



The Rabbinic Mind (RD) Sanhedrin 70a

Sanhedrin 70a		סנהדרין ע"א
דברים כא:יח-כא כִּי־יִהְיֶה לְאִישׁ בֶּן סוֹנֵר וּמוֹרָה אֵינָנו שֹׁמֵעַ בְּקוֹל אָבִיו וּבְקוֹל אִמּוֹ וַיִּסְרוּ אוֹתוֹ וְלֹא יִשְׁמַע אֲלֵיהֶם: If a man has a rebellious and defiant son, who does not listen to his father or mother and does not obey them even after they discipline him, וְתִפְּשׂוּ בּוֹ אָבִיו וְאִמּוֹ וְהוֹצִיאוּ אוֹתוֹ אֶל־זִקְנֵי עִירוֹ וְאֶל־שַׁעַר מִקְדָּמוֹ: his father and mother shall take him and bring him out to the elders of his town at the public place of his community. וְאָמְרוּ אֶל־זִקְנֵי עִירוֹ בְּנֵנוּ זֶה סוֹנֵר וּמוֹרָה אֵינָנו שֹׁמֵעַ בְּקוֹלָנוּ זוֹלָל וְסוֹבָא: They shall say to the elders of his town, "This son of ours is disloyal and defiant; he does not listen to us. He is a glutton and a drunkard." וְרָגְמָהּ כָּל־אֲנָשֵׁי עִירוֹ בָּאֲבָנִים וּמָת וּבָעֵרְתָּ הָרַע מִקִּרְיָתְךָ וְכָל־יִשְׂרָאֵל יִשְׁמְעוּ וַיִּרְאוּ: (ס) Then the men of his town shall stone him to death. Thus you will sweep out evil from	אינו נעשה בן סורר ומורה עד שיאכל בשר וישתה יין: He is not made a rebellious and wayward son until he eats meat and drinks wine. תנו רבנן The Rabbis taught: אכל כל מאכל ולא אכל בשר שתה כל משקה ולא שתה יין אינו נעשה בן סורר ומורה עד שיאכל בשר וישתה יין שנאמר זולל וסובא If he ate any food [in excess] but not meat, or drank any drink [in excess] but not wine, he is not a rebellious and wayward son until he eats meat and drinks wine, as it says "A glutton and a drunkard." ואע"פ שאין ראייה לדבר זכר לדבר שנאמר (משלי כג, כ) אל תהי בסובאי יין בזוללי בשר למו ואומר (משלי כג, כא) כי סובא וזולל יורש וקרעים תלביש נומה And even though there is no proof for this, there is a hint, as it says (Proverbs 23:20) "Do not be counted among the drunkards of wine, the gluttons of meat"	The Torah commentator Rashi encourages people to read the story of the rebellious son together with the two sections of the Torah that immediately precede it: one dealing with a (male) soldier who claims a female captive in war and subsequently marries her, the next about a father who loves one son more than another. Together, Rashi says, the three sections tell a cautionary tale of a son who is conceived in a less-than-loving situation (by a soldier and a female captive), raised in a loveless environment (loved less than his brother), and as a result becomes rebellious and hateful, not knowing how to love. What shifts or changes from the teaching of the Torah to the teaching of the gemara? Why do you think the rabbis made this shift? How did they “change” what they found

your midst: all Israel will hear and be afraid.		unacceptable about the teaching of the Torah?
---	--	---

What essential (big) questions are these texts addressing? What questions do these texts raise for you?	What are the practical implications of this gemara, today?
--	---