

Scoring Definitions:

<b>8</b>	Top Quality / Outstanding
<b>7 - 7.9</b>	Very Good
<b>6 - 6.9</b>	Above Average / Good
<b>5 - 5.9</b>	Average / Standard / Satisfactory
<b>4 - 4.9</b>	Below Average / Sub-Standard
<b>3 - 3.9</b>	Unsatisfactory
<b>2 - 2.9</b>	
<b>1 - 1.9</b>	Poor
<b>0 - 0.9</b>	

Awards (badges) by category:

(the highest scoring entry in each category will be awarded the corresponding badge)

Melodies Themes	Harmony Chords Textures	Form Development Structure	Originality Creativity	Score Presentation	Instrumentation Orchestration	Execution of Given Challenge	Taste
"Tune Smith"	"Ingenious Harmonizer"	"Musical Architect"	"Musical Explorer"	"Immaculate Engraver"	"Outstanding Orchestrator"	Theme Winner - "From Bits to Bangers"	"Impeccable Taste"

Player: Tónskáld

Entry G - "Revisiting Kirby" by @Setthavat

Category: Orchestral and Large Ensemble

8-Bit Track used

Track 4 - Kirby's Adventure - "Grape Garden"

Melodies Themes Motives	Harmony Chords Textures	Form Development Structure	Originality Creativity	Score Presentation	Instrumentation Orchestration	Execution of Given Challenge	Taste
7	7	8	7.5	4.5	7.5	7	7.5

Average Score: 7.00

Review: An incredibly emotional orchestral arrangement, this piece provides one of the best uses of the source material in the entire competition. The opening melodic material is nicely executed, with waltz-like rhythms and punctuations from pizzicato strings, interspersed with traded statements between woodwind and solo violin. The brooding middle section provides wonderful contrast and a superb transition to the second theme of the source material, which is (again) handled quite originally here. The return to the opening is likewise expertly handled, and the end is both poignant and resolute. The harmonies are tertian overall, although short expeditions into quartals are apparent, especially in the transitional segment; the result is very effective, in my opinion. The orchestral color employed by the composer is beautiful, organic, and moving. The score, unfortunately, suffers from spacing issues, lack of consistent solo vs. tutti notation, and slurring (which is apparent in the audio but the score does not reflect).

Player: Thatguy v2.0

Entry G - "Revisiting Kirby" by @Setthavat

Category: Orchestral and Large Ensemble

8-Bit Track used

Track 4 - Kirby's Adventure - "Grape Garden"

Melodies Themes Motives	Harmony Chords Textures	Form Development Structure	Originality Creativity	Score Presentation	Instrumentation Orchestration	Execution of Given Challenge	Taste
6	7	6	6	7	7	6	6

Average Score: 6.375

Review:

First of all, the judging for this judge will be a little bit different. If you relisten to all of the 8-bit tracks we posted, they're all bangers. They were just limited by the technology offered. I was a bit disappointed tbh, as this competition turned into "From Bits to Ballades". I hoped for powerful rockin tunes inspired by these pieces, and although some of you captured what I felt was so important to this particular competition, most failed my bangers test. These scores are out of 8 bits, but if your piece isn't a "banger" by what I've held dear as the definition, I have no choice but to slice off the top layer of the maximum score down to 7 bits for each category.

I'm sorry to say, your piece did not pass the banger test. Your scores will only receive a possible 7 bits per category instead of 8.

Awesome music you posted. I love the suspense in the strings, and the color throughout was good. As with many other competitors, I wish this felt like more of a banger to me, but your music is solid and a great effort.

Player: PeterthePapercomPoser  
Entry G - "Revisiting Kirby" by @Setthavat  
Category: Orchestral and Large Ensemble

8-Bit Track used

Track 4 - Kirby's Adventure - "Grape Garden"

Melodies Themes Motives	Harmony Chords Textures	Form Development Structure	Originality Creativity	Score Presentation	Instrumentation Orchestration	Execution of Given Challenge	Taste
7.5	7.75	7.9	7.75	5.5	8	8	8

Average Score: 7.55

Review:

The other banger that used "Kirby's Adventure" also chose a clarinet with string accompaniment as a first statement of the main theme. I guess great minds think alike! Your transformation of this track took a completely different turn though in terms of character than your competitor. There are some very interesting percussive elements to your rendition, giving it sometimes an almost Spanish feel. Also, the 3/4 meter and waltz accompaniment gives your music a very dance-like character as well. At other times, you bring uncertainty and unease into the music with string tremolos and dissonance. Sometimes this banger takes on the quality of a cinematic atmosphere piece with some horror elements even. But your handling of the theme, harmony and orchestration is pretty well done overall. I think it's safe to say that you developed the melodies and harmonies more than the other "Kirby's Adventure" banger as well. I guess your approach is to create kind of these orchestral character variations of the original 8-bit theme. I think you pulled it off quite well! And there are quite a few details in the orchestration that get lost to a casual listener. But the score is really hard to follow, because it often does not contain enough material per page, making it impossible to keep up with the music.

Player: Henry Ng Tsz Kiu  
Entry G - "Revisiting Kirby" by @Setthavat  
Category: Orchestral and Large Ensemble

8-Bit Track used

Track 4 - Kirby's Adventure - "Grape Garden"

Melodies Themes Motives	Harmony Chords Textures	Form Development Structure	Originality Creativity	Score Presentation	Instrumentation Orchestration	Execution of Given Challenge	Taste
7.8	7.9	7.4	8	7.7	7.9	8	8

Average Score: 7.84

Review: The melodic element is captured in the music with lovely touch especially harmonically. . Your orchestration is excellent for me especially with the use of the percussion instruments like castanets and tambourine which add so much colour to the fairytale-like piece. It's just sometimes I feel like some string techniques are used for using the techniques since they only appear briefly, like the col legno in b.58 and sul tasto in b.52.

For me one of the shortcomings is the "Something Emerging" section. The transition to the section is abrupt and the expectation of something different is not fulfilled very satisfactorily after the section in b.93 since I feel like the clarinet appearance in Gb major is not too eventful. The transitions between sections is not the smoothest, for example when tonic A major is regained abruptly in b.176 where I wish there will be a climax!

The scoring is very clear with all details and great job on that!

My favourite section is the ending as it ends serenely with the winds featuring.

Reviewer: Omicronrg9  
Entry G - "Revisiting Kirby" by @Setthavat  
Category: Orchestral and Large Ensemble

8-Bit Track used

Track 4 - Kirby's Adventure - "Grape Garden"

Melodies Themes Motives	Harmony Chords Textures	Form Development Structure	Originality Creativity	Score Presentation	Instrumentation Orchestration	Execution of Given Challenge	Taste
7.2	7.5	6.9	8	6.5	7	8	7

Average Score: **7.26 out of 8**

Review:

Another beautiful rendition of Kirby's "Grape Garden" with nice twists and, I must say, some questionable sections that have mixed success fitting with each other. The majority of the new material not only fits but expands a lot the original theme, creating an entire atmosphere of music around it in unexpected, adequate and very enjoyable ways.

Regarding the score, I understand that the blank page and some overlapping might be due to software limitations but taking advantage of that space to do some clarifications wouldn't have hurt possibly, though I am not a fan of dense or overly flamboyant "explanations" anyway.

In summary, you caught the essence of this theme very successfully. The scoring has a bit of room for improvement, but in any case this is a very creative, high quality submission.  
Congratulations!

Player: chopin

Entry G - "Revisiting Kirby" by @Setthavat

Category: Orchestral and Large Ensemble

8-Bit Track used

Track 4 - Kirby's Adventure - "Grape Garden"

Melodies Themes Motives	Harmony Chords Textures	Form Development Structure	Originality Creativity	Score Presentation	Instrumentation Orchestration	Execution of Given Challenge	Taste
7.5	8	8	8	5	7	8	8

Average Score: 7.44

Review:

You definitely win creativity and harmony points with this work. Absolutely beautiful piece that captures Kirby's theme but in a really fun and unique perspective with just the right amount of dissonance. This is set for a massive orchestra, but I have to admit, I had a really hard time following your score. I kept getting lost, so I eventually just gave up and relied just on my ears. A lot of these problems can be fixed with setting your pdf to landscape, or tabloid and by setting your zoom smaller. Small thing, but would help out the reviewers in large works like this. Basically, I couldn't scroll fast enough!

Clarinet melody line is beautiful, and the violin has some nice solos. When you changed the mood at around 0:50, this is where you ventured into your own unique voice, and I was pleased to hear how well you integrated this with the main theme of Kirby. This is why I scored you very high on Form and Development. I definitely look for how well music segues from one section into the next, because if the transitions are too obvious, it disrupts the user's listening experience (exceptions are if the composer intended that, but it still has to segue nicely in my opinion). But you were able to provide me with a smooth listening experience.

At around 2:30 when the strings make their debut, I'm wondering if maybe you should have chosen marcato, or added some type of attack to the strings section, so they don't sound so muddled. I feel that this section wasn't intended as "background music" so choosing that style seemed a bit out of character. It could have just been some balancing issues, because your solo strings, woodwinds and percussion seemed pretty well balanced. But a lot of composers on this site seem to have issues with this when using higher quality samples with string ensembles. Ironically, people who have the lower quality midi sounds do not have this problem, because the string ensembles of poorer quality have a much sharper attack, making it easier to hear the melody in larger orchestral works.

Overall though, this work is beautiful, and you demonstrated your ability to not only execute the challenge, but also displayed your creativity by using your own unique voice. And I want to emphasize that you blended in your own ideas quite well when changing up the mood of the piece.