

Making Fun of Our Old Cosmere Theories

Welcome, Shardcast listener! Here is a vaguely formatted outline we used for our Shardcast episode. But please feel free to read through our old craziness in full! Featuring some old Brandon snippets too...

Chaos

Ash is of Preservation

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5739.msg119395#msg119395>

"I doubt it. When we are having things like super manipulative, god-like forces at work, I find it hard to believe that strange voices aren't caused by either Preservation or Ruin. There's another instance of this, where Elend kills this koloss as he's leaving Jastes for the first time, where a voice tells him how to defeat the beast. This wouldn't be strange, but it says that "the voice didn't come from Tindwyl, or anything he'd ever heard before." Something like that. It just seems odd that it would come from nowhere.

Though I see where you are going. I went through all of WoA thinking Zane was just some insane madman. Now I realize Ruin was manipulating him all along.

Now, here's the time for radical theories. I'm under the impression that if Ruin has some sort of external mechanism to exist in, like the mist, then Preservation should have something similar.

I think, then, (with very little to no evidence to support this) that the Ashmounts and ash itself is Preservation. Somehow."

Noticing dots on the Allomancy chart (actually correct!)

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5690.msg119408#msg119408>

3. Notice the dots on each of the pairs. On one, the dot is inside the rest of the symbol, and the other, it's on the outside. I believe this signifies which metal is a Pushing or Pulling metal.

On Ashmount names

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5739.msg119421#msg119421>

Well, I don't think Brandon would put in the Ashmounts and give them names if they weren't important in some ways.

Lots of confusion on the mists

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5739.msg119448#msg119448>

It's strange. The mists seem to be something both Ruin (through killing) and Preservation (through the mist spirit) can use. I wonder why that is, exactly? I mean, both forces are essentially opposites, so why are they both wielding the mists?

Hemalurgy pre-Ascension

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5697.msg119611#msg119611>

Hmmm, I know that Kwaan said that Alendi survived assassins and a bunch of other things. It's not too unlikely that he had some special ability of his own.

Of course, that would mean that Hemalurgy existed before the Ascension. That could have profound ramifications all around.

Well this is rather confident

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5755.msg119708#msg119708>

In my Ruin and Preservation topic, I explained that Kelsier got the Eleventh metal from the kandra. I will be utterly convinced of that fact until Brandon proves me wrong.

But I don't think I will :D.

Mists are why an Allomancer can burn metals

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5782.msg119999#msg119999>

Let's think for a moment. Brandon says mists are "fundamental" in the world of Mistborn and its magic. So--go with me here--what if, the mists were the reason *why* an Allomancer can burn metals?

It's weird, in itself. I could be totally in crazy land with this one, I'll admit. I have very little evidence to support this theory. But, the link seems logical and reasonable to me.

In fact, I'm beginning to think we all have it backwards. Our normal analysis says that when we use Allomancy, the mists move. That's cause and effect. The Allomancy--*cause*--makes the mists move--*effect*. Well, switch that around. An Allomancer uses his or her subconscious, and somehow that channels the mists--pulling the mists *towards* the Allomancer--and that, in turn, lets the metals burn. The mists are the *cause*, rather than being the *effect*.

The Lord Ruler would never have procreated!

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5793.msg120392#msg120392>

Last thing, I doubt the Lord ruler would've procreated. He made the Terris breeding programs specifically to remove Feruchemy. Since Feruchemy and Allomancy are both hereditary, any child of the Lord Ruler would have the exact same abilities. The Lord Ruler fears a powerful challenger to his authority, so I'm absolutely certain he wouldn't have kids.

Me remembering kandra have Hemalurgy but not at all understanding it one bit

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5745.msg120583#msg120583>

My friend--who I loaned my WoA copy to but has not yet finished--had a very interesting idea. I had told him about Hemalurgy a bit and how it is related to metal stuck in your body. He said this to me about kandra:

"The kandra have Hemalurgy."

"What?" I say.

"Well, they don't have Allomancy, and they don't have Feruchemy. They have to get their power somewhere. That third magic system you were talking about, Hemalurgy."

"You need metal for Hemalurgy. Like, giant spikes through your eyeballs."

"Well, they have to get their power somewhere!"

And, I realize now, that there IS a liquid metal in existence: the Well of Ascension. The Lord Ruler touched that power, maybe he gave it to his creations of the koloss and kandra. Maybe not koloss, but remember, the koloss have nails stuck into them. That can't really be something the koloss just do on accident. The nails give them Hemalurgical powers. Maybe the kandra have it as well.

"Lightning-rod Hemalurgy", where Eric is convinced Hemalurgy isn't just stealing powers (Long)

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5745.msg120598#msg120598>

The "on his arms" thing in the epigraph is just a metaphor!

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5834.0>

Atium's first name was...Atrium. Which was already a word, so Brandon took out the R.

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=6061.msg127474#msg127474>

The Allomancer Hobo

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=6122.msg128515#msg128515>

As for your case #2, I doubt it's likely that someone really "foretold" the Lord Ruler's downfall. It could just be some random Allomancer hobo who discovered malatium and not realizing that there weren't 16 metals, thought that this special, new metal which was separate from the main ten was important somehow. Combine that discovery with the longing to end the Lord Ruler's, it's not difficult to think that somebody just discovered malatium on accident and created this theory on a hope. This person wouldn't randomly tell people about this "prophecy", so that would mean Sazed would have never heard of it.

As a corollary, if the Allomancer Hobo had a distrust of people which prevented him from telling this theory to, say, Keepers, then the Allomancer Hobo must have trusted Kelsier (or Gemmel, Kelsier's mentor) to give it to him. And I believe the prophecy is rather vague because Kelsier didn't really know how to use it. If someone discovered malatium on accident as described above, I doubt he would know the deep intricacies of the metal, much less how the metal would defeat the Lord Ruler. It's a prophecy built on hope, not strategy.

(Note, I call him the Allomancer Hobo because he would need to be an Allomancer to ensure the metal was of Allomantic quality, and Hobo because it could be any random person who could have discovered it.)

Of course, it could be the kandra, but somehow that appears far less likely than this scenario.

Atium is weird and TLR made it

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=6061.msg128709#msg128709>

Furthermore, there is a reason why the kandra only take atium as payment, but I don't know what it is.

It's not coincidental. It's special in some way, so I just randomly threw out there that the Lord Ruler could have created atium.

The final Hero of Ages Theory thread, with Eric's very long nonsense

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=6132.msg128802#msg128802>

It's doubtful that the mist spirit is the embodiment of Preservation on the sole basis that it sounds really lame. Preservation is a primordial force on par with Ruin, not some loser mist spirit.

The Lord Ruler's clues = Lord Ruler's epigraphs.

No clue about mist spirit

I'm not even going to touch this one. Yup. I don't have a clue on anything about the mist spirit, why it exists, or why it has Allomancy. I do know, however, that the mist spirit is not the combined spirits of all previous Heroes of Ages--that I am immensely confident of. The best mist spirit theory I have is that the mist spirit is... the guardian of the Well of Ascension. Somehow, somehow. Yeah, I don't have a clue about the mist spirit.

Plausibility: Considering I didn't actually give a theory, I'd say it's pretty dang plausible.

Flaws: I don't have a theory on this one.

Related Topics: The "Give Chaos a Clue" Foundation.

Somehow, inside the Well of Ascension there are two forces: Ruin, which wants to be freed, and Preservation, the force I surmise the Lord Ruler touched. I have no theory for that. It defies my mortal logic. I cannot understand crazy things of gods like the Well of Ascension. However, there is some logic to Preservation being the force the Lord Ruler touched. In MB1 Annotation Prologue Part Two, Brandon says the world is a little frozen in time. In the MB3 Prologue, Marsh says that there is something like a shield over the land. I think both are the works of Preservation; the Lord Ruler burning the power of Preservation to freeze the world.

No, another, much more probable theory is that Hemalurgy has some sort of ability to steal power from a sacrifice. Sacrifice a misting who burns Pewter, and bam, now with a pewter spike, you have the ability to burn Pewter like an Allomancer. This could also be why the Inquisitors are killing Feruchemists: kill a Feruchemist and gain their power. However, I cannot reconcile this idea with my 3-A model. Power stealing can't be all there is to Hemalurgy, there has to be something more. Indeed, it is different than pure Allomancy, but how and why does it differ?

I have no idea.

Another idea is that Hemalurgy pumps up basic Allomancy, like something that enhances basic attributes. But still, I refuse to believe that is all Hemalurgy is. There is something more, but I do not know what it is.

The Well of Ascension is woefully unexplained. So much power is in there and it is so colossally important, and yet, there are so many questions. Where did the Well come from? Why does it fill up every thousand years? Does it really fill up every thousand years, or is that just a myth that Ruin manipulated? What is the Well filled with, and where does the Power come from? How does it get filled by "well-liquid", is it just spontaneous? I'm certain all of these questions are tied to the nature of Ruin and Preservation, and if these questions are answered, a lot of things get answered with it.

One question I've always had is when Ruin manifests his will. The Lord Ruler was doing something to stop Ruin in the span of the Final Empire, but in Alendi/Kwaan/Rashek's time, there was no such assurance. Even Ruin trapped inside the Well had some measure of power. What set off Ruin in the ancient age? The only answer I can think of is that the "millennial power" was filled at the Well, which then prompted Ruin to do his thing. It could also be that Ruin did not have any power when the Well was empty, only gaining his power back when the Well filled.

However, there is one person--One Guy--who is almost to the scale of a mythological figure. This One Guy had Ascended pre-Alendi, and during that Ascension, the One Guy sealed Ruin inside of the Well's power (or something like that). I think it is somewhat unlikely that Ruin had been inside the Well since the beginning of time, so I'm assuming here that the One Guy sealed Ruin in there by some weird means.

At least the question list was good:

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=6132.msg128921#msg128921>

Peter laughing at us for thinking Rashek was the epigraph writer:

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=6153.msg129156#msg129156>

You guys were so sure, with no good reason. Every time a new sample chapter got posted, you were like, "Oh, it's definitely Rashek," and I could only shake my head.

The Almighty's Shard

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/155-theory-the-almightys-shard/>

I'm putting this topic here since it may have some Mistborn spoilers, too, in order to bolster my argument.

We all wonder what Shard the Almighty has. Well, maybe it's really simple. Dalinar always gets signals of "Unite them", over and over. This is almost identical to Ruin's "Kill them" for Zane. Both Shards in those cases could only send general messages, as they were inhibited (though the Almighty being inhibited by death is a little more extreme than Ruin's imprisonment). So, since "Kill them" had a direct tie with Ruin's nature, "Unite them" probably relates to the Almighty's nature.

So, therefore, a few candidates:

Unity

Honor

In my mind when I read WoK, I was thinking that he was Unity. Now, I'm backpedaling and going with Honor. Honor and Odium (effectively meaning Hatred) has a nice duality to it. Cultivation doesn't fit with that, but... maybe she came to Roshar later?

Hot take: Odium is in the east

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/368-nearest-to-honor/>

So... Honor is in the west. I don't know what that really means (especially since any Shard could will him or herself wherever they want), but perhaps the important thing is that he is the furthest from the east and the Origin as possible. This suggests to me the highstorms are of Odium, and that Odium, perhaps, is located in the east.

Crazy Principle of Intent stuff:

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/369-theory-the-principle-of-intent/?page=1>

I began pondering what exactly would Honor--the Almighty's Shard--do. Knowing the answer to this would give an intuitive understanding to the mechanism of his magic. But Honor is hard to pin down. Ruin ruins... Honor honors stuff. That's, uh, super helpful.

But you know what's really honorable? Oaths. Promises. Bonds. Oathpact. Surgebinder. Peter said on TWG that a Surge is what people on Roshar call a force (I'd assume things like gravity). Surge, plus a bond with a spren? Surgebinders. Congratulations, you are now a magic user. Honor's power comes from oaths and bonds. Perhaps it creates a spiritual bond of sorts. That's what Honor does.

There was also the question of what happened to Kaladin at the end of Way of Kings. He spoke the Second Ideal of the Knights Radiant, then he burst with power. Seems to me that this near unequivocal evidence that Honor uses these oaths in a specific, magical way.

Then there's good old Szeth. How is he a Surgebinder if he doesn't have a spren? I'm not totally sure, but perhaps his strong oaths as a Truthless provides the sufficient bond for Honor's magic to work. Maybe there does exist a spren. Either way, those oaths are intricately tied with Szeth's Radiant powers. So, I'm calling it right now: if Szeth breaks his oaths, he will lose his powers.

My crazy Realmatic attributes (very long):

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/9502-realmatic-attributes-a-classification-of-magics/?page=1>

Mist fabrials!

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/4359-magical-technology-on-scadrial/?page=1>

Shards can't remember their names:

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/70-theory-shards-cant-remember-their-names/?page=1>

Thus, I think we can safely say that whoever wrote the letter (probably Hoid) and its recipient do not have Shards, as if they did, they would eventually forget their names by now. Their immortality is separate somehow.

I really liked going on about Adonalsium's Opposition

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/6419-regarding-adonalsiums-opposing-force-shadows-f-or-silence-planet-name/>

There's a weapon made by Adonalsium's Opposition, and Odium knows of it. Odium knows of the weapon:

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/52486-odium-and-adonalsiums-opposition-new-info/?page=1>

I am in utter shock the Lord Ruler ACTUALLY HAD KIDS

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/30543-the-lord-ruler-had-children/?page=1>

Totally being wrong about devotion and dominion:

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/3377-theory-devotion-dominion-and-convergence/?page=1>

Eric asking questions through Josh in 2011 about Shard names:

Josh

Is Aona's Shard name Devotion?

Brandon Sanderson

RAFO, but that's more of a "Email that question to me" because I would have to look at my computer to see which term I settled on, but you're basically there. I think it actually may be Devotion. So I'll have to look. It may be a synonym.

Josh

Is Skai Unity?

Brandon Sanderson

Um, RAFO.

Josh

Passion?

Brandon Sanderson

What? RAFO. I'm not going to tell you. You already kind of pulled out of me what Aona was.

[West Jordan signing \(Aug. 4, 2011\)](#)

Argent

- Been a fan since... May? 2009
- Didn't really get into the deep lore until 2011+
- Didn't really theorycraft until ~WoR

Shardblades are related to Odium

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=8067.msg175247#msg175247>

I always assumed there was some relationship between Odium and the Shardblades & Shardplates (possibly). I don't like the way people die if they are killed by a Shardblade - the burning in their eyes makes me think about Voidbringers, and Voidbringers make me think of Odium. I am not sure how this fits into that vision of Dalinar where he saw the Knights Radiant abandon their weapons and armor.

...

I remember reading this epigraph and thinking that maybe the Shardblades have a Voidbringer bound/imprisoned inside them.

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/851-the-effect-of-intent-on-the-aquisition-of-magic/#comment-14647>

I definitely think the Thrill is associated with Odium, at least a tiny bit. My flimsy logic here goes like this:

Syl doesn't like Shardplates & Blades. Syl is obviously connected to Honor / the Almighty. Therefore the Almighty wouldn't have liked the Shardgear as it is right now. This implies something that changed, perhaps something about the actual Shardgear; something that would introduce Odium's power to the formerly Honor-only artifacts. Where else have we seen a mix between the two Shards? In the Oathpact, I think. We have the Heralds, servants of Honor, who only get to enter to world in order to defend it from a Desolation. In their spare time they live in some sort of hell.

I've always thought that this Oathpact is not very good business. It sounds like the Honor made a deal with Odium, and part of the deal was the fate of the Heralds. It would be possible that another clause is the corruption of all the Blades and Plates, so that they induce an intense feeling of hatred (as seen through Dalinar's POV) in their wielder.

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/950-lighteyes-shardblades-and-the-oathpact/#comment-16317>

It is possible that the Shardblades are an imitation of the blades the Heralds (or the Radiants?) used. Plus, they always seemed a little Odium-ish to me, with the eyes of the victims burning when the Blade takes a life.

The Parshendi Are “Weakened” Voidbringers

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=8045.msg175361#msg175361>

Reading this makes me think... 'They changed, even as we fought them. Like shadows they were, that can transform as the flame dances.' Assuming this is really referring to the Voidbringers, and assuming the Voidbringers really are the Parshendi, we haven't seen a single indication that they can change forms, especially in a swift manner. Maybe they can grow their chitin-like armor at will, but it doesn't seem like that is a fast process.

Could this be an argument against the claim that the two are the same? Or maybe the Voidbringers aren't as human-like as Jasnah likes to think. Maybe the Parshendi are the Voidbringers, but somehow inhibited, weakened.

Shallan's Shardblade was her father's

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=8085.msg175534#msg175534>

What bothers me more is why Shallan killed her father. I believe the Blade was his before the assassination/murder, since some of Shallan's memories mention blood in the room - which would not have been present if she killed him with the Blade. So, the way I see it, she killed the good old Davar the old fashioned way, took his Blade, and then kept the Blade in secret from her brothers. The part that confuses me is that Shallan doesn't seem the type to do anything like that - kill her father for personal gain, and then hide such an essential thing from her brothers. She seems genuine. And not exactly happy the murder.

Surgebinding comes from the spren

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=7967.msg175789#msg175789>

@cromptj, I believe that the honorspren binding to Surgebinders are what gives them their abilities. It's a mutual relationship - the human gets Surgebinding, the spren gets... well, humanity. So Szeth's connection with his spren has been severed somehow, he'd lose his abilities.

Shadesmar's lights are spheres

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=8326.msg177480#msg177480>

I always assumed the glowing orbs represented Stormlight somehow. Jasnah did think Shallan stupid for attempting to enter Shadesmar with only one infused sphere somewhere in the last chapter, I think. And Shallan did attempt her first soulcasting with quite a few spheres, which she later noted had gone dun.

Gobletspren don't exist

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/758-some-new-theories-spoilers/#comment-14278>

Except the original spren wasn't a "gobletspren", it was probably a "metalspren" (though I don't think we've seen those). So it breaking down into a multitude of smaller metalsprens would make sense. I don't think sprens are associated with the object they "live" in as much as the material the metal is made of. I would imagine a "chairspren" and a "tablespren" are actually just woodsprens, with perhaps slight variations in their characteristics (much like those flamesprens the scientists, whose names I forgot, were different in sizes).

Argent and Chaos interact (re: Principle of Intent)

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/369-theory-the-principle-of-intent/?page=3#comment-14139>

Argent: Fantastic theory, Chaos! The core of it explains a lot of what is going on throughout the various Shardworlds we've encountered and it does it in the consistent manner we are used to seeing in Brandon's works. My only concern is that, maybe, you are taking it too far

...

Chaos: I do feel I took it too far. Valid criticism.

Creating thunderclasts

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/99-thunderclasts-vs-chasmfiends/#comment-16258>

My theory is that since thunderclasts were brought up from stone, possibly by Voidbringing, they need a giant gem (gemheart) as a focus. There seems to be a relationship between certain types of Surgebinding/Voidbringing and the way fabrials work, the two being natural and artificial manifestation of the magic on Roshar. You need gems to hold the Stormlight you use for Soulcasting (and possibly other forms of Surgebinding), so it could be possible that you would need a ton of Stormlight to create a beast as massive as a thunderclast. In addition to all that, we have those spren people can only see around freshly killed chasmfiend. They made me think of fabrials and the spren people trap in them to make them work. Maybe when a chasmfiend dies, the magical energy that kept it going, its spren, goes away. There is obvious some handwaving here, but it feels like puzzle pieces fitting together - we just don't have all the pieces.

Taravangian is spying on Adolin

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/955-the-kings-servants-contains-spoilers/#comment-16412>

Here I dismiss the idea that Taravangian has a spy keeping an eye on Adolin...

Syl is dumb because Honor is dead, and also Cryptics have multiple bodies

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/4382-spren-bonding/>

So I'll make the following claim. The reason Syl - and presumably the other four "male" Orders' bondingspren - shows so much less knowledge than Wyndle is because she is not in her "normal" state due to Honor's Splintering. I claim that all (bonding?) spren are supposed to be as knowing and functioning as Wyndle, but Odium effectively crippled half of them.

...

Shallan does see a single spren. However, due to the Cryptics' nature, this singular spren appears as if it had multiple bodies, sides, aspects. Interesting (to me), but not terribly well supported.

Truthwatchers transform physically

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/4323-seattle-signing-report-out-101413/#comment-67813>

Palah is also a curious one, though I can't even begin to fathom what you would do with Growth and Light. Lightweavers weave the light, the appearance, the form of something to transform it into something else (though I fail to see how that differentiates from them from the Elsecallers). So, Palah's order manipulates the light, the shape of... living things? Could physical transformation be possible under Surgebinding? Her essence is pulp, after all...

Ym belongs to Palah's Order

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/4304-el-cerrito-california/?page=2#comment-67931>

This is from before Words of Radiance when we only had a few interludes

Interesting what Ym's order's words might be... Windrunners take after Jezrien's protecting attribute. I don't think Shallan has found hers, and we don't know about Jasnah - thought it would make sense for them to deal with honesty/truthfulness and wisdom respectively. Some of you can't verify this, but Lift seems to be onto something related to the loving attribute of her order's patron, Vedeleddev. I say this so we can uniquely identify the shoemaker as a potential member of Order #5, Palah's order.*

Back to Ym though. He'll probably lean on the giving aspect of Palah. Learned would kind of also fit him, but if I had to choose one, I'd go with giving. So something like "I will give to those in need"?

Ishar is a sex worker

https://www.17thshard.com/forum/profile/488-argent/content/?type=forums_topic_post&page=233

Ishar

He is supposed to be pious and guiding. His body focus is flesh. I think we'll find him involved with the oldest business in the world - though I don't know on which side. Probably a customer. Indulgent, carefree, shameless, sinner - we are looking for a dirty old man here, folks.

The Unmade are the Parshendi gods

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/6914-the-parshendi-gods/>

Misc

Brandon is darker than Jordan

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=7198.msg158807#msg158807>

I might be influenced by Elantris and Mistborn, but I see Brandon as slightly darker author [than Robert Jordan]

Argent asks how to become an alpha reader XD

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=8054.msg175031#msg175031>

Argent earns the praise he deserves

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/4220-chicago-signing-1/#comment-66180>

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/4220-chicago-signing-1/#comment-68908>

Misc TWG:

Yea, we talked about it somewhere. One of the popular theories was that since we know that the mists are Preservation's body (kind of), and the stormlight is associated with the Almighty (who is also dead), we may have a running motif where some of the worlds' magical energies are there because some god/Shardholder has died.

Windrunner

Voidbringers on Sel

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/1745-the-war-against-odium/>

The largest piece of evidence we have from the war here is of course the Splintered remains of Devotion and Dominion. **Odium came here to kill them and ensure that they could not be taken up again. I also believe that he killed the original Elantrians, and possibly the Dakhor monks** as well. The whole former race that occupied Arelon, and Elantris were gone when the Arelish arrived, **I think Odium probably brought some Voidbringers with him and just slaughtered them all. That's probably also the reason that there aren't any myths of Voidbringers on Sel, because the people they fought were obliterated, so there wasn't anyone else left to tell tales.**

Hoid

We all know that Hoid was posing as a simple beggar in Arelon. The question is, why did Hoid show up? He's centuries too late to save Aona and Skai. However, I'm sure Hoid thinks the more Shards to oppose Odium, the easier job they will have, and I imagine Hoid probably also emphasizes with the Elantrians. We know that Devotion and Dominion are Splintered, the question is, how permanent is Splintering? I personally am of the opinion that it isn't permanent, because Shards are eternal, the problem is to somehow make them re-coalesce. It might even be happening on its own already, there are no new Seons, and fewer old ones, and apparently the Elantrians didn't make them. So hopefully somewhere Seons are converging and Devotion is starting to reform. So obviously Hoid wants new allies in his fight. I now know that anyone can take up a Shard. It might be easier for an Eantrian to do so but that's just speculative. Perhaps Hoid has had one of his precognitive visions and knows an Elantrian is destined to take up the power, maybe even Raoden. He could also simply be looking for allies, which makes a little less sense, because Galladon is obviously not Hoid's friend right now.

On Urithiru

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/1555-urithiru/#comment-26888>

On why Feruchemy loses power

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/1443-theory-why-feruchemy-loses-power/>

I attempted to fit Feruchemy into Ruin and Preservation and realized that could they power it half and half quite nicely. Preservation is what allows the power to be stored. Ruin on the other hand lets it be used, however not without a cost. Rather like Hemalurgic decay when an attribute is overdrawn it ends up with less power overall because it is, after all, **Ruin that is allowing the attribute to be "Ruined" or used up.** Am I making any sense or what? Feedback is always welcome.

Kelsier and people's belief in him

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/2388-spiritual-constructs/>

So Kelsier, who no longer has a physical aspect, should also no longer have a Cognitive aspect under that supposition, yes?

Well I could always go with the cop-out that Kelsier breaks everyone's rules, even Brandon's about trying to avoid bringing back characters from the dead 🤔 I think I've got a legitimate answer for this one. I think that it seems likely that the faith is behind this. It's what allowed Kelsier as Preservation to speak to Spook which is a power Preservation shouldn't have, and it's also what allowed Vin to power Elend's Allomancy. Faith allows for connections between people so I'd say it's possible that all the faith from Kelsier's followers is standing in for his Physical aspect. It's not much, not enough to actually give him anything of a Physical presence, but enough to retain his mind. He's also a Sliver, so who knows what effect that has on it. For all we know, Sazed could be even helping out here, wanting a helper on Scadrial, even if they don't always agree. (I don't really think this is what's happening but I'm just tossing out possibilities)

Intent and acquisition of magic

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/851-the-effect-of-intent-on-the-aquisition-of-magic/#comment-14623>

*Odium- Hateful acts allow you to get power, perhaps attracting Odiumspren
Cultivation-her intent makes me think that we will find that the users of her magic are the farmers in Shinovar, the place with the most "Cultivation", going on.*

Emotion & Investiture

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/1590-emotion-and-investiture/>

Can trees think?

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/2247-can-trees-think/>

Chaos and I were both stunned by that last bit. Anyone who knows Realmatics can tell you that it's virtually certain that everything exists in all three Realms. So naturally a tree would have a Cognitive aspect. Probably one stronger than your average rock anyway, since it takes spiritual energy to make life. (Ruin and Preservation on Scadrial) So Kwaan was poking around in Realmatics.

Or was he? There's the distinct possibility that this is all one crazy coincidence, fueled by exhaustion. I'm feeling pretty optimistic that this was intentional, but then I'm not exactly unbiased either. I've tweeted about it to Brandon, but he may not respond. So what is it, simple coincidence or a fun little easter egg?

A topic so controversial Josh closed it xD

Complementary Shards

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/1705-shard-complements-theory/>

I'm going to fall back to Ruin and Preservation again. Yes they were opposites, but when Sazed used them together he came to a realization. They are complements too. They were two halves of the same power, and they belonged together. **Now, if we accept this idea that complements, not opposites, are what's important in Shard pairs, then patterns become clear.** Devotion and Dominion are one for certain. The way I look at it, it is the central conflict between Shu-Korath and Shu-Dereth, unity by love, or unity by force. I also think Endowment and Cultivation are a pair. They seem like two sides of a coin to me, either giving something what it needs, or guiding it through growth so it can get what it needs on it's own.

Another, much more murky idea I've had has to do with intents. I wonder if perhaps Shards can somehow affect other Shards using their intent. That is why Odium didn't instantly destroy Honor, and instead abided by the rules of the Oathpact until the Heralds broke them. (I have another theory on this to be posted tomorrow) **Odium had not choice because, for lack of a better term, Honor was "using" his intent on Odium.** That is also possibly how Odium defeated both Devotion and Dominion. He "used" Odium on them, and got them to weaken each other by fighting. Then he swooped in for the kill.

Kind of a random one with a lot of charts about Spiritual Aspects

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/2388-spiritual-constructs/>

The one where I think Shallan has never lied and Dalinar is a Stoneward

<https://www.17thshard.com/forum/topic/1743-surgebinding-attributes/>

Shallan's defining attributes are creativity and honesty, regardless of what she was currently doing. They make who she is as a person. Her drawings are a part of her, and I do believe she thinks about having never told a lie before, in TWoK, but I could be wrong. It's not what she is currently doing, it's character based.

That's why Dalinar would fall into Resolute Builder. He may be destructive and confused for most of the events of the book, but those attributes define who he is. For most of his life, he's known exactly what he wanted to do, he was resolved, to rebuild Alethela. The same goes for Kaladin. No matter how much he gives up, his desire to protect and lead define who he is as a character. And that is why Syl doesn't leave, even through all those months of him sitting in the slave wagon. It's who he is and what he does. I hope this isn't out of place, I just wanted to correct what I see as being a misunderstanding that I've noticed in a couple places. If you feel that I've misunderstood something, please comment, I would love to debate it with you.

Comatose

Joined in 2007, deleted account, rejoined in 2008 pre HOA

Terrible spelling

Claim to Fame (Sarah G) - **Quote from: miyabi on July 16, 2008, 02:01:27 AM**
WTF is expedcially? OMG! I must have been TIRED when I typed that. Haha.

Spelled knights three different ways none of them correct

MAIN THREADS - Hemalurgy, Why is Vin so Powerful, Reen's Obsidian, Metal Lake, Hero Of Ages

Allomancer Hobo -

Don't worry, you're not even close to the worst speller/proofreader on these boards. [cough]
Comatose [/cough] :-)
<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5919.msg123133#msg123133>

First Post Back - Piercings of the Hero

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5697.msg119357#msg119357>

Chaos Responds - *Spectacular... That can have some very interesting ramifications. If Ruin can "edit" the Terris prophecies, he perhaps could manipulate them to state that the Hero needed piercings.*

Not sure piercings were hemalurgic though
<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5745.msg119523#msg119523>

Could the mists be gaseous metal? **[hot take that was correct]**

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5739.msg119524#msg119524> [eric rejects it (due to text but still fun) - <http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5739.45>

Reen's Obsidian - Loved this theory for some reason

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5930.0>

Metal Lake

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=6004.msg124883#msg124883> (only thread) - Peter -
"Someone in this thread is on to something, and it's not like eReen's obsidian) - Peter Trolling) -
I was really in to the metal lake

Final Theories Thread

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=6132.0>

Peter Brandon (Coma) 2007 - discussion of hoid

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5475.0>

Since when is hoid immortal

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=7644.msg167719#msg167719>

Tears of Edgli and Dor

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=7006.msg166014#msg166014>

Brandon

On withdrawing from fandom discussion

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5741.msg119414#msg119414>

Introduction

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=3.msg5344#msg5344>

Great Houses and Other Cameos

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=1622.0>

On RAFO

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=5661.msg118159#msg118159>

On his first book deal

<http://twg.17thshard.com/index.php?topic=4614.0>