

Appendix B: Organizations with Entities Missing Baseline Expectations

InCommon Baseline Expectations 2 Dispute Resolution
Closing Action Plan

November 7, 2022

(This Appendix is being updated as organizations meet BE2 requirements. Its numbers may differ from the main report.)

Contents

[Appendix B: Organizations with Entities Missing Baseline Expectations](#)

[BE2 Dispute Resolution Action Plan](#)

[Group 1 - Unused/deprecated Entities](#)

[Group 2a - Service Providers missing encryption requirements](#)

[Group 2b - Entities missing SIRTFI requirements only](#)

[Group 3 - Organizations working on updates and remediations](#)

[Identity Providers and Service Providers that meet priority BE2 requirements, but are missing encryption score or scored "B" in the most recent scan](#)

BE2 Dispute Resolution Action Plan

Group 1 - Unused/deprecated Entities

Entities in this group are confirmed by their registering organization to be either no longer in use, or are in the process of being un-registered from InCommon.

Group 1 includes 31 entities from 8 Participants.

Recommendation

- Send one final reminder in mid November with a metadata **unpublish date of December 12, 2022.**
- **Unpublish entities from InCommon metadata on announced unpublish date**

- InCommon Service Desk to monitor; reverse action as needed.

Organization	Notes
Dropbox	1 Service Provider Dropbox intends to withdraw from InCommon
ingenta	1 Service Provider Ingenta had indicated that they no longer use the SP and would like us to remove the SP from metadata.
Otis College of Art and Design	1 Identity Provider Otis has 2 IdPs in InCommon. Otis is in the middle of migrating to a new IdP. It intends to retire the older, non-adhering IdP in December.
Middlebury College	1 Identity Provider Middlebury has indicated that it only uses the Cert service. It does not use its IdP for Federated access.
Regis University	1 Identity Provider Regis had indicated they were no longer using the IdP in InCommon.
San Jose State University	1 Service Provider SJSU has migrated the SP (an internal financial application) to connect directly via Okta. It no longer needs to be in InCommon
Washington University in St. Louis	1 Service Provider WUSTL had indicated they intend to remove https://connect.wustl.edu/shibboleth-sp from InCommon and run the metadata locally back in February.
Workplace Answers, LLC	24 Service Providers

	Workplace Answers had merged with Everfi. Everfi confirmed that they no longer need the SPs registered under Workplace Answers
--	--

Group 2a - Service Providers missing encryption requirements

Entities in this group are service providers that are missing the encryption requirement from BE2. Organizations responsible for these entities have not responded to our notices.

This grouping is a change from the original report. It reflects the discussions of the Steering review on November 7, 2022.

Group 2a consists of 2 entities from 2 Participants.

Recommendation

- Send one final reminder in mid November with a metadata **unpublish date of December 12, 2022.**
- **Unpublish entities from InCommon metadata on announced unpublish date**
- InCommon Service Desk to monitor; reverse action as needed.

Organization	Notes
Facilities Survey, Inc.	1 Service Provider One SP (https://dev.cvbcommons.org) long-standing score of "F"; as of November 7, ssllabs.com confirms "F". https://www.ssllabs.com/ssltest/analyze.html?d=sso.facsur.com&hideResults=on Email to Exec contact bounced. They have not responded to our outreach
Study Edge	1 Service Provider As of Oct 25, ssllabs.com shows C: https://www.ssllabs.com/ssltest/analyze.html?d=tutormatchingservice.com&hideResults=on

Group 2b - Entities missing SIRTFI requirements only

Entities in this group are identity providers and service providers that are only missing the explicit statement in their metadata asserting compliance with the SIRTFI. They otherwise conform to BE2.

This grouping is a change from the original report. It reflects the discussions of the Steering review on November 7, 2022.

This new Group 2b consists of 92 SPs and 3 IdPs from 14 Participants.

Recommendation

- To minimize service interruption, **we recommend not removing these entities' metadata from the InCommon aggregate at this time.** These organizations are nevertheless required to conform to SIRTFI as part of Baseline Expectations incorporated into terms of service, and are subject to the dispute resolution process in case of actual performance inconsistent with SIRTFI.
- These entities remain out of compliance with BE2 as originally formulated. InCommon will continue to reach out via alternate means to get organizations to update the SPs' metadata.
- NOTE: Any attempts to publish changes to these metadata will require acknowledgement of SIRTFI conformance, *i.e.*, the metadata in this state is "frozen" unless it is removed or the organization updates to acknowledge SIRTFI conformance.

Organization	Notes
BoardEffect LLC	19 Servicer Providers; Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement Internet2 is a customer. We are attempting to reach BoardEffect from their sales side. BoardEffect registers separate SPs for each customer. Unpublishing the metadata will affect customer access.
Calero Software	1 SP: https://limestone.calero.com/shibboleth Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement

	Calero has not responded to any outreach attempts. Email to Exec is bouncing
Demco Software	44 Servicer Providers Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement Demco has not responded to our outreach; Email to Exec is bouncing.
DocuSign, Inc	1 Service Provider: https://docusign.com/sp Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement Docusign has responded and is in the middle of updating its SP metadata.
Double Map Inc.	1 Identity Provider; 4 Service Providers Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement IdP missing error URL (IdP is likely a test IdP) Doublemap has not responded to our outreach.
HandsOn Connect Cloud Solutions	2 Service Providers Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement <i>Update: HandsOn is withdrawing from InCommon</i> No response from HandsOn Connect.
Kaltura Inc.	10 Service Providers <i>Update: Kaltura is withdrawing from InCommon</i> No response from Kaltura.
Malone University	2 Service Providers - Malone University Research Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement Malone has not responded to our outreach

Media Highway (PyraMED Health Systems)	4 Service Providers Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement No response from Media Highway
Microsoft	3 Service Providers (Microsoft Academic Verification Engine) Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement No response from Microsoft
Millersville University of Pennsylvania	1 Service Provider SP- PASSHE Millersville - Desire2Learn Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement Millersville is a Cirrus Bridge Customer; Cirrus reached out in August -- ticket created in Cirrus Support system; no updates from Millersville since
The Beans Group Ltd.	1 Service Provider Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement TBG had responded in February, but no recent response
Malone University	IdP missing SIRTFI acknowledgement; Malone has not responded to our outreach
Franklin & Marshall College	IdP missing SIRTFI acknowledgement F&M had indicated in early 2022 that they'd move to a new IdP and was engaging Moran Technologies. No response since that point. 10/19 - Moran will contact them.

Group 3 - Organizations working on updates and remediations

Entities (identity providers and service providers) are either being updated, or they are identity providers belonging to organizations we are attempting to re-establish contacts.

This grouping is a change from the original report. It reflects the discussions of the Steering review on November 7, 2022.

Recommendation

- **We are not recommending these entities' removal at this time.**
- **These entities remain out of conformance to BE2 requirements.** InCommon will continue to work with organizations in this group to update their registrations to meet BE2 requirements.
- NOTE: Any attempts to publish changes to these metadata will require them to meet BE2 requirements, i.e., the metadata in this state is "frozen" unless it is removed or the organization completes the required updates.

Organization	Notes
Catapult Sports	1 SP: https://sp1.catapultsports.com/Shibboleth Missing SIRTFI acknowledgement Catapult Sports has indicated they wish to withdraw from InCommon; recommend leaving metadata in place until termination is processed.
Chaminade University of Honolulu	IdP missing error URL and SIRTFI acknowledgement Chaminade had replied in Spring and indicated they would update. Kevin M reached out to Chaminade in October. Chaminade's executive contact responded initially, but has not replied to follow up emails.
Millersville University of Pennsylvania	IdP missing error URL and SIRTFI acknowledgement; Millersville is a Cirrus Bridge Customer; Cirrus reached out in August -- ticket created in Cirrus Support system; Kevin M. reached out to Millersville.

	Millersville has responded. Scheduling follow up meetings.
Ramapo College of New Jersey	IdP missing SIRTFI acknowledgement; Ramapo is updating its metadata and had indicated it'd complete the update by November 7, 2022
University of Massachusetts Medical School Worcester	IdP missing error URL and SIRTFI acknowledgement Latest: reaching out via Chris Misra
University of California - Office of the President	3 Service Providers https://spsandbox.ucop.edu/SSO . https://spstsdev.ucop.edu/SSO . and https://spsts.ucop.edu/SSO had score of C. As of Oct 25, sslabs.com show C UCOP is developing remediation plan to secure the 3 SPs
Washington State University	IdP missing error URL and SIRTFI acknowledgement Reached out via Brad Crist; WSU responded initially, but did not reply to multiple meeting scheduling requests. Reaching out through Internet 2 Member contacts
Wellesley College	IdP missing error URL and SIRTFI acknowledgement Working with Wellesley to address technical questions (Wellesley is transitioning, or has transitioned to a Duo cloud IdP solution)

Identity Providers and Service Providers that meet priority BE2 requirements, but are missing encryption score or scored “B” in the most recent scan

Organizations on this list meet all priority BE requirements except some either are missing encryption score (unable to scan) or have an encryption score of “B” in the latest scan.

CTAB does not recommend removing these entities at this time. Instead, CTAB and InCommon Operations will continue to work with these organizations to raise/report TLS scores. InCommon Operations will also be implementing trend monitoring to track entity adherence over time in order to better inform final dispute resolution actions.

Organizations with 1 or more entities with encryption score of “B”:

- Academic Analytics
- Ad Astra Information Systems
- Antelope Valley Community College District
- AppointLink Portal Solutions, Inc.
- AthenaOnline.com
- Biomedical Research Alliance of New York (BRANY) d/b/a Protocol Builder
- Bowling Green State University
- Calero Software
- California Community Colleges Chancellors Office
- California State University, Office of the Chancellor
- CampusOptics, Inc.
- Carilion Clinic
- Case Western Reserve University
- Cayuse, Inc.
- Clemson University
- Cohen Veterans Bioscience, Inc.
- College of Eastern Idaho
- Columbia College
- Comevo Inc.
- Cornell University
- DaVinci Education Inc.
- Demco Software
- Drew University
- Eastern Washington University
- Elon University
- Emerson College
- Emory University
- Ex Libris North America
- Fairfield University
- Fitch Solutions, Inc.
- Florida Atlantic University
- Florida Gulf Coast University
- Full Sail University
- Georgetown University
- Gettysburg College
- Gustavus Adolphus College
- Hampshire College
- Harvard College
- Hazelden Betty Ford Foundation
- HighWire Press
- Hirezon d/b/a Interview Exchange

- IMLeagues, LLC
- Imodules Software, Inc.
- InfoReady Corp
- InnoSoft Canada Inc.
- Inova Health System
- Interfolio, Inc.
- Internet2
- InTime Solutions Inc.
- Johns Hopkins University
- Kualii, Inc.
- Lamar Institute of Technology
- Lamar University
- Lewis - Clark State College
- Malone University
- Marin Community College District
- Maryland Institute College of Art
- Mayo Clinic
- Medical College of Wisconsin
- Miami University
- Middlebury College
- Mississippi State University
- Naval Postgraduate School
- New Mexico State University - Main Campus
- NG Web Solutions
- North Idaho College
- Northern Arizona University
- Northwestern University
- Novelution Corporation
- NuPark LLC
- Ohlone Community College District
- Omnibond Systems, LLC
- Omnilert, LLC
- Open Commons Consortium (OCC)
- Otis College of Art and Design
- Owens Community College
- PeopleAdmin, Inc.
- PhotoShelter, Inc.
- Questica, Inc.
- Quinnipiac University
- Ramapo College of New Jersey
- Rave Wireless, Inc.
- Reclaim Hosting, LLC
- Research Foundation for the State University of New York (The)
- Rice University
- RSmart
- San Jose - Evergreen Community College District
- San Luis Obispo County Community College District
- Santa Monica Community College District

- SCLogic
- Sequoias Community College District
- Shiftboard Inc.
- St. Catherine University
- StarRez, Inc.
- Stony Brook University
- SUNY Polytechnic Institute
- Swarthmore College
- TALX Corporation
- Tarleton State University
- Terra Dotta, LLC
- Texas Tech University Health Sciences Center
- The Ohio State University
- The Pennsylvania State University
- The University of Arizona
- The University of Memphis
- Thomas Jefferson National Accelerator Facility
- Thomas Jefferson University
- Transact Campus Inc.
- Trondent Development Corporation
- Truman State University
- Turning Technologies
- Turnitin
- University of California - Office of the President
- University of California-Los Angeles
- University of California, Davis
- University of California, San Francisco
- University of California, Santa Barbara
- University of Chicago
- University of Florida
- University of Georgia
- University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
- University of Maryland Baltimore County
- University of Michigan
- University of Missouri System
- University of Nebraska-Lincoln
- University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
- University of North Carolina at Greensboro
- University of North Georgia
- University of Oklahoma
- University of Pennsylvania
- University of Southern California
- University of Southern Mississippi
- University of Tennessee
- University of Utah
- University of Washington
- University of Wisconsin - La Crosse
- University of Wisconsin - Stout

- University of Wisconsin-Madison
- University of Wisconsin-Parkside
- Vanderbilt University
- Vassar College
- Ventura County Community College District
- Villanova University
- Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University
- Wake Forest University
- Washington Research Library Consortium
- Washington University in St. Louis
- Wayne State College
- Weber State University
- Webster University
- WEPA, Inc.
- West Chester University of Pennsylvania
- Wichita State University
- Willamette University
- Yale University
- Yavapai College

Organizations with 1 or more un-scannable entities

- Aastra USA Inc
- AEFIS, LLC
- Agilent Technologies, Inc.
- AliveTek, Inc.
- American University
- Amherst College
- AppointLink Portal Solutions, Inc.
- ARMS Software, LLC
- AssetWorks
- Atlas Systems, Inc.
- Auburn University
- Axle Informatics, LLC
- Azusa Pacific University
- BadgePass Inc.
- Bates College
- Baylor College of Medicine
- Baylor University
- Ben Fry, LLC
- BiblioLabs
- BioRAFT
- Blackboard, Inc
- Boston College
- Brookhaven National Laboratory
- Brown University
- Bryn Mawr College
- California Institute of Technology

- California Maritime Academy
- California State University, Bakersfield
- California State University, Channel Islands
- California State University, Chico
- California State University, Dominguez Hills
- California State University, Fresno
- California State University, Long Beach
- California State University, Los Angeles
- California State University, Monterey Bay
- California State University, Northridge
- California State University, Office of the Chancellor
- California State University, Sacramento
- California State University, San Marcos
- California State University, Stanislaus
- California University of Pennsylvania
- CampusGuard LLC
- Carnegie Mellon University
- Catapult Sports,
- Cayuse, Inc.
- CD Advantage, Inc. D/B/A Advantage Design Group
- Cedar Crest College
- Cedarville University
- Cengage Learning
- Center for Research Libraries
- Central Washington University
- Children's Hospital of Philadelphia
- Cincinnati Children's Hospital Medical Center
- Clarion University
- Clemson University
- Coast Community College District
- Coconino County Community College District
- Cohen Veterans Bioscience, Inc.
- CollegeNET, Inc.
- Colorado School of Mines
- Colorado State University
- Columbia University
- Community College of Baltimore County
- Connecticut College
- Cornell University
- Cornerstone OnDemand, Inc.
- Dartmouth College
- Delaware Valley University
- Demco Software
- Digital Measures
- DLC Solutions, LLC
- DLT Solutions
- DocuSign, Inc.
- DSE Rec, LLC

- Duke University
- East Carolina University
- eBay Inc.
- Edinboro University of Pennsylvania
- Edublogs
- EDUCAUSE
- ERezLife Software, Inc.
- ESnet
- Fairleigh Dickinson University
- Fermi National Accelerator Laboratory
- Fischer International Identity
- Fitch Solutions, Inc.
- Florida A&M University
- Florida Atlantic University
- Florida International University
- Florida State University
- Franklin & Marshall College
- George Mason University
- Georgia Institute of Technology
- Georgia State University
- Governmentjobs.com Inc. d/b/a Neogov
- GPN (Great Plains Network)
- Grinnell College
- Hamilton College
- Hampshire College
- Hartnell Community College District
- Harvard College
- Hebrew Union College - Jewish Institute of Religion
- HighWire Press
- Humboldt State University
- Huron Consulting Services, LLC
- Identity Automation LP
- Imodules Software, Inc.
- Indiana University
- InfoReady Corp
- ingenta
- Ink Labs Inc.
- InnoSoft Canada Inc.
- Institute for Advanced Study
- Instructure, Inc
- Internet2
- Johns Hopkins University
- Kansas State University
- Kennesaw State University
- Kenyon College
- Kivuto Solutions Inc.
- Kualii, Inc.
- Kutztown University of Pennsylvania

- LabArchives
- Lafayette College
- Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory
- Leepfrog Technologies, Inc.
- Lehman College of the City University of New York
- Lock Haven University
- Louisiana State University
- Louisiana State University Health Sciences Center - Shreveport
- Loyola University Maryland
- Loyola University of Chicago
- Malone University
- Marine Biological Laboratory
- MCNC
- Mediat, LLC
- Meredith College
- Michigan State University
- Microsoft
- Millersville University of Pennsylvania
- Modo Labs Inc.
- Montana State University - Bozeman
- Morgan State University
- Moss Landing Marine Laboratories
- Mount Holyoke College
- National Institutes of Health
- National Science Foundation
- New Jersey Institute of Technology
- NOIRLab (National Optical-Infrared Astronomy Research Laboratory)
- North Carolina State University
- Northeastern University
- Northern Arizona University
- Northwestern University
- NuPark LLC
- Ohio Technology Consortium ("OH-TECH")
- OhioLink
- Oklahoma State University Main Campus
- Old Dominion University
- OneNet
- Online Computer Library Center Inc.
- OnPlan Holdings
- Open Commons Consortium (OCC)
- Pace University
- Pacific Lutheran University
- Pennsylvania College of Technology
- PeopleAdmin, Inc.
- Pomona College
- PPD Development, L.P.
- Princeton University
- Prism RBS, LLC

- Purdue University Main Campus
- QS Unisolution GmbH
- Questica, Inc.
- Radford University
- Reclaim Hosting, LLC
- RefWorks, LLC
- Regis University
- Risk and Safety Solutions
- Rochester Institute of Technology
- RSmart
- Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey
- Salisbury University
- San Diego State University
- San Francisco State University
- San Jose State University
- SciQuest, Inc.
- SCLogic
- Shippensburg University
- Skidmore College
- Smith College
- South Dakota State University
- Southern Oregon University
- Stanford University
- Stark State College of Technology
- StarRez, Inc.
- Stellic Inc
- Stevens Institute of Technology
- Stevenson University
- Stony Brook University
- SUNY College at Brockport
- SUNY Empire State College
- Symplicity Corporation
- Syracuse University
- Taskstream, LLC dba Taskstream-Tk20
- TeamDynamix Solutions, LLC
- Teamworks Innovations
- Terra Dotta, LLC
- Texas A&M University - San Antonio
- Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi
- Texas State University - San Marcos
- Texas Tech University
- Texas Woman's University
- The Beans Group, Ltd.
- The College of Wooster
- The George Washington University
- The Moody Bible Institute of Chicago
- The Ohio State University
- The Pennsylvania State University

- The University of Arizona
- The University of Montana
- Tivli
- Towson University
- Trinity College
- Trinity University
- Tufts University
- Tulane University
- University At Albany, State University of New York
- University At Buffalo, The State University of New York
- University of Alabama at Birmingham
- University of Alaska Statewide System
- University of Arkansas for Medical Sciences
- University of Arkansas Main Campus
- University of Baltimore
- University of Bridgeport
- University of California - Office of the President
- University of California Hastings College of the Law
- University of California-Irvine
- University of California-Los Angeles
- University of California, Berkeley
- University of California, Davis
- University of California, Merced
- University of California, Riverside
- University of California, San Francisco
- University of California, Santa Cruz
- University of Central Florida
- University of Chicago
- University of Colorado at Boulder
- University of Connecticut
- University of Dayton
- University of Florida
- University of Houston Libraries
- University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
- University of Iowa
- University of Kansas
- University of Kentucky
- University of Maryland Baltimore
- University of Maryland Baltimore County
- University of Maryland College Park
- University of Massachusetts Amherst
- University of Massachusetts Boston
- University of Miami
- University of Michigan
- University of Mississippi
- University of Missouri System
- University of Nebraska
- University of Nebraska-Lincoln

- University of New Hampshire
- University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
- University of North Carolina At Charlotte
- University of North Carolina at Greensboro
- University of Northern Iowa
- University of Notre Dame
- University of Oklahoma
- University of Oregon
- University of Pennsylvania
- University of Richmond
- University of Rochester
- University of South Carolina
- University of South Dakota
- University of Southern California
- University of Texas at El Paso
- University of Texas At Tyler
- University of Texas Health Science Center At Houston
- University of Texas Health Science Center At San Antonio
- University of Texas Health Science Center At Tyler
- University of Texas M.D. Anderson Cancer Center
- University of Texas Medical Branch At Galveston
- University of Texas of the Permian Basin
- University of Texas Rio Grande Valley
- University of Texas Southwestern Medical Center at Dallas
- University of Texas System
- University of Utah
- University of Vermont
- University of Virginia
- University of Washington
- University of Wisconsin - Green Bay
- University of Wisconsin - Platteville
- University of Wisconsin - Whitewater
- University of Wisconsin Oshkosh
- University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee
- University of Wisconsin-River Falls
- Unizin
- Utah State University
- Vanderbilt University
- Virginia Commonwealth University
- Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University
- Washington Research Library Consortium
- Washington State University
- Washington University in St. Louis
- Wayne State University
- WebAssign
- Weill Cornell Medical College
- Weill Cornell Medical College in Qatar
- Wentworth Institute of Technology

- Western Michigan University
- Western Nebraska Community College
- William Paterson University
- Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution
- Woofound, Inc.
- Worcester Polytechnic Institute
- Workplace Answers, LLC
- Yuzu Labs Public Benefit Corporation d/b/a StudyPages
- Zoom Video Communications, Inc.