



# Multimedia Textbook on Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders

### Lesson Plan

Terms of Use: This document is intended for teachers and can be adapted for educational instructional use only. The UCLA Asian American Studies Center is not responsible for any modifications, reproductions, or derivatives that depart from this original document.

Notice about this beta version: This version is for use by teachers for beta testing in 2025. Please do not share access to this lesson plan and its linked materials, upload them to any platform, or distribute hard copies or digital/electronic versions outside of the specific classroom in which you are beta testing the lesson plan.





# The Tape Family and Chinese American Civil Rights Module 1: "That Chinese Girl"

#### **Lesson Plan Contributors:**

Kathy Lu, Sulynn Miao, and Julia Wang

# **Chapter Compelling Question**

Can one family's assertion of their civil rights become a "victory" for an entire community?

# **Module Supporting Questions**

- How was the Tape family viewed in comparison to the rest of the Chinese immigrant community, and how did this make them "ideal" figures in fighting for school inclusion for Chinese Americans?
- What arguments did the Tape family use to fight for Mamie Tape's right to go to school?
- What were the limitations of the "victory" in Tape v. Hurley?

# **Module Description**

In this module, students will learn about Tape v. Hurley, the landmark California court case that resulted from the legal action of the Tape family. When their daughter, Mamie Tape, was denied admission to public school in San Francisco because she was Chinese, Joseph and Mary Tape sued the Board of Education, and the case went all the way to the California Supreme Court. The Tapes were uniquely positioned to fight against exclusion from public schools because they had assimilated into American culture and spoke English. Their legal strategy involved both fighting for civil rights against the unfair exclusion of Chinese people and arguing that they were an exception to most Chinese American families because of their "respectability." Even though the Tapes won the case and the California Supreme Court ruled







that all children were entitled to public school admission, this did not lead to the integration of Mamie and other Chinese children in schools. Instead, the *Tape v. Hurley* decision led to the creation of segregated schools for Chinese children. Despite the family's protests, Mamie Tape ultimately went to a segregated school on the edge of San Francisco's Chinatown.



#### **Lesson Plan Description**

Students will learn the historical context of the *Tape v. Hurley* decision, which was made during a time of widespread anti-Chinese sentiment and the legal exclusion of Chinese immigrants from the US. This lesson will start with a cultural energizer for students to reflect on the critical concept of "respectability" and how this social pressure shows up in shared spaces, including the classroom. Students will then engage in a community-building activity to collaborate on shared values for the classroom. Then, students will explore the module's critical concepts in-depth. Finally, students will participate in the main activity, which delves into the *Tape v. Hurley* case and the arguments made for either the exclusion or admission of Chinese students into public schools.

The lesson will blend primary document analysis, reading comprehension, group discussion, critical thinking, and writing to foster a deeper understanding of the strategies employed by the Tape family to fight for inclusion and the case's unintended consequences. We recommend instructors to select either Activity 1: *Tape v. Hurley* OR Activity 2: Mary Tape's Letter for the main part of the lesson. Activity 1 is designed for higher grade levels and Activity 2 is designed for lower grade levels.



# **Learning Goals/Objectives**

Students will...

 Understand how, as a middle-class family who strove to assimilate into white American culture and dissociate from their Chinese identity, the Tapes positioned themselves as "ideal" figures to attend American schools.







• Explore how, at the same time that the *Tape v. Hurley* decision represented a massive civil rights breakthrough, it also ushered in a new era of segregation and discrimination.

Skills Focus
☑ Written Communication
☑ Oral Communication
☑ Primary Source Analysis & Research
☐ Community Engagement
☐ Creative Arts
☑ Critical Thinking
☐ Additional Skills
Ethnic Studies Framing & Pedagogy
☑ Build a foundational understanding about Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders
including the histories, perspectives, and contemporary experiences spanning the
precolonial to the present day.
☑ Develop literacy and the skills to communicate, understand, engage, and
articulate different perspectives through understanding multiple ways of knowing,
including indigenous, ancestral, familial, and diasporic knowledge.
✓ Nurture critical thinking and inquiry on fundamental assumptions related to
empire, capitalism, race and racism, gender and patriarchy, and other structures of
power and inequality and how they shape society and the environment.
☐ Cultivate holistic well-being amongst all and connections across difference by
strengthening historical empathy, self-worth and mutual respect, cultural expression,
and cross-cultural understanding.
□ Apply knowledge to imagine and create new possibilities and solidarities for a
more just, equitable, democratic, non-racist, compassionate, and sustainable society
and world.





_	_		
Suggested	Grade	Level(	s)

☑ 9

✓ 10

☑ 11

✓ 12

□ 13-14

# Suggested Discipline(s)

☐ Arts

☑ English Language Arts

☑ History / Social Studies

☐ Other: Geography

# Note About Content Standards

The following standards are based on the Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts & Literacy in History/Social Studies and Technical Subjects established by the California State Board of Education. Please check your own state's English Language Arts and History/Social Studies Standards for specific curriculum alignment.

# ELA Standards Alignment

• RH.9–10.1: Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources, attending to such features as the date and origin of the information.





- RH.9–10.2: Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary of how key events or ideas develop over the course of the text.
- RH.9–10.4: Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in a text, including vocabulary describing political, social, or economic aspects of history/social science.
- RH.9–10.6: Compare the point of view of two or more authors for how they treat the same or similar topics, including which details they include and emphasize in their respective accounts.
- RI.9-10.9: Analyze seminal U.S. documents of historical and literary significance (e.g., Washington's Farewell Address, the Gettysburg Address, Roosevelt's Four Freedoms speech, King's "Letter from Birmingham Jail"), including how they address related themes and concepts.
- **WHST.9–10.4:** Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.
- WHST.9–10.8: Gather relevant information from multiple authoritative print and digital sources (primary and secondary), using advanced searches effectively; assess the usefulness of each source in answering the research question; integrate information into the text selectively to maintain the flow of ideas, avoiding plagiarism and following a standard format for citation. CA
- **SL.9-10.1:** Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.
  - A. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas.





- B. Work with peers to set rules for collegial discussions and decision-making (e.g., informal consensus, taking votes on key issues, presentation of alternate views), clear goals and deadlines, and individual roles as needed.
- C. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that relate the current discussion to broader themes or larger ideas; actively incorporate others into the discussion; and clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions.
- D. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives, summarize points of agreement and disagreement, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views and understanding and make new connections in light of the evidence and reasoning presented.

# History/Social Studies Standards Alignment

- **HSS-11.10**: Students analyze the development of federal civil rights and voting rights.
- HSS-11.10.2: Examine and analyze the key events, policies, and court cases in the
  evolution of civil rights, including Dred Scott v. Sandford, Plessy v. Ferguson, Brown v.
  Board of Education, Regents of the University of California v. Bakke, and California
  Proposition 209.

# Materials (e.g., handouts, slides)

- 1.0 Handout: Universal Human Needs/Values
- 1.0 Slides Intro to Lesson
- 1.1 Slides Activity 1
- 1.1 Worksheet
- 1.2 Worksheet

# Modifications, Accommodations, Resources for Multilingual Students, SPED, & Newcomers

• **Use varied texts:** Prepare materials with varying reading levels; offer alternatives, such as a short video or audio piece, that can transmit similar information.





- **Provide multiple modalities:** Offer text-to-speech apps for written text; utilize audio and visual elements to accompany texts.
- **Offer literacy supports:** Give lists of unfamiliar vocabulary; chunk text into smaller parts.

#### **CRITICAL CONCEPTS/KEY TERMS:**



# exclusion

#### **DEFINITION & RATIONALE for choosing this word, phrase, or concept**

<u>Definition:</u> The policy and/or practice of banning or prohibiting a person or group of people from accessing a place, group, or resource.

Rationale: Tape v. Hurley was a court case that decided whether the exclusion of Chinese students from public schools was legal. The case took place during an era where the exclusion of Chinese immigrants from the United States was made legal through the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882.

ACTIVITIES: What activity(ies) will you use to teach this concept?

Activity 1: Tape v. Hurley

**Activity 2: Mary Tape's Letter** 



### segregation

#### **DEFINITION & RATIONALE for choosing this word, phrase, or concept**

<u>Definition:</u> The system and/or act of separating a group of people from others based on race, ethnicity, or other identity categories.

Rationale: Despite the *Tape v. Hurley* ruling that determined Chinese children were entitled to public school admission, the court case led to the creation of segregated schools for Chinese Americans.

ACTIVITIES: What activity(ies) will you use to teach this concept?

Activity 1: Tape v. Hurley

**Activity 2: Mary Tape's Letter** 









# immigration

#### **DEFINITION & RATIONALE for choosing this word, phrase, or concept**

<u>Definition:</u> The act of moving to a foreign country, with the intent to settle permanently. <u>Rationale:</u> Joseph and Mary Tape were immigrants from China, but the *Tape v. Hurley* case was focused on their daughter Mamie Tape, who was American-born Chinese.

ACTIVITIES: What activity(ies) will you use to teach this concept?

Activity 1: Tape v. Hurley



#### citizenship

#### **DEFINITION & RATIONALE for choosing this word, phrase, or concept**

<u>Definition:</u> The legal status of being a member or inhabitant of a country, in which a person gives allegiance to the government in exchange for rights and protections. This status is granted to certain individuals, either through birth or naturalization.

Rationale: At the time of the *Tape v. Hurley* case, Chinese immigrants were not able to be naturalized, and Chinese people could only be granted citizenship by being born in the US. This shows how citizenship is a variable, not fixed, status that is affected by racialized policies.

ACTIVITIES: What activity(ies) will you use to teach this concept?

Activity 1: Tape v. Hurley



#### Americanization

#### **DEFINITION & RATIONALE for choosing this word, phrase, or concept**

<u>Definition:</u> The process of assimilating to American culture, often experienced by immigrants as they are pressured to give up their heritage and cultural practices in favor of practicing American values and customs.





Rationale: One of the Tape family's primary arguments for Mamie's admission into public school was that she and their family were Americanized in language and culture, and therefore unlike other Chinese immigrants.

ACTIVITIES: What activity(ies) will you use to teach this concept?

**Activity 2: Mary Tape's Letter** 



#### assimilation

#### **DEFINITION & RATIONALE for choosing this word, phrase, or concept**

<u>Definition:</u> The process in which a group of people adapts to a dominant culture's norms, language, values, and behaviors, either by choice or by force, in order to gain social acceptance and access to privileges.

<u>Rationale:</u> The Tapes assimilated into white American society and raised their children to do the same. However, the results of the *Tape v. Hurley* case show that, in spite of their assimilation, they were not able to gain full access to privileges and opportunities in society.

ACTIVITIES: What activity(ies) will you use to teach this concept?

Activity 1: Tape v. Hurley

**Activity 2: Mary Tape's Letter** 



#### respectability

#### **DEFINITION & RATIONALE** for choosing this word, phrase, or concept

<u>Definition:</u> The quality of being socially accepted as proper or correct, and therefore worthy of being respected. The norms or behaviors considered respectable in a society are usually determined by its dominant culture.

<u>Rationale:</u> The Tape family presented themselves as respectable in their court case, setting themselves apart from other Chinese families at the time. This example shows how respectability has been racialized and equated with white American culture.

ACTIVITIES: What activity(ies) will you use to teach this concept?

Activity 1: Tape v. Hurley







#### **LESSON PLAN**

#### C1: CULTURAL RITUAL/ENERGIZER

Title of Cultural Ritual/Energizer: Community Values

#### **DESCRIPTION:**

Students will engage in a community building activity to critically think about norms of respectability and where they come from, in order to intentionally collaborate in creating shared values for the classroom. Students will learn about the critical concept of respectability and reflect on how respectability is racialized and enforced, in regards to both the Tape family's story and examples from the present-day. This activity will support students in uplifting community values that can be returned and referred back to throughout lessons in the classroom.

#### ~

#### STEP 1: Land & Ancestor Acknowledgement [5 min.]

Use the Native Land Digital Map resource to identify the Indigenous people and nation(s) that have been caretakers of the land where your classes take place: <a href="https://native-land.ca/">https://native-land.ca/</a>. Then read a land and ancestor acknowledgement aloud for the whole class.

Note: We encourage Ethnic Studies lessons to start off with a land and ancestor acknowledgement. A land acknowledgement is a formal statement that recognizes and gives respect to Indigenous peoples as traditional stewards of their land. It also respects the enduring relationship that exists between the native people, their traditional language, and their culture on these lands. This is an act of conciliation that makes a statement honoring the traditional land of the native people who have called, and still call the land home, before and after the arrival of settlers. (Source: Native American Studies group of the Liberated Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Collective.)







# **✓** STEP 2: Reflect on Respectability [20 min.]

Write or project the following reflection questions on the board, then invite students to journal independently for five minutes on these prompts.

- What is considered socially acceptable or unacceptable?
- What behaviors are considered okay for some people to do, but not for others?
- Who decides what good and bad manners are? Who decides what is right and wrong?
- Where do those expectations come from? Why do you think this is?

Provide a disclaimer that what students write will be for their eyes only, and is not going to be shared or turned in. Afterwards, introduce the critical concept of respectability:

Respectability means being socially accepted as proper or correct, and therefore worthy
of respect. We live in a society where respectability is racialized. What this means is:
race is often used to determine who is respectable and given the privilege of
respectability in our society. This is because the norms and behaviors we consider
"respectable" come from the dominant culture in the US. For example, people are often
pressured to adhere to white American culture and norms, and if they don't, they might
face consequences in society.

Engage the class in discussion using these prompts:

- Can you think of an example of "respectable" behavior?
- Have you had a personal experience of feeling pressured to conform to what is considered "respectable"?

#### ✓ STEP 3: Share Community Values [25 min.]

Share this context with the class to introduce the next exercise:

Respectability shows up everywhere, including in our classroom. We get messages all
the time about what is considered socially acceptable or not at school. Some of these
cultural norms might fit us, and some of them might not. Instead of assuming what is





right and wrong based on respectability norms, we are going to decide what we value as a community. We will collectively share which values we want to uplift in our classroom, and this will guide us in how we show up each day and how we treat each other.

#### Directions:

- Print out copies of the 1.0 Handout: Universal Human Needs/Values (found in the Materials section) for each student. This is an external resource from Grok the World, a company that creates products for teaching Nonviolent Communication.
- Form a circle in the classroom using chairs, so students can be seated facing each other.
- Pass out the handout and three blank slips of paper to each student.
- Instruct students to read through the list of needs on the handout while reflecting on what values are most important to them in the classroom setting. Students can reflect on values that are both on and off the list.
- Tell students to select and write their top three values on the slips of paper. The values
  can be from the list or described in their own words.
- Go around the circle and have each student share their values aloud. After sharing, each student should add their slips of paper to the center of the circle before returning to their seat. Then, the next person can share.
- Compile all of the values from the center of the circle to create a list of community values for the classroom, and display the list for everyone to see.
- Refer back to this list of community values throughout the lessons when relevant.

# C2: CRITICAL CONCEPTS Introduction to the Lesson

Title of Slide Deck/Presentation:Introduction to Module 1: "That Chinese Girl"





#### **DESCRIPTION:**

After students have read Module 1 of the textbook, titled "That Chinese Girl," use the 1.0 Slides Intro to Lesson presentation (found in the Materials section) to introduce them to the module's critical concepts.

For each concept/term, invite students to practice their reading comprehension and deduction skills by analyzing excerpts from the chapter text. That way, students can think and talk through the critical concepts before they read the definitions. Then, engage students in the provided discussion questions to make connections between the critical concepts and current events and/or their own lives.

# STEP 1: Module 1 Recap - Slides 1-3 [7 min.]

Review the key facts and events from Module 1. Invite students to share any questions about the chapter or bring up any unfamiliar words from the text.

# STEP 2: Exclusion - Slides 4-5 [3 min.]

Read the excerpt from the textbook: "From 1859 to 1871, [Chinese communities in San Francisco] had only sporadic access to public education, despite ongoing appeals to the school board by both Chinese community leaders and white Protestant missionaries. They argued that the Chinese paid taxes and that their exclusion from tax-supported schools was a form of taxation without representation."

- Reflection Question: What does this quote reveal about exclusion?
- Definition: The policy and/or practice of banning or prohibiting a person or group of people from accessing a place, group, or resource.

### STEP 3: Segregation - Slides 6–7 [5 min.]

Read the excerpt from the textbook: "Superior Court Judge James Maguire issued a comprehensive ruling that all children were entitled to public school admission ... Anticipating this eventuality, the school board had rushed an act through the state legislature authorizing







separate schools for "children of Chinese and Mongolian descent." It prepared to open a Chinese Primary School on the edge of Chinatown. ... Rather than achieving full inclusion in the school system, the ruling led to legal segregation."

- Reflection Question: What does this quote reveal about segregation?
- Definition: The system and/or act of separating a group of people from others based on race, ethnicity, or other identity categories.
- Discussion Question: How are exclusion and segregation similar? How are they different?

#### ✓ STEP 4: Immigration - Slides 8–9 [3 min.]

Read the excerpt from the textbook: "Although courts blocked Chinese immigration until the Exclusion Act was repealed in 1943, the *Tape* case was not about immigrants, but instead about an American-born Chinese who was a US citizen. Despite ongoing hostility toward Chinese immigrants, there were some white people, like school board member Charles Cleveland, who believed that under the Constitution all children born in the United States were citizens."

- Reflection Question: What does this quote reveal about immigration?
- Definition: The act of moving to a foreign country, with the intent to settle permanently.

#### ✓ STEP 5: Citizenship - Slides 10–11 [5 min.]

Read the excerpt from the textbook: "The Tapes' lawsuit was extraordinary at the time because it was made on the heels of the Chinese Exclusion Act, passed in 1882—the result of decades of racist, anti-Chinese agitation. The Exclusion Act barred all Chinese laborers from entering the United States and all Chinese from acquiring naturalized citizenship."

- Reflection Question: What does this quote reveal about citizenship?
- Definition: The legal status of being a member or inhabitant of a country, in which a
  person gives allegiance to the government in exchange for rights and protections. This
  status is granted to certain individuals, either through birth or naturalization.
- Discussion Question: How are immigration and citizenship related?





# **★** STEP 6: Assimilation - Slides 12–13 [3 min.]

Read the excerpt from the textbook: "As racism against Chinese communities spread, so did people's opposition to their admission into public schools. Racist beliefs blamed the Chinese for being unassimilable. That same thinking also opposed education precisely because it threatened to assimilate, and hence, permanently establish the Chinese population in the area."

- Reflection Question: What does this quote reveal about assimilation?
- Definition: The process in which a group of people adapts to a dominant culture's norms, language, values, and behaviors, either by choice or by force, in order to gain social acceptance and access to privileges.

#### **✓** STEP 7: Americanization - Slides 14–15 [5 min.]

Read the excerpt from the textbook: "Although it was not obvious from their names, the Tapes were Chinese, and the San Francisco Board of Education did not allow Chinese children into its schools at the time. Although Mary Tape knew this, she thought being Chinese would not matter because the family spoke English and lived in a white neighborhood. ... Mamie and Frank [Tape] were "American" in terms of their clothing, English fluency, residency in a white neighborhood, and white friends."

- Reflection Question: What does this quote reveal about Americanization?
- Definition: The process of assimilating to American culture, often experienced by immigrants as they are pressured to give up their heritage and cultural practices in favor of practicing American values and customs.
- Discussion Question: How are assimilation and Americanization related?

#### ✓ STEP 8: Respectability - Slides 16–17 [7 min.]

Read the excerpt from the textbook: "Joseph Tape's own court statement [stressed] his and his family's assimilated character—that is, their lack of "Chineseness." ... To underscore their







identity as Americans, the Tapes posed for a studio portrait around the time of the lawsuit to show the family's respectability and assimilation into Western society."

- Reflection Question: What does this quote reveal about respectability?
- Definition: The quality of being socially accepted as proper or correct, and therefore
  worthy of being respected. The norms or behaviors considered respectable in a society
  are usually determined by its dominant culture.
- Discussion Question: What norms and behaviors are considered socially acceptable and respectable in our society (for example, at school, work, in public)? Where do you think these norms come from?

# **★** STEP 9: Overview of Main Activity [2 min.]

Read the brief overview of the main activity that students will be doing in the next part of the lesson. Both activity options are listed on this final slide, but we recommend selecting just one of the activities, depending on the class.

- Activity 1: Tape v. Hurley
- Activity 2: Mary Tape's Letter

Activity 1 is designed for higher grade levels and Activity 2 is designed for lower grade levels.







# C3: COMMUNITY COLLABORATION/CRITICAL CULTURAL PRODUCTION

Some lessons can be accomplished in a 40–90 min. class period, but some may need multiple days.

Note: We recommend instructors to select either Activity 1: Tape v. Hurley OR Activity 2: Mary Tape's Letter for this portion of the lesson plan. Activity 1 is designed for higher grade levels and Activity 2 is designed for lower grade levels.

Title of Main Activity: Activity 1: *Tape v. Hurley* Time/Days Needed: 1–2 Days [65–115 min.]

#### **DESCRIPTION:**

In this activity, students will examine primary documents from the landmark *Tape v. Hurley* court case and write an essay analyzing the motivations and arguments on both sides. Students will first learn the historical context of *Tape v. Hurley, which* followed the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882 and preceded the *Plessy v. Ferguson* ruling of 1896. Students will explore excerpts from all three historical events and engage in a group discussion around anti-Chinese sentiment. Students will then read and annotate the primary documents relating to the *Tape v. Hurley* case. Students will participate in group discussions to reflect on what they've read. Finally, this activity will culminate in an essay assignment, either to be completed as homework or as an in-class mock exam. This activity will support students in thinking critically about legal strategies and understanding the critical concepts of exclusion, citizenship, Americanization, respectability, and segregation.

### STEP 1: Introduce the Activity [2 min.]

Read aloud the following context for the class:
 "Tang v. Hurlov was a landmark court case in the class."

"Tape v. Hurley was a landmark court case in the history of Asian American civil rights and school segregation in the United States. The California Supreme Court ruled that excluding Mamie Tape from public school because she was Chinese was unconstitutional. This 1885 court decision was bookended by two major historical events: 1) the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882 that outright banned Chinese laborers







from immigrating to the United States, and 2) the US Supreme Court decision *Plessy v. Ferguson* in 1896 that upheld segregation in public facilities, including schools, under the doctrine of "separate but equal." The Tape family fought for educational equality for their children in a time of widespread anti-Chinese sentiment. Although the Tapes won the court case, the education system found a way out of full inclusion and integration of Chinese American students in public schools by setting up schools segregated by race."

Introduce the main activity by telling students: "We are going to learn about the
historical background of these events. Then, we will examine some primary source
documents from the landmark *Tape v. Hurley* court case and think about the arguments
and motivations on each side."

#### **★** STEP 2: Present Historical Overview [15 min.]

Open the **1.1 Slides Activity 1** presentation (found in the **Materials** section) and project it on the board for students. Tell students:

• "We are going to go through a brief historical overview about the Chinese Exclusion Act, Tape v. Hurley, and Plessy v. Ferguson. We will also read through quotes from each of these legal events. After we go through the slides, we'll have a short discussion."

As you progress through the slides, pause after each quote to provide additional context to students. Highlight the following bolded concepts before moving on to the next event:

- Chinese Exclusion Act (1882) Slides 2-3
  - Exclusion: The primary response to Chinese immigration was the effort to exclude and expel Chinese people from the US. In other words, preventing them from entering the country and removing those who do.
  - Citizenship: Chinese people were denied citizenship (through naturalization)
     because they were considered inherently un-American and unassimilable.
- Tape v. Hurley (1885) Slides 4–5







- Americanization & Respectability: The Tape family's primary argument in appealing for Mamie Tape's admission into public schools was showing evidence that they were "American" in their clothes, speech, manners, and habits. Their argument was based on the idea that "respectability" is defined by how good a person is at following white American customs and norms.
- Plessy v. Ferguson (1896) Slides 6–7
  - Segregation: Justice Harlan, the only Supreme Court Justice to dissent from the Plessy v. Ferguson ruling, compared Chinese and Black people in part of his statement. He argued that even Chinese people, who were "a race so different from our own" that they were legally excluded from the country, were not segregated while Black people were.

After reviewing the slides, share the following discussion prompt with the class:

• What do the Chinese Exclusion Act, *Plessy v. Ferguson*, and *Tape v. Hurley* show about how Chinese people were viewed by the American government and society?

Encourage them to apply what they learned from the quotes on the slides. Invite a couple students to share their responses and facilitate a short discussion. To conclude the class discussion, explain the significance of the events and quotes with the following summary:

 All of these quotes and concepts encompass the idea persisting today that Chinese people, and Asians in general, are a race fundamentally different from white people and are always viewed as "foreign"—no matter if they are immigrants or American-born, if they speak English and adhere to white American customs or not.

#### **★** STEP 3: Distribute Handout and Introduce Activity [3 min.]

Print out and distribute copies of the **1.1 Worksheet** (found in the **Materials** section) to students. The worksheet includes historical context and directions on the first page.







- Tell students: "As we read, I want you to practice annotating the text excerpts by highlighting or underlying and writing notes in the margins. Focus on key parts that answer these questions:
  - O WHO does this court case involve?
  - WHEN does it take place?
  - WHAT is this court case deciding?
  - WHERE is it taking place?
  - O WHY are both sides making their arguments?
  - HOW are they making their arguments?

After students read the excerpts, they will write a response to this essay question:

• What are the major arguments for and against the admission of Chinese into public schools in the *Tape v. Hurley* case, and what are the underlying motivations for each side?

# **✓** STEP 4: Read and Annotate [25 min.]

Read the excerpts out loud and/or invite some student volunteers to read the excerpts. Periodically remind students to highlight and annotate parts of the text.

#### **✓** STEP 5: Discussion [15 min.]

Either in small groups or as a class, have students discuss some or all of the following reflection questions:

- The Tape v. Hurley case resulted in segregation rather than outright inclusion or exclusion from schools. What are the differences between exclusion and segregation?
   What are the differences between inclusion and segregation?
- What are the social impacts of exclusion versus segregation?
- Why do you think some white people wanted the Chinese to be fully excluded from schools, rather than segregated like Black or Indigenous students?





- How do you think Mary and Joseph Tape viewed their own racial identity?
- How did the Tapes try to strengthen their arguments for admitting their children into public schools by using their lack of "Chineseness"?
- How do you think these arguments might have affected Chinese people in the US who were considered less Americanized, middle-class, or "respectable"?

#### STEP 6: Extended Essay Assignment [5–50 min.]

Either for homework OR as an in-class mock exam, have students respond to the essay question provided on the worksheet. This can be done during a 50-minute class period, or can be assigned to students to complete independently by an appropriate deadline. Students will write a 5–7 paragraph essay on this prompt:

 Essay Question: What are the major arguments for and against the admission of Chinese into public schools in the *Tape v. Hurley* case? What are the underlying motivations and potential consequences for each of these arguments?

Tell students to consider WHO might be impacted by these consequences and HOW. Encourage them to use supporting details from the chapter text and the documents provided, aided by their annotations and the classroom discussion. These writing tips and reminders are also listed on the first page of the worksheet.

Title of Main Activity: Activity 2: Mary Tape's Letter

Time/Days Needed: 1 Day [50-75 min.]

#### **DESCRIPTION:**

In this activity, students will analyze primary sources from the landmark *Tape v. Hurley* court case, including Mary Tape's letter to the San Francisco Board of Education and excerpts from arguments for and against the exclusion of Chinese students in public schools. Students will practice reading comprehension skills as they examine the arguments made by Mary Tape and the school board members. Students will then write their own letters to the school board in support of admitting Mamie Tape into public schools. This activity will support students in practicing critical thinking, reading, and







writing skills, as well as in understanding the differences between concepts of exclusion, inclusion, and segregation.

#### **★** STEP 1: Introduce Activity & Distribute Handout [3 min.]

- Introduce the activity by sharing context about Mary Tape's letter: "In April 1885, after the Tape v. Hurley court case had been decided, Mary Tape once again tried to enroll her daughter, Mamie, into the Spring Valley School in San Francisco and was once again thwarted by the school's principal, Jennie Hurley. Mary wrote a letter to the Board of Education in protest, which was then printed in the newspaper, the Daily Alta California. We are going to read through this letter, as well as some arguments made for and against admitting Chinese students into public schools. Then, you are going to write your own letter to the school board in support of Mamie Tape's admission into public schools."
- Distribute copies of the 1.2 Worksheet (found in the Materials section) to students.

# STEP 2: Read Primary Sources [15 min.]

- As a class, read the directions at the top of the handout.
- Before reading the letter, provide a disclaimer that there are some spelling and grammatical errors in the primary source document because it is a verbatim copy of Mary Tape's letter from 1885.
- Have students read through Mary Tape's letter to the Board of Education (either by using popcorn style or asking for volunteers). Invite students to underline or highlight words or phrases they have questions about or do not understand.
- Review the vocabulary list on the handout, and invite students to bring up additional words or questions. Students can take notes on the margins of the handout or on a separate piece of paper.
- Again as a class, read through the primary sources in the next section of the handout,
   titled "Arguments For and Against." These are excerpts from additional primary sources.





Invite students again to underline or highlight words or phrases they have questions about.

# **✓** STEP 3: Discuss Arguments and Strategies [12 min.]

As a class, discuss the following reflection questions based on the readings:

- What are your thoughts or reactions to the arguments being made for and against
   Mamie's admission into public school?
- What are the underlying beliefs of the arguments on both sides?
- What strategies or tactics are being used for each argument? Are they effective or ineffective?

# **★ STEP 4: Write Your Own Letter [20–45 min.]**

Tell students that they will write their own letters to the Board of Education in support of admitting Mamie Tape into public schools. Students can work on these letters for the remainder of the class period, or the letter can be assigned as homework.

Notes: Remind students that they will be arguing for inclusion and integration, NOT segregation of students by race into a separate school for Chinese children. In their letters, students can pretend to be community members, parents of schoolchildren, etc. Encourage students to use supporting details from the primary source excerpts, as well as the chapter text.

#### C4: CLOSING DIALOGUE

#### **DESCRIPTION:**

Share the following reflection questions with students:

• How was the Tape family strategic in their arguments for the admission of Mamie Tape into public schools?







- What might be some unintended consequences of their strategies? Who might this have impacted?
- How do perceptions of a "good immigrant" and "bad immigrant" persist today?

Invite students to share some of their responses aloud and facilitate a closing discussion. Make sure to connect this dialogue back to the chapter's compelling question and/or the module's supporting questions.

#### **Links to Resources and Notes**

#### Resources

- Native Land Digital Map
- Universal Human Needs/Values Resource GROK the World





C4 LESSON PLAN FORMAT-Tintiangco-Cubales/Community Responsive Education, 2022