacceptable
Intro/Conclusion	<p>Introduction grabs attention and provides meaningful context to analysis</p> <p>Conclusion effectively restates the argument, but fresh language and meaningful insight leaves reader wanting more</p>	<p>Introduction sparks some interest and effectively introduces reasonable argument</p> <p>Conclusion restates arguments, but uses new language and shows understanding of the big picture</p>	<p>Introduction provides context for the argument but is obvious and/or basic</p> <p>Conclusion restates arguments, but recycles previous statements verbatim</p>	<p>Introduction or conclusion does not flow with the argument of the paper</p> <p>Introduction or conclusion contains blanket or vague statements; needs development to be effective</p>	No introduction and/or conclusion
Thesis	Thesis presents a claim about a shared theme in each short story and the film, is clearly articulated, original, and based on a deep understanding of the text	Thesis presents a claim about a shared theme that is clear and focused	Thesis presents a claim about a shared theme from the novel but it is somewhat broad, vague, or unoriginal	Thesis presents what the writer sees as a shared theme, but demonstrates a misunderstanding of the text	Thesis is not evident, in the correct position, or extremely off base
Body Paragraph Topic Sentences and Transitions	Topic sentences effectively introduce paragraph topics and contribute to	Topic sentences introduce paragraph topics	Topic sentences introduce paragraph topics	Topic sentences are present but not	Topic sentences do not introduce topics, are



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

	the analytical support of the thesis		but are obvious and basic	relevant to the thesis	rhetorical questions, or are very difficult to understand
Evidence from the text	<p>Author has included the best evidence from the text to support their thesis</p> <p>Evidence is properly cited with a works cited page, introductions that include the author's or director's name, parenthetical citations, and quotation marks (if a direct quote is used)</p>	<p>Author has included evidence that supports their thesis but which is not necessarily the best evidence available from the stories or film</p> <p>Evidence is properly cited with a works cited page, parenthetical, page number citations, and quotation marks (if a direct quote is used)</p>	<p>Author has included evidence but it is not relevant to the thesis</p> <p>Or</p> <p>Evidence is improperly cited or formatted with a works cited page, parenthetical, page number citations, and quotation marks (if a direct quote is used)</p>	<p>Evidence chosen is not specific or relevant to the thesis</p> <p>And</p> <p>Evidence is improperly cited or formatted with a works cited page, parenthetical, page number citations, and quotation marks (if a direct quote is used)</p>	Insufficient or no evidence from the text is provided to support the thesis
Context	Each paragraph compares and contrast the structures of the short stories and film in support of the thesis.	Each paragraph compares and contrast the structures of the short stories and film in support of the thesis.	Analysis supports your thesis, but ideas are obvious and basic or don't represent a comparison or contrast of the two	Evidence lacks Development or vice versa; misunderstanding of prompt or text; illogical argument;	Analysis not present simply plot summary



	Creative/original ideas and insights provide context for the evidence from the text	Analysis is believable and convincing, a few assertions may lack specific examples, but ideas and insights clearly support the thesis	short stories and film		
Style, Vocabulary, Sentence Structure	Sophisticated vocabulary, at least five of the unit vocabulary words have been used correctly, sentence Variety is present, quotations and evidence are smoothly blended into the essay	Sophisticated vocabulary, 3-4 unit vocabulary words used correctly, quotations and evidence are appropriate but could flow better within the essay	Vocabulary is obvious and basic, 2 unit vocabulary words used correctly, quotations and evidence are present but interrupt the flow of the essay	Vocabulary used is below the author's ability, 1 unit vocabulary word used correctly, the sentence structure of the essay is disorganized or confusing	Vocabulary use is inappropriate, no unit vocabulary words used, essay is off topic or disorganized
Grammar, Spelling, Punctuation	No errors in grammar, spelling, or punctuation	1-2 errors in grammar, spelling, or punctuation	3-5 errors in grammar, spelling, or punctuation	Multiple errors in grammar, spelling, or punctuation reduce the clarity of the essay	Errors in grammar, spelling, or punctuation make the essay difficult to understand
Formatting	No errors in MLA formatting, parenthetical citations are	1-2 errors in MLA formatting, parenthetical citations are	3-4 errors in MLA formatting, parenthetical citations are	5 errors in MLA formatting, parenthetical citations are	Multiple errors in formatting detract from the meaning of the essay.



	present after evidence from the text is used, the novel is listed on an appropriately formatted works cited page	present after evidence from the text is used, the novel is listed on a works cited page	present after evidence from the text is used, the novel is listed on a works cited page	present after evidence from the text is used, the novel is listed on a works cited page	Parenthetical citations and/or works cited page are missing*
--	--	---	---	---	--



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.