Unit Six: Debate and the Scrutiny of Argument

Cutting Cards

Definitions

Card—a piece of evidence

Cutting Cards – formatting a piece of evidence in the conventional way established by debaters of the NSDA

Tag—a brief phrase or sentence at the beginning of the card that briefly summarizes the card and may also hint at the way the card may be used in a case

Format

Tag

Source, Year [Full MLA Citation, often with credentials in case asked about in round] At least one full paragraph from the source with the words to be read in the case underlined. Special attention should be given to not distorting the meaning of the source when selecting the portion to underline and quote in the case. Opponents may ask to see and examine cards for faithful and ethical representation of source material, and rounds can be lost over distortions and misrepresentation of evidence.

Samples

To support a negative position on the resolution that the United States has a moral obligation to promote democratic ideals in other nations.

The results shocked U.S. officials.

BBC News, 2005. ["Hezbollah Ticket Sweeps S Lebanon." *BBC News*. BBC, 06 June 2005. Web. 25 Mar. 2015.]

The election results stunned U.S. and Israeli officials, who have repeatedly stated that they would not work with a Palestinian Authority that included Hamas, which both countries and the European Union have designated as a terrorist organization. In Washington, Secretary of State Condoleezza Rice said that a party could not "have one foot in politics and the other in terror. Our position on Hamas has therefore not changed."

Democratic elections backfired in Palestine in 2006.

Washington Post, 2006. [Wilson, Scott. "Hamas Sweeps Palestinian Elections, Complicating Peace Efforts in Mideast." *Washington Post*. The Washington Post, 27 Jan. 2006. Web. 25 Mar. 2015.]

RAMALLAH, West Bank, Jan. 26 -- <u>The radical Islamic movement Hamas won a large majority in the new Palestinian parliament, according to official election results announced Thursday</u>, trouncing the governing Fatah party in a contest that could dramatically reshape the Palestinians' relations with Israel and the rest of the world. In Wednesday's voting, Hamas claimed 76 of the 132 parliamentary seats, giving the party

at war with Israel the right to form the next cabinet under the Palestinian Authority's president, Mahmoud Abbas, the leader of Fatah. Fatah, which has dominated the legislature since the previous elections a decade ago and the Palestinian cause for far longer, won 43 seats. A collection of nationalist, leftist and independent parties claimed the rest.

Democratic elections backfired in Germany in the early 20th century.

USHMM ["Hitler Comes to Power." *United States Holocaust Memorial Museum*. United States Holocaust Memorial Council, n.d. Web. 11 Feb. 2015.]

The party's rise to power was rapid. Before the economic depression struck, the Nazis were practically unknown, winning only 3 percent of the vote to the Reichstag (German parliament) in elections in 1924. In the 1932 elections, the Nazis won 33 percent of the votes, more than any other party. In January 1933 Hitler was appointed chancellor, the head of the German government, and many Germans believed that they had found a savior for their nation.

A Sample Contention from a Case Utilizing these Cards

Contention 1. The democratic ideal of fair and open elections that represent the will of the people can be problematic in certain nations, paradoxically resulting in fewer human rights and ultimately threatening the interests of the United States. For example, in 2005, according to *BBC News*, Hezbollah, considered a terrorist organization by Israel and the United States, won all the parliamentary seats in South Lebanon. Similarly, *The Washington Post* reported in 2006 that when Hamas, a militant organization in Palestine won its free elections, the Bush Administration, which had supported the elections, was caught off-guard, as it expected the less extreme Fatah party to win. The most stunning example, however, comes not from the Middle East, but from Europe, as it must be remembered that the National Socialist Party, led by Adolph Hitler, was brought to power through a democratic process of fair and open elections in the Weimar Republic, Germany's first attempt at democracy.