

AI and Academic Writing Analysis Project

*adapted from Dr. Moises Santos, Santa Rosa Junior College

Overview

This 3-part project asks you to use AI chatbots to help us deepen our understanding of how writing works through both critical reflection and analysis.

Many of you are probably aware of the conversations in the media about AI, such as:

- AI will help us [think](#)
- AI affects work [productivity](#)
- chatbots like [Chat GPT are dangerous](#)
- students are using AI to write assignments and [plagiarize work from the internet](#).

Aspects of all these discussions are important to consider and we are going to embrace this opportunity by learning how to use AI responsibly and deepen our understanding of how language works. We will learn how to use AI as a tool to learn, think critically, and analyze language and writing.

We will be using [Chat GPT](#) and [Chatsonic](#) to compare and contrast the work you produce and the work the chatbots produce. I will provide the prompts, then you will input those into the AI platform(s) and analyze the responses they produce. Then we will use the responses that we get from these chatbots to learn how to critically analyze texts, and ultimately edit, expand, and revise the information that we are provided with.

Goals

Anything we get from an AI chatbot is informed by the same dynamics of power and cultural ideologies that we find in society. The information provided by AI is not necessarily wrong or right, and most likely it will produce a very generic response that lacks the variety and emotion that is part of the human voice. In fact, many proponents of AI chatbots argue that the technology is [meant to help spark ideas](#) for what we can write on a particular subject and we aim to “test” that theory by using **ChatGPT AND Chatsonic**.

Ultimately, the primary goal with this project is to analyze what is being provided, and make it better by thinking critically about the subject and editing the text. *In other words, we will provide the AI platform with a prompt, get a response, and use that response as a template for something we want to write so we can write it better!*

Format

- Part #1: AI generated essay and analysis
 - 250-500 word AI generated essay in a word document or gDoc with your reflection and analysis added using the track changes “comments” feature
- Part #2: Working with sources and doing research
 - Source verification and analysis
- Part #3: Revised essay
 - Revised 500-750 word essay using both the AI generated text and your own customization

Approach

Part #1: AI generated essay and analysis

Step 1: Choose a Prompt

Choose a prompt from the following list

1. Tell me what makes college writing good.
2. Tell me what literacy is.
3. Tell me how writing connects to identity.
4. Tell me the history of grades in universities.
5. Tell me the history of teaching college writing.
6. Tell me what information literacy is.

Step 2: Enter the Prompt into Chat GPT (openAI) and Chatsonic (writesonic)

It doesn't matter which chatbot you use first, but please do enter prompts into BOTH platforms. Both of these AI chatbots will require you to create an account but you can use a gmail account to sign in as well.

- Chat GPT can be found here: <https://openai.com/blog/chatgpt>
- Chatsonic is run by the site "Writesonic" (just make sure you are using Chatsonic and not one of the other functions on Writesonic): <https://writesonic.com/chat>

For all of these prompts you should get about a response of a paragraph or two from each chatbot. Chatsonic will also provide some citations, or references to information it found on the internet. Make sure that the "Include latest google data" button is turned on.

After you have entered the prompts, check that the chatsonic response has references to it, if not try clicking the "Regenerate Response" button to have it produce a new response until you get one with references.

Step 3: Copy and Paste the Responses and Analyze Them

After you have gathered responses from both Chat GPT and Chatsonic;

- copy and paste them onto a Google Doc or Word Document. Make sure you identify which response is from each chatbot.
 - NOTE: When copying the Chatsonic response, **do not use the copy function on the site**, highlight the text and references and copy and paste them yourselves.

Then you will begin to analyze the text. Write a few sentences comparing the responses from both chatbots. Use the following questions as guidelines:

1. How are they similar or different? How long is each response?
2. Are they using similar language? tone? and/or arguments?
3. Do they take the same approach to answering the prompt?

Next, using the comments function on Google Docs or Microsoft Word, make notes on the text about things you find interesting, want to learn and write more about, or have questions about. Use the following as guidelines for your comments:

1. Highlight text and note why you highlighted it.
2. Ask questions using the "comment" tool.
3. Mark parts of the narrative that are too vague or broad, or on the other hand, too specific or misleading.
4. Note parts of the narrative that you may want to fact check
5. Mark parts of the text that you are interested in editing, rewriting, or expanding on. **(At this point you are just marking these parts in the text, later you will do a bit of your own research to be able to add to the text)**

Sample/Template

You will submit the work from Steps 1-3 for **Assignment #1**.

Here is an example of what **Assignment #1** should look like:

Prompt: Tell me the history of Native Americans in the United States.

ChatGPT

The history of Native Americans in the United States spans thousands of years, beginning long before the arrival of Europeans. The diverse indigenous cultures have deep roots and a complex history of interactions with both their environment and each other. Here's a condensed overview of their history:

- Pre-Columbian Era:** The Americas were inhabited by numerous Native American tribes and civilizations. These societies thrived across the continent, developing unique languages, cultural practices, and sophisticated agricultural, architectural, and artistic traditions. Prominent civilizations include the Aztecs, Mayans, Incas, and the mound-building cultures of North America.
- European Arrival:** In 1492, Christopher Columbus arrived in the Caribbean, marking the beginning of European exploration and colonization in the Americas. Subsequent European powers, including the Spanish, French, Dutch, and English, established colonies and sought to exploit the continent's resources. This led to conflicts and interactions between Native Americans and European settlers.
- Colonial Period:** Throughout the 17th and 18th centuries, European colonies expanded, displacing and often forcibly removing Native American populations from their ancestral lands. The Native Americans encountered diseases brought by the Europeans, resulting in devastating epidemics that decimated their populations. Many tribes were also engaged in trade and diplomatic relationships with European settlers.
- American Revolution:** During the American Revolution (1775-1783), Native American tribes were caught in the crossfire. Some tribes sided with the British, hoping to prevent further encroachment on their lands. However, the newly formed United States government sought to expand its territory westward, leading to conflicts with Native American tribes.
- Indian Removal Act and Trail of Tears:** In the 19th century, the U.S. government implemented policies to remove Native Americans from their ancestral lands to make way for white settlement. The Indian Removal Act of 1830 authorized the forced relocation of tribes from the southeastern United States to lands west of the Mississippi River. The most infamous episode was the Trail of Tears, when thousands of Cherokee and other tribes were forcibly marched to Indian Territory (present-day Oklahoma), resulting in significant loss of life.
- Reservations and Assimilation:** By the late 19th century, many surviving Native American tribes were confined to reservations—specific tracts of land set aside for their use. The federal government pursued policies aimed at assimilating Native Americans into mainstream American culture, including boarding schools that sought to eradicate indigenous languages and traditions.
- Civil Rights Movement and Activism:** In the 20th century, Native American activism and advocacy increased, inspired in part by the broader Civil Rights Movement. Native American organizations, such as the National Congress of American Indians and the American Indian Movement, fought for greater recognition of their rights, tribal sovereignty, and improved living conditions.
- Contemporary Issues:** Today, Native Americans continue to face challenges such as poverty, health disparities, and the preservation of their cultural heritage. There has been a growing movement to reclaim and revitalize indigenous languages, traditions, and self-governance. Legal battles over land rights, natural resource exploitation, and environmental protection remain ongoing.

It's important to note that this summary provides a general overview, and the experiences of Native American tribes vary greatly across time and region. There are over 500 recognized tribes in the United States, each with its own distinct history, cultural practices, and contemporary circumstances.

Chatsonic

The history of Native Americans in the United States dates back tens of thousands of years ago with the settlement of the Americas [1]. When European settlers began to arrive in the fifteenth century, the continent was already richly populated with Native American communities [2]. However, the expansion of settler territory and the growth of the United States resulted in Native American communities being moved, renamed, combined, dispersed, and destroyed across several centuries. This was mainly due to US government policies that relegated the independence and well-being of Native Americans to secondary status [2]. Native Americans responded to colonization in various stages, from cooperation to revolt [3]. The French and Indian War led to the forced removal of Native Americans from their homes, leading to a significant reduction in their populations by the end of the 19th century [3].

References: [1] [History of Native Americans in the United States](#) [2] [Native American Immigration and Relocation in U.S. History](#) [3] [Native American History Timeline](#)

Analysis

The two responses are very similar in how they describe the history of Native Americans in the U.S. in that they give a very brief and generalized overview of pre-colonial and colonial Native American and settler events. The main difference is that ChatGPT is much longer and gives a breakdown of different time frames and certain historical events including a modern synopsis of lasting issues facing Native American people in society. Chatsonic doesn't mention specific events or give a breakdown by era but more or less has the same content. The tone and language being used is very similar from each response which takes on a matter of fact, or regurgitation of information of events sort of tone. Both accurately describe the destructive impact that Native American people and society was dealt due to colonial expansion and oppression but do not analyze the effects any deeper. I think that both programs take the same approach to the prompt, but I would commend ChatGPT compared to Chatsonic since it is at least somewhat reflective of the social dynamics and outcomes that can be seen

Commented [PT1]: I would like to know more about the complexity of these cultures. Why were European settlers so keen on eradicating them?

Commented [PT2]: The America's had been explored before this by European cultures. Is there any documentation of interactions among them and Native American society?

Commented [PT3]: From a personal anecdote, when COVID was in full swing, many of the Native American families in the community I worked in were not very trusting of whites and were sceptical of us. They viewed COVID as a white peoples disease and I can now see why they had reason to be scepticle.

Commented [PT4]: It would be interesting to explore tensions that arose between Native American society at this time.

Commented [PT5]: Policy and action of the government left a devastating effect on trust and relations that persists to this day. These sections (#5 and #6) barely scratch the surface on policy and eradication of people and culture. These topics deserve much more analysis and attention with regards to the historical and lasting impact.

Commented [PT6]: And how are they being treated now.... Not very well for the most part.

Commented [PT7]: EDIT, REWRITE, EXPAND on reservation and assimilation as well as policy. Specifically the lasting impact it has had.

Commented [PT8]: At least ChatGPT is mentioning some positive action. It would be great to further study activism with regards to Native Americans.

Commented [PT9B9]: It seems like advocacy and activism need to increase even more.

Commented [PT10]: This is good. Although, I know that Native communities still struggle immensely with all these issues.

Commented [PT11]: What are the successes? How are history and contemporary issues being taught and how exactly are these issues being addressed

Commented [PT12]: EDIT, REWRITE, EXPAND on Contemporary issues. Perhaps find a specific case to study/learn more about, or focus on how people are now being educated on these issues (particularly in public school)

Commented [PT13]: Yes, this is all very generic information that has so much depth to it that isn't explored. The lasting impacts of policy, war, tensions, land allotment, assimilation, loss of culture, disease, etc., deserve more analysis. Were all Native American people affected in the same way? Is it possible to make right and/or repair relations?

Commented [PT14]: What were these cultures like? How did the govern themselves? How were relationships between different tribes?

Commented [PT15]: How was any cooperation rewarded? Once cooperation was given, were there then follow up events/policies that negatively impacted them?

Commented [PT16]: I feel like this whole explanation is a generic summary of how Native American history was taught to me in public school growing up. This left me now understanding, until much later in life, how bad things actually were.

Note: If you are submitting a google doc, please make sure that you have allowed me to have “editor” access to the doc, otherwise I will not be able to see your comments on the margins.

Part #2: Working with sources and doing research

Step 1: Check the Citations/References that Chatsonic Provided

Remember, Chatsonic will provide references from the internet that it used to create the response.

In this step, you will be **critically analyzing** the references it used and how well it used them. Click on each of the hyperlinks that Chatsonic provided and use the following questions as guidelines to analyze **each one** of the sources.

1. Are these citations related to the topic?
2. How close is the information from the source to that of the text provided by Chatsonic? Is it the same? (that would be plagiarizing lol). Is it not even close? (that would also be bad).
3. Are these scholarly sources? (not sure what that means...check this out [What is a Scholarly article?](#))
4. Does Chatsonic use all of the sources equally? Sometimes you will find that Chatsonic will provide 3 references, but only cite 1 of them. So why provide the other two? Do those other two also have the same relevance to the subject?

You will submit the work for **Assignment #2**

Here is an example of what **Assignment #2** should look like:

References:

- [1] Race vs. Ethnicity: What's the Difference?
- [2] Ethnicity
- [3] Ethnicity | social differentiation

Reference 1

The sentence in which Chatsonic references reference 1 is practically word for word what is written in reference 1. Chatsonic tweaked a few words so it is not a direct copy like reference 3 but it is pretty darn close. In my opinion, the reference 1 citation was relevant to the topic. Reference 1 mainly focuses on race instead of ethnicity so I personally wouldn't have chosen this article. Reference 1 claims that this article was medically reviewed.

Reference 2

Reference 2 was only used once in the Chatsonic response however it was used accurately. Reference 2 is the reference which I believe relates to the topic the most out of all the references. Chatsonic appears to have paraphrased information from reference 2 in its response. Reference 2 is a wikipedia page making it an illegitimate source. Reference 2 was barely used in Chatsonic's response.

Reference 3

The first sentence of the Chatsonic response was legit word for word copied from reference 3. Reference 3 briefly talks about ethnicity however the main focus of this article is anthropology. This article claims to have been peer reviewed by multiple people multiple times since publication. This article is the main article quoted in the Chatsonic response. I do not believe that this reference should have been quoted as much as it was.

Step 2: Do Your Own Research

Now that you have analyzed the references that Chatsonic used, it's time for you all to find your own sources that will allow you to eventually edit and revise the response from both Chatsonic and Chat GPT.

Look up some sources for the topic/prompt you chose through the USF library website <https://library.usfca.edu/home>.

Type in a keyword and hit search. Then, on the left hand side click the "peer-reviewed articles" filter so that you can filter your searches to readings that will be much more manageable.

Choose 1-2 sources for you to read. Provide the citation for the sources you choose. The library website generates citations for you. When you click on an article, you will see a button that says "citation" then you can copy and paste that text onto your document.

Part #3: Revised “final” essay and analysis

Finally, edit, revise, and expand your essay using the new sources you found through the library website to revise the text of one of the responses from Chat GPT or Chatsonic. Because of the additional research and knowledge you have gained through this process, you are expected to expand your essay by approximately **250 words**. The content you provide should include what you learned from the new sources you found on the library website.

You will submit the your completed edited, revised, and expanded essay for **Assignment #3**

Here is an example of what **Assignment #3** should look like:

Project 1 Steps 5-6 - What is Racism?

Citation

DiAngelo, Robin. "WHAT IS RACISM?" Counterpoints (New York, N.Y.), vol. 497, 2016, pp. 107–24.

Chatsonic (Original response)

Racism is a social construct that involves creating unequal opportunities and outcomes for people based on their race through individual or institutional prejudice. It includes all laws, policies, ideologies, and barriers that prevent equity and justice for people based on their racial identity, and can manifest as various forms of harassment, abuse, or violence [1]. While racism has been a central feature of Australian society since European colonization and continues to shape society today, it can change over time and affect different communities in different ways [1]. However, it is important to note that race has no biological meaning, and scholars have called for an end to the use of racial categories in medical research, as it is a poorly defined marker of diversity [2]. The idea of "race as a social construct" means that race is used to create racial differences and inequality, which is seen in places like Cleveland where racism has caused much of the inequalities [3].

Expanded Chatsonic Response

Racism is a social construct and a form of oppression in which one racial group dominates others. Racism encompasses economic, political, social, and institutional actions and beliefs, which systemize and perpetuate an unequal distribution of privileges, resources, and power. It includes all laws, policies, ideologies, and barriers that prevent equity and justice for people based on their racial identity. The critical element that separates racism from individual racial prejudice and racial discrimination is the historical buildup and ongoing use of institutional power and authority to support the prejudice and to enforce discriminatory behaviors in systemic ways.

In the United States, whites are the dominant group and people of color are the minoritized group. In this context, racism is white racial and cultural prejudice and discrimination, supported intentionally or unintentionally by institutional power and authority, used to the advantage of whites and the disadvantage of people of color. Racism is deeply embedded into the fabric of our society and is not limited to a single act or person. People of color may hold prejudices and discriminate against whites, but do not have the social and institutional power backing their prejudice and discrimination that transforms it into racism making the impact of their prejudice temporary and contextual. People of color may also hold prejudices and discriminate against their own and other groups of color, but this prejudice and discrimination ultimately serves to hold them down and, in this way, reinforce the system of racism that benefits whites. Oppression is a society-wide dynamic that occurs at the group level. This means that in the United States only whites have the collective social and institutional power and privilege over

people of color. Racial disparity between whites and people of color continues to exist today in every institution across society. Segregation may make racial disparities hard for whites to see, so they are often denied. Yet racial disparities and their impact on quality of life can be found in the US today in health care, criminal justice, education, and wealth distribution.

Racism is not exclusive to the United States and can be found in different societies throughout the world. [1]. While racism has been a central feature of Australian society since European colonization and continues to shape society today, it can change over time and affect different communities in different ways [1]. However, it is important to note that race has no biological meaning, and scholars have called for an end to the use of racial categories in medical research, as it is a poorly defined marker of diversity [2]. The idea of "race as a social construct" means that race is used to create racial differences and inequality, which is seen in places like Cleveland where racism has caused much of the inequalities [3].

Notes

This 3-part project is likely to feel “messy” and a bit confusing at times. That’s ok! It’s part of the process. We will take the appropriate time for each phase and they will be broken down and discussed in class. If you have any questions along the way or see challenges that need to be addressed PLEASE share! The process is meant to be intellectually challenging and engaging,

and not painful. So, share the struggle so we can work together to make the process productive and useful.